ISSN 1949-8519 (Print)
ISSN 2154-6711 (Online)

Forum for World Literature Studies

世界文学研究论坛 Vol.12 No.3 September 2020

Literature
الأدب
Littérature
Literatura
Литература

Knowledge Hub Publishing Company Limited
Hong Kong • West Lafayette

Forum for World Literature Studies
世界文学研究论坛
Vol.12 No.3 September 2020

Forum for World Literature Studies

Vol.12, No.3, September 2020

Knowledge Hub Publishing Company Limited
Hong Kong · West Lafayette

世界文学研究论坛

2020 年第 3 期

香港 • 西拉法叶

Editorial Board

编委会

Forum for World Literature Studies (Print ISSN: 1949-8519; Online ISSN: 2154-6711), published by Knowledge Hub Publishing Company Limited, is a peer reviewed academic journal sponsored by Zhejiang University and co-edited by Professor Nie Zhenzhao of Zhejiang University, Professor Charles Ross of Purdue University. This journal provides a forum to promote diversity in world literature, with a particular interest in the study of literatures of those neglected countries and culture regions. With four issues coming out every year, this journal publishes original articles on topics including theoretical studies, literary criticism, literary history, and cultural studies, as well as book review articles.

Forum for World Literature Studies accepts submissions in English or Chinese by authors from all over the world. The manuscript is expected to be of about 5000-8000 words and must follow the MLA style. Submission should be made including an abstract of about 200 words, a short biography of the author, and three to five keywords, as well as the main body of the essay. Manuscripts should be sent to: fwlstudies@163.com or fwlsmarket@163.com. Website: http://www.fwls.org.

***The Publisher and Editorial Office Address*:** Knowledge Hub Publishing Company Limited, Hong Kong SAR, China. To subscribe to this journal or purchase any single issue, please contact the editorial office at 6 East Building, Zijingang Campus, Zhejiang University, 866 Yuhangtang Rd, Hangzhou 310058, P.R. China. Tel: +86-571-8898-2010, Email: fwlsmarket@163.com or fwlstudies@163.com.

Forum for World Literature Studies is indexed in ESCI, SCOPUS and also included in the databases of EBSCO, Gale, MLA (MLA International Bibliography) and ABELL (The Annual Bibligraphy of English Language and Literature).

Contents

目　录

Antons Austriņš' Oeuvre in Cultural Context

Alina Romanovska
Institute of Humanities and Social Sciences, Daugavpils University
Vienibas iela 13, Daugavpils, LV-5401, Latvia
Email: alina.romanovska@du.lv

Abstract Literary texts are inextricably linked to the context of the time when they were written — culture, historical, and social situation at a particular time influences writers' consciousness and determines the forms and special features of the content of their literary work, as well as literary work affects the consciousness of society. Therefore, in order to fully understand the peculiarities of a particular author or literary work and their role in literature and culture at that time, the study analyses literary works of the Latvian writer Antons Austriņš (1884 - 1934) in a broader context. This goal defines the specificity of further research and determines its interdisciplinary methodology using theories and schools of a biographical approach, new historicism, structuralism, semiotics, hermeneutics, etc.

The specificity of the late 19th century and early 20th century European culture situation marked by a change of culture paradigms made an essential impact on Austriņš' world perception and determined the peculiarities of his artistic searching. His search for an individual expression makes the writer a part of the existing culture paradigm of his epoch. European culture at that time witnessed the coexistence of two opposed culture types — realism and modernism. In Latvia, their coexistence was especially obvious as features of realism and modernism appeared in the work of almost all younger generation writers. Austriņš' prose in this respect is a typical phenomenon of Latvian literature as it accumulates traits of several culture types. Significantly, the writer's individual spiritual searching (solutions of his personal ethical and aesthetical problems, hesitation between the traditional and decadent values) fostered by the liminal situations of his life are organically related to the changes in the culture situation in general. Therefore, the coexistence of several literary trends and types in Austriņš' prose was determined not only by the culture situation but also his individual life experiences.

Key words Latvian literature; cultural context; modernism; Austriņš,

Author **Alina Romanovska**, Dr.philol., is a researcher of the Centre of Cultural Research of the Institute of the Humanities and Social Sciences at Daugavpils

University, Latvia. Her research interests are comparative literature, Latvian literary history and identity.[1]

Introduction

Each epoch creates its own picture of literary history depending on the dominant features of the world vision, artistic criteria, system of values, etc. Any literary work, irrespective of the artistic value it determines, is an important proof of the existence of a nation, mode of expression of the system of values of a certain epoch and reflection of its identity. In order to develop at present as complete a notion of the past processes of literature development as possible, it is necessary to describe and analyse each, even its smallest segment, and produce a thorough analysis of every writer's work. Jelena Korolova, Zans Badins and Alina Romanovska indicate that

> fiction is an indicator and creator of spiritual search. Depicting their characters' life process in peculiar historical period, writers reproduce not only their own subjective, but also nation's collective understanding of time portrayed from contemporary perspective, subordinating narrative to certain artistic conception. In this respect fiction becomes an extremely important research object. (Korolova, Badins, Romanovska 192)

Sangeeta Vatsa specifies:

> Literature indeed reflects the society, its good values and its ills. In its corrective function, literature mirrors the ills of the society with a view to making the society realize its mistakes and make amends. It also projects the virtues or good values in the society for people to emulate. Literature, as an imitation of human action, often presents a picture of what people think, say and do in the society. (Vatsa 114)

The goal of this research is to study Anton Austriņš' literary work in a broader cultural context, highlighting how processes in culture and politics influenced the writer's work and how the writer and his work contributed to the creation of the

1 This research was supported by Daugavpils University research project "Cultural Memory and Identities of Latvia's Future: Crosspoints of Literature, History and Religion II"(Grant No. 14-95/7).

Latvian national identity.

The research attempts to bring into focus a little-known author whose work reflects an optimistic vision of the world, ability to notice the wondrous and surprising in everyday life matters, paying great attention to details and respect to the Latvian people; his style of writing is marked by an amazing feeling of the language, simplicity, rhythmicity, and musicality. Austriņš' (1884-1934) life was dynamic, varied, adventurous; his character and world view were formed during rough trials and joyful moments. The writer's work possesses significant autobiographical aspects reflecting, to a great extent, his life reality, experiences, and emotions.

The literary legacy of Austriņš is not widely known to contemporary readers, yet it deserves consideration and deeper study as a peculiar phenomenon that in miniature reflects specific features of the literary development of the epoch and presents the ardent searchyiings and original findings of the writer's individual poetic style.

Austriņš' literary oeuvre is versatile, rich, and demands a second thought as to its evaluation; he has produced poetry, short prose fiction, plays, feuilletons, and a novel-chronicle. Beside significant works that possess a constant value in the history of Latvian literature there are works that seem to be doomed to oblivion. Many works by Austriņš, especially those that were written in his mature age, e.g. prose collections *Māras zemē* (In Land of Māra; 1919), *Puiškāns* (The Lad; 1930), *Neievērotie* (The Unnoticed; 1931), poetry collections *Saules grieži* (Equinox; 1923), *Dzīves burvība* (Charm of Life; 1925), *Aizsaule* (The Netherland; 1933), etc., have gained a positive evaluation by the writer's contemporaries. The novel-chronicle *Garā jūdze* (The Long Mile; I - 1926, II, III - 1934) was a well-known literary phenomenon of the epoch that through the lens of subjective experience reveals not only facts of the author's biography but also the twists of the history and culture contexts of the age. Response of the writer's contemporaries testify to the fact that Austriņš' oeuvre was a significant part of the culture process of his time, and this is much more important than his successors' incidental, subjective evaluations determined by the culture values and ideological systems of the following generations. The widespread notion of Austriņš as a second-rate writer is clear evidence of the obscure regularities that guide writing a history of literature with their incidences, subjectivism, and dependence on political and ideological standpoints.

Investigating the intersections of Austriņš' life and writing, major attention is attributed to the writer's work, particularly prose, whereas biographical data are

used along with the characteristics of the historico-cultural picture as additional material for a more detailed understanding of the dominant qualities of the writer's work. The use of a biographical approach, and theories of new historicism, structuralism, semiotics, hermeneutics, etc. determined the scientific style of the research. Awareness in the importance of historical, cultural, literary, and biographical contexts for the understanding of the text forms the conceptual basis of the research.

Special Features of the Cultural Context

In the late 19th century - early 20th century alongside with the traditional values and virtues rooted in traditional experience, the tendencies of foreign culture started to play an important role; fast Europeanization began. Latvian culture becomes open to new foreign trends. The situation in Latvia at that time is specific: the whole of European cultural heritage entered the Latvian culture at the same time; the Latvian cultural consciousness was absorbed in the processes of cognition, compilation, and analysis (acceptance or non-acceptance) of this heritage. Bronislavs Tabūns writes:

> Bright artistic values are created both by Romanticism and Realism. In addition, new trends, which were formed in the literature of bigger nations in the West earlier, start to manifest themselves. In Latvia, this process takes place not replacing the existing type of culture with a new one, but under the conditions of interacting between them, and often even in the works by the same author. (Tabūns 28)

Conceptual changes reflected in Latvian culture, including Austriņš' prose, began in Europe already in the second half of the 19th century, when various trends and movements coexisted complementing each other. In the middle of the 19th century, based on the philosophy of positivism, realism and naturalism coexisted, which is characterized by the appeal to everyday images, emphasizing a person's social and biological determinacy, and highlighting common typical features. The desire to depict real life as it is, is one of the most essential features of this trend. The trend is based on the philosophy of positivism — theoretical views of Auguste Comte, Herbert Spencer, and Hippolyte Adolphe Taine.

Representatives of naturalism focused on and analysed only a person's physiological features without connecting them to spiritual manifestations. In the mid-19th century, ideas about the irrational sphere of the world became relevant and the existence of super-reality (the highest, divine sphere) was again declared a

protest against this one-sided explanation of a person.

The earliest reaction to positivism ideology emerged in France in the mid-19th century: in 1857, Charles Pierre Baudelaire published a collection of poems The Flowers of Evil, which offered a fundamentally new understanding of aesthetic categories and shocked society of that time by its openly expressed protest against philistinism. In the 1880s French symbolists actively made themselves known. In 1886 Jean Moreas published the *Symbolist Manifesto*, in which he advocated "pure poetry" that is not affected by ideology, performs only aesthetic functions, and exists on the principle "art for art's sake" (Barzun). Paul-Marie Verlaine, Jean Nicolas Arthur Rimbaud, etc. create this type of poetry. Symbolism also developed in the German-speaking countries.

In the 1890s a sharp reaction to the positivism ideology arose in England. During the Victorian time, England had a high level of scientific and technical achievements. Aestheticism, with Oscar Wilde being its brightest representative, emerged as a protest against the understanding of a person as a mechanical being. The idea of "art for art's sake" was emphasized, and the category of aesthetic beauty was appealed to as the fight against the reality of life.

Friedrich Wilhelm Nietzsche's philosophy is another vivid example of protests emerged in the second half of the 19th century in Germany. In the late 19th century - early 20th century, views of the German philosopher symbolised a universal protest against existing ethical and aesthetic values. Literary works of many writers of that time should be interpreted in the context of Nietzsche's philosophy. The philosopher observed the decline of European culture and searched for its causes; he proposed the Apollonian and Dionysian concepts as a symbolic reflection of the development of European culture. Nietzsche's contradictory philosophy and the specific artistic character of his works open up a wide range of opportunities for interpretations, which ensured the popularity of his ideas. The emphasis on the Overhuman phenomenon, the idea of the "eternal return", the juxtaposition of the Apollonian and Dionysian concepts, the death of God, the problem of Christianity, etc. are the most significant concepts of Nietzsche's philosophy.

Nietzsche's views are largely in line with the views of another German philosopher Oswald Arnold Gottfried Spengler. In the 1920s his work The Decline of the West (1918) acquired a wide popularity. In his work, the author examined the development of European culture, opposing culture and civilization — there is an unsurmountable gap between them. Spengler spoke about cyclical theories of culture. The philosopher distinguished eight cultures that are mature in their development: Egyptian, Indian, Babylonian, Magic (Arab-Byzantine), Chinese,

Apollonian (Greco-Roman), Faustian (Western European), and Mayan cultures. The existence of these cultures is not a single process in the world history, but the unity of life in the universe. These cultures develop on the basis of the same principle — the rise is followed by the fall; they go through three development stages: pre-culture — culture — civilization. Western European culture is at the final stage of its development, which means its decline. Spengler, as well as Nietzsche and many other authors in the mid-19th century - early 20th century declared the crisis of European culture.

Theoretical views of the French philosopher Henri Louis Bergson also had an immense impact on the changes in perception of time. He countered time with space, emphasizing that time is uninterrupted, while space is interrupted. In the context of the early 20th century literature, there is a fundamental idea of the all-encompassing power of intuition. The artist's intuition which ensures the unity with the origins of the world was especially important.

These philosophical ideas vividly reflected the key concepts for changing culture paradigm in the mid-19th century - early 20th century, and defined the worldview reflected in literary works. In general, in European culture, under the influence of the social and political situation, there was a change in the perception of the world; the ideas of revaluation of values and creation of new ethical and aesthetic priorities dominated.

Changes in European culture in the 19th century marked the change in human consciousness. At that time, European human consciousness shifted from mythological to de-mythological (in realism and naturalism), which in turn is replaced by a neo-mythological (a type of modernist culture) consciousness. Subjective, individual perception of the world is essential for the type of modernist culture. Therefore, an individual myth (an individual version of the world) is created within the framework of neo-mythological consciousness. Modernism developed a number of individual ideas about a supernatural spiritual sphere. In contrast to the linear flow of time, the emphasis was on cyclicity, subjective time, and instantaneous moment. Modernism highlighted a subjective perception of the world and life of an individual soul.

In the second half of the 19th century ideas on the formation of a national state became especially relevant in Latvian culture. Arguments for forming a nation were mainly found in the ideas expressed by National Romanticism. They dwell upon the significance of traditional national material and non-material values for the further development (Kalnačs 23-24). Therefore, a special emphasis was put on the study of folklore, as folklore texts provide evidence of the harmonious ideal past

— the golden era when the nation was united. These forms of historical unity and togetherness were considered the basis for the formation of states and nations (Bula 29-30). The 1905 revolution is a political climax of the processes described, but the establishment of national states in 1918 is their logical conclusion. These political events also had a significant impact on the development of literature and culture.

In the late 19th century - first decades of the 20th century, not only Western European, but also Russian cultural trends were relevant in Latvian culture. It was determined by both the socio-political situation and economic and cultural contacts. In the early 20th century, many Latvian writers of young generation (Viktors Eglītis, Pāvils Gruzna, Fallijs, etc.) studied and lived in St. Petersburg. They established close contacts with Russian symbolists, were actively engaged in the events organised by Russian intelligentsia, and attended their meetings.

Typological similarities as well as genetic contacts — influences and borrowings united Latvian and Russian cultures at that time. At the turn of the century, both Russian and Latvian cultures found themselves in the situation when they were ready to accept European cultural heritage. German, British, French, Polish, and Scandinavian literature provided significant sources for inspiration. Both cultures established modernism paradigms, taking the experience of European culture as a model, and the sources which Latvian and Russian authors address and refer to are similar.

> Not only the geographic proximity of the countries and their common national status determined the parallel development of the two literatures — Latvian and Russian, but mainly it was a great interest in the aesthetic phenomenon of the turn of the century. Authors expressed a special interest in the philosophical ideas of Neocantianism, in the concepts of Schopenhauer, Nietzsche, Bergson, etc., at the same time naturally incorporating problems, themes, and motives of such representatives of symbolism literature as Edgar Poe, Baudelaire, Verlaine, Rimbaud, Maeterlinck, Mallarme, George, Ibsen, Hamsun, Pshibishevsky, Strindberg, etc. in the sphere of their interests. (Sproģe, Vāvere 14)

It is important to mention that Latvian readers became acquainted with the texts by the abovementioned authors in translations made by Russian authors. It determined the specific character of their perception.

The most significant changes in perception of the world are related to ethical and aesthetic concepts of decadence and symbolism in both Russian and Latvian

cultures. Dmitry Merezhkovsky, Konstantin Balmont, Valery Bryusovs, and Vyacheslav Ivanov are the most distinguished representatives and theoreticians of this literary trend. In terms of themes and motives, Russian symbolism is close to Latvian decadence. The idea of a new personality that is free from social determinacy is emphasized; the special attention is on the spiritual life of a person and the focus is on the Dionysian energy; taboo topics are highlighted; authors address erotism, death aestheticization, justification of a physical aspect of a personality, etc. They also experiment with creative forms and genres; descriptions of individual genres become popular (a novel chronicle, a novel myth, a story of a soul, a night book, etc.), which contributes to the active use of cultural citations and creates dialogue, metaphorization, and ambiguity.

When new trends enter into Latvian literature, emphasising of a "foreign" text becomes essential. There are works based on dialogues — intertextual citations and reminiscence links. A new literary paradigm is created and implemented by such authors as Edvards Virza, Jānis Akuraters, Pāvels Grūzna, Linards Laicens, Eduards Vulfs, Valdemārs Dambergs, Viktors Eglītis, Haralds Eldgasts, Fallijs and others, known as decadent and/or symbolists in the history of Latvian literature. Austriņš is also included in this list of authors. The over excessive use of citations often negatively affects the artistic quality of texts, and does not allow realizing a concept comprehensively. Therefore, many young authors who strive to perceive and implement in their works all the latest trends of European literature attract sharp criticism and irony from the adherents of traditional ethic and aesthetic values (Jansons-Brauns 40).

Open and conscious use of artistic facts from other cultures, inclusion of cultural citations and reminiscences in texts, as well as demonstrative reference to the author of the borrowed text are characteristic features of Latvian decadence and symbolism. A literary scientist Vāvere believes that

> a conscious reference to a certain cultural layer is a common phenomenon in literary works at different times. However, it is mostly revealed in the form of hidden citations, reminiscences, stylistic borrowings. In this sense, it seems that the initial stage of modernism, where all references were demonstratively referred to in the text, is a unique phenomenon in the history of literature. (Vāvere 300-301)

Researchers relate the use of a "foreign" text which is a characteristic feature of symbolism and decadence to the artistic principles of symbolism: firstly, the

conceptual meaning of symbols in the works of art and the nature of a symbol, mainly its polysemy which provides the explanation of one meaning through another; secondly, theoretical principles of symbolism, namely, the theory of panaestheticism declared by them, that is, the idea of the aesthetic as the deepest meaning in the world, whose transformation is linked to the active aestheticizing of life (Vāvere).

Despite the rapid entry of foreign literature trends, it should be noted that a tradition rather than an experiment prevails both in Latvian and Lithuanian literature in the early 20th century. Researchers admit that this situation was determined by the fact that literature in these countries was very young and could not afford to be in opposition to the old, as the aesthetic structures which were considered traditional and traditional literary paradigms had not yet established (Vecgrāvis 186, Berelis 41).

World Culture Contexts and a Biographical Element in Austrinš' Oeuvre

Latvian literature in the early 20th century featured characteristics of realism and naturalism as well as impressionism and modernism. Austrinš' talent as a writer was formed in the situation of interaction between culture types and trends. His spiritual crisis, existential fears, his feeling of unfreedom resonated with the ethical and aesthetical paradigm of decadence and art system of symbolism. Being engaged in the processes of changing the European culture paradigm and actively responding to the latest trends, nevertheless, Austriņš strived to incorporate his individual perception of the world in his texts, and to create and preserve his specific identity.

