

Nationalism, Transnationalism and Sense of Belonging: *Burnt Shadows* as a Post 9/11 Cosmopolitan Critique of Terror

Ayesha Perveen

University of Management and Technology

CII, Johar Town, Lahore, Punjab, 54000, Pakistan

Email: ayesha@vu.edu.pk

Abstract Post 9/11 literature turns out to be a signifier for terror oriented discourses. Kamila Shamsie's novel *Burnt Shadows* (2009) critiques the US discourses on war on terror by highlighting the terror disseminated by a globalized world order and traces its germination in the past by historicizing aggressive nationalism of the superpowers. The terror is manifested through the state exigencies triggering extreme reactions in the name of freedom fighting and guerrilla warfare. This paper interprets Shamsie's vision of history and the linear development of terror from colonization onwards to World War II through post 9/11 war on terror. Shamsie discusses the 'others' point of view who have been the victim of holocaust, colonization of the Subcontinent and Soviet and American interventions in Afghanistan. The study concludes that the exploding globalization in the world nurtures terror networks and only the love for humanity based cosmopolitan vision can turn out to be a savior in post 9/11 transnational times.

Key words 9/11; terror; nationalism; transnationalism; cosmopolitan

Author **Ayesha Perveen** is a PhD researcher at University of Management and Technology, Lahore. She works as assistant professor at Virtual University of Pakistan. Her research interests include but are not limited to South Asian literatures written in English and English language teaching in Asia.

Introduction

September 11, 2001 attacks on the World Trade Centre turned out to be an abrupt check on the utopian vision of a cosmopolitan world. The events signified "re-signification of older forms of European colonialism under the aegis of an 'American

empire” (Hartnell 336). Thus it resuscitated the debates about the failure of multiculturalism in a global age. The American 9/11 novel was read through “postcolonial gaze” (Hartnell 336) especially by those who were the direct victims of post 9/11 American discourses i.e., Muslims and Pakistanis. As a result 9/11 inspired Pakistani diaspora novelists to take up the question of belonging - which community the diasporic Muslims belong to especially after being signified as terrorists after 9/11. Thus the post 9/11 Muslim writings grappled with the questions like how can one belong in a global transnational world overcoming chaotic experiences while conceding to the culture of the community they live in.

The post 9/11 creative engagement encompasses wide geography of the world to render voice to different global contexts. The Pakistani post 9/11 fiction delineates pendulating and discursive movement of their characters in different zones posing the question whether national and cultural ties can ever be superseded in favour of a cosmopolitan world. Kamila Shamsie’s *Burnt Shadows* (2009) can be interpreted as one of those texts that are ‘literary encounters with the USA’, borrowing Claudia Perner’s term (Perner 238). This paper will debate the changing shape of the “ism” in cosmopolitanism through the lens of the characters’ postcolonial and post 9/11 experiences as presented in *Burnt Shadows*.

Cosmopolitanism and Transnationalism

The term Cosmopolitanism can be traced back to the stoic philosophy and then to Kant’s cosmopolitan historical view (Perner 238). However, it was in the late 1980s that it appeared in the form of ‘ism’ based on the socio-political-cultural interactions at a global level. Cosmopolitanism conveys a notion of ‘shared responsibility and planetary interdependence’ (Perner 239). According to Appiah, cosmopolitanism must take into account the fundamental differences and focus more on dialogue than a consensus. So it becomes a delineator of responsibility for a cosmopolitan - responsibility towards all others beyond blood relations or national citizenship. “The golden rule of cosmopolitanism is: *Homo sum: humani nil a me alienum puto*. ‘I am human: nothing human is alien to me’” (Appiah 111). Claudia Perner defines a cosmopolitan as an individual who has the capacity to easily move “between nations and culture” (Perner 238) and geographical divisions or borders and with a flexible approach towards it. Mignolo defines cosmopolitanism as an act towards planetary conviviality (Mignolo 157). Dharwadker considers three factors as the main cause of the popularity of cosmopolitanism till 1995: (a) consolidation of nationalism (b) empowerment of immigrants and (c) globalization of capital and material production (1). Based on his contention, it can be inferred that globalization is part

of cosmopolitanism and acts as a trigger towards the new forms of cosmopolitanism, whereas the latter remains a holistic term.

The increasing connectedness of the world is creating a transnational world with some sense of shared responsibility which can be called cosmopolitan responsibility. Transnationalism is different from cosmopolitanism as it includes the first part of Perner's definition, that of easy mobility between nations and cultures and may not involve any sense of responsibility. Cosmopolitanism cannot be considered synonymous with transnational or transcultural although the term is used most often without outlining any clear difference from the aforementioned terms. The trans in both the terms may indicate movement, negotiation and positionality. Cosmopolitanism can be considered more holistic than transnationalism based on Perner's concept of flexible attitude towards transnationalism and Mignolo's concept of planetary conviviality.