Austriņš may not have known theoretical views of early modernists, symbolists, etc. in detail. However, he could get acquainted with them through Latvian decadent and Russian symbolists. Therefore, being aware of the processes undergoing in the cultural space of that time, Austriņš partly intuitively, partly consciously applied relevant artistic techniques and included popular cultural texts in his prose.

Despite the fact that Austriņš supported decadent experiments, especially at early stages of his literary work, he willingly involved ideas and works of Latvian authors in his texts, although much less frequently than texts of European literature. Among Latvian classical poets, Austriņš always greatly respected Poruks and Rainis (Ērmanis 27). Austriņš also highly appreciated Rūdolfs Blaumanis, who inspired his development as an author at the beginning of his literary career. Blaumanis' influence can be seen in Austriņš' several realistic short stories.

Russian culture texts had a significant impact on Austriņš' artistic consciousness. To a large extent, it was determined by the writer's biography: his studying at

the parish school was in Russian, and his studies and life in St. Petersburg contributed to his knowledge of Russian culture. In addition, Austriņš' trips to St. Petersburg, Moscow, and Novgorod during the years of runaway provided him with new nuances in the perception of Russian everyday culture.

Russian culture was subjectively close to Austriņš: he translated works by Ivan Turgenev, Leo Tolstoy, Dmirty Merzhkovsky, Valery Bryusov, etc. into Latvian language. It should be noted that Russian was the only foreign language which Austriņš was fluent in and he could read complex philosophical texts in this language. Therefore, the Latvian writer's ideas of the culture phenomena in Western Europe, Scandinavia, and America were mainly formed through Russian culture. Russian culture provided Austriņš with an important source for inspiration as well as enabled his connections with the European culture heritage.

In both periods of his oeuvre, the structure and conception of the world model created in Austriņš' prose reveal features of both realism and modernism. The characteristic traits of modernism in his works are the depiction of the world as having two spheres (the actual and the transcendent, supra-real), foregrounding the individual's subjective experience, formation of an individual version and a new myth of the world. Traits of modernism in Austriņš' prose works appear not only at the level of ideas but also in their structure, e.g. story *Čaikovska kvartets* (Chaikovsky's Quartet) attempts at synthesizing regularities of music and literature, novel-chronicle *Garā jūdze* (The Long Mile) is a specific sample of merging genres of a chronicle and a novel that in its fragmented structure reflects the peculiarities of modern human's thinking.

The second period of Austriņš' creative work is usually treated by critics in connection with realism as it lacks militant decadence but acknowledges life values and traditional morality. At this stage Austriņš is no longer bound by decadence experiments; he reduces the use of cultural citations and does not very often mention names of foreign authors; the evidence of vital power and joy for every moment lived replaces pessimism and ideas of death, the desire to describe everything seen and felt in real life by depicting the everyday beauty of life and paying attention to subtle seemingly insignificant details becomes relevant. Some of Austriņš' stories are bright samples of realistic narrative. However, the peculiarities of the world model in his works testify to the fact that also in the second period of his work the writer preserves features of a world picture characteristic of modernism. Refraining from decadence and symbolism, Austriņš started creating works that were related to the trend of acmeism. Both in his poetry and short prose he emphasized the poetics of everyday life and depicted seemingly insignificant details both in prose and poet-

ry, cultivating the language, searching for bright archaic words, dialect words, thus trying to make his images vital and sensual, at the same time not losing the simplicity of narration and language. The writer regards as important the awareness of the applied worth of the world, precision and clarity of the poetic word, definiteness of the image, highlighting the beauty of reality and everyday life. Turning to the genre of sketch made it possible for the writer to merge harmoniously detailed factography with emotionality and subjectivity, as a result forming a reality based subjectively emotional world picture.

Austriņš' oeuvre manifests both features of realism and modernism, national Latvian and generally human and cosmopolitan values. His works possess original poetics and reveal a peculiar world vision that has been developed from the writer's personal experience. Austriņš' oeuvre is a specific phenomenon in Latvian literature that brings out a bond with the popular culture concepts of the early 20th century: he extensively applies the autobiographical mode of writing, depicts the schisms of the modern personality's consciousness and search for a new and better personality, focuses on the issues of relations among nature, culture, and civilization, highlights the subjectivism and emotionality of the world perception.

The autobiographical text based on the description of rural Latvia is the brightest feature of Austriņš' oeuvre, especially in the second period of his literary work. The beginning and creation of Latgale's text is the writer's significant contribution to Latvian literature. Antons Austriņš was one of the first Latvian writers who showed Latgale in his literary texts. Since 1909, his first visit to Latgale, the author paid special attention to the study of this region's features; he participated in the meetings with Latgale's culture experts, collected newspaper articles on Latgale, wrote down dialect words, created a collection of Latgalian toponyms and proper names. Alina Romanovska writes that "it is Latgale that Austriņš connected the origins of Latvian people and the idea of spiritual revival to" (Romanovska 52). Austriņš's contemporaries had a critical attitude towards his commitment to and idealization of Latgale, as this region in the consciousness of Latvia's people had an image of an uneducated and undeveloped province. Reviewers believed that Latgale in the works by Austriņš was too idealized (Paegle,1920; Sudrabkalns, 1919; Virza, 1930). Romanovska believes that "Austriņš created nostalgia for the harmonious past using the image of Latgale and he associated it with the origins of the national identity" (Romanovska 132). Austriņš' personal experience determined his subjective approach, as in Latgale he felt at home and safe. There is also an important ideological and political subtext in the idealized creation of the Latgalian text: Austriņš attempted to include the Latgalian region in the single image of Latvia.

This played an important role before the establishment of the independent state and during first years of its existence, as Austriņš made Latgale close and interesting for Latvian readers.

With his search for the ways of individual expression, the writer is organically included in the general culture situation in Europe as well as in Latvia. Two opposite culture types — realism and modernism continue to exist in European culture, and their specific coexistence is also observed in Austriņš' oeuvre. A person's subjective experience is foregrounded in the structure of the author's world model and he creates an individual worldview (this is vividly expressed in the author's late collections of short stories *Māras zemē,* and *Puiškans*), while his attention to the description of details is the evidence of the features of realism.

Conclusion

Austriņš uses in his works the most widespread and popular early 20th century world culture codes and texts, yet selects them and adjusts to his own individual world perception. The subjective in Austriņš' prose dominates over the supra national. He has used literary images of foreign writers as metaphors, allusions, or culture citations very fruitfully. Important sources of inspiration that have influenced the formation of Austriņš' worldview are found in Latvian, Russian, Italian, Spanish, German and other cultures. However, such intertextuality, an interplay of various culture citations, is not self-sufficient, the writer is not carried away by intertextual games; what matters more is the revelation of the individual experience in texts. Not refraining from the inclusion of autobiographical motifs and details in his works and the foregrounding of his subjective worldview make Austriņš' oeuvre a unique phenomenon of the literature of his time.

Regarding the presence of European culture paradigms in Austriņš' prose, there emerge two different stages in his works. The first is the period of decadence (approximately till 1910), the second is the stage of recognizing the traditional moral values (1910 - 1934). Highlighting the world culture text in his prose works is more characteristic of the first period of Austriņš' writing. During this period, he uses abundant citations, refers to the foreign authors' names popular at that time and current ideas of the turn of the centuries. Causes for such an approach in the poetics of prose works are related both to subjective reasons and the specificity of the general culture situation. Firstly, the writer's identity at that time was under the process of formation, he had not defined his mode of expression yet, therefore was just searching for justification of his ideas in texts by other authors. Secondly, an essential feature of Latvian culture situation at that time was familiarization with the culture

of other nations. During the second period of his writing, Austriņš emphasizes autobiographical text and subjective world perception to a greater extent and strives to position himself not as "one among others" but as an independent individuality. Being included into the culture trends of his time and reflecting current processes in society, Austriņš balances between realism and modernism and searches for new forms of expression. During his short artistic life, he went through several stages of development — decadence, symbolism, realism, and acmeism — and he found his individual modernism style in prose and poetry. Austriņš develops and forms the collective consciousness of Latvian society by emphasizing and individually interpreting significant texts of Latvian culture (the 1905 revolution text, Latgale text, Piebalga text, etc.).

Works Cited

Barzun, Jacque. *From Dawn to Decadence: 1500 to the Present. 500 Years of Western Cultural Life*. New York: HarperCollins, 2000.

Berelis, Guntis. *Latviešu literatūras vēsture: no pirmajiem rakstiem līdz 1999. gadam*. Rīga: Zvaigzne ABC, 1999.

Bula, Dace. *Dziedātājtauta. Folklora un nacionālā ideoloģija*. Rīga: Zinātne, 2000.

Ērmanis, Pēteris. "Antons Austriņš atmiņu atspulgā." *Paziņu portreti*. Linkolna, Nebraska: Gauja, 1986. 27.

Jansons—Brauns, Jānis. *Fauni vai klauni?: piezīmes par mūsu jaunāko rakstniecību*. Pēterburga: [b.i.], 1908.

Kalnačs, Benedikts. *Baltijas postkoloniālā drama*. Rīga: LU Literatūras, folkloras un mākslas institūts. 2011.

Korolova, Jelena, Badins Zans, Romanovska, Alina. "The Soviet Period Everyday Life Narrative in Contemporary Latvian Culture." *3nd International Multidisciplinary Scientific Conference on Social Sciences & Arts SGEM 2016, Conference Proceedings*, Book 3, Albena, Bulgaria. 2016. 191-198.

Paegle, Leons. "Par tēlojumiem *Māras zemē*." *Taurētājs*, 2. burtnīca, 1920. 59.

Romanovska, Alina. "Nostalgia and National Identity: Idea of Revisiting the Past in Latvian Fiction." *Respectus Philologicus*. 2020. 37 (42).127-136.

Romanovska, Alina. "The Search for Regional Identity: Latgale in Latvian Literature in the First Decades of the 20th Century." *Forum for World Literature Studies*. 11. 1 (2019): 39-62.

Sproģe, Ludmila, Vāvere, Vera. *Latviešu modernisma aizsākumi un krievu literatūras „sudraba laikmets*. Rīga: Zinātne. 2002.

Sudrabkalns, Jānis. "Par tēlojumiem *Māras zemē." Latvijas Sargs*. 1919. 202,

Tabūns, Broņislavs. *Modernisma virzieni latviešu literatūrā.* Rīga: Zinātne. 2003.

Vatsa Sangeeta. “Literature is the Mirror of Society but Must Be Able to See the Mirrored.” *International Journal of English Literature, Language and Humanities*. 4. 3 (2016): 115-124.

Vāvere, Vera. “Haralds Eldgasts un viņa romāns (1882 - 1926).” *Eldgasts H. Zvaigžņotās naktis.* Rīga: Valters un Rapa. 1999. 300-301.

Vecgrāvis, Viesturs. “Latviešu literatūra no 1890. līdz 1905. gadam.” *Latviešu literatūras vēsture.* I. sēj. Rīga: Zvaigzne ABC. 1998-186.

Virza, Edvards. “Antons Austriņš.” *Laikmeta dokumenti*. Rīga: Zemnieka Domas, 1930. 124.

Expressions of Aesthetic Cosmopolitanism in Latvian Modernist Prose (1930s)

Ilze Kacane
Institute of Humanities and Social Sciences, Daugavpils University
Vienibas iela 13, Daugavpils, LV-5401, Latvia
Email: ilze.kacane@du.lv

Abstract Latvian literature of the interwar period, the 1920s - 1930s, developed concurrently with European literature, attempting to acquire new ideas and forms of expression and customize the "alien" impulses into "one's own" cultural and literary space. In the 1930s, modernistic trends in Latvian literature coexisted with those antipodal literary tendencies which belonged to the national ideology-based literature of positivism. The paper is aimed at analysing the expressions of aesthetic cosmopolitanism in the Latvian literature of the 30s of the twentieth century focusing on the works by the representatives of the second generation of modernists for whom irony was one of the most important features of cosmopolitanism. The expressions of aesthetic cosmopolitanism incorporated in Latvian modernists' prose works are traced via analysing cosmopolitan style. Among various dimensions of cosmopolitan style, the representation of detachment, treatment of the world as a source of pleasures, and cosmopolitan outlooks, experiences, values have been observed. Irony in Latvian modernists' works of the 1930s is revealed via both allusions to untypical personalities of West European cosmopolitan writers and literary characters — strangers — who are striving to become cosmopolitan. Searching for an innovative form and style, modernists engaged in a "cosmopolitan conversation" with "cosmopolitan aesthetes" preventing the national literature from provincialism. The research has been carried out by applying cultural-historical method, content analysis and structural-semiotic method.

Key words cosmopolitanism; aesthetic; modernists; creativity; irony; global culture

Author **Ilze Kacane**, Dr. philol., is a senior researcher at the Institute of Humanities and Social Sciences at Daugavpils University (Latvia) and Head of the Centre of Cultural Research within the Institute. She is an expert of the Latvian Council of Science in the commission "Humanities and Arts" in the research area "Linguistics and Literary Science" and in the commission "Social Sciences" in the research

area "Sociology and Social Work." Her methodological expertise lies in cultural studies, comparative literature, mainly West-European (British) and Latvian literary contacts; she is the editor of *Journal of Comparative Studies*, the author of one monograph (*Oscar Wilde. Latvian 'Oscariana'*, 2015) and more than 100 research articles. She has broad experience in the implementation of national and international research projects. Currently she is involved in the Horizon 2020 project *Cultural Heritage and Identities of Europe's Future* (CHIEF) funded by the European Commission (2018 - 2021).[1]

Introduction

Traditionally a cosmopolitan has been described as being "the citizen of the world", however since its classic Greek origins through the Enlightenment till nowadays, it has been approached as the alternative to a nationalist and a manifestation of an individualist (Kacane, "Interpretations…"). In today's world, every person is a cultural cosmopolitan to a greater or lesser extent as a cosmopolitan will includes engagement with cultural diversity and embracing cultural differences (Patell).

During the recent decades, the analysis of cultural globalization has been carried out most often within the sociological and anthropological discourse focusing on different cosmopolitan perspectives and undertaking the attempts of redefining cosmopolitanism (Hannerz). Based on such studies, the mixing of cultures is not a new phenomenon, on the contrary, it is a natural event and a rule (Beck), moreover in mixing and re-packing of cultures it is possible to see expressions of cosmopolitanism, "This might be a weak expression of cosmopolitanism but, depending on the degree of self-transformation that results, it may also take a stronger form. Recognition of the perspective of the other is the key to cosmopolitanism and it makes little sense speaking of cosmopolitanism if this is absent" (Delanty 220).

The idea of cosmopolitan interaction may include dialogic perspectives (Beck; Nava), a polylogue, or "a conversation across boundaries" (Appiah). Due to the imperfection of both individuals and nations, the engagement in "cosmopolitan conversations" is required since such "communications" not only test one's own ideas, but also lead to openness and cultural shifts, "Being cosmopolitan doesn't mean that you're well-travelled, eat all kinds of different cuisines, or enjoy a variety of highbrow cultural forms: it means that you […] see difference as an opportunity for personal growth" (Patell). The idea of "growth" refers also to the development of

1 This research was supported by Daugavpils University Research "Cultural Memory and Identities of Latvia's Future: Crosspoints of Literature, History and Religion II"(Grant No.14-95/7).

one's own culture and literature, which due to the lack of cultural contacts may fall into the prolonged period of stagnation.

Interaction and blending of cultures are not features typical only of today, but are characteristic also of previous centuries and decades, which reveal themselves in genetic or typological influences of cultural attributes and units, in borrowings and affinities, i.e. in "permutation of diversity" created in the result of seeking for innovative expression forms and styles.

In time, when national cultures, preserving their uniqueness and specific features, start voluntarily accepting "alien" borrowings, transnational or global cultural and art elements penetrate into "one's own" cultural space. Thereby, in the result of cultural cosmopolitism, the development of culture, including literature, is enhanced. Society's orientation towards openness or a counter-reaction against the existing seclusion and monoculture is considered to be an imitative process "through which local cultures follow globally disseminated models of creativity and lifestyle practices, perceived as representing the forefronts of modernity" (Regev 30). Literature not only depicts cosmopolitan aspirations such as human's desire for travel and staying/living in a global community, but represents a variety of cosmopolitan impulses embedded in a literary text by the writers' cosmopolitan imagination.

Modernist literature originated in great metropolises (places for cultural and literary experimentation) and by the production of diverse multifaceted creative forms it has been defined as cosmopolitan (Marshik 12). There are two basic streams of cosmopolitanism: geographical cosmopolitanism (international travel) and the aesthetic cosmopolitanism of impressionism and decadence (Walkowitz). The concept "aesthetic cosmopolitanism", which falls into a broader discourse of a cultural cosmopolitanism and is treated as "the realm of practices and products involving creative labour" (Regev 28) (i.e. literary imagination), more and more frequently is being analysed within the frame of the Cosmopolitan theory. According to the Cosmopolitan theory, aesthetic cosmopolitanism pays attention to the cosmopolitan style, narrative forms, and a concept of a "stranger", i.e. types and variants of cosmopolitans. Cosmopolitan style may include such dimensions as representation of new locations (cosmopolitan geographies), depictions of international and metropolitan settings, cosmopolitan circles and groups, imagined conditions of national and transnational affiliation, as well as detachment from social concerns, treatment of the world as a source of pleasures (Bohemianism), and cosmopolitan outlooks, experiences, values.

The issue of cosmopolitanism has been one of the concerns in Victorian studies, specifically related to the late Victorian literature where on the threshold of

Modernism literary Aestheticism originated. The basic entity characterizing Aestheticism is a complete detachment of art from life. The subjective interpretation of art as a world view marked the shift in artistic landmarks and manifested itself as a protest against the objective perception of art dictated by positivism. A typical feature of literary aestheticism is searches for ways of making the form and style of expression more emphatic as well as "seeking signs of beauty" (Ellmann 151-152). Aestheticism as "an affirmation of a sensuous life" includes such values as negation, irony and cosmopolitan detachment that are instrumental defensive forms of aesthetic subjectivity (Eastham, "Aesthetic…" 214). Moreover, "Aestheticism was the site of a conflict between an ideal of sensuous aesthetic embodiment and the striving for irony, cosmopolitan detachment, and abstraction […]" (Eastham, "Aesthetic…" 80).

1.

In the 20s - 30s of the twentieth century, there developed a trans-national or cosmopolite type of writers in the world. These writers, who represented a geographical cosmopolitism, travelled more than the previous generations had done and described everything they had seen in their works, trying to embrace the whole world. The aesthetic cosmopolitism, in turn, began as a phenomenon of the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth century and was related to the tradition of Modernism (Tabūns), when influences of writers-modernists started to widely circulate among other national literatures and became cosmopolitan borrowings.

The change of a European cultural paradigm on the turn of the century made an essential impact on Latvian writers' artistic consciousness and features of their creative seeking. Among the numerous and diverse literary impulse givers, creative work and personalities of cosmopolitan writers (O. Wilde, G. D'Annuncio a.o.) became an integral part in writings of both the representatives of Latvian early modernistic (decadence) literature (the beginning of the twentieth century) and the younger generation modernists (1930s) as well. If Latvian early modernists projected the synthesis of decadence, symbolism, modernism and other modern phenomena, as well as brought to the foreground human's (artist's in particular) individuality and inner freedom within the context of art autonomy, then the next generation of modernists continued their seeking in the field of style, composition and content, reflecting also their aspirations after cosmopolitan spirit.