From Postcolonial to Post 9/11 Cosmopolitanism

This paper studies how Shamsie connects postcolonial and post 9/11 world. As nationalism is a key component of postcolonialism, it is pertinent to investigate the role of nationalism in a cosmopolitan world. If a cosmopolitan individual like Hiroko is easy at moving anywhere in the world, what would be his/her stance about national ties or bonding. Does cosmopolitanism transcend national affiliations? Is it in contrast to/opposed to nationalism or does it provide a good balance of the two? If cultural individuality like food and clothes can be sustained anywhere in the world, what about the sustainability of the happenings in one's memory? Featherstone talks about a 'cosmopolitan memory' by contending that even if imagination and identification are abstract processes they are impacted by cosmopolitanism and individual perceptions turn into recollections which are cosmopolitan in scope. In this context, Featherstone considers 9/11 as a part of cosmopolitan memory. It became a part of cosmopolitan memory because of the enormous representation of the event through media (Featherstone 2).

Apparently cosmopolitanism draws a comparison to nationalism if it does not seem opposed to it; however, Brennan criticizes postcolonialism and cultural studies in service of propagandists (2) and recommends a cosmopolitan approach that should encompass national sensitivities (72). Similarly Robbins disregards the commonsensal opposition between cosmopolitanism and nationalism as illogical and emphasizes that cosmopolitanism that seems to be having a look from above must encompass transnational aspects by addressing discrete issues like coercion through exploring "full multivoiced complexity" (12). Vertovec and Cohen in their

introduction to *Conceiving Cosmopolitanism* argue that cosmopolitanism is an outlook and mode of experience that transcends the ostensibly outmoded nation-state model. It mediates between the universal and the particular, the global and the local, is culturally anti-essentialist, and represents a complex repertoire of identities, allegiances and interests (3). If cosmopolitanism encompasses all of the above, how a postcolonial subject attains a cosmopolitan vision will be discussed in this study through Hiroko's transformation.

Amanda Anderson divides cosmopolitanism into exclusionary and inclusionary aspects by considering the former as cosmic or abstract and the latter as more inclusive of intercultural problems with a sympathetic approach to resolve them as it is more egalitarian (Anderson 172). "From the vantage point of critical cosmopolitanism," all Eurocentred approaches "lack both the hermeneutical aim of cultural translation and the critical task of broadening the moral and political horizons of society" (Delanty 14). Delanty questions Eurocentric cosmopolitan tradition by subdividing it into civilizational, and analytical universalism as well as exceptionalism and conceptual Europeanism. She talks about cultural and cognitive universalism of Asia by suggesting alternative cosmopolitanism through cosmopolitan liberalism. She recommends critical cosmopolitanism as an alternative that makes cultures learn from each other through encounters (11).

A cosmopolitan writer must imagine beyond national microcosms to represent global interconnectedness by moving beyond differences or 'us vs them' debates to shift paradigms and herald the beginning of an era where one must survive in spite of such petty differences (Schoene, 32). Perner on the other hand, considers national novels equally valuable and disregards a set of rules for cosmopolitan novels (251). My paper will contest Jameson's dated claim that all third world texts are national allegories (Jameson 69) as *Burnt Shadows* reflects a movement away from postcolonial writing back to post 9/11 writing back to the centre. Perner considers a cosmopolitan approach, the one wherein the individual is situated, and shaped through a connection to a global world - an inoutsider observing from a global perspective while retaining belonging (Perner 251).

It is pertinent to discuss the shift in theory in the works written after 9/11 particularly by those authors who have a postcolonial background e.g., Shamsie. Selden, Widdowson, and Brooker consider our era as a post theory era. Since the dominant theories of our era are no more about literary writings, it brings about an end of theory (267) era in literature, due to politicization of theory by issues like race, gender and sex. Their contention is that literature once used to be the centre of theories, which is not the case anymore. However, the very death is a reorientation

and not an apocalypse as new body of works is contributing to cosmopolitan theory for example Berthold Schoene's *The Cosmopolitan Novel* (2009), Katherine Stanton's *Cosmopolitan Fictions: Ethics, Politics, and Global Change in the Works of Kazuo Ishiguro, Michael Ondaatje, Jamaica Kincaid, and J. M. Coetzee* (2005) and Vinay Dharwadker's *Cosmopolitan Geographies: New Locations in Literature and Culture* (2001) bring literary cosmopolitanism at its focal point by bridging contemporary globalization and previously established literary theory. Schoene attaches cosmopolitanism to two 9/11s, first of 1989, when with the fall of Berlin Wall, the world felt an echo of togetherness; and the second that of 2001 when the attack on the twin towers jolted that togetherness (7).

Schoene considers post 9/11 cosmopolitanism an 'attitude', 'disposition', and 'strategy for resistance' (Schoene 5). He considers it a movement forward from traditional approach of internationalism towards an attitude of rendering significance to local and communal identities. According to him, the fall of Berlin Wall in 1989 conceived the idea cultivating it into the utopian cosmopolitanism of 1990s. 9/11 initiated the recasting of cosmopolitanism as another turning point by making it move forward from intercommunal conviviality in multicultural ethnically diverse societies to a new form which is more 'realist' by being rooted in contemporary times and challenges (Schoene 9).

Schoene not only considers cosmopolitanism in collusion with neo-imperial strategies of the US but also relates it to contemporary Britain's peculiar status between old Europe and the current US resulting in a new form of fiction - cosmopolitan fiction with the scope of a creative imagination that keeps world as its setting, less home and specific territory oriented (Schoene 11-12). Thus cosmopolitan novel unlike national novel which upholds or deconstructs nationalist ideals, creates narrative trajectories that transgress geographical, cultural or even religious boundaries by making the world an imagined community instead of one nation and for this purpose using techniques that reflect the world as a "kaleidoscopic cellularity" (Luburić-Cvijanović & Muždeka 434). Shamsie creates this type of fiction, especially in the novel under analysis.