After the proclamation of national independence (1918), building up of international contacts and moving towards European culture were high priorities of the independent state. Active literary experiments and attempts to get rid of heaviness

dominating in literature of that time enhanced the enrichment of Latvian literature, and this, in turn, helped to identify what was specifically national. This period "opened the door to foreign ideas, so that by exploring and fighting against them to uncover the secrets of art trade, mission and opportunities" (Eglītis, "Pēdējais…" 65), as well as to learn "a more exquisite taste, simplicity and melodiousness" (Ādamsons, "Jaunākā…" 527). In the 1930s, modernistic trends in Latvian literary situation coexisted with those antipodal literary tendencies which belonged to the national ideology-based literature of positivism where emphasis on Latvian values was placed, and coincided with the period of Kārlis Ulmanis' authoritarian regime (1934 - 1940) in the history of Latvia.

During the time of national positivism, cosmopolitanism was characterized as a widespread phenomenon in Europe and was assessed as a threat to Latvian national values and to the development of national self-confidence. The national political ideology, based on preserving Latvianness as the basic national value ("Not to become russianised, not to become germanised, but remain the Latvians" (Zanders 6)), determined the multiple interpretation of aesthetic cosmopolitism. During the authoritarian regime, a cosmopolite was defined as "a citizen of the universe", "representative of the past time", "spiritual tramp and good-for-nothing", and "a human unwanted in life", while the "orientation" to the East or to the West, in literature too, was considered "an illness which our intellectuals should recover from" (Brastiņš 40). The importance of preserving Latvianness in the native country and also while staying/living in an alien cultural space was emphasized in a political as well as cultural and literary discourse. In some discussions, especially when re-evaluating the nineteenth century "cosmopolites" (e.g. K. Valdemārs), education was considered an opportunity for cancelling the negative marking, namely, a dividing line was drawn between an educated and uneducated cosmopolite, underlining that an educated cosmopolite is aware of the necessity for the interaction and development of culture in the society.

Clashes of opinion between the traditionalists and the cosmopolites could be observed even among the circles of close colleagues, which the analysis of periodicals, critique and private correspondence testifies to. Thus, for instance, unlike many of her contemporaries, the writer, translator and thinker Zenta Mauriņa (1897 - 1978) did not live only in the world of Latvian culture and was considered a cosmopolite both in Latvia of the 1930s and later in emigration. In the Soviet cultural space, she was fiercely criticized as being a "petty bourgeois cosmopolite" (Krauliņš 1072). The writer and painter Anšlāvs Eglītis (1906 - 1993), representative of the second generation of writers-modernists, is also characterized as a cosmopolite,

however this is not so much due to the geographical cosmopolitism (he was a refugee from 1944), but rather due to his personality and his world outlook, which has undoubtedly made and impact on his creative work too:

> He is an Englishman as to his clothes: nothing too elegant, nothing that would be too small or uncrumpled. He is a Greek as to his revelry — everything in moderation. He is a Frenchmen as to showing off in the society: *galanto, nonchalance, esprit.* And he is a Latvian by his internal structure — persistent and composed." (Zirnītis 26).

The more rapid and stronger the economic development of the state is, bringing to the foreground the dominant of utilitarianism and practicality, the more active the polemics with it is. Despite the serious conflict between the conservative views of that period society and avant-garde seeking of Modernism art, the 30s of the twentieth century in Latvian literature are a productive period when creativity, diversity, irony, and striving for freedom in art indicate to the presence of expressions of cosmopolitanism.

2.

The creative work of the younger and talented generation of Latvian modernists excels in the elegance of its "texture", where the fluency of the plot obeys the subtle touch of writer's hand.

As a counter-reaction to a literary positivism and to a precise depiction of life in art, under the influence of foreign writers, in Latvia thrive irony, playful scepticism and an elegant style. Dissociating themselves from art as performing the function of implementing political and social ideas, the younger literary generation is united in demonstrating certain anarchism, searches for a peculiar artistic expression and ways of imparting aestheticism to art, which are able to "derange the traditional, the generally accepted and create an effect of surprise, or even shock the society to some extent" (Smilktiņa, "Īsās…" 132). "Art for art's sake" and the idea about art as a creator of aesthetic delight, the same as at the beginning of the century, become important for the young modernists, often called hooligans and pessimists in literature. By employing the means of the "universal language" of Modernism and "cosmopolitan art" they reveal an individualized world perception.

Detaching themselves from specific time, they devote their works to the portrayal of the irrationally mysterious or Bohemian world, thus continuing the literary tradition of early modernists with a differently marked and nuanced stylistics —

individually original manner of writing full of easiness, wit and elegance, having elements of a delicately hidden irony. The creative work of these writers exhibits not only a specifically shaped artistic space typical of Modernism aesthetics, but also a human who is "quite an ambitious and simultaneously estranged personality" (Smilktiņa 239).

Aspiration for what is extravagant is a typical feature of literary characters created by young Latvian modernists. "[A] Latvian-cosmopolite, exposed to the influences of the world around him, is treated as a "self-made" man and is described with irony in Latvian writers' works of this genre in the 1930s, as for example, Jūlijs Pīpkalējs in A. Eglītis' work "Vāravs"" (Kacane, "Interpretations…" 200). The protagonist of A. Eglītis' story "Vāravs" (1936; first published in the magazine *Daugava*, 1934) is a young and ambitious poet who pursues a goal of his life to transform from an unimportant common man into a widely popular poet, from a simple city snob into an aristocrat. He takes the opportunity provided by his working place to attend all Riga cinemas free of charge, and while watching films, travels in his imagination, merging with the heroes from the refined and rich world he sees on the screen, and feels a burning desire to withdraw from both his dull past and mundaneness of the full-of-care present. When he imitates the film heroes' weary indifference and elegant posture, a "cosmopolite's smirk" appears on his face. Just the desire to adopt a relaxed posture and a face expression, in which the author ironically emphasizes "cosmopolite's spleen", indicate to imitation or to a "nice cosmopolite" wearing a mask. Consequently, cosmopolitanism is related to "aristocratism", elegance, dandyism and freedom, towards which the representatives from a creative world strive in their imagination. Spleen, ennui, and melancholia embody seeking for distraction in elegance. The list of cosmopolites' or "universal people's" desires mentioned also in the Latvian periodicals of the 1930s includes several cross-national features: "English coat", "German tongue", French manners", "Slavic scope", which testify not only to individual, but symbolically also cultural strivings to universalism (Kacane, "Interpretations…").

In the consciousness of the representatives of cosmopolitan aestheticism as well as in the artistic world of writers-romanticists, irony most frequently is related to brain games, where speaking ironically about the real world the reality of the ideal world is emphasized. Modern intellectuals cannot perceive irony unequivocally as an absolute negation of a definite situation, but as creative seeking for a new reality. In a literary work, irony replaces finiteness with the infiniteness, since it is "the only sign of the infinity of 'the divine' and finite world (Fedorov 109). According to Friedrich Schlegel, irony is a form of parody, since irony combines two prime origin

sources — both the negation and creation of a new world —, which simultaneously are the principal features of a paradox:

> At negating the established general truth, a paradox opposes to it a different—new—truth; it puts a stamp of relativity on the object; a paradox demonstrates diverse levels of cognition, different stages in understanding the truth (Fedorov 106).

For the protagonists of literary works created by Latvian authors — artists and "queer people" entailed with art world —, beauty, relish and a pose are part and parcel of their life, and in literary works this is manifested through multiform and multi-plural depictions of domestic and art objects and their integration into the rhythmic frame, thereby making them means of expressing irony and satire. The list of interests — dances, songs, flowers, books, temples, wines — of the hero in the story "Seši Brīnumi" [The Six Miracles] by Eriks Ādamsons (1907 - 1946) reminds of inconsistently rich interests of both the eccentric aesthete Jean des Esseintes in the novel *À Rebours* (1884) by the French writer Joris-Karl Huysmans (1848 - 1907) and Dorian Gray in the novel *The Picture of Doran Gray* (1890/1891) by the Irish-born British writer Oscar Wilde's (1854 - 1900). E. Ādamons' character Emīls Aivars, the protagonist of the story "Dzeltenā roze" [The Yellow Rose] — an aesthete and seeker for love —, who, strolling through city streets, wanders into the magnificently rich space of a church, is also fascinated by the unseen beauty of different visible things. However, quite frequently the breathtaking beauty and frightening ugliness and mystery get synthesized in young modernists' works with the aim to demonstrate the inconstancy of human consciousness and chaos of the epoch.

In works by Latvian authors, the objects of a domestic space most often are revealed within the context of social caricature. In the descriptions of spatial structures given by E. Ādamsons and A. Eglītis, things and objects succeed in long lists, thus testifying to the density of a material world so typical of a poetic perception. For instance, in E. Ādamsons' and A. Eglītis' works, protagonists' inner feelings and emotional experience are disclosed through the descriptions of spaces and attributes in them, and the protagonist's portrayal is ironical and full of banter. Consequently, the Latvian authors create both the images of a person — aesthete who is an estranged personality and the spatial structures which are chaotic or full of material maze, revealing the oddity of human mind in a modern epoch. Bohemianism and Epicureanism, being the expressions of aesthetic cosmopolitanism, are also revealed via the spatial structures that characterize Bohemian way of life. The space of a

tavern is a peculiar underground/death island, where among the decadent attributes — the mist of intoxicating tobacco smoke and drinks — not only strangled street-walkers and stabbed cocaine users can be found, this place is regularly attended by the beauty seekers and worshippers as well.

Oriental motifs, images and attributes are woven into the descriptions of the external image of a human and material world — human ears are transparent like Chinese porcelain (Eglītis, "Fortinbrass" 168), theatre director's body drawn nearer to the Tatar khan and Turkish sultan is like "two pyramids", the nose glitters like "a pearl in a shell" (Ibid. 180). In the arrangement of spatial structures, the writer, the same as representatives of British Aestheticism, uses several Oriental natural and every-day life elements — a reed curtain like a picture shows Chinese landscapes and dragons (Ibid. 155). The use of such comparisons testifies to the fact that modernists, striving to manifest their aesthetic cosmopolitanism, stray to the exotic ancient cultures (China, Japan) "whose impressionistic art is close and kindred to them" (Klaustiņš 444).

Thus, a literary cosmopolite is a wanderer experiencing perpetual haste in the result of "neurosis of the epoch" — cosmopolitanism. Latvian writers depict their characters as detached and anxious people in "cosmopolitan strivings" and being under the impact of fragmentariness and perpetual kaleidoscope.

Conclusion

In Latvia, under the influence of the ideology of positivism in the 1930s, the idea of cosmopolitism is generally juxtaposed with the idea of national unity. Cultural cosmopolitanism and cosmopolitan art — the modern artists and writers, as well as their literary works aiming at transforming the culture from traditional to anti-traditional, from national to modern and cosmopolitan, — have made a significant investment in the circulation of the idea of cosmopolitanism.

Although bearing the Gallic "trademark", the "mobility" of Modernism ensured its cosmopolitan ethos. Striving towards cosmopolitanism by Latvian modernists of the 1930s was a manifestation of distancing from and reaction against provincialism and it was displayed by the attempts of "aesthetic inventiveness" and openness to foreign influences. The second generation of Latvian modernists, having a cosmopolitan outlook and being the developers of modern and psychological story and novella (and translators of works by well-known West European writers as well), focuses in their works on depicting a human of a transitional period, rendered by inherent contradictions or human's "delicate ailments". Striving and searching for an innovative form and style, modernists placed human's impetuous-

ness and heightened emotionality within the frame of irony and wit, and engaged in a "cosmopolitan conversation" with "cosmopolite aesthetes" moving towards the aestheticization of art and representation of the spirit of Modernism, thus preventing the national literature from having an air of provincialism. By capturing a dialogic aspect, Latvian writers of the new modernist generation created a specific expression of Modernism: being themselves aesthetic cosmopolitans they ironically interpreted cosmopolitanism as "a neurosis of the epoch". Thanks to the aesthetic game of young Latvian modernists, the borders of the artistic world got expanded, destroying the predictability and routine in literature of a national positivism period determined by the epoch.

Literary aspects of cosmopolitanism stimulated a self-reflexive exploration of not only an individual, but also of the collective and of the national consciousness revealing that cosmopolitanism and patriotism are not contradictory concepts and that one can be a cosmopolitan without disassociating oneself from the national. "Conversations across boundaries" and dialogism in motion make a cultural space "a changeable reality" since "any cultural space falls within a wider cultural context characterized by an informed choice of specific cultural values and models" (Kacane, "Reception…" 82). Thus, cosmopolitanism in this sense, is related to the capacity for cultural and literary self-transformation.

The Soviet occupation in 1940 and the beginning of World War II interrupted the efforts of Latvian modernists of the 1930s. In Latvia, during the period of Soviet ideological repressions, "cosmopolitans" were citizens who were ill-disposed towards the Soviet power — marginals, including representatives of intelligentsia of "aesthetic cosmopolitanism" often called anti-patriotic and bourgeois aesthetes.[1] Some of them joined the alien power becoming the representatives of socialist realism, while others, like A. Eglītis, still continued developing the expression of Modernism in exile throughout the decades, thereby providing the opportunity to read and re-evaluate their works in their motherland after "the iron curtain" would fall and the independence of the country would be renewed. The re-evaluation of these writers' life and creative work began due to the change of a cultural paradigm on the turn of the 1980s—1990s and after the renewal of independence of Latvian statehood, since these events initiated refocusing attention onto those writers and their artistic world, whose names had been forbidden and concealed in previous decades. Literary specialists and critics gave a special attention to Modernism as a trend in literature, free Latvia's period (1918 - 1940) as well as to the analysis of the exiled

1 On the turn of the 1940s - 1950s, formalists and cosmopolitans faced persecution known under the name "a Cosmopolitans' case."

writers' life and literary heritage.

Works Cited

Appiah, Kwame Anthony. "Rooted Cosmopolitanism." *The Ethics of Identity*. Princeton, New York: Princeton UP, 2005. 213-272.

Ādamsons, Eriks. "Jaunākā angļu dzeja." *Daugava* 4 (1928): 524-527.

Ādamsons, Eriks. "Seši brīnumi." *Dāvana. Kopota īsproza*. Rīga: Daugava, 2000. 413-427.

Beck, Ulrich. *The Cosmopolitan Vision.* Cambridge (UK) and Malden MA: Polity Press, 2006.

Beck, Ulrih and Sznaider, Natan. "Unpacking Cosmopolitanism for the Social Sciences: A Research Agenda." *British Journal of Sociology* 61.1 (2010): 381-403. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-4446.2009.01250.x

Brastiņš, Ernests. *Tautai, Dievam, Tēvzemei*. Rīga: Zvaigzne, 1993.

Delanty, Gerard. "Cosmopolitan Imagination." *Revista CIDOB d Afers Internacionals* 82/83, (2009): 217-230. DOI: 10.1017/CBO9780511642227

Eglītis, Anšlavs. "Pēdējais dekadents." *Laiks* 23 (1949): 64-65.

Eglītis, Anšlavs. "Fortinbrass." *Maestro*. Rīga: Jumava, 2006.

Eglītis, Anšlavs. "Vāravs." *Maestro. Stāsti.* Rīga: Valters un Rapa, 1936.

Eastham, Andrew. "Aesthetic Vampirism: Pater, Wilde, and the Concept of Irony." *Art and Life in Aestheticism: De-Humanizing and Re-Humanizing Art, the Artist and the Artistic Receptor*. Ed. K. Comfort. New-York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008. 79-95.

Eastham, Andrew. *Aesthetic Afterlives: Irony, Literary Modernity and the Ends of Beauty*. London: Continuum, 2011.

Ellmann, Richard. *Oscar Wilde.* London: Penguin Books, 1988.

Fedorov, Fjodor. *Romanticheskij hudozhestvennyj mir: prostranstvo i vremja*. Riga: Zinatne, 1988.

Hannerz, Ulf. "Cosmopolitans and Locals in World Culture." *Theory Culture & Society* 7 (1990): 237-251. https://doi.org/10.1177/026327690007002014

Kacane, Ilze. "Interpretations of Cosmopolitanism and Cosmopolitan Identity in Latvian Periodicals (till 1940)." *Language, Individual & Society* 13 (2019): 193-203. https://www.scientific-publications.net/en/article/1001964/

Kacane, Ilze. "Reception of Opera 'Salome' by Richard Strauss in Aspazija's Novel 'The Autumn Nightingale'." *Forums for World Literature Studies* 11(1) (March) (2019): 81-66.

Klaustiņš, Roberts. "Apzinīgais un neapzinīgais impresionisms." *Daugava* 5 (1933): 437-452.

Krauliņš, Kārlis. "Rainis un krievu kultūra." *Karogs* 11 (1950): 1070-1076.

Marshik, Celia (ed.) — *The Cambridge Companion to Modernist Culture*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1017/CCO9781107278882

Nava, Mica. "Cosmopolitan Modernity: Everyday Imaginaries and the Register of Difference." *Theory, Culture, and Society* 19(1-2) (2002): 81-99. DOI: https://doi.

org/10.1177/026327640201900104

Patell, Cyrus R. K. *Cosmopolitanism and the Literary Imagination*. Springer, 2015.

Regev, Motti. "The Conditions of Cultural Cosmopolitanism." *Aesthetic Cosmopolitanism and Global Culture.* Eds. V. Cicchelli, S. Octobre, V. Riegel. Brill, 2019. 27-45.

Smilktiņa, Benita. "Īsās prozas žanriskais briedums." *Latviešu literatūras vesture. 1918-1945.* 2. sējums. Rīga: Zvaigzne ABC. 103-145.

Smilktiņa, Benita. *Novele*. Rīga: Zinātne, 1999.

Tabūns, Broņislavs. *Modernisma virzieni latviešu literatūrā*. Rīga: Zinātne, 2003.

Walkowitz, Rebecca. L. *Cosmopolitan Style: Modernism beyond the Nation.* New York: Columbia UP, 2006.

Zanders, Ojārs. "Latvijas neatkarības paudējs [Jānis Lapinš (1885-1941)]." *Brīvā Latvija: Apvienotā "Londonas Avīze" un "Latvija"* No.30.911(2005):6.

Zirnītis, Edmunts. "Anšlāvs Eglītis." *Treji Vārti* 4 (1967): 25-37.

Collapse of Latvian National Identity and Construction of Soviet Latvian Identity: Literary Journal "Soviet Latvia" (1940-1941)

Žans Badins
Institute of Humanities and Social Sciences
Daugavpils University, Daugavpils, Latvia
Email: zans.badins@du.lv

Abstract The present article considers the first years of the literary process in Latvia after the occupation and joining the USSR in the summer of 1940. The object of research is the journal "Soviet Latvia" published in 1940-1941. This journal brought together writers who were members of the newly formed Latvian Writers' Union and was the official mouthpiece of the new authorities. The subject of analysis is the policy of the journal, selection of authors and texts. The propaganda of the achievements of Soviet culture as well as literature have become one of the most important strategies for the incorporation of the Baltic republics into the USSR. The content of the journal clearly gives evidence of the breakdown of Latvian identity and of one of the first attempts to construct a new Soviet identity. Particular attention was paid to two main requirements for literature — 'partiinost' (party spirit) and nationality. Literature, influencing the minds and feelings of the readership, was called upon to create a 'new world' for the inhabitants of Latvia who had escaped executions and deportations. The connection of the Latvian people with the Russians who had carried out the Great October Revolution, as well as with other 'fraternal' peoples living in the USSR, was especially emphasized. By analysing literary texts specially selected for publication in the first Russian-language journal in Latvia, an attempt was made to study the context of the formation and changing of the identity of Latvian inhabitants.