Post 9/11 Cosmopolitanism in *Burnt Shadows*

The aesthetic creativity allowed in fiction or any other literary genre renders it a scope which is far broader than any ism representation providing room for other forms of identification. *Shadows* represents identification by questioning the concept of nationhood and further delineating its practical repercussions through the development of Hiroko's identity. The novel bridges past, present and future by

proposing the idea of collective belonging. This collective belonging is considered post 9/11 cosmopolitanism in this study delineated by the novelist through the experience of the protagonist, Hiroko Tanaka.

Shadows encompasses the development of Pakistan as a nation-state since partition to post 9/11 era including significant markers like Zia era and Afghan war from an objective point of view. All this is presented through Hiroko's (a Japanese) life spanning over all these transition markers after she survived in WWII. However, through Hiroko, Shamsie simultaneously questions the notions of terrorism associated with nationhood and upholds human identity without belonging to a nation or believing in the concept of aggressive nationalism and wars. She differentiates a postcolonial existence from a post 9/11 one by segregating migrancies into privileged and non-privileged ones. Privileged and unprivileged migrations have always and particularly after 9/11 determined human choices and status.

Impact of Migrancies on Identity

Cara Cilano divides the migrancies in *Shadows* into two groups: privileged and unprivileged. Based on the status of migrancies, she traces the national affiliations of the characters in the novel (222). Using Cilano's division, this study relates the identity development of the characters with the nature of their migrancies. The scale of these migrancies ranges between positivity to acceptance to disregard and oppression. A privileged migrancy may be a luxury while an unprivileged one a desperate need. Shamsie explores how nationalism can turn into violent acts of brutal mass killing and migrancies can inform one with a cosmopolitan vision by rejecting this sort of nationalism. The major characters of the novel experience this at multivariate levels.

Konrad Weiss is a German who moves to Japan by choice to meet Hiroko who is his erstwhile teacher and now a beloved. His eight years stay at Japan turns his privileged migrancy into an unprivileged one due to the postwar challenges non-Allied countries faced in the Second World War. Before WWII even Japan had a cosmopolitan approach due to its openness towards Europe as is evident from Konrad's migration, accommodation and acceptance by the country. Similarly Konrad's half-sister Ilse has a cosmopolitan approach because she chooses to marry an Englishman named James Burton and moves to New Delhi with him since he is appointed there by the British government. What prompts Hiroko's migrancy is the atomic explosion and the death of Konrad, her father and her back seared by the bird shaped design of her kimono.

Cilano further interprets an important aspect of privileged migrancies, that is, the degree of divergence (223). The higher level of divergent attitude and independence of choice makes a migrancy more privileged. For example, the Britishers had a choice to move to and back from India and enjoy privileges during their stay. On the contrary, Hiroko moves out of desperation due to her traumatic experiences. On the other hand, Ilse who marries James makes a conscious choice of assimilation and Anglicizes herself. This helps her enjoy a privileged status of being the wife of an English Barrister in the colonized India. Her choice of such privileges makes her break away from her national belonging easily. James, being at the pinnacle of self-complacency, is a true representative of British colonialism. Ilse chooses to stay at home as a housewife and accompany James in his social circle. However, this compromise impacts her personality in an adverse manner making the same migrancy turn into an unprivileged one.

Less privileged migrancies in the novel bring characters closer to their national identity. For example, Sajjad who visits Turkey, after his marriage to Hiroko, to avoid Hindu-Muslim riots in a separating India, is denied entry to India being a Muslim with an assumption that he must have chosen to move out of India by choice. This makes him choose a national affiliation and resultantly he settles in Karachi, Pakistan. Sajjad too was attached to Delhi but the violence that takes place after partition results in his mother's death and makes him choose a Muhajir status in Karachi. By throwing light on Muhajir debate in post-partition Pakistan, Shamsie also highlights the divisions within a nation which may result in privileged or unprivileged migrancies. The first world countries enjoyed privileged migrancies both in post/colonial times and the third world unprivileged ones.

Sajjad's Identity Development

Sajjad's realization of master-slave relations between James Burton and himself develops identity consciousness in him. When he arranges Burtons & Hiroko to visit Qutb Minar and introduces its history to them, he is perplexed at the thought of explaining his history in a slave status to his colonizer masters. Like Changez in *The Reluctant Fundamentalism*, he gradually develops an ownership of his history. He bitterly realizes how his history was colonizers' 'picnic ground' (Shamsie 81). As the English never considered India as home, when they were leaving India, they were going home, Sajjad brainstormed (Shamsie 82). James Burton is never ready to acknowledge that any Indian should write in English as no English has ever tried to write in Urdu. Sajjad is baffled on his slave status, in getting denied entry back in India and this helps him achieve his Pakistani identity as a Muslim. Religion does

play a great role, however, it is not the case with Hiroko as her identity is constantly reshaped and she is not even influenced by her nationality. Shamsie as a post 9/11 writer portrays Pakistanis' background of Independence from the British colonizers but expands her vision to the world events of the past as well as the present. She creates a nexus between history-terror-nationalism. She makes various nationalities across borders interact as well as confront each other and translate cultures as per their understanding. This is her creative world formation that makes the novel achieve a cosmopolitan vision in a post 9/11 world.

Henry Burton's Identity Development

Henry Burton also known as Harry Burton, son of James and Ilse Burton, is flexible in his approach towards national identity as his childhood is spent in the Subcontinent from where he moves to the US and Afghanistan. In his teens, he had a strong affiliation with the Subcontinent which perturbed his parents who considered the option of sending him to England for schooling to check that influence. In spite of his adaptability, when he moves to the US, he adapts to an American identity with great ease. However, Karachi still resonates in his mind which forces him to move to Islamabad for his CIA enterprises. Harry has a very positive impression about the US as he considers the US of 1949 as a multicultural society welcoming people from all around the world as well as facilitating them to be a part of her national fabric. Shamsie traces the cosmopolitan American dream from 1940s onwards. Harry assimilates his British identity into American identity. It is obvious by his justification of American racism as multiculturalism and a democratic system that helps multiple citizens of the world connect to each other. Cilano calls it "easy appropriation of American identity" (225) as Harry's affiliation to CIA is a source of excitement and his thrill-seeking self inspires him to become a military contractor after 2001. The privileged migrancies can make transnationalism exciting which may be demeaning for the unprivileged ones. For Harry, America has a cosmopolitan vision which is an indirect contrast to American aggressive nationalism. He comments on their acts in Afghanistan as "we make a desolation and call it peace" (Shamsie 284), as he is a witness to what America has done to Afghanistan before and after 9/11.

Raza's Identity Development

Raza Konrad Ashraf faces identity crisis because his migrancy is an unprivileged one and his sense of belonging a complicated one. Raza is a Pakistani-German-Indian as his name shows, with Japanese blood running inside his body from his

mother's side - a cosmopolitan being - with an ambiguous sense of belonging. He is multilingual and able to translate languages, however, the novel focuses on how Raza and his mother are able to translate cultures and to enable readers to translate this transformation. This is what makes the novel a post 9/11 cosmopolitan novel as Shoene has described a cosmopolitan novel as "creative world formation" stance both on part of the author and the reader (32).

Raza's travels in search of a sense of belonging and a stable identity are summed up by Cilano as "existential unsettledness" (226) which, I contend is a down side of transnationalism. This is because any individual needs a sense of belonging whether national, cultural, religious or communal which when let too loose results in waywardness. Too many belongings or identities if not resolved may create identity crisis which is obvious in Raza's case. However, a cosmopolitan ability to translate cultures while retaining one's roots can resolve this lack of stable core. "The more languages you learned...the more you found overlap" (Shamsie 258). Raza's learning of different languages in Dubai made him realize the overlap in languages. A post 9/11 cosmopolitan needs to excavate the sameness in cultures and humans.

In the postcolonial Pakistan of 1980s during the Zia regime, Raza is seen being influenced by the culture around when he asks his mother to wear the same sort of attire as other women in the neighbourhood do. This identity foreclosure represents his sense of belonging to Pakistan (national identity) and choice of dress as cultural identity. His parents are confused on his sense of national identity for Shamsie is often critical of Zia regime and Raza's affiliation to the dominant norms of the times which are seen both with a sense of pity and as a cause of laughter. Due to his Japanese origin, Raza's misfit appearance in Pakistan triggers his identity crisis, however, the same provides him temporary adjustment in Afghanistan when he is impersonated as Raza Hazara by his fellow Afghans. This makes him more of a wanton boy than a cosmopolitan as moving to Afghanistan is a desperate choice. Over there, he strongly realizes the comforts he had been taking for granted after he witnesses brutal violence.

Hiroko's Cosmopolitan Identity

Hiroko is the main character who upholds cosmopolitanism as her vision rises above aggressive or parochial nationalism that provokes violent tactics to stay dominated or even safe. Condemned to move from place to place, she faces foreignness repetitively. According to Cilano, the only belonging she has is "foreignness" (227). She is least bothered to be considered a foreigner for a life time in Pakistan wherein

she has a home to live in. The sense of belonging to a nation is contradictory and therefore, insubstantial for her and the same thought makes her a mouthpiece of Shamsie. Even after Nagasaki bombing she moves to Tokyo to work as a translator for the Americans because she still did not blame anyone for the bombing. However, when she listens to an American saying that the bomb saved America, she quits the job for the first time realizing the nefarious aims attached with a sense of national belonging – that makes individuals fall below humanity. Shamsie questions whether in such a scenario one can remain human by staying outside national belonging or identity? Hiroko does not consider Nagasaki bombing a trauma only because she lost her father and fiancé or compatriots but because it was a trauma for large scale humanity.

After Sajjad's death, Hiroko moves to Abbotabad but the increasing tension between India and Pakistan precipitates her relocation to the US. She adjusts well in New York as she considered the city plural for foreignness, however, she considers post 9/11 polemics as shrunken national jingoism, limited in approach. This has been a historical phenomenon, Nazis demeaning Jews, Allies demeaning non Allies, USSR demeaning Afghans, US demeaning many in both pre and post 9/11 eras. Shamsie contextualizes her novel to render a universal picture of human sense of belonging and claims of being threatened by terror and the actuality of the spread of terror. An approach for the goodwill of all humans is considered a cosmopolitanism approach in this novel.