Key words Latvia, occupation, identity, Russian literature, Latvian literature.

Author **Žans Badins**, Dr. philol., is a researcher at Daugavpils University Institute of Humanities and Social Sciences, Latvia, and a lecturer at Daugavpils University Department of Russian and Slavic Linguistics, Latvia. His main research areas are comparative literature and culture, mainly Russian and Latvian literary contacts

and literature of Russian Emigration. [1]

Introduction

In the contemporary, erratically developing and fast transforming world appears the necessity to explore dynamics of identity, its transformations. Research on the dynamics of the Latvian society identity has in recent times become not only scientific, but also societal demand. Due to the non-linear development of the Latvian history, the changes taking place in the development of the society have become the reason for uneven social development that is fraught with particular risks. Intrinsic historical processes have led to the situation when the identity of the inhabitants of Latvia appeared caught in the dynamics of non-linear development.

Events of the summer 1940 are one of the most hectic subjects in the contemporary history of Latvia. The theme of occupations and deportations in the literature written in the Latvian language became of relevance as soon as there appeared the possibility to publish such works, after regaining independence in 1991. One of the best-known contemporary Latvian film directors V. Kairišs has spoken on this subject:

> Deportation is one of the principal factors of the Latvian history, and we can build our collective consciousness on it. I believe, we should speak here more not about victims, but about the strength that allowed to survive. We need to build our spiritual gene pool in particular for those people for whom it was important to return, for those people who returned and did not break. ("Za …")[2]

After Latvia officially became part of the USSR, already in August 1940, literary descent is sent to Latvia at the instruction of the USSR Union of Writers — the well-known novelist and playwright Nikolai Virta, satirist Evgeny Petrov, poets Vladimir Lugovskoy and Evgeny Dolmatovsky, author of the popular science fiction Mikhail Ilyin, as well as other authors form Moscow and Leningrad. The writers' arrival was duly and exhaustively covered on the pages of the newspaper "Literatūras avīze" [Literary Newspaper]. N.Virta noted that "creation of a literary newspaper would help Latvian writers to get organized, united not only among themselves, but

1 This research was supported by Daugavpils University Research Development, "Cultural Memory and Identities of Latvia's Future: Crosspoints of Literature, History and Religion II"(Grant No.14-95/7).

2 All the quatations from Latvian or Russian into English are translated by this article's author.

also with writers living in Moscow, Leningrad and other places" (Vavere, Mackov 268). V.Lugovskoy wrote about Latvia in enthusiastic manner:

> The Latvian people, its history and literature captured my attention as soon as I arrived to Riga. I would be happy if I could get even closer introduction to everything, I would eagerly work hard to help the Latvian literature that "vigorously flows in the socialist culture." (Vavere, Mackov 268)

M.Ilyin's words "If the Latvian people have created so much while in chains, then how much they could create when freed!" (Vavere, Mackov 268) sound like a particular closure of this trip and parting request for future. It is obvious that as the result of this trip literary texts were also created that are still to be discovered. One of such texts is Evgeny Dolmatovsky's poem Moscow-Riga, dated August 1940 (Dolmatovskij 118).

This text is the first Russian variant of the "Latvian" text of the new historical period — "Soviet Latvia". Already in this poem, one can notice trends that will be characteristic for creating the new model of the Russian literature's "Latvian text". The first step in the new strategy: Latvia is no more the enemy of the Soviet state, Soviet system. It is not the country of "bourgeois" and "run-away nepmen" anymore (Badins 32). The Red Army returns power to the working people in the republic, thus reconstructing the historical justice. Poems by E. Dolmatovsky and many other similar texts actualize the temporal paradigm Past — Present. In this regard, the removal of the spatial category of borders being of supreme significance for the era of the 1920s-1930s — "the former border fall" (Dolmatovskij 118) — becomes momentous. Consequently Daugavpils — the first Latvian city on the way from Moscow to Riga — fits into the new spatial paradigm corresponding to the well-known and own Russian space. The description of Daugavpils — "As though between Tula and Ryazan" (Dolmatovskij 118) — withdraws any manifestation of exotics characteristic to texts created during trips to new lands. The context of the habitual, readily recognizable, own, native includes not only the space, but also people. Latvians welcoming the persona in Daugavpils region[1] are endowed by the Soviet poet with "blue Russian eyes" (Dolmatovskij 118).

In this case Dolmatovsky is interested not in the truth of the fact, but in a kind of higher historical truth, turning into reunification of Latvia and Latvians with the

1 Though in 1940, the city's Latvian population did not exceed 18%, Daugavpils was mainly inhabited by Jews and Russians, it is unlikely that there were Latvians among people greeting writers from Moscow.

Soviet Russia. This point of contact is the category of memory and arising figure of the fallen Soviet diplomatic courier Theodor Nette whose name was already eternalized in the Soviet revolutionary pantheon through V.Mayakovsky's poem "To Comrade Nette, the Man and the Ship" (Majakovskij 162-164). The version of the attack on Theodor Nette and Johann Mahmastal being the most popular among the contemporary Latvian historians is linked to the fact that the Soviet diplomatic couriers transported a huge amount of counterfeit pounds sterling that had to be used against Great Britain (Ekabson). Dolmatovsky was literally replying to a request — dream expressed in V.Mayakovsky's poem "To live in a unified world, made happier / By the absence of divisions like Russia and Latvia" (Majakovskij 164). The situation of the summer 1940 actually establishes the world without Latvia and, to some extent, also without Russia.

Methodology

In an era when the concept of national identity is experiencing a certain crisis, it becomes extremely important to comprehend the historical and cultural processes that disrupted the linear development of the dynamics of the identity of a particular social group. It is necessary to designate the contexts that form identity, assert the functioning norms of self-identification of an individual, small groups, social formations - ethnic groups, nations, countries.

The identity studies are associated with diverse scientific schools, trends and approaches. Within the framework of the present article, the emphasis is on the issue of changing national identity due to socio-cultural transformations. In this regard, the works of Anthony Giddens and Zygmunt Bauman, which reflect changes in identity as consequences of social dynamics, become relevant.

The world of high modernity certainly stretches out well beyond the milieux of individual activities and personal engagements. It is one replete with risks and dangers, to which the term 'crisis', not merely as an interruption, but as a more or less continuous state of affairs, has particular application. Yet it also intrudes deeply into the heart of self-identity and personal feelings. The 'new sense of identity' [..] is an acute version of a process of 'finding oneself' which the social conditions of modernity enforce on all of us. This process is one of active intervention and transformation. (Giddens 12)

> According to the concept of the British scientist John Urry a changing society requires new concepts, new methods and categories: "New rules of sociological method are necessitated by the apparently declining powers of national

societies [..]" (Urry 1-2).

Literary texts, as well as art in general, reproduce both for the individual and for the society, semantic, ideological, social models that form their worldview and attitudes. The artistic world view of a particular era reflects a segment of reality, refracted through the prism of the perception of a particular individual and received an emotional assessment, passing into the sphere of subjective experience. Each era makes its own selection of literary texts, as a rule, a new epoch begins with harsh criticism and rejection of the values of the previous epoch, destroying the existing hierarchy of texts, introducing bans on certain works.

As Yuri Lotman noted: "a new name corresponds to a new state. From a mythological point of view, the transition from one state to another is thought of in the formula "and I saw a new heaven and a new earth" (Apoc. 21.1) and simultaneously as an act of complete change of all proper names." (Lotman 70) An analysis of the main themes and motives of the works can clearly demonstrate both a change in the worldview, and, in this case, the collapse of national identity and an attempt to replace it with an international social identity.

Literary Life in the First Years after Latvia's Occupation

After Latvia was occupied in the summer 1940, vast propaganda of accomplishments of the Soviet culture was started in the republic, and literature became one of the most significant strategies for including new republics into the "family of friendly nations". The old publishing system was destroyed almost immediately, numerous periodicals were closed, writers' organizations were eliminated, yet the very writers were clearly divided into two camps — the 'right ones' and the 'wrong ones'. The first lists of forbidden books and authors were compiled and updated regularly (Strods 35).

The 'old' publications had to be replaced by new ones. If we speak about literary journals, then in 1940 two journals appeared: "Karogs" [Flag] in the Latvian language, while "Soviet Latvia" [Sovetskaya Latviya] was published in Russian. While the former journal is quite well-known and continued to exist after the end of the World War II and was issued right up to 2010, the second journal passed to certain oblivion. Thus, in some contemporary publications "Karogs" is named as the only literary journal in the Latvian SSR in the early 1940s. The first issue of "Karogs" was published already in September 1940, while the first issue of the journal "Soviet Latvia" was passed for press on September 29, 1940, and it was published in December with a circulation of 10 thousand copies. If "Karogs" positioned itself as 'a periodical of Latvia SSR Writers' Union', the journal "Soviet Latvia" was 'a literary

artistic and socially political journal'. The editor of "Karogs" was Andrejs Upīts; apart from him, the journal's editorial board included: Vilis Lācis, Jūlijs Lācis, Arvīds Grigulis, Jānis Niedre, apparently the role of the political curator was undertaken by Žanis Spure.

Attempts to establish scientifically founded concept of social realism in the Latvian literature began only in the 1960s. Furthermore, incomprehension did not prevent writers from intuitive detection and moving along the path of creating social realistic texts, this is especially true about the period of the 1940-1941. As the consequence, the journal pages turned out to be filled with texts full of never-ending flow of rhetoric, propaganda, ideological clichés and slogans. Texts from both journals present magnificent material for understanding historical, cultural and literary processes of that period, this material allows to understand why the then literature was exactly as it was, or — I would express a categorical position — why there was no literature at all. Actually, we are dealing with almost industrial flow production of texts, right up to exact exposure of approaches. The contemporary researcher can reconstruct the whole literary process, fitting a particular matrix. As a rule, directives were prepared in Moscow or, at least, always had to be approved in Moscow, they had to pass through party committees, and then were sent down to Riga. The local executives (editorial boards) ensured strict observation of these directions, without allowing any liberty.

"Soviet Latvia": People and Texts

The journal "Soviet Latvia" has become the first literary artistic and socio-political journal published in the Latvian Soviet Socialist Republic in the late 1940 - early 1941 in the Russian language. The journal was regarded as the official publication of the Latvia's Union of Soviet Writers. During this period of time, in total 5 volumes of the journal were published — the first one in December 1940 and two double volumes of the January-February and March-April issues in 1941. Apparently, the following expected double volume of the May-June issue was not published due to Germany's attack on the Soviet Union.

The layout and content of the journal "Soviet Latvia" repeats some details characteristic for "Karogs" and for other Soviet literary journals. Title pages of the first issues of "Karogs" and "Soviet Latvia" are decorated with the canonical portrait of J. Stalin. Other publications present portraits of V.Lenin, editors of literary journals V.Lācis, J.Niedre, and, what is interesting, the Ukrainian poet I.Franko.

The first text opening the first issue of the journal "Soviet Latvia" is the Declaration of the Latvian SSR Writers' Union (it was published in "Karogs" a month

earlier). It comprises the formulation of the main objectives faced by the new Latvian Soviet literature:

> the Latvian SSR Writers' Union guards the interests of the working class and is vigilant against penetration of the enemies of the people and supporters of the overturned Ulmanis' regime among them. ("Deklaracija…" 4)

The editor-in-chief of all the issues of the "Soviet Latvia" was Jānis Niedre, apart from him, the journal's editorial board consisted of Andrejs Upīts, Pēteris Valeskalns, Žanis Spure, Lev Zaks and Hiršs Rapoports. The position of the editorial secretary at first was taken by Grigory Krupnikov, later — by Lev Zaks. As it can be seen, three people (A.Upīts, J.Niedre and Ž.Spure) participated in the editorial work of both journals. It is obvious that a more responsible approach was taken to form the editorial board in case of the "Soviet Latvia" as one of the members of the "Karogs" editorial board, Jūlijs Lācis, who was the Minister of national welfare in the Republic of Latvia, was arrested in January 1941. He was accused of anti-Soviet activity due to his cooperation with the bourgeois publications "Jaunākās Ziņas" [The Latest News] and "Atpūta" [Rest].

A writer's bond with public environment was declared as the main artistic principle of the new era —

> The writer of the Soviet Latvia cannot stand aside of the everyday people's work. <…> Heroes of the working people and working class must also become heroes of literary works. Creating the image of a person from socialist society is one of the problems of literature in Latvia, ("Deklaracija…" 4)

as well as loyalty to social realism; in addition to this, one of the main principles of the Soviet ideology in the Baltic countries is stated — "These works must be socialist in their content and national in their form" ("Deklaracija…" 3).

Eventually, one must write so as to fully comply with the new criteria. Critics and theoreticians have carefully quoted each other, not forgetting to refer to the main authority and 'Soviet writers' friend' comrade Stalin. The "Declaration…" directly specifies five iconic names destined to become guides for the new Latvian authors. Those are Marx and Engels, Lenin and Stalin, as well as Rainis, whose 'inspirational poetry' becomes the example for the emerging Latvian Soviet artistic canon. Marx, Engels, Lenin and Stalin as figures embodying immortality appear in the cliff-hanger of Mira Krupnikova's poem "Lines on Glory and Immortality"

(Krupnikova "Stihi…").

Just the five journal issues present around half a hundred of authors, some of them have become classic authors of the Latvian Soviet literature, others have with time become translators, while others became forgotten by both literary scholars and readers.

Just few authors were able to overcome the ideological selection: prosaists Vilis Lācis, Indriķis Lēmanis, Ernests Birznieks-Upītis, Arvīds Bērzs and Žanis Spure. The Latvian poetry is represented by Jānis Plaudis, Valdis Lukss, Meinhards Rudzītis, Leons Paegle, Andrejs Balodis. It is possible to find Aleksandrs Čaks' sketch *He Saw Lenin* in one of the issues (Čaks). All the journal's issues include texts by two main authors — Andrejs Upīts and Jānis Niedre, as well as *Town and Countryside*, a historical and economical work by doctor B.Shur published in series.

The March-April 1941 journal issue presents the only dramatic piece — play *They Opened the Way* by Jūlijs Vanags and Fricis Rokpelnis, highlighting the continuity of times. The play's action begins on the eve of the 1905 Revolution, then smoothly passes to the events of October 1917 and finally ends with events of the summer 1940. Particular semantic load in this play is given to the image of Latvian riflemen that in the 1950s - 1960s becomes one of the dominating lines of the "Latvian text" in the Soviet literature, being it Latvian or Russian (Vanags, Rokpelnis).

A significant place in the journal is devoted to literary criticism. Once again the central spot here is taken by A.Upīts who publishes the policy article *On the Latvian Novel* in the first issue. J.Niedre publishes one more policy article — *Short Overview of the Latvian Literature*. In the March-April issue, J.Sudrabkalns publishes his critical article about V.Lācis, Edgars Damburs — about Jānis Niedre, Ādolfs Talcis — about Ernests Birznieks-Upītis. The section Bibliography includes reviews on the journal "Karogs", newspaper "Literatūras avīze" [Literary Newspaper], as well as on some books by contemporary Latvian authors.

The main difference of the "Soviet Latvia" from "Karogs", apart from the very language of publication, is active contribution to the creation of texts by Latvian authors writing in Russian. It is worth mentioning that their number is negligible taking into account the stormy literary publishing life of Russian-speaking Latvia in the 1920s-1930s. Practically none of the authors having cooperated with one or another issue, published in the Republic of Latvia are invited for cooperation. The only exception is Lev Zaks who has published a poem in the journal "Nord-Ost".

The main part of the journal's editors' Russian-speaking part consists of Grigory Krupnikov, Mira Krupnikova, Lev Zaks, Nikolay Yanin, Pavel Vasilyev and some other authors venturing in prose and poetry. I have to note that only one of

them — Nikolay Yanin — is featured in *Russian Poetry in Latvia (XIX-XX cent.)*, the book-anthology published in 2014 under the editorship of Sergejs Žuravļovs and being a compilation of works by more than a hundred authors published in the "Soviet Latvia".

Emergence of literature out of nothing, refusal of years-long experience of the existing literary tradition — it was the deliberate position for constructing a new world, set in the text of *The Internationale*:

> Let's make a clean slate of the past,
> Enslaved mass, arise, arise!
> The world's foundation will change,
> We are nothing, now let's be all! (Pottier)

This excerpt suits extremely well to characterize some authors who represent the Russian diaspora of Latvia on the journal's pages. One of them is Makar Yakovlev who has published two stories on the journal's pages — *Accordion and Funeral* — and he has never been a writer before 1940. Even more, when studying the then Latvian press, it is possible to learn that he was a candidate for deputy of the Supreme Soviet of the LSSR. And we learn from the questionnaire presented to the newspaper "Cīņa" [Fight] about the candidate's mere three-year primary education, yet it is sufficient to have a seven-year imprisonment period to become a Soviet Latvian writer.

The best-known and remarkable figure among the Russian-speaking authors of the journal was Grigory Krupnikov. He was born in Saratov, in a prosperous Jewish family. He was of extreme left political orientation as opposed to his parents who did not admit the October Revolution and left Petrograd in 1918. In his autobiography he noted that "being just sixteen years since birth, without informing parents, he appeared in the representative office of the Soviet Russia in Berlin and asked to grant him the Russian citizenship" (Stranga "Yevrei…" 72). In 1924, the Krupnikov family settled in Latvia. In 1930 he made stable connections with Latvian communists. He became a prominent organizer of the publishing of illegal party press and individual publications (known by nicknames Viktor, Anton), as well as underground press. The whole press of CPL (Communist Party of Latvia) was Stalinist, it advocated hatred towards independent Latvia and favoured collapse of its sovereignty. Krupnikov was arrested in April 1940, released after the arrival of the Soviet Army. In 1941, he died in battles near Leningrad.

G.Krupnikov's wife Mira Krupnikova (née Kisina) graduated from Landau's

private girls' high school in 1926. For four years she then studied at Economical and commercial institute in Naples. After returning to Latvia, she took active part in the activities of CPL. Till 1940, she regularly published her works in underground publications. After occupation she worked as a reporter for the newspaper "Moscow News". From 1941 till 1944 she was an instructor at the Red Army Political department, her works are published in various military issues. Since 1954 she was known as a translator of Latvian literature to the Russian language. In 1983 she published an autobiography *Memory Box*.

One of the main tasks when creating ideology of the new world is establishment of a new history line. June 17, 1940, becomes one of the new sacral dates. On this date Soviet tanks entered the territory of the Republic of Latvia; this set the stage for the Latvia's occupation and collapse of Latvia's sovereignty. This event is described in Mira Krupnikova's sketch *June 17, 1940*, Petr Vasilyev's poem *June 17*, N.Yanin's poems *The Freed Nation and Lines on Great Friendship*, Lev Zaks' *We Swear*. It is worth noting that Petr Vasilyev's name is mentioned on the list of 26 troublemakers (it is not clear if they were arrested or just identified) that was compiled by Riga's prefect K.Jaunarājs after disorders in the streets of Riga (Stranga "Okkupacija…" 92).

Oddly enough, yet in the post-war period, Soviet ideologists will choose and highlight another date — August 5, 1940 — the day when Latvian SSR officially became part of the Soviet Union.

In texts by authors from the journal "Soviet Latvia", events taking place on June 17 in Latvia become logical continuation of the events of the Great October Revolution on October 25 (November 7 N.S.): "Golden June — Joy of our October" (Krupnikov 112). The era of the independent Republic of Latvia is viewed as an era of troubled times. This is time of "tearful nights" and "days crushed with a malign stone". "We lived in times of sorrow and grief" (Janin "Osvobozhdennyj…"). The poem by Lev Zaks particularly highlights the theme of suffering of "the best sons of the Latvian people" — shooting of nine communists in the yard of the Riga Central prison, Jaunzems-Šilfs, secretary of the CC (Central Committee), and A.Arājs-Bērce, member of the CC and Bolshevik poet, among them (Zaks).