According to Gohar Karim Khan, *Shadows* represents the socio-political realities of various territorial settings by drawing continuous parallels between these settings, implying a 'unifying global resonance'. Thus it espouses 'alternative forms of existence and identification' (Khan 54). The characters' personal life is intertwined with transnational politics and nationalism. She considers Hiroko Tanaka a metaphor of transnationalism and shared belonging. However, she studies *Shadows* as a transnational text only. She defines transnationalism as an attitudinal phenomenon based on collaborations that link people beyond national borders which she considers artificial constructs. However, her contention remains limited to postcolonial theory as she presents it as a challenge to culture, geography and history. However, she maintains that *Shadows* questions the limited notions of terrorism and ideological violence resulting out of extremism due to national borders. The novel provides a nuanced and broader perspective in its capacity as a transnational text while interrogating the relationship between terrorism and nation according to her. This is done by linking geographies and histories of various nations and countries.

Ali Usman Saleem considers revisiting postcolonial while focusing on the contemporary political happenings as a paracolonial approach (113). According to him, *Shadows* “deconstructs, decenters and challenges” (Saleem 113) by acting as a counter narrative to the post 9/11 Western polemics. This study contends that Shamsie’s linking of the past and the present and interpreting 9/11 terror through the help of WWII is a post 9/11 cosmopolitan approach. It argues that a post 9/11 cosmopolitanism moves beyond sheer critique of colonial experience or political critique of capitalism or celebration of hybridity for better adjustments in the West. It encompasses globalization, transnationalism with all its after effects like wars or clash of civilizations. However, the only response to any neo-imperialisms is through a love-for-humanity response. Post 9/11 cosmopolitan literature can be different from post 9/11 literature as it advocates a cosmopolitan sense of responsibility for all instead of promoting hate stories through presenting one-dimensional suffering. Zink (2010), for example, considers Islamic terrorism as presented in *Shadows* as a by-product of cultural globalization which is a reaction to the US policy of cultural homogenization/globalization in a post 9/11 world through geopolitics (45).

The transnational migrant is in a constant process of simultaneously belonging and unbelonging, acculturating as well as liberating oneself from hierarchical global structures. *Shadows* also throws light on this tension by presenting a pluralized version of nationalism while not outrightly rejecting it. Transnationalism is “inbetweenness” like the space of the diaspora. “Interstitial space” is crucial in the initiation of new strategies of belonging and identity formation. It facilitates collaboration and contestation; agreement and dissent (Boehmer 21). Boehmer refers to it as a site of “potentially productive inbetweenness” between the “first” and the “third” worlds (21). Ellen Berry considers it a resistance to closure and insistence on permanent openness. “Contact zone” is a usefully coined term by Mary Louise Pratt which is a transcultural space making people across cultures meet and interact in asymmetrical ways. Getting familiar with the unfamiliar and attempting to accommodate it facilitates people in the contact zone. This study contends that a post 9/11 contact zone is different from Bhabha’s postcolonial third space or interstitial spaces (17) as it replaces colonizer-colonized binary with first world and third world binary. Therefore, Hiroko’s inbetweenness subverts conventional notions of nationalism, and is powerful enough to blur the distinctions between foreign and familiar by accommodating to it, understanding its intricacies, appreciating its positivities and ignoring petty biases. She represents a new form of globalization by challenging nation specific normative understanding of nationalism

by presenting an altered territorial bearing that moves away from London, Paris or New York to Tokyo, Kabul, Delhi, Istanbul and Karachi. Equally, she is interested in the nationalist sentiments and practices that connect these otherwise distinct and separate nations, proposing nationalism as a global phenomenon experienced by everyone and in dire need of a cosmopolitan vision based on transnational experiences.

Globalization has further enhanced the shackles of capitalism and created heterogeneous cultural political and social groups. Post 9/11 world replaces capitalism with globalization debates whereby transnationalism is the major manifestation of globalization. Shamsie has experienced transnationalism herself as she lived across borders, languages and cultures. Shamsie being a diaspora is well aware of the predicament of being at home and away. She chooses Karachi, her home city for her first three novels because she is well versed with its subtexts, geography, passions, and varieties of lifestyles. However *Shadows* is set in Japan, Afghanistan, Pakistan and India. She broadens the horizon of this novel by moving away to a larger canvas. Her personal life decision to move to London was based on broadening the canvas of her experience and by distancing herself from Karachi with which she further strengthened her relationship. It also helped her envision her country from a different perspective, one she could never gain while staying inside. She believes that a writer should not commit to a physical presence at one particular place as moving away from home renders better capacity to reflect about one's country and nation. Thus her ties to her nation remain very strong. Similarly, Hiroko will always remain a Japanese even if she moves anywhere in the world, it is only that she is against any sort of terrorism be it state terrorism or guerrilla warfare. Thus cosmopolitanism does not eradicate one's sense of belonging. Zinck considers *Shadows* as a diaspora text which encompasses diaspora predicaments of movement, nostalgia and relocation and considers contemporary diaspora fiction intensifying the nostalgia to the extent of going back to one's homeland (45). "Contrary to earlier diasporic fiction celebrating resilience, resourcefulness, acculturation or hybridity ... more recent diasporic works focus on the failure of relocation and the need to return to one's homeland" (Zink 54). The post 9/11 Pakistani fiction asserts the need of going back to one's homeland or redefining identities and loyalties in contrast to assimilation or acculturation as propagated by most of postcolonial fiction. So post 9/11 cosmopolitanism celebrates national, transnational and glocal belongings simultaneously while emphasizing global citizens' responsibility towards each other.

Shamsie's remarkable contribution is how she addresses current debates on global terror especially with reference to Pakistan that was being tagged as

a terrorist country and the Muslims who were labelled as terrorists. Therefore, two identifications exist, Pakistani and a Muslim. This is also sketched in her short story “Our Dead Your Dead” (2011), when the narrator Ayla breaks down the pattern of terrorism as she sees it: “America had 9/11; England had 7/7; India had 26/11; Pakistan has 24/7”. A pertinent example is Shamsie’s article in *The Guardian* published on 23 March 2012, titled “Kamila Shamsie on Pakistan, America and the Pitfalls of Plotting” in which she swivels the historical moments between America and Pakistan that have become common markers of terrorism. She alters the commencement of this relationship from the 1980s to 1958 when America provided Pakistan with one hundred F-86 planes in exchange for the use of Peshawar as a listening post. Shamsie explores the masquerade of terrorism either in the name of war or war on terror or fanaticism. She traces it back to the Second World War and the bombing on Japan not as a justification but as an act of terror. She stretches it to the post 9/11 American intervention in Afghanistan and considers Guantanamo Bay as an act of terror as well. Therefore, she decodes the American stance on 9/11, Muslims and Pakistan to present a cosmopolitan point of view. While digging out terrorism through international history and linking it to the present era, she also explores the sense of belonging and not belonging in Hiroko. So horizontally, the novel is spread over geographical division and vertically over historical development and contexts. The post 9/11 cosmopolitanism creates a nexus of time and space to uphold a human sense of responsibility towards each other beyond time, demarcations and ideologies. Shamsie represents historical examples of terrorism which were misrepresented for political motives by the hegemonic powers like the US and Europe, asserting their reemergence in the form of 9/11. She considers current terrorism as a demon of the past haunting nations again. To counter 9/11 media representation Shamsie focuses more on Nagasaki destruction to reflect the ubiquity of violence in history exposing bias in post 9/11 representations of political terrorism. When Hiroko comes across a poster “MISSING SINCE 9/11. IF YOU HAVE ANY INFORMATION ABOUT LUIS RIVERA PLEASE CALL...”, Hiroko recalls Nagasaki train station walls “plastered with signs asking for news of missing people” and concludes: “ In moments such as these it seemed entirely wrong to feel oneself living in a different history...” (Shamsie 274). Thus the text’s trajectory becomes broader than postcolonial to become post 9/11 through a deconstruction of history and projecting each terrorist activity as a rupture in cosmopolitan vision.

Guantanamo Bay Criticized

One such rupture takes place when Raza Konrad Ashraf is imprisoned in Guantanamo Bay and, wondering about his bleak future, he asks himself how he achieved that status? The answer is that Raza's identity crisis is not a result of a series of personal events but that of the large scale political interventions. In fact he encounters his fate due to his multicultural ventures starting from Abdullah and ending with Kim. The large scale and endless enmeshing of an individual in post 9/11 politics propound that terrorism is not a regional and temporal and phenomenon, it is a global and a spatial one. Shamsie sketches it by making her readers move from Guantanamo Bay's darkness to the bright sky on the morning of August 9, 1945 which is about to be darkened forever. She compares the destruction of Japan's beauty to that of Iraq or Afghanistan. Time in her novel moves from present to past and vice versa. The enormity of terrorist events is presented through the lens of individuals eyes like Hiroko presenting Nagasaki bombing and its impact on humans. It stifles her love, her life, her country. She being in love finds the day sunny and bright when all of a sudden "the world goes white" (Shamsie 23) with the atomic explosion.

Shamsie indirectly draws a comparison between the enormity of destruction that resulted due to American atomic bombing on Japan and the few deaths in the attacks on the twin towers. If the US has 9/11, this was Japan's 9/8. Shamsie's imagery of the devastation in Nagasaki draws a parallel to ghastly scenarios witnessed after the terrorist bombing of the World Trade Centre: "Only melted rosaries remained," Hiroko describes, "of the people inside the Cathedral" (Shamsie 76); "[t]he next morning I went to the Valley; it was what the priest at the Urakami had spoken of when he taught me from the Bible—the Valley of Death. But there was no sign of any God there, no scent of mangoes...days—no, weeks—after the bomb and everything still smelt of burning" (Shamsie 77).

The Hibakushas, the survivors of the atomic explosion, had to face far reaching effects of the bomb till coming generations. Hiroko has to abort her first child due to a fear of mutation which may be caused by radiation. Even Raza's beloved expresses the same possibility and refuses to marry him. "Nagasaki. The bomb. No one will give their daughter to you in marriage unless they're desperate, Raza. You could be deformed. ... I've seen the pictures. Of babies born in Nagasaki after the bomb" (Shamsie 189).

Shamsie also compares the bloodshed as a result of war on terror in Afghanistan and after Indo-Pak partition. The myth of justified "state terror" is

hence exploded to reveal its politically and economically motivated reality and is shown to be as, if not more, destructive than individual/group acts of terroristic violence. Abdullah recalls when he meets Hiroko in New York: “[f]irst they cut down the trees. Then they put landmines everywhere. Now ... cluster bombs” (Shamsie 311). The defacement of Afghanistan is a direct parallel to the destruction of the beauty of Japan decades ago. Abdullah still wants to live in that Afghanistan which has now been played havoc with by the Americans. This reminds Hiroko of the Japan before World War II.