In her sketch, Mira Krupnikova mythologizes events of June 17. For instance, it is not said that June 17 in 1940 was Monday (workday), it was also the Feast of Pentecost for the Orthodox and Old Believers. The sketch describes real Riga's topoi — building of the police prefecture, alleys alongside the city channel, boulevard in front of the opera house, Marijas Street, the post office building. The central event of the sketch is the encounter of forces of the old and new Latvia. Representa-

tives of the new Latvia — these are unarmed workers from city outskirts, men and women, youngsters and old men who stand against armed police officers as well as the bourgeoisie representatives. In this collision opponents of the new world lose their human appearance. A police officer is compared to a "malignant, cowardly rat". The climax — it is the scene of reprisal against a person who refused to greet the Soviet tankman. In the sketch text, he is described as "someone in brownish outfit": "Tens of arms are stretching towards him. Just a moment — and he disappears in the thick crowd. No-one sees him anymore. Feet — many feet — squash and trample something, busily and silently. [..] When breaking apart, the crowd throws out something brownish, barely resembling a person." (Krupnikova "17-oe…" 92). Mira Krupnikova intentionally says nothing about the nationality of people welcoming the Soviet Army since the main accent of the opposition, as seen by the authors, carries social, not national character.

In literary works of that time, search for ideological and artistic guides was carried out. If Rainis was proclaimed as such a guide for Latvian authors, then Mayakovsky becomes a peculiar example for authors writing in Russian. Oddly enough, yet in G. Krupnikov's poem *Victory* [Победа] Mayakovsky is perceived as a direct successor of Pushkin: "Next to Pushkin Mayakovsky/And Mayakovsky can only figure Pushkin out" (Krupnikov 113) — despite the fact that at the time futurists offered to throw Pushkin and Gogol down the modernity ship. Just like T.Nette in Y.Dolmatovsky's poem, V.Mayakovsky in G.Krupnikov's poem is invited as a living witness to evaluate the state of the art in the modern Soviet Latvia. Mayakovsky's image highlights not only the image of the main proletarian poet, but also the image of an older comrade ready to come to the rescue in the hour of need.

In the first days of deportations, on June 14-15, 1941, Riga welcomed the first Congress of the Latvian SSR Soviet writers that showed how many writers or so called writers had become active collaborators; a report at the Congress was made by Arvīds Pelše, ideology secretary of the CPL CC, who was the first to announce that in July 1940 the "socialist July revolution" took place — the greatest "historical event" in the lives of the Latvian people, with the main lesson: "Be vigilant. Ready to fight. Throw away your nationalist skin." (Stranga "Okkupacija…"129).

Conclusion

It is possible to observe collapse of the Latvian national identity in all the texts of the journal "Soviet Latvia" dealing with events of the summer 1940-1941. It was improper to remember or write about the Republic of Latvia of the time period 1918 — 1940. Instead of this, both ideological and artistic texts started to propagate con-

nection of the historical fate of Soviet Latvia and Soviet Russia. The first printed issues of Soviet Latvia advocated hatred towards independent Latvia, calling Latvia a country of plutocrats, extreme chauvinism. It is noteworthy that not only occupants arrived, but they also brought the language — the language of political labels and clichés, aimed at influencing new generations.

Change in identity impacted the condition of culture, morals, politics, and attitude of people to each other. Yet these changes were not only consequences of the processes of social development, but also the result of the governmental and other identity policies shaping it in this or that direction. Soviet literature as well as art in general was designed to replace the functioning standards of an individual's self-identification in the Baltic countries.

Works Cited

Badins, Zans. "Latvia in Russian Literature (1901-1940)". *Forum for World Literature Studies* Vol. 11, No 1 (2019): 23-38.

Čaks, Aleksandrs. "On videl Lenina." Sovetskaja Latvija 3-4 (1941): 34-36.

Dolmatovskij, Evgenij. *Sobranie sochinenij v treh tomah. Tom pervyj*. Moskva: Hudozhestvennaja literatura, 1989.

Ekabson, Ēriks. "Tajna Teodora Nette." Archive.today, 2014. Available at <https://archive.is/20140802065131/www.gazeta.lv/story/24379.html>.

Giddens, Anthony. *Modernity and Self-identity: Self and Society in the Late Modern Age*. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 1991.

Janin, Nikolaj. "Osvobozhdennyj narod." *Sovetskaja Latvija* 1 (1940): 14.

—. "Stihi o velikoj druzhbe." *Sovetskaja Latvija* 1 (1940): 15.

Krupnikova, Mira. "Stihi o slave i bessmertii." *Sovetskaja Latvija* 1 (1940): 89.

—. "17-oe ijunja 1940 g." *Sovetskaja Latvija* 1 (1940): 90-92.

Krupnikov, Grigorij. "Pobeda." *Sovetskaja Latvija* 3-4 (1941): 112-114.

Lotman, Jurij. "Mif — imja — kul'tura." *Izbrannye stat'i v treh tomah. T.1. Stat'i po semiotike i topologii kul'tury*. Tallin: Aleksandra, 1992.

Majakovskij, Vladimir. *Sobranie sochinenij v 13 tomah. T*. 7. Moskva: Hudozhestvennaja literatura, 1958.

Niedre, Jānis. "Kratkij ocherk latyshskoj literatury." *Sovetskaja Latvija* 1-2 (1941): 89-98.

Pottier, Eugène. "The Internationale." *MIA: History: Soviet History: Sounds of the Soviet Union: Lyrics*. Translated by M. Abidor. Available at: <https://www.marxists.org/history/ussr/sounds/lyrics/international.htm>.

Stranga, Aivars. "Okkupacija Latvii 17 ijunja 1940 goda i evrei." *Evrei Latvii i sovetskaja vlast' (1928 - 1953)*. Ed. L. Dribins. Riga: Institut filosofii i sociologii Latvijskogo universiteta,

2010. 81-140.

—. "Yevrei v kommunisticheskoy partii Latvii (1934-1940)." *Evrei Latvii i sovetskaja vlast' (1928 - 1953)*. Ed. L. Dribins. Riga: Institut filosofii i sociologii Latvijskogo universiteta, 2010. 64-81.

Strods, Henrihs. *PSRS politiskā cenzūra Latvijā, 1940-1990: Dokumenti un materiāli*. Rīga: Jumava, 2010-2011.

Upit, Andrejs. "O latyshskom romane." *Sovetskaja Latvija* 1 (1940): 108-113.

Urry, John. *Sociology Beyond Societies: Mobilities for the Twenty-first Century*. London, New York: Routledge, 2000.

Vanags, Jūlijs, Rokpelnis, Fricis. "Oni probili put'." *Sovetskaja Latvija* 3-4 (1941): 56-111.

Vasil'ev, Pjotr. "Stihi: 17 ijunja." *Sovetskaja Latvija* 1 (1940): 93.

Vavere, Vera, Mackov, Georgy. *Latyshsko-russkie literaturnye svjazi*. Riga: Zinatne, 1965.

Zaks, Lev. "Kljanemsja." *Sovetskaja Latvija* 3-4 (1941): 8-9.

—. "Deklaracija Sojuza pisatelej Latvijskoj SSR." *Sovetskaja Latvija* 1 (1940): 3-4.

—. *Russkaja pojezija Latvii (XIX — XX vv)*. Ed. S. Zhuravlev. Riga: Ulej, 2014.

—. "Za sovetskij fil'm 'Dolgaja doroga v djunah' vstupilas' Jelita Vejdemane." *Freecity*.lv. Available at <http://www.freecity.lv/kultura/34123/>.

Peculiarities of Actualizing the Subject of Festivities in Latgalian Poetry of Exile

Oksana Kovzele
Institute of Humanities and Social Sciences, Daugavpils University
Vienibas iela 13, Daugavpils, LV-5401, Latvia
Email: oksana.kovzele@du.lv

Abstract The present paper reveals the potential of actualizing the subject of festivities for expressing the life experience acquired in exile and in the land of settlement on the example of previously little known poetry by seven émigré authors born in Latgale (south-eastern part of Latvia). The mentioned traumatic experience in Latgalian poetry of exile is mostly treated within a binary opposition "native land (past) — foreign land (present)" that is brightly revealed by comparing celebrations of Christmas, Easter, and New Year as observed in Latvia, to the reality of the land of settlement. Lyrical hero provoked by an acoustic impulse (hearing festive tunes or toll of the church bells) carries out a dream journey into the past where s/he visits native home and recalls most important codes of one's national festive culture (tradition of hospitality and cooking, lit candles, going to the church) that help surviving in the foreign land. It is noteworthy that, in the course of time, hope for the return of the Golden Age (past, native land), that is more characteristic of Christmas poetry, vanishes, hence the works under analysis — mostly Easter and especially New Year poetry — more and more often express the authors' despair and doubt.

Key words exile; trauma; festivities; actualization; Latgale; poetry

Author **Oksana Kovzele**, Dr. philol., is a researcher of the Centre of Cultural Research at Daugavpils University Institute of Humanities and Social Sciences, Latvia. She is the author of more than 40 scientific articles and the editor and member of the Scientific Boards of 15 scientific journals and conference proceedings. Her main research interests are comparative literature, comparative linguistics, and cultural studies. Currently she is implementing a postdoctoral project "Transformations of Festive Culture in the Borderland: The Case of Latgale

and Pskov Regions" supported by European Regional Development Fund.[1]

Conditions of Exile and Trauma Experienced

The word "exile" in the present paper is used with the meaning of a significant period of time in the history of Latvia from the end of World War II (autumn of 1944 to 1945) when, escaping the anticipated repressions of the Soviet regime and danger of death, 10% of the total number of residents left the country, to 21 August 1991 when Latvia regained its state sovereignty and emigrants had an opportunity to return to their native land (Celle 5; Daukste-Silaspoģe (2002) 5; Plakans). The given period, almost 50 years long, is divided into three main stages (Celle 5), during which the acquired experience and whole range of feelings accompanying it are registered in various kinds of documents, including the literature of exile:

1) the period of refugee camps in Germany (1944-1950) when literary works generally "expressed pain for the lost homeland, pain for the tragedy of Latvian nation" (Zalāne 257), as well as "feelings of alienation, inability and unwillingness to accept the other as one's own" (Nollendorfs 222), hence the written text turns into "a document of spiritual resistance" (Daukste-Silasproģe (2002) 5);

2) settling in more distant lands of settlement — Australia, USA, Canada, Great Britain, South America and elsewhere (starting from 1949) when literary discourse registers "strain not so much between past and future as between past and present" (Nollendorfs 225);

3) gradual passage of the leadership of life in exile into the hands of the generation born in the foreign lands (mostly the 1970s—1980s), when "treatment of the surrounding environment and people becomes thematically important in texts" (Nollendorfs 229).

Hence, this regards the traumatic experience registered by authors that arose by collision of two realities — past (the time spent in one's homeland that is positioned in the majority of texts as a happy and harmonious life stage) and present (need for survival, both physical and moral, under hostile, as perceived by the authors, conditions of exile that they gradually adapt to, though are never able to fully accept), as well as the gradual shift of the perspective of actualizing this experience registered by the literary narrative:

1 The research has been carried out in the framework of ERDF project "Transformations of Festive Culture in the Borderland: The Case of Latgale and Pskov Regions" (Agreement No. 1.1.1.2/16/I/001; Application No. 1.1.1.2/VIAA/1/16/109).

> Because of her displacement, the migrant's identity undergoes radical shifts that alter her self-perception and often result in her ambivalence towards both her old and new existence. She can no longer simply or nostalgically remember the past as a fixed and comforting anchor in her life, since its contours move with the present rather than in opposition to it. (Mardorossian 16)

Literature as a Form of Registering National Culture Experience under Conditions of Exile

The reality of exile, along with the painful experience of loss of homeland and desperate search for the means of subsistence, gives rise to a sense of common mission, that is, necessity of preserving and cultivating one's national culture even in a foreign land, that at the same time means preserving one's selfhood: "[...] the community of exile consists of a proportionally large number of intelligentsia who experience the loss of their culture environment as an existential loss" (Nollendorfs 219).

In this context, literary activity of exiles is to be regarded as a major means of preserving and enriching national culture under the conditions of living in exile, along with book publishing, theatre, painting, fine arts, and other forms of representation of national culture achievements: "National self-awareness as a sign of identity was taken along by Latvians into emigration: willingness to think, feel, write in Latvian irrespective of the country of settlement" (Daukste-Silasproģe (2007) 7). In this respect, exile in many respects stimulates the process of writing that results in the development of a unique phenomenon of literature of exile:

> Displacement, whether forced or self-imposed, is in many ways a calamity. Yet, a peculiar but a potent point to note is that writers in their displaced existence generally tend to excel in their work, as if the changed atmosphere acts as a stimulant for them. These writings in dislocated circumstances are often termed as exile literature. [...]. World literature has an abundance of writers whose writings have prospered while they were in exile. [...]. (Saha 186)

Peculiarities of Actualizing the Subject of Festivities in Literature of Exile

Festivities are traditionally regarded to be one of the most solid forms of the spiritual and social realization of the nation (Bennett, Taylor, Woodward 1; Korolova et. al. 544). However, according to recent research, under the impact of various factors (secularization, globalization, flourishing of commerce and digital technolo-

gies), they have gradually transformed: "Recent research in ritual studies has shown that rituals are not at all static, but, on the contrary, more often subject to dynamic changes, even if their participants continue to claim that they have been the same since time immemorial" (Kreinath, Hartung, Deschner 1).

Under the conditions of exile, festivities acquire additional symbolical meaning, as they are perceived as a central mechanism that stimulates the preservation of national identity and self-identification in a foreign environment. Respectively, in the course of time, a specific canon of festive culture of exile is formed. The newcomers often try, under the circumstances of the land of settlement, to observe also those festive traditions and customs that in homeland may have seemed insignificant and unimportant (Anikin). In fact, it is an attempt at keeping this important part of cultural legacy in memory unchanged and static as long as possible.

In the literary narrative of exile, festive traditions and customs, on the one hand, represent a part of folk national culture legacy — the one that is to be preserved and enriched by all means, and, on the other hand, make it possible to express nostalgic feelings in relation to festivities celebrated once in homeland. This picture of ideal festivities reconstructed in memories mostly does not comply with the celebrations observed in the land of settlement: "[in fugitive years — O. K.] many poems dedicated to Easter [...] and Christmas [...] are to be read, yet also in this poetry one can mostly find the opposition — that is Easter and Christmas in foreign land [...]" (Daukste-Silaspoģe (2002) 190-191). In other words, festivities actualized in the literary discourse of exile trigger off stable associations with the time spent in homeland that under present circumstances seems harmonious and ideal for exiles (treated as "the Golden Age"); under the impact of historical and political events it has been lost (treated as "the Iron Age"), yet, possibly, it will be regained in future (new "Golden Age"): "[...] he [exile — O. K.] is constantly striving to return to what has been, the foreign is associated with what has been witnessed in one's homeland, and the experience of memories is stronger than the new impressions" (Daukste-Silasproģe 188). It must be noted that, in the course of time, this spatial-temporal structure characteristic of early Romanticism may change, as the optimism and assurance of exiles turn into pessimism and scepticism.

Festivities in Works by Latgalian Poets of Exile: The Corpus of Texts under Analysis and its Specificity

Philologist and writer Paulīne Zalāne (married name Vallena; 1931-2018) in article "Latgales rakstnieku devums trimdā" [The Contribution of Latgalian Writers in

Exile] states that, as a result of emigration, at least 40 writers of Latgalian origin settled in western countries who continued writing literary works including poetry. As testified by the writer, in the time period between 1948 and 1952, Latgalian writers mostly moved to the USA and Canada, some of them remained in Germany, and only one went to Australia (Zalāne 257).

Of the number of writers mentioned by P. Zalāne (the contribution of 42 personalia is given closer characteristics), 17 authors in various periods of exile published poetry — in press periodicals, anthologies, and individual collections, some of which have become bibliographical rarities by now. Subject matter of festivities is not treated in all of these authors' works, and this condition even more limits the range of texts under analysis making the study exciting and unique.

Within the topic under study, seven literati born in Latgale deserve more scientific interest:

1) *Marija Andžāne* (married name Stroda; 1909-1988) — a writer born in Landskorona civil parish (present region of Kraslava) whose début in literature happened during her years of studies; in 1944 she left Latvia, lived in refugee camps in Greven and Langerfeld, together with her husband founded a school in Germany and worked there as a teacher, in 1951 moved to the USA, worked there in a factory and died in this land of settlement; the article analyzes M. Andžānes's poems first included in the collection "Namīra vōrtūs" [In Gates of Unrest] (Feldafing, 1951) and later republished in other collections and periodicals in exile;

2) *Janīna Babre* (1919-1983) — a poet and author of religious articles born in Daugavpils who in 1944 left Latvia, studied in Munich and Illinois where she acquired bachelor degree in pedagogy, worked as a teacher and journal editor, actively published her works since the early 1960s receiving several prizes; buried in Royal Palm cemetery, USA; in the context of treating the subject matter of festivities, the author's poetry collections "Meditācijas" [Meditations] (Chicago, 1968), "Ceļā uz Loreto" [On the Way to Loreto] (Chicago, 1972), "Meditācija naktī" [Meditation at Night] (Leuven, 1978) deserve special attention, along with poems published in press periodicals in exile (mostly newspaper "Latgolas Bolss" [Voice of Latgale]);

3) *Vladislavs Bojārs* (1905-1984) — a writer, educator, and journalist born in Bērzgale civil parish, his first publications appeared since 1928, in 1944 he left Latvia, lived and worked as a teacher in refugee camp schools in Germany, started studying in Munich, in 1950 moved to Canada where continued studies in St. Hieronymus' College Ontario province, is buried in Canada; within the topic under study, the author's poems included in the collection "Sirds smeļdze" [Heart Longing] (Munich, 1957) deserve special attention;

4) *Leonards Latkovskis* (1905-1991) — a linguist, folklorist, ethnographer, and writer born in Varakļāni civil parish who published his works since 1927, in 1944 he left Latvia, first staying in Germany and Bavaria where he founded and headed Latvian gymnasia and worked as a translator (having a command of 18 languages), later, in 1950, he moved to the USA where he was a professor of linguistics, scholar, participant of congresses and conferences, editor; buried in Louisville, USA; in the framework of the topic under study, L. Latkovskis' poetry included in the edition "Dzymtōs zemes ļaudis II" [People of the Native Land II] (Munich, 1983) is investigated;

5) *Jōņs Leidumnīks* (real name Jōņs Mozga; 1909-1982) — a poet born in Varakļāni civil parish whose first works appeared in Latgalian periodicals since the end of the 1930s, in 1944 he left Latvia, lived in Neu Etting, Germany where he engaged in active public work among Latvian Catholics, in 1948 moved to England and in 1951 — to Canada where he worked as a secretary typist, compiled and edited periodical editions, worked in St. Joseph's hospital in Ontario where he later died; in the sense of treating the subject matter of festivities, J. Leidumnīks' poetry collection "Tāva pogolmā" [In Father's Yard] (Munich, 1959) as well as its publications in exile periodicals are of special significance;

6) *Francis Murāns* (1915-2001) — a writer born in the family of peasants from Viļāni civil parish whose first works appeared in the 1930s, in 1944 he left for Germany, in 1949 emigrated to the USA where he worked as a blue collar worker, yet in the course of time obtained a doctoral degree in economics at the University of Michigan, worked as a lecturer, assistant, docent, and finally — professor at various USA higher education institutions, took an active part in the social life of local Latvians, was buried in Stephens Point, USA; the present paper regards F. Murāns' poetry first published in the collection "Ilgu zeme" [The Land of Longing] (Bayern, 1946) and later included in the edition "Svešumā klīstot" [Roaming in Foreign Lands] (Rēzekne, 1993);

7) *Ontons Zvīdris* (1911-1992) — a painter, sculptor and writer born in Makašēni civil parish (at that time a part of Rēzekne district) who was sent to Germany in 1942 where he worked as a farm hand near Flensburg, after World War II he stayed in Flensburg, studied at Dusseldorf Art Academy, in 1946 moved to England, in 1949 — to Canada where he graduated from art college and organized several exhibitions, died in Toronto, Canada; the present paper regards O. Zvīdris' poetry form collections "Tu" [You] (Munich, 1974), "Dvēseles ilgas un sāpes" [Longing and Pain of the Soul] (Rēzekne, 2001), as well as exile periodicals.