Depiction of Afghans

Shamsie renders a human touch to Afghans as well. For example, Abdullah’s hatred of the Soviets and his passion to drive the last Soviet out of Afghanistan and the picture of a dead soviet behind the truck he drives is a source of pride for him. Hiroko’s impression of Abdullah changes when she meets him and she find him “a man who understood lost homelands and the impossibility of return” (Shamsie 313). So, she can relate her loss with him. Shamsie does not side with this but presents their sentiments neutrally by counterbalancing the hatred through presenting their hospitality, friendship and warmth. Raza’s presence in the Pashtun inhabited districts of Karachi, while first resisted by Abdullah is soon after welcomed. After his initial reluctance to accept Raza as a friend, Abdullah embraces him as a “brother” by virtue of their alleged common enemy, the Soviets, and will henceforth willingly lay down his life for his “brother’s” safety. This desire to protect Abdullah characterizes Mujahedeen’s thoughts and actions more generally, working as they do within closely-knit and interconnected communities. There is sincerity at work here, which refuses to allow the reader to form undiluted reservations about Abdullah. His conversations with Raza, even when highlighting the assumptions about masculinity and violence in the construction of anti-Soviet nationalism, carry a certain lightness. The novel’s punctuated visits to the Mujahedeen training camps make the readers imagine what develops a jihadist—the terrorist of dominant global discourse. Raza has a perverse fascination with the training camps. When he escapes them, for some time, he experiences guilt. Shamsie uses heaven and hell imagery to indicate the sincere emotions and firmness of the beliefs of men like Abdullah who commit their lives to the cause of jihad to save their land from becoming a hell, the foreign intervention has made it. Shamsie has undertaken research to convey a sympathetic image of the Mujahedeen both in Pakistan and Afghanistan while not ignoring Taliban’s obsession with “fighting infidels and heretics” (Shamsie 320), their banning of sports, music and a healthy lifestyle.

Kim as an American Representative

Kim becomes Hiroko's foil as she fails to see the making of these Mujahedeens. Kim informs police about Abdullah's location because she believes in her training which guides her to eradicate a threat and declines the idea that anti-Muslim attitude is just a prejudice. In this way, she confirms the post 9/11 binaries of centre-periphery. Kim has a strong sense of nationalism and cannot bear the loss of her family. Hiroko on the other hand stands for unprivileged migrancies and can see the negative side of such a sentimental nationalism. She is able to transcend the static national identity as Hiroko tells Kim that such events are just a small part of the bigger picture of the spatial time. It is Kim who makes her realize "how nations can applaud when their governments drop a second nuclear bomb" (Shamsie 362). Hiroko realizes how the strong oppress the weak, through hegemony, globalization and wars. Media plays its role in establishing inaccurate beliefs like that of Kim's. All identity crises (the ones faced by the victims of 9/11 and the ones faced by Afghans in war on terror) result in pain but it is our choice to alleviate them either through positive vision or aggression.

Shadows as a post 9/11 text decodes terror with the help of media and popular discourses after 9/11 by sketching parallel forms of terrorism in the form of state terrorism of the US on Japan, communal terrorism during Indo-Pak partition, neo-imperial terror of the USSR and the US in Afghanistan and post 9/11 terror in Guantanamo Bay. Globalization itself produces terror and enmeshes the third world countries through the American dream and creating aggressive nationalism. Hiroko through her journey faces an identity crisis by finally opting for a cosmopolitan identity, upholding ethical behavior and global responsibility towards each other, while undermining any service to political interests in the name of state or nation or general goodwill. Last but not the least Hiroko and Raza's ability to translate languages symbolically makes the novel a *trans(l/n)ational* (transnational and translational) fiction. Hiroko successfully translates cultures and successfully achieves cosmopolitan identity whereas Raza becomes a victim of shattered identity crisis. Translation of cultures is a solace wherein transnationalism makes identity unstable, helps one rephrase national space, cultural rituals and domestic habitus. It re-forms identity that may bring global ethics to the fore and push global terror to the background.

Conclusion

Shadows writes back to the centre from the Indo-Pak Subcontinent soil, with a

history of colonization, rewriting the havocs that colonization played with the land now called India and Pakistan. The post 9/11 world with the clash of civilization moves beyond post partition/ post colonial era. The post 9/11 world has its tools for discourses and counter discourses i.e., media and state exigencies. The political agenda shapes terrorism for nefarious aims, ignoring human rights as in WWII and post 9/11 intervention in Afghanistan. Through the critique of a transnational ambiguity of belonging and a sense of responsibility, the novel promotes a cosmopolitan vision of shared human responsibility of respecting each-others' rights in an increasingly globalized world. The post 9/11 cosmopolitan world must define itself by successful communication through translating cultures, borders, politics and discourses for upholding rights for fellow human beings beyond any ism. My study concludes that Pakistani fiction has moved beyond standardized postcolonial issues after 9/11 and promotes a post 9/11 cosmopolitan vision in an era where there is a need (a) to bridge gaps between global north and south, (b) to be spatial in approach by using discursive strategies like dialogism, deconstruction or critical analysis of discourse both by readers and writers, (c) to uphold humanity beyond political divisions of first or third worlds or clash of civilizations (d) retain national and regional values by translating cultures and sensitivities. The study recommends more research about a shift from postcolonialism to a post 9/11 cosmopolitanism.