(https://latgalesdati.du.lv/; http://literatura.lv/lv/post/index; Paukšte, Rancāne,

Salceviča)

It must be emphasized that the present paper analyzes texts created both in the Latvian literary language and Latgalian dialect. These poems are available not only in individual collections but also in periodicals. In fact, these works have been and still remain little known to Latvian readers. In the context of treating the subject matter of festivities, texts of the mentioned corpus have not been previously analyzed by other scholars.

Festivals Occurring Most Often in Latgalian Poetry of Exile

Literary scholar Inguna Daukste-Silasproģe (1968), in her analysis of the period of refugee years, indicates that it is marked by "poetry as a dominant, yet quantitatively prevalent books of short prose fiction, not poetry" (Daukste-Silasproģe (2002) 168). According to the scholar, it is exactly "lyric that has always most directly reacted to the changes, events, and experiences of the epoch" (Daukste-Silasproģe (2002) 188).

The study of Latgalian poetry of exile has led to a conclusion that, firstly, from a broad range of festivities and holidays, Christmas and Easter are mentioned in these texts most frequently. This is accounted for by the fact that, in both cases, there has been synthesis of both ancient Latvian traditional, i.e., heathen, festivities and later inherited Christian festivities and traditions. In other words, this concerns the national culture code characteristic of exiles and simultaneously the evidence of deep religious feelings characteristic of Latgalians (mostly Catholics) that are manifested in the poems under analysis by means of the subject matter related to Christmas and Easter. In this context, special importance is attributed to the idea of spiritual elevation and rebirth that poets often include on the acoustic level. Most often, the initial acoustic impulse in this kind of poems is given by church bell tolls, festive melodies and other phenomena of audial register. These sounds provoke self-reflections of the lyrical hero/heroine on the life in foreign land and the lost paradise of homeland that, in turn, makes it possible to form a kind of a portal through which one can mentally, if not physically, return to past and linger in the scenes of festivities celebrated long ago. This short journey that is made by heroes in their mind causes sense of harmony and happiness.

Secondly, it must be noted that New Year appears in a similar context that in the reality of the land of settlement assumes a specific semantic of a point of reference, with constant regularity (due to its annual occurrence) evoking consideration of the opportunity of return to homeland. The more years are spent by poets in exile, the more pessimistic their self-reflections become, as they see

the current year off. Hence, cases of actualization of New Year, as compared to depictions of Christmas and even Easter, must be acknowledged as grim testimonial of inner pain in the corpus of poetry under analysis.

It must be noted that other festivals and holidays in works by Latgalian poets of exile occur much more seldom, they do not manifest as radically and emotionally as Christmas, Easter, and New Year.

Christmas

Despite the difficulties faced by Latgalian literati in various lands of settlement (status of a foreigner, psychological trauma, desperate search for a job, etc.), depiction of Christmas in their poetry is generally rather light and optimistic, as they mostly convey hope for return to Latvia some day.

Jōņs Leidumnīks in the 1950-1970s, in his poetry published both in collections and periodicals, associates Christmas with hope and peace of mind. In his interpretation, Christmas is the time when one has an opportunity to return in one's thoughts to one's homeland, thus having spiritual rest:

"Zīmassvātkus gaidūt…"

[...] Lyuk, Zīmassvātki pi vōrtim,
Un snīdzeņš kreit kai zvaigzneites
Pa pogolmu, uz dōrza kōrtim,
Kur seņdīnōs reiz gōju es…

Myrdzušais tōļumu gaišums
Naktī šai atspeid kai zalts.
Svātki dūs cereibas mums
Reitam, nu Dīva kas calts. [...].
(Leidumnīks (1959) 30)

"Expecting Christmas..."

[...] See, Christmas is near,
And snow is falling like small stars
In the yard, on garden fence,
Where once upon a time I walked...

The glistening lightness of afar
Shines as gold in this night.
Festivity gives us hope
For the morrow raised by God. [...].

"Zīmassvatkūs"

[...] Sirds soka: ir atgōjuši Kristus svātki!
Tymsa zuduse, gaisma vysur mirdz… [...].
(Leidumnīks (1969) 1)

"At Christmas"

[...] Heart says: Christ's festivity has come!
Darkness is gone, light shines everywhere... [...].

“Zīmassvātki”	**“Christmas”**
[...] Kristus prīcu vēsteis Vysam pasauļam un tev dzimtine [...]. (Leidumnīks (1971) 1)	[...] Christ will bring a joyous message To the whole world and you homeland [...].

Christmas scenes included in poetry collections by Janīna Babre published in the 1960s—1970s in the USA and Belgium greatly remind of meditations and mysteries. The author who had religion as an important source of inspiration in her texts willingly sets on dream journeys to homeland and this usually happens at the time of celebrations of the birth of Christ. In this context, a sound of sleigh bells ringing becomes an acoustic stimulus, whereas the colour of white gains specific semantic as a symbol of purity and innocence — e.g. white clothing, white snow, etc. Christmas miracle conveyed in the author’s poetry is revealed in an opportunity, even if in one’s mind and for a very short while, to visit native land that suddenly becomes close, as well as to see father’s house that is the most consequent association with the lost homeland. However, it is essential that the visit of father’s house is not described in these lines:

“Sapņu brauciens”	**“A Dream Journey”**
Ziemassvētki, Ziemassvētki, Skanošs brauciens divjūgā! Agri rieti, vēli lēkti, Zvaigznes saplaukst brīnumā.	Christmas, Christmas, A sonorous ride in a sleigh! Early sunsets, late sunrises, Stars flourish in a miracle.
Ziemas sniega miera klāsti, Baltās drānas, Betlēme, — Atkal dzīvi senie stāsti, Tuva tuva dzimtene!	Peaceful loads of winter snow, White clothes, Bethlehem, — The olden tales are alive again, The homeland is near by!
Ziemassvētki, Ziemassvētki Sniega klaju baltumā. — Aizslīdu uz tēva māju Zvanu skaņu vieglumā… (Babre (1968) 116)	Christmas, Christmas In the white of the plains of snow. — I glide to my father’s house In the lightness of the sounds of bells...

In J. Babre's poetry, a trip to homeland in one's mind is provoked also by the tunes of Christmas luxuriantly celebrated in the land of settlement — both well known to the author and totally new and unknown. The joyful scene of celebrations observed by the lyrical heroine in the foreign land is contrasted to her serious thoughts and prayer sent to God for retrieving the lost paradise that is in fact a prayer of all Latvian nation and her greatest dream:

"Zīmassvātki svešumā"	**"Christmas in the Foreign Land"**
Ir skaisti Zīmassvātki svešumā, Daudz krōšņu guņteņu un rūtu kūšu, Bet skots maņ klejoj kaut kur tōļumā Kur voska sveces gada līsmu spūžu.	Christmas is beautiful in the foreign land, Lots of bright firelights and flowers, But my look wanders in the far distance Where wax candles burn with a bright flame.
Ir skoni Zīmassvātki svešumā, Skaņ ilgi tyvas, senōs melodijas Un jaunas vēstej Svātku tyvumu Un tūmār — dūmas vysam pōri vejās:	Christmas is loud in the foreign land, Familiar, old tunes are sounding And new ones herald the coming of the Festival And yet — thoughts meander above all:
Kaut kur aiz guņteņu un skaņu klaigom, Kur apsnyguši egļu syli Vēļ šudiņ speitej tundrom, taigom, (Tū zemi, Kungs, Tu labi zyni!) Uz turīni myus' ved, mes lyudzam, Kungs, myusu zemi prosom, lyudzom! (Babre (1969) 1)	Somewhere beyond the clamour of fires and sounds, Where fir forests are covered with snow Keep spiting tundras, taigas, (Lord, You know that land well!) Take us there, we pray, Lord, we pray, we beg for our land!

Similar praying for the Latvian people in exile is found in Marija Andžāne's poetry where main accents are placed on spiritual light that, as a result of God's beneficial interference, like white snowflakes, might cover the doubts of the exiles:

“Zīmassvātkūs”	**“At Christmas”**
[…] Lai gaišums šys uz myusu sirdim mōj!	[…] May this light wave to our hearts!
Lai apskaidroj un pasorgoj nu grāka, Lai paceļt skotu augšup spātu mes, Lai trymdas ceļūs napītryuktu spāka, Lai stypri gora gaismā tveramēs! [...]. (Andžāne 43)	May it clarify and safeguard from sin, So that we would be able to raise our eyes up, So that we would not lose strength in exile routes, So that we keep strong in the light of spirit! [...].

The symbol of spiritual vertical, faith, and hope — the burning Christmas candle — used by Janīna Babre in poem “Christmas in the Foreign Land” appears also in M. Andžāne’s poem where the desperate mother of exile is looking at it:

“Saruna ar dālu”	**“Talking to the Son”**
Pleiv voska svece uz golda, Ir Zīmsvātku vokors vāls. — Tev līgta nūskaņa solda. Muns svešumā asūšais dāls. [...].	Wax candle is flickering on the table, It’s late Christmas night. — You are forbidden the sweet air. My son in the far-away land. [...].
Ar klusu dvēseles vaidu, Kod Zīmsvātku sveceite mirdz, Es tevi pōrnōkam gaidu, Lai mīru atrostu sirds. [...]. (Andžāne 147)	With a soft moan of the soul, When Christmas candle is shining, I await for you to return, For my heart to be at peace. [...].

It is noteworthy that also in this poem journey to native land is carried out in one’s mind, while longing for reunion with native land, analogous to poem “A Dream Journey” by J. Babre cited above, assumes a shape of a sleigh ride, and this time again the destination of the journey taken in mind — the house — is never reached:

— Es gorā steidzūs uz sātu	I hurry home in my spirit
Kur svātku guņs vilinūt speid…	Where festive light shines alluring...
Uz bērneibas zemi svātku	To the land of childhood festivity
Maņ ilgas kai komonas sleid…	My longing glides as a sleigh...
Es sapnūs pi tevis tikšu,	I will reach to you in my dreams,
Kur čaukstādams smōrdoj sīns,	Where hay is fragrant and swishing,
Uz tō sovu smogumu likšu	I will place my burden on it
Un svešumā nabyušu vīns.	And won't be alone in the far-away land.
(Andžāne 147)	

The Christmas candle burning in the church becomes a central image also in the poem by Vladislavs Bojārs written in the 1950s where it helps overcome fear and darkness, becoming a landmark for the spirit of the lyrical hero wandering in the dark:

"Advents"	**"Advent"**
[...] Brīnūt pa snīgim, — tymsā nav baiļ,	[…] Wading through snows, — in darkness there is no fear,
Jo gaisma blōzmojās zaigōs. —	Because light is shining like dawn. —
Klausitēs, brōli! Advents ņyu klōt!	Listen, brothers! Advent is here!
Bazneicā aizdagta svece. [...].	A candle is lit in the church. [...].
(Bojārs 281)	

The situation when the lyrical hero "was in spirit in homeland" occurs in poetry by Latgalian authors of exile without any external acoustic effects. This approach is characteristic of Ontons Zvīdris' poetry. The exile hero depicted by this author is able to spontaneously recall the Christmas lavishly celebrated in native land that cannot be fulfilled at present in the foreign land. This ideal festivity is associated with joy, smiles, lots of guests and treats, as well as traditions:

“Adventa laiks”	**“The Time of Advent”**
[…] Un dreiži satak pylna sābru ustoba Ar na jau lyugtim cīmenim, Bet vīnmār eisti gaideitim. Skaņ klusi smīkly, jautra bārnu volūdeņa. [...]. (Zvīdris (1974) 218)	[...] And soon the neighbours’ room fills With guests not really invited, Yet always really welcome. Quiet laughter, merry children’s talk is heard around. [...].

“Zīmassvātki”	**“Christmas”**
[...] I munā sātā sabrauce Daudz meilu, meilu cīmeņu. Skar munas rūkas augumus, Kam prīca acīs — vaigā zīd Un meily smaidi lyupōs plaukst. [...]. (Zvīdris (1974) 162)	[...] My home, too, Is full of dear, dear guests. My hands are touching bodies That flourish with joy in eyes — in the face And warm smiles blossom on their lips. [...].

The traditional Latgalian attributes for Christmas celebrations — hay placed under the table-cloth on the table, *kalada* (blessed bread), *kuchas* (dish made of barley or wheat grains stewed with a half of a hog’s head), beer — are depicted by Leonards Latkovskis in his poem that in fact is a journey to the author’s childhood made “by the memory tracks”:

“Zīmassvātkūs”	**“At Christmas”**
[...] Uz golda sīns, klōts ar goldautu boltu, Tur kalada, maize, kūčas un ols. Tāvs lyugšonu skaita ar cīneibu stoltu. [...]. (Latkovskis 8)	[…] Hay on the table, covered with a white cloth, Kalada, bread, kuchas, and beer there. Father says prayers with stately respect. [...].

It is noteworthy that such journeys are carried out by L. Latkovskis’ lyrical hero, respectively, the poet himself, in complete silence with clear awareness that it is no more than just a dream:

“Zīmassvātku sapyns svešumā”	**“Christmas Dream in a Foreign Land”**
[...] Vyss klus kai dīvnomā. Ni vōvereite loksta, ni dzenis prīdē kaļ. Tik es pa snīgu brīnu kai gōju putnys spōrnim nūlaistim, Kas pazaudējis ceļu atpakaļ.” (Latkovskis 169)	[...] All is silent like in a church. Neither a squirrel hops, nor a woodpecker pecks in the pine-tree. Only me wading through the snow like a bird of passage with wings down, Who has lost its way back.

Easter

Easter is usually depicted in Latgalian poetry of exile in a different tonality, though the expressive means used by the authors are generally rather similar (acoustic impulse, the image of a candle). The longer the lyrical hero/heroine stays in the foreign land, the smaller his/her hope of “resurrection”, i.e. return to the homeland becomes.

Janīna Babre constantly relates Easter and particularly Good Friday to the destruction of the town of Rēzekne in Latgale in the post-war time, when, as a result of Soviet aviation bombarding, almost hundred civilians died and several thousands remained without shelter. In the poem, this historical background is positioned as a stimulus for becoming a fugitive. Thus a parallel is drawn between the crucifixion of Jesus Christ and the tragedy experienced by the Latvian people, as they had to leave their dear homeland:

“Stabat mater”	**“Stabat mater”**
[...] Šo Lielo Piektdienu neaizmirsīs Rēzekne, kad ļaudis drupas pameta un izgāja uz lielceļa, lai bēgļu gaitas uzsāktu. [...]. (Babre (1978) 90)	[...] This Good Friday Rēzekne will never forget, when people left the ruins and went on the highway, to set on their fugitive way. [...].

Notwithstanding the Easter church sounds identical for homeland and similarly yellow sun of the land of settlement, the lyrical heroine of M. Andžāne’s poem realizes that she is no longer “the same”, that is, she no longer believes in the

miracle of resurrection and cannot be truly joyful:

“Leldīnas trymdā”	**“Easter in Exile”**
Duņ zvoni Leldīnōs	Bells toll at Easter
Un prīcas vēsti junda	And pass the joyous message
Kai lobōs seņdīnōs,	Like in good old days,
Tik nanōk mīra stuņde.	Just the hour of rest does not come.
Tei poša skaņa sleid	The same sound is gliding
Kai seņōk Latvijā	Like it used to in Latvia
Nu augstim tūrņgolim,	From high tower peaks,
Tei poša saule speid	The same sun is shining
Kai dzymtā nūvōdā	Like in the native land
Ap boltim dīvnomim…	Around white churches...
Tik sirds tei poša nav —	The heart is not the same —
Tei natic breinumim.	It does not believe in miracles.
Šai gaišā svātreitā.	On this light holy morning.
Duņ zvoni Leldīnōs	Bells toll at Easter
Un jaunu dzeivi junda	And stir a new life
Kai lobōs seņdīnōs —	Like in good old days —
Bet nanōk prīcas stuņde.	Just the hour of joy does not come.
(Andžāne 47)	

Ambivalent feelings are caused by the remembered Easter celebration scene in the church of native Rogovka for the lyrical hero of Ontons Zvīdris’ poem. Observing streams and listening to their appealing sounds (another significant acoustic detail-impulse), he cannot really tell whether in this water his native land is washing or crying:

“Leldīnas svešumā”	**“Easter in a Foreign Land”**
[...] Īlejōs burbuļoj strauti,	[...] Streams gurgle in valleys,
klausūtīs līkās tik jauki,	they seem so nice to listen to,
sudobra seiceni zvoni	tiny silver bells
skaņ kai nu šļupsteigom mēlem.	sound like from babbling tongues.
Nazynu eistyn, voi mozgojās zeme,	I don’t really know whether the land is
voi osoras lelas tei raud…	washing,
(Zvīdris (2001) 52)	or shedding big tears...

The motif of suffering and tears of humankind is repeated by the author in a poem published in periodicals:

“Lelā Pīktdīnā”	**“Good Friday”**
[...] Daudz cīššonu un sōpu apkōrt	[...] Much suffering and pain are around
šudiņ,	today,
Kū cylvāks pats ir nataisneibā	That human has himself created in
radējis.	injustice.
Nu jauna ašņa upes plyust	Once again blood rivers are flowing
Un osoras nu vaiga ciļvēces,	And tears from the humankind’s face
Vēļ ilgi, ilgi nanūžyust. [...].	Do not dry for a long long time. [...].
(Zvīdris (1975) 3)	

Easter church bells make Francis Murāns think of Jesus Christ’s sacrifice for the sake of humankind, agony experienced by Latvian people and opportunities of possible rescue in the “eternal light” of the netherworld. Hence, this concerns reflections of a believer who no longer hopes for a harmonious life in this reality and possible return to Latvia, yet, according to the canons of Christian faith, is certain that a different life is possible when the soul reaches heaven, that is, after one’s physical death:

“Leldīnes reitā”	**“On Easter Morning”**
[...] Tod radzu es otkon kai sauli tū reitu,	[...] Then I see again that morning like the sun,
uz golvas kod zīdi nu ōbelem bērst,	when apple-tree blossoms fall on my head,
kai osorom acīs pret Tū ceļūs kreitu,	when I fall to my knees with tears in my eyes at Him,
kas manis dēļ Golgotā nūmūceits mērst. [...].	who dies at Golgotha for me in agony. [...].
Kod Leldīnes zvoni nu bazneicas boltōs	When Easter bells from the white church
par myužeigu gaismu un piļneibu pauž,	profess about eternal light and perfection,
es ceļūs tod gorā nu dzeives šōs soltōs	I rise then in spirit from this bleak life
tur tōli, kur zvaigznes maņ vaiņuku auž.(Murāns 51)	there in the distance where stars weave a wreath for me.