Works Cited

- Anderson, Amanda. *The Way We Argue Now: A Study in the Cultures of Theory*. Course Book ed. Princeton UP, 2009. *Project MUSE* muse.jhu.edu/book/29975.
- Bhabha, Homi K. *The location of culture*. London: Routledge, 2004.
- Boehmer, Elleke, and Stephen Morton, eds. *Terror and the postcolonial: A concise companion*. Malden, MA: John Wiley & Sons, 2010.
- Brennan, Timothy. *At home in the world: Cosmopolitanism now* (Vol. 15). Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 1997.
- Cilano, Cara N. *Contemporary Pakistani Fiction in English: Idea, Nation, State*. New York: Routledge, 2013.
- Delanty, Gerard. "Not all is lost in translation: World varieties of cosmopolitanism." *Cultural Sociology* 8.4 (2014): 374-391. Sage Publications. Web. 13 March 2019.
- Dharwadker, Vinay. *Cosmopolitan geographies: new locations in literature and culture*. New York: Routledge., 2016.
- Featherstone, Mike. "Cosmopolis: An Introduction." *Theory, Culture & Society*, vol. 19, no. 1-2, 2002, pp. 1-16. Sage Publications. Web. 12 February 2019.
- Hartnell, Anna. "Moving through America: Race, place and resistance in Mohsin Hamid's *The Reluctant Fundamentalist*." *Journal of Postcolonial Writing*, 46.3-4 (2010): 336-348. Taylor

- and Francis. Web. 1 March 2019.
- Holton, Robert J. *Cosmopolitanisms: New thinking and new directions*. New York: Palgrave-Macmillan, 2009.
- Jameson, Fredric. "Third-world literature in the era of multinational capitalism." *Social text* 15 (1986): 65-88. jstor. Web. 1 March 2019.
- Khan, Gohar. Karim. The Hideous Beauty of Bird-Shaped Burns—Transnational Allegory and Feminist Rhetoric in Kamila Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows*. *Pakistaniaat: A Journal of Pakistan Studies* 3.2 (2011): 53-68. Pakistaniaat. Web. 20 Nov, 2019.
- Leonard, Philip. *Literature after globalization: Textuality, technology and the nation-state*. London: Bloomsbury, 2013.
- Luburić-Cvijanović, Arijana, and Nina Muždeka. "Salman Rushdie from Postmodernism and Postcolonialism to Cosmopolitanism: Toward a Global (ized) Literature?." *Critique: Studies in Contemporary Fiction* 57.4 (2016): 433-447. Taylor and Francis. Web. 1 January 2019.
- Mignolo, Walter. "The many faces of cosmo-polis: Border thinking and critical cosmopolitanism." *Public Culture* 12.3 (2000): 721-748. Dukeupress. Web. 13 March 2019.
- Perner, Claudia. *US-American inoutside perspectives in globalized anglophone literatures* (Doctoral dissertation, Universität Duisburg-Essen, Fakultät für Geisteswissenschaften» Institut für Anglophone Studien» Literary and Cultural Studies (Literatur-und Kulturwissenschaft (en))» British Literature and Culture), 2011. https://duepublico2.uni-due.de/receive/duepublico_mods_00031698 on 1-7-2018. Web. 15 November 2018.
- Robbins, Bruce. Actually Existing Cosmopolitanism. In *Cosmopolitics: Thinking and Feeling beyond the Nation*, edited by Pheng Cheah and Bruce Robbins, 1-19. London: U of Minnesota P, 1998.
- Roudometof, Victor. "Transnationalism, cosmopolitanism and glocalization." *Current sociology* 53.1 (2005): 113-135. Sage publications. Web. 3 April 2019.
- Shamsie, Kamila. *Burnt Shadows: A Novel*. London: Macmillan, 2009.
- . *Our Dead Your Dead*. The Guardian.. *The Guardian* , Ebook, 2011: Web. 6 June.2019.
- . "Kamila Shamsie on Pakistan, America and the Pitfalls of Plotting" *The Guardian* , 23 March. 2012: Web. 6 June.2019.
- Schoene, Berthold. "Introduction." *The Cosmopolitan Novel*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2009. pp. 1–34. *JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/10.3366/j.ctt1r21tg. Web. 8 Jan. 2020.
- Selden, Raman, Peter Widdowson, and Peter Brooker. *A reader's guide to contemporary literary theory*. New York : Routledge , 2013. Stanton, Katherine. Ethics, politics, and global change in the works of Kazuo Ishiguro, Michael Ondaatje, Jamaica Kincaid, and J.M. Coetzee. New York, NY : Routledge, 2005.
- Vertovec, Steven, and Robin Cohen. Introduction: *conceiving cosmopolitanism*. pp. 1–22. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2002.
- Zinck, Pascal. "Eyeless in Guantanamo: Vanishing Horizons in Kamila Shamsie's 'Burnt Shadows'". *Commonwealth Essays and Studies*. 33.1 (2010). 45-54. Academia. Web. 20 March 2019.