New Year

Poetry by Latgalian poets in exile dedicated to New Year seems even more pessimistic against the background of other works. The motif of doom in it is closely related to the idea of cyclic repetition: starting each new calendar year, the lyrical hero/heroine concludes that nothing has changed in his/her life: another year passes, like many others, but the situation remains unchanged — he/she is still living in exile without any perspectives of the change of the status of exile.

“Dark veil of sorrow”, “unrest of heart”, and “mean sadness” saturate the poem by Marija Andžāne where the focus event is the need for the Latvian people to set on roaming “anew” without any prospects for stability and happiness in future:

“Jaunā godā”	**“At New Year”**
Tymss bādu pleivurs apkōrt klōjīs, Kai ānas sōpes pōri gulst… Šķīt, laiks ar mīra vēsti stōjīs, Nu jauna namīram sirds mulst, Nu jauna ceļam kōjas aunam, Lai izkleistu pa tōlumim, Nu jauna sirdis skumem ļaunam Mes, moldūtīs pa svešumim. (Andžāne 44)	Dark veil of sorrow lies all around, Pain like shadows falls upon... It seems that time has stopped with the tidings of peace, Heart is confused with unrest anew, We are setting on our way anew, To wander into far away, Anew we give our hearts to mean sadness Wandering in the foreign lands.

The idea of “Brīves Diena” [Day of Freedom] that most probably will befall only descendants of Latvian exiles is expressed in Francis Murāns’ poem dedicated to the subject matter of New Year:

“Jaunajā gadā”	**“At New Year”**
[...] Kā lielā spogulī mēs tanīs skatus metam un skumji nopūšamies, redzot takas ietas, kad zinām, mīdīt tās būs lemts varbūt tik retam un atkal redzēt sapņu ziediem vītās vietas… Ies gads pēc gada atkal, daudzi zudīs dzīvei un mieru atradīs kaut kur zem svešām smiltīm, bet tie, kas paliks, ies arvienu tuvāk brīvei, lai celtu karogu par aizgājušām ciltīm. [...]. (Murāns 56)	[...] Like in a large mirror we throw our glances in them [memories — O. K.] and sadly sigh, seeing the paths bygone, knowing that only few will be destined to tread upon them and see the places twined with dream flowers... Year after year will pass again, many will be lost to life and will find rest somewhere beneath the foreign sands, but those who stay, will come nearer to freedom, to raise the flag for bygone tribes. [...].

The poems cited in the article were selected as the brightest testimonial to the contemporary epoch saturated with strong experiences of Latgalian poets of exile — psychological trauma after the loss of homeland as well as survival in exile. Further in-depth study of this literary narrative will provide for specifying other nuances of treatment of the subject of festivities and reveal new opportunities of its analysis.

Conclusion

After the end of World War II, with the institution of Soviet totalitarian power, approximately 10% of the total population of Latvia including many representatives of intelligentsia went on exile. Reaching various lands of settlement, there arose necessity to survive physically and continue acting in the sphere of culture. The acquired traumatic experience appears in diverse documents of that time, literary works among them. The contribution of poets in exile who were born in Latgale, south-eastern region of Latvia, in this context is significant with the peculiar actualizing of the subject of festivities. Festivities (mostly Christmas and Easter) as an important part of national legacy for these authors allow not only ascertain their belonging to their nation and culture but also form a binary opposition between the Golden Age of past in homeland (harmony, happiness, agreement, peace represented by the topos of house, richly laid table, lit candles and olden day traditions) and the Iron Age of present in the foreign land (unaccustomed sounds, crowds of people, incessant wandering, pain, impasse). Mental journey to homeland greatly stimulated by the sounds heard in the foreign land (festive bell toll, tunes, sleigh bells, running stream water) provoke diverse emotions of lyrical heroes: longing, hope, doubt, disbelief, despair. The change of the emotional state conveyed in poetry is conditioned by the number of years spent in foreign lands that grows at the moment of the beginning of the current New Year.

Works Cited

Andžāne, Marija. *Namīra vōrtūs*. Lirika. [Feldāfinga]: A. Jūrdža fonds, 1951.

Anikin, Daniil Aleksandrovich. “Prazdnik kak jelement kul’turnoj pamjati migracionnogo soobshhestva.” *Studia Humanitatis* No 2 (2018): www.st-hum.ru (last viewed 06.05.2020).

Babre, Janīna. *Meditācija naktī.* Dzejoļi. Luvēna: Gaisma, 1978.

—. *Meditācijas.* Čikāga: Jāņa Šķirmanta apgāds, 1968.

—. “Zīmassvātki svešumā.” *Latgolas Bolss* 20. decembris, 1969: 1.

Bennett, Andy, Taylor, Jodie, Woodward, Ian. “Introduction.” *The Festivalization of Culture.* Eds. Andy Bennett, Jodie Taylor, Ian Woodward. London and New York: Routledge, 2016. 1-8.

Bojārs, Vladislavs Daneļs. *Sirds smeļdze.* Dzeju krōjums trejōs daļōs (1944-1957). [Minhene]: P/s

Latgaļu izdevnīceiba, 1957.

Celle, Ojārs. "Ieskats trimdas latviešu kultūras arhipelagā." *Konferences "Trimda. Kultūra. Nacionālā identitāte" rakstu krājums.* 2004. gada 30. septembris — 2. oktobris. Rīgas Latviešu biedrība. Pasaules Brīvo Latviešu apvienības kultūras fonds. Latvijas Valsts arhīvs. Sast. D. Kļaviņa, M. Brancis. Rīga: nordik, 2004. 5-11.

Daukste-Silasproģe, Inguna. *Latviešu literārā dzīve un latviešu literatūra bēgļu gados Vācijā, 1944—1950.* Rīga: Zinātne, 2002.

—. *Latviešu literārā dzīve un literatūra ASV un Kanādā, 1950—1965.* Rīga: Valters un Rapa, 2007.

Korolova, Jelena, Badins, Zans, Kacane, Ilze, Kovzele, Oksana, Brakovska, Anna. "Festivities and Holidays in the Border-zone: The Case of Latgale." *2nd International Multidisciplinary Scientific Conference on Social Sciences & Arts SGEM 2015*. Conference Proceedings. Book 1. *Psychology and Psychiatry, Sociology and Healthcare, Education*. Volume 1. Bulgaria, 2015. 543-550.

Kreinath, Jens, Hartung, Constance, Deschner, Annette. "Introduction." *The Dynamics of Changing Rituals. The Transformation of Religious Rituals within Their Social and Cultural Context*. Eds. Jens Kreinath, Constance Hartung, Annette Deschner. New York: Peter Lang Publishing, 2004. 1-7.

Latkovskis, Leonards. *Dzymtōs zemes ļaudis. II.* [Minhene]: P/s Latgaļu izdevnīceiba, 1983.

Leidumnīks, Jōņs. *Tāva pogolmā. I.* Dzejūli. [Minhene]: P/s Latgaļu izdevnīceiba, 1959.

—. "Zīmassvātki." *Latgolas Bolss* 18. decembris, 1971: 1.

—. "Zīmassvatkūs." *Latgolas Bolss* 20. decembris: 1969: 1.

Nollendorfs, Valters. "Trimdas literatūras periodizācija II." *Konferences "Trimda. Kultūra. Nacionālā identitāte" rakstu krājums.* 2004. gada 30. septembris — 2. oktobris. Rīgas Latviešu biedrība. Pasaules Brīvo Latviešu apvienības kultūras fonds. Latvijas Valsts arhīvs. Sast. D. Kļaviņa, M. Brancis. Rīga: nordik, 2004. 218-230.

Mardorossian, Carine M. "From Literature of Exile to Migrant Literature." *Modern Language Studies* Vol. 32, No 2 (Autumn, 2002): 15-33.

Murāns, Francis. *Svešumā klīstot.* Rēzekne: Latgales Kultūras centra izdevniecība, 1993.

Paukšte, Jānis, Rancāne, Anna, Salceviča, Irēna. *Latgales kultūras darbinieki. 1.—2.* Rīga: Jumava, 2008.

Plakans, Andrejs. "Latviešu trimda pēc Otrā pasaules kara." *Nacionālā enciklopēdija.* https://enciklopedija.lv/skirklis/4556-Latvie%C5%A1u-trimda-p%C4%93c-Otr%C4%81-pasaules-kara (last viewed 06.05.2020).

Saha, Amit Shankar. "Exile Literature and the Diasporic Indian Writer." *Rupkatha Journal on Interdisciplinary Studies in Humanities* Vol. 1. No 2 (Autumn, 2009): 186-196.

Zalāne, Paulīne. "Latgales rakstnieku devums trimdā." *Konferences "Trimda. Kultūra. Nacionālā*

identitāte" rakstu krājums. 2004. gada 30. septembris — 2. oktobris. Rīgas Latviešu biedrība. Pasaules Brīvo Latviešu apvienības kultūras fonds. Latvijas Valsts arhīvs. Sast. D. Kļaviņa, M. Brancis. Rīga: nordik, 2004. 257-268.

Zvīdris, Ontons. *Dvēseles ilgas un sōpes.* Dzejūli. Rēzekne: Latgolas Kulturas centra izdevnīceiba, 2001.

—. "Lelā Pīktdīnā." *Latgolas Bolss* 29. marts, 1975: 3.

—. *Tu.* Dzeju krōjums. [Minhene]: P/s Latgaļu izdevnīceiba, 1974.

https://latgalesdati.du.lv/ [database] (last viewed 06.05.2020).

http://literatura.lv/lv/post/index [portal] (last viewed 06.05.2020).

Four Distinctive Features in the Early Dawn of Vernacular Spanish Poetics: Between Classical Influence and the Italian Style Ruling

Irene Rodríguez Cachón
Departamento de Educación, Facultad de Ciencias Sociales y Humanas
Universidad Loyola Andalucía
Avda. de las Universidades s/n, 41704 Dos Hermanas, Sevilla, Spain
Email: irodriguez@uloyola.es

Abstract During most of the 16th century, Spanish Poetics was understood as something difficult to figure it out. Therefore, the first poetic standards that organized and fixed the new way of doing poetry — both in their principles and in their uses — did not appear in the Iberian Peninsula until almost the last two decades of the 16th century. However, this fact does not imply that the Spanish poets were not caught up in the new winds of change, which had started early in the same century in Italy. Therefore, some treatises, which seek to explain and systematize a new poetic regulation just all in Spanish, rather than in Latin, begin to appear timidly from 1580 onwards. This article will attempt to propose and summarize four distinctive features that explain why the modern Spanish poetic treatises come so chronologically late regarding the rest of Europe. In addition, it will point out the fundamental aspects of the new modern Spanish Poetics, considering the most significant titles that were published in Spain at the dawn of the Early Modern Age.

Key words Poetics, Classical antiquity, Italian-style, vernacular Spanish, features

Author **Irene Rodríguez Cachón,** PhD in Spanish Philology, is Assistance Professor in Spanish Language and Literature at the Universidad Loyola Andalucía (Spain). Prior to joining Loyola, she also obtained a four-year research predoctoral scholarship at University of Valladolid and a two-year postdoctoral contract at the Universität Münster (Germany). Her main research interests focus on Spanish Golden Age Literature with special attention to 16th century Classical translations, Poetics, and narrative miscellaneous texts, as well as Spanish Language and Literature Didactics.

Apes, ut aiunt, debemus imitari.
Seneca

No todos los pensamientos y consideraciones de amor, y de las más cosas que toca la poesía cayeron en la mente del Petrarca y del Bembo y de los antiguos.
Fernando de Herrera (16th century)

When studying of how it must be developed and conceived a literary text, firstly it is indispensable to know the ideological, cultural, and literary background of the literary moment it has been devised. Concerning that, the well-known Spanish literary academic Claudio Guillén (142) pointed out quite rightly that "every period, every school or every critical approach takes its situational prism, that it is to say, it is reformatted from other issues or questions that constitute their historical setting or in connection with it." Thus, the moment muse of the literary theorists will help us to reconstruct widely the broadly literary sense of any text.

Therefore, in the late Spanish 16th century, —as the modern Spanish poetic language started to consolidate and the dawn of the century—, many factors and historical events started to converge and markedly affect the birth and subsequent development of Spanish Poetics by itself. This meant that at the beginning of the Spanish Early Modern Age (mid-late 16th century), the early new Spanish Poetics features noteworthy characteristics that stemmed from the idiosyncrasies of the political, social, cultural and historical development.

This brief discussion aims to put forward four general distinctive features on this peculiar situation that shaped modern Spanish poetry theoretical precepts and provides some wide general arguments that would help to explain it based on its classical shaping influences.

The Spanish Poetics during the 16th Century

Contrary to what it occurred in much of Europe, throughout the Middle Age and Early Renaissance, poetry did not play a significant role as a specific and distinguishing subject area in vernacular Spanish literature. The few theoretical studies about poetry found could be included in some grammar and rhetoric books under the sub-heading of *artes versificatoriae* or *artes poetriae*[1] and they are rather

1 The *artes versificatoriae* or *artes potriae* "covers the borderline area between Rhetoric and Poetics. The expression *poetria*, which appeared around 1200, represents the instruction of verse writing and achieving the stylistic effect through tropes, figures, composition and other means. [...]. In its final stages, medieval rhetoric gradually but more consistently applied its rules to the works of literature as well as preaching in national languages" (Kraus 92).

simple descriptive texts more than an analysis or pedagogical document on the poetic craft.

Poetic theoretical treaties in the new established Spanish language —dealing with the subject exclusively and with enough comprehensiveness— are not frequently found until well the beginning of 17th century. This situation has led some critics to insist to this day on the perhaps misleading idea that Spanish poets in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries were "prodigious improvisers" because they sought the direct empirical imitation of Italian Renaissance poets[1]. This somewhat elevated conception of the genius of 16th century Spanish poets is perhaps somewhat inaccurate. However, although the chronological data seems to support this claim, it is also in somehow deceptively because until 1580 it does not appear published the first two modern poetic theoretical attempts[2]: the hardly known *El Arte Poética en Romance Castellano* by the Portuguese Miguel Sánchez de Lima and the renowned *Anotaciones a la poesía de Garcilaso* by the celebrated Fernando de Herrera. These publications about modern poetry principles in the new vernacular Spanish language, very delayed and extemporaneous in chronological terms, have helped bolster this high regard of Spanish poets of this period.

Moreover, it is also true that generally any instructional compendium on any subject is always created *a posteriori* what it aims to prescribe. However, if this element is also considered, the influence of the new Spanish poetic theoretical treatises on Spanish authors of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries must have been rather limited and even more questionable in the most innovative poets.

Nevertheless, it is likewise important to underscore that all literary authors —even the most unconventional— strive for their work to follow the accepted artistic and rhetorical channels, whether implied or intrinsic, carved out by the transcendent literary texts in their field. This fact was, if anything, more significant during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries when the theory of *imitatio* of Classical antiquity models permeated everything. It implied following a tradition, which was already certified and therefore prestigious.

Moreover, the clear majority of Spanish literate and knowledgeable people of the time had a fair mastery of Italian. Therefore, from early on, they had access to a wealth of Italian theoretical treatises, which were decisively instrumental in the creation of the extraordinary literary activity of the next century poetry.

1 This idea comes principally from Vilanova (567—692).

2 We call these two books "attempts" because although they deal with poetic analysis, any of them were designed or conceived as a poetic treatise themselves. It has been the later critical labour the one that has defined them as poetic instructions.

Accordingly, it would perhaps be more appropriate to change our perspective of the scientific approach to them, from "prodigious improvisers" to the excellent interpretation that López Bueno makes in this regard. She considers that Spanish 16th century authors are "the most eloquent example of empirical learning" (98), not only for their assimilation of the Italian literary world —with varying results— but also for their continual scouring of Greek and for Roman classics, especially authors such as Ovid, Virgil or Horace.

Thus, it can also be said that modern poetic prescriptive standards in new vernacular Spanish, although far removed from the poetic yearnings of the moment, are born and structured simultaneously to its practice but it took more time to put in words. This parallel receptivity changed throughout the 17th century, as Spanish poetic theorists began to be more interested in the actual literary activity around them and immediately, they started to score and discuss about. This culminated in the famous poetic controversies starred the next century by poets like Luis de Góngora and Francisco de Quevedo, perhaps one of the most significant and decisive epicentres and poetic ideological battles in the Spanish literature.

Shaping the Birth of Modern Vernacular Spanish Poetical Treatises

Since the early 1530s, the Italian manners and style increasingly guided how poetry must be written in the new consolidated vernacular Spanish language. Many Spanish authors travelled continuously to Italy and established strong ties, including acclaimed Spanish Renaissance poets such as Garcilaso de la Vega, Gutierre de Cetina or Hernando de Acuña, among others. These authors gave proof of the modern poetic reality that would very soon begin to emerge in Spain. It this sense, it is important to remember that in 1543 the widow of Juan Boscán (the first Spanish translator of Baldasare Castiglione's *The Book of the Courtier*) published in Barcelona a volume entitled *Las obras de Boscán y algunas de Garcilaso de la Vega*. This work marks a clear path to follow (Petrarch–style approaches and classical Latin references) and became a watershed event in the ultimate nationalisation of Italian-style new Spanish poetry.

To understand why and how this new poetry arises in Spain, it is first important to bear in mind the long time span between the publication of the ultimate example of the courtly lyric poets of the medieval songbooks, Juan del Encina's medieval poetic treatise *Arte de Trobar*, in 1496 and the publication in 1580 of the two first poetic modern treatises attempts abovementioned —*El Arte Poética en Romance*

Castellano by Sánchez de Lima[1], but most notably, Fernando Herrera's *Anotaciones a la poesía de Garcilaso*—. These two texts represent the turning point and transition to another and fresh way of understanding the new poetry written in Spanish language, which it will become delineated during the 17th century.

According to this, in this wide-ranging poetic scene, it is equally important to note also that, after Sánchez de Lima and Herrera, in the short time slot between 1580 and 1605 up to four great generations of literary authors co–exist, all of whom are very different in their understanding of literature and the topics they handle. In the first place, teachers and mentors (Fernando de Herrera himself or Fray Luis de León), authors who straddled various periods (Vicente Espinel or Miguel de Cervantes, among others), then the reformers (Lope de Vega, Tirso de Molina or Luis de Góngora) and, finally, the young poets who were destined to coalesce the new Spanish poetry (Francisco de Rioja, Francisco de Quevedo or Pedro Espinosa, between the most representatives). In this prolific environment, both theoretical and applied, the emerging of literary controversies would be crucial to understand the evolution of modern poetic Spanish standards that will also mark the area of the new poetic prescriptive treatises.

Amid this intense literary rise, the new Spanish-language poetic theorists would still take some time to emerge, particularly as regards the poetic craft. Critics has discussed on many occasions why this delay in the appearance and final consolidation of Spanish modern Poetics, but there has not been enough consensus among it. Even so, most likely, it was the result of many circumstances of different sorts which can be gathered and reviewed in the next four features:

1) Complex and laborious adaptation and assimilation into the Spanish literary system of anything featuring Italian elements.

The majority critics agree that the Italian dominance drove the configuration of the new Spanish poetic standards in the late 16th century. Nevertheless, many distinctly traditional Spanish authors resisted these new forms and did not accept the foreign influence. They opposed to those who, at various degrees, had already assimilated these standards as their own and genuinely poetic way. However, this opposition to new influences from abroad had very little real influence because the poetic standards shaped by the traditional Castilian style had also little effect on the literary works of the time. The aesthetic and literary ideas these authors still

1 Despite the absence of treaties in the vernacular, "during the first half of the 1500s several theoretical treatises were published in Spain on poetry matters written in Latin and incorporated as appendices to rhetorical works (Rivas Hernández 70)." These works include *De ratione dicendi* (1522) by Luis Vives, *De oratione* (1554-1558) by Antonio Lulio or poetry exercises published in the annex of *De art dicendi* (1558) of Francisco Sánchez de las Brozas, "el Brocense."

professed had very limited real impact as well. Thus, this fact would certify that the literary theory was already almost anchored to the Italian influence.

However, in most cases the actual development of the Spanish poetic craft stemmed from the individual experience (and sometimes genius) of the Spanish writers and it was also very coupled with empirical guidelines imported from Italy. The consequence was that in most new literary works from the year 1560 it can be detected a clear empirical influence of literary patterns, rather than the result of any knowledge of the day's foremost European poetic treatises. In the absence of adequate modern prescriptive poetic standards in Spanish, it is common for Spanish poets who achieved a certain literary level and mastery of Italian to resort to the modern Italian theoretical models to perfect their craft, examples as *L'Arte poetica* by Minturno, Scaliger's *Poetics*, the *Discorsi* by Tasso, *L'Italia liberata* by Trisino, the *Poetica d'Aristotele vulgarizzata e sposita* by Castelvetro or Robortello or his reinterpretation of Aristotle's *Poetics*, among the most well-know.

2) The old residual medieval poetic verse was still deeply rooted in Spain, which entails a prevailing widespread desire to follow these old medieval principles throughout most of the 16th century.

Although poets realised very early that the poetry in Italian meters also offered a huge variety of possibilities in Spanish, the craft of the ancient medieval poetry songbooks was still pervasively practiced. A cursory glance at few late-medieval and early-Renaissance Spanish songs' anthologies reveals this strong support. Thus, for example, in the song collection *Cancionero General* (1511) by Hernando del Castillo the metric and poetic style of the old Spanish forms still feature prominently. This also applies to similar compilations that appeared later in the century. In another songbook compilation, *Espejo de enamorados* (1535-1539), the old medieval Spanish ballad "Romance de Fonte Frida" and the outdated medieval couplets by Garci Sánchez de Badajoz are extended and still very traded. Other mid-century late songbooks, as *Cancionero llamado Vergel de amores* (1551) by Esteban de Nájera, mostly still feature compositions, which have already still appeared, like in the example before, forty years earlier in Castillo's collection[1].

Even so, although the new Italian style was very established, only a few song collections did timidly begin to include a few new Italian-style verses and stanzas, delighted with characteristics of the incipient Renaissance environment.

1 "By around 1550 the general songbook *Cancionero General* was virtually dead, although not buried, except for some ditties and carols. [...]. Significantly, after 1540 it was no longer reprinted in Spain and the only two editions (1557 and 1573) were printed in Antwerp (contemporary Belgium), one of last places in which outlasts the defence of Spanish literary archaism" (Rodríguez Moñino 33).

This is the case of the 1564 songbook *Cancionero general de obras nuevas* which gives equal share to compositions in old Castilian meters and poetry in new Italian rhythm. Final current poetic strengthening will take some decades more to become consolidated.

Under these circumstances throughout the 15th century, Spanish poetic genres developed under two different bearings, but with continuous connections between them. The first will be the Italian vernacular-origin Petrarch-inspired system, which reached Spain fully developed. This style was imitated directly by the Spanish poets (for example, in forms like the sonnet, *madrigal* or the use of the hendecasyllable verse). The second relates to the classical or neoclassical genres of Latin Antiquity, which adapted to the new vernacular approach to poetry (poetic forms, such as the ode, the eclogue, the elegy, or the Roman epistle would be the most popular). In this line of influence, Spanish poets will no longer directly imitate the Italians but rather will blend an amalgamation of contributions from other European poetic traditions that also sought the recovery and use of the classical Greek and Latin heritage.

The outdated patterns of song collections would not truly begin to die out until the last two decades of the 16th century. However, the debate between Italians and Spaniards or hendecasyllabic *versus* octosyllabic verse will still rage for a few years more, which it will transform into the particular and idiosyncratic nuances of Spanish poetic patterns.

3) Chronological delay in the dissemination in Spain of Aristotle's *Poetics*.

This merit is often attributed to the Spanish humanist Alonso López "el Pinciano" in 1596 with his *Philosophía antigua po*ética. However, most of Aristotle's poetic ideas were already known in Spain towards the year 1550. And yet, —despite the significance of Alonso López's virtually definitive translation into Spanish of Aristotle's works— it was of little use to Spanish literary flair, not only because of its intrinsic characteristics but also because the impetus and strength of other classic poetic thinkers who had enjoyed and still enjoyed much influence in Spain. These include Horace and Plato who, as maximum *auctoritates* of the Renaissance, fuelled most of the Spanish modern reflection on the literary scene, both in substance and form. However, the penchant of Spanish humanists for the *contaminatio* between texts meant that each ideological trend would take on nuances from counter patterns. In this aspect, it is likewise important to remind that Aristotle's *Poetics* is a laborious text to assimilate because it is an argumentative treatise difficult to adapt to other formats. This feature contributed to its lack of impact in the Spanish poetic system.

In addition, the literary revolution at the turn of the century must also be

considered, triggered by the new ideas of Lope de Vega whose theories collided head–on with Aristotle's. The early appearance in 1609 of the *Arte Nuevo de hacer comedias en este tiempo* and its extremely rapid consolidation –although it directly only advocated for a renewal in theatre– had also very significantly swayed in all aspects of the Spanish literary world.

Moreover, translations of Aristotle's *Poetics* failed to take much root since there was also very little translation tradition in Spain during the 16th and 17th centuries. Spanish translators — very much in line with Erasmus ideas — had a very particular idea about how to translate. For them, translating did not imply an absolute fidelity to the text but rather an understanding of the general feeling or spirit of the text. Overlooking the intrinsic literalness assumed in standard translations resulted that many Aristotelian ideas were modified, and even perverted, scattered in prefaces, introductions, scholia, didactic treatises or miscellaneous documents. Thus, Spanish translation of Aristotle's *Poetics* barely made any impact on the synthetic Spanish scenery of translated authors during this time. The first two reliable translations into Spanish of Aristotle's *Poetics* were not published until 1626, firstly by Alonso Ordoñez das Seijas y Tobar and later by Vicente Mariner de Aragón, librarian of King Philip IV at the Monastery of San Lorenzo de El Escorial in Madrid.

4) Gradual and progressive metamorphosis of classical rhetoric towards positions that are more literary than persuasive.

The new Italian poetic standards marked in *De arte poetica* by Girolamo Vida in 1527 pointed to the full confirmation of poetry as a field separate from rhetoric. However, in Spain, this change would not become evident until well into the last third of the 16th century[1]. This transformation in turn meant a gradual but noticeable decline in the prevalence of rhetoric. One of the most eloquent quantitative data in this regard is that, strictly speaking, prior to 1580 (same year of Sánchez de Lima and Herrera's publications) there is an abundance of rhetoric publications but only a few poetic printings. After 1580, it was just the opposite, many and varied poetic works began to be published but only a few rhetoric works (Kohut 33).

Some 16th century Latin rhetoric treaties, as *Institutionum Rhetoricarum* (1554) by Fadrique Furió Ceriol, challenged the use of rhetorical principles in literature. In *De imitatione seu de informandi styli ratione* (1554), Sebastián Fox Morcillo even

1 López Bueno points out that at the outset of the Golden Age, "it is true that in terms of the treaties and theory in general, the [Spanish] authors were rather near-sighted about poetry in their surroundings. They preferred to abide by the Aristotelian and Horatian standards and couch into this format their contemporary poetry —often a very contrived arrangement" (57).

noted that rhetorical precepts could be aimed not only to the speaker but also to the writer (in most of the work the term *dicere* is replaced by *scribere*). A decisive factor in this regard is the cultural transformation involving the leap from an eminently oral culture —such as it was the medieval universe— into another world decisively committed to the written word, in which the printed text offers virtually infinite possibilities for studying the artistic language, and even more in the new demanding Spanish language.

Until the late 16th century, Spanish humanists regarded that poetry and historiography had to be subordinated to the dictates of rhetoric (Kohut 34). However, from the second half of the century a significant shift became apparent in the intrinsic configuration of rhetoric itself, since the explanation of the theoretical conscience of the work began to be fostered, in contrast to the mere *elocutio* thereof. For Spanish humanists of the first half of the 16th century, Poetics was a vague, indeterminate and common discipline that sometimes was studied diffusely by a grammarian or rhetorician. The only interest Poetics aroused had to do with the metric element (most of the time only applied to works in Latin) and theorists such as Francisco Sánchez de las Brozas, "el Brocense," with his *Organum Dialecticum et Rhetoricum* (1579), or Pedro Simón Abril, with his *Artis grammaticae latinae linguae rudimenta* (1576), briefly only study Latin literary texts exclusively in terms of metrics. Likewise, in the Spanish vernacular language, theorists such as Juan Díez de Rengifo, with his *Arte poética española* (1596), or Luis Alfonso de Carvallo, whit his *Cisne de Apolo* (1602), barely explored beyond the metric. Thus, it can be said that virtually all poetic treaties in Spanish that appeared until the *Philosophia antigua poética* (1596) dealt almost entirely with metrical aspects of poetry, without addressing essential theoretical issues, as it was the case of the new Italian poetic treaties since the early same century.

In this situation, non-prescriptive significant in shaping texts, such as Juan de Valdés' *Diálogo de la lengua* (1547) for example, are even more concerned about structuring the language itself and its results than the original treatises themselves, which they only were theoretical without getting attention into any critical literary problem. Even the influential *Anotaciones y Enmiendas a Garcilaso* (1574, and subsequent revisions) by "el Brocense" did not reached general poetic standards and conclusions because it only focuses strictly on finding Garcilaso de la Vega classical and Italian sources. In his preface to the second edition of the text in 1581, "el Brocense" even admits that he does not regard a poet who does not imitate the ancient good poets, an idea that flies in the face of the poetic originality and freedom championed by the new Italian style. Other representative, albeit partial, samples

of this mixed situation are, for instance, the famous Garcilaso de la Vega's *Carta-Prólogo* (published in Juan Boscán's translation of *The Courtier* in 1534) which only includes a brief and not very deep reflection about the new Renaissance poetry and also Gonzalo Argote y Molina's *Discurso sobre la poesía castellana*, inserted at the end of his edition of *El conde Lucanor* (1575), which only explores virtually some metrics used and others outdated, without engaging in substantial literary theorising.

However, a significant change will occur gradually through the century with respect to the usefulness of poetry beyond the metric component, a fact that will significantly influence the progressive shaping of Poetics and its gradual disengagement from rhetoric. By the late 16th century, poets will begin to appreciate instruction and delight in equal measure as the aim of good literature. From this emerging hedonistic position, some outstanding authors began to look for reasons that help to explain the purpose of art in general, and poetry in particular, an attitude that would distinguish the Spanish 17th century literature. Nevertheless, other authors would continue to follow trends more closely linked to morality. This is the case, for example, of Juan de Mariana with his *De monetae mutatione* (1609) where he rejects the delightful part of literature (which he associates with the devil, the antagonist of every good Christian) and in which he attacks anything that undermines the ethical fibre of literature.

Thereby, it began to feel the necessity to talk about Poetics as a discipline separate from Rhetoric but without ever losing sight of the rich wealth of theoretical concepts that Rhetoric accumulated since time immemorial. This moment in time has been defined as "switching between a discursive theory to a textual theory" (Luján Atienza 200), something which helped decisively to "place the poet's activity in the foreground, outranking the speaker" (Lorenzo 209). Poetics started to acquire greater autonomy, independence and generic value as a unique and individual discipline that will drive Spanish literature to its pinnacle in the 17th century.

In this exited and unique environment, Spanish poetry brought about the growth of a much more aesthetic and utilitarian poetic theory, far removed from the most conservative rhetorical patterns. This would foster the emergence of Spanish literature designed for entertainment and enjoyment with no moral purpose, but with also a solid support based on the Classical antiquity influence and the Italian-way style.

As far as the poetic theory is concerned, the Spanish poetic theorists will still take a little more time to establish their conceptual bases, a fact that will not affect to lay the solid groundwork for one of the most important and valuable literary

moments of Spanish literature that it will soon start in the 17th century. The belated but new poetic perspectives will decisively help shaping this new reality as one of the first important steps to build the modern Spanish Poetics.

Works Cited

Guillén, Claudio. *Entre lo uno y lo diverso. Introducción a la literatura comparada*. Barcelona: Crítica, 1985.

Kohut, Karl. *Las teorías literarias en España y Portugal durante los siglos XV y XVI*. Madrid: CSIC, 1973.

Kraus, Jirí. *Rhethoric in European Culture and Beyond*. Prague: Karolinum, Charles University, 2015.

López Bueno, Begoña. "Poesía, poética y retórica en el Siglo de Oro español: la teoría frente al espejo." *Literatura medieval y renacentista en España: líneas y pautas*. Ed. Fernández Rodríguez, Natalia and María Fernández Ferreiro. Salamanca: SEMYR, 2012. 97-117.

Lorenzo, Juan. "La retórica en la España del siglo XVI." *El Brocense y las humanidades en el siglo XVI*. Ed. Codoñer Merino, Carmen, Santiago López Moreda and Jesús Ureña Bracero. SEMYR: Universidad de Salamanca, 2003. 191-2010.

Luján Atienza, Ángel Luis. *Retóricas españolas del siglo XVI: el foco de Valencia*. Madrid: CSIC, 1999.

Rivas Hernández, Asunción. *De la poética a la teoría de la literatura (una introducción)*. Salamanca: Universidad de Salamanca, 2005.

Rodríguez Moñino, Antonio. *Cancionero general recopilado por Hernando del Castillo*. Madrid, 1958.

Vilanova, Antonio. "Preceptistas españoles de los siglos XVI y XVII." *Historia general de las literaturas hispánicas, III. Renacimiento y Barroco*. Ed. Guillermo Díaz Plaja. Barcelona: Ed. Barna, 1953. 567-692.

Intertextual Reflections on Nature and Solitude in Alexander Pope's "Ode on Solitude": An Islamic Perspective

Aiman Sanad Al-Garrallah & Reem Rabea
Department of English Language and Literature, Faculty of Arts
Al-Hussein Bin Talal University, Ma'an, Jordan
Email: Aiman-sanad@hotmail.com; reem_rabia@yahoo.co.uk

Abstract Many a great well-known English writer has drawn on Arabic culture. Unfortunately, those writers have not acknowledged such a cross-cultural interaction, which has been tackled by few studies. It is surprising that writers in the field have left out of their account Arabic and Islamic echoes in the poetry of Alexander Pope. This paper argues that an intertextual reading of Pope's "Ode on Solitude" uncovers a possible affinity between Pope and Islamic culture in terms of the relationship between nature, happiness, and solitude. This paper argues that Pope's "Ode on Solitude" restructures, appropriates, and even (in some cases) translates some *Quranic* verses and the *Hadith*. This paper moreover suggests that a hypertextual relationship between Pope's poem and Islam can be obviously detected.

Key words Solitude; Intertextuality; the *Quran*; *Hadith*; Nature

Authors **Aiman Sanad Al-Garrallah**, Professor in English Literature, Al-Hussein Bin Talal University, served as the Dean of Educational Sciences at Isra University, the Founding Dean of the College of Arts and Sciences and the Founding Head of the Department of English Language and Translation at Amman Arab University; and as the Head of the Department of English Language and Literature at Al-Hussein Bin Talal University. He has published about twenty peer-reviewed papers, and two translated books. **Reem Rabea**, is currently Associate Professor at Al-Hussein Bin Talal University. Her research interests include Modern English Novel in the 20th Century, Postcolonial Literature and Postcolonial Theory, Comparative Literature, British Travel Writing in the 19th and 20th Centuries and Postcolonialism and Fin-de-siècle Literature and Culture.

Many a great well-known English writer has drawn on Arabic culture. Unfortunately, those writers have not acknowledged such a cross-cultural interaction, which has been tackled by few studies. For instance, Al-Garrallah (15-41) argues that Wilfred Scawen Blunt appropriates and even translates the story of Abu Zaid Al-Hilali, who is a famous Arab legendary figure celebrated in folklore, where many stories are woven around him. In the same vein, Al-Garrallah (1-13, 101-121) unravels specific Oriental echoes in William Shakespeare's *The Tempest* and sonnets. He argues that Shakespeare is surprisingly touched by *the Quran*, *the Arabian Nights*, and the poetry of Antara bin Shaddad. Similarly, Al-Garrallah (75-86) explains how James Elroy Flecker appropriates and even translates the poetry of Antara bin Shaddad. Furthermore, Al-Garrallah (671-686) explores some striking similarities between Chaucer's *The Merchant's Tale* and seven Arabic short stories. Al-Garrallah (528-547, 160-177, 69-85) suggests that Rudyard Kipling's poetry and stories are rife with elements taken from the *Quran* and the *Arabian Nights*. Furthermore, Al-Garrallah (524-547) explains how English poets appropriate Islamic versions of the story of Solomon and the angel of death. In continuing Al-Garrallah's efforts in unravelling the unacknowledged influence of Arabic culture in English literature, this paper argues that Alexander Pope might have been aware of the *Quran* and *Hadith*.[1]

It is surprising that writers in the field have left out of their account Arabic and Islamic echoes in the poetry of Pope. Critics, however, pay attention to Pope's preoccupations with Islam and Arabs. For instance, Al-Rodhan (122) suggests that Pope read Arabic texts such as *Hay bin Yagthan*. Similarly, in 1716, in a letter addressed to Lady Montague, Pope admits his awareness of Islam (Garcia 61). In the same context, Alexander Pope was introduced to Turkish poetry by Lady Mary (Lewis 30). Therefore, the main aim of this paper is to explore how Pope's "Ode on Solitude" *intertexts* (so to speak) with the *Quran* and *Hadith*.

Alexander Pope (1688-1744) wrote "Ode on Solitude" when he was twelve years old. Meanwhile, his family left London to Binfield due to catholic beliefs (Rogers 23). Although this poem is anthologized, it is not examined by Pope's critics. However, in "The Happy Man and the Cultural Fable of the Good Life," Brown (103) directs readers' attention to the significance of Pope's poem. She compares Aristotle's philosophy of good life with the concept's pervasiveness in the imagination of 18th century's culture. She elaborates on the concept of good life and happiness in 18th century poems — among which are Thomas Gray's "Elegy Written in a Country Churchyard," Alexander Pope's "Ode on Solitude," and Oliver

1 Israr Ahmad Khan mentions that "the *Hadith* consist of reports containing information about the Prophet Mohammad's sayings, deeds, decisions, and tacit approvals" (28).

Goldsmith's "The Deserted Village." Brown (103) argues that the concept of the "happy man" might be a precursor and an early version of its development as a cultural fable of happiness and "good life" of U.S. modern thought in the postwar period. Brown explains that "good life" and "happiness" are linked primarily to material culture and postwar economic expansion and is also seen as an "imaginative reflection upon or negotiation with contemporary historical forces." Thus, these imaginative and cultural constructs, which echo modern life, are found in the eighteenth century's culture which was preoccupied deeply with happiness.

What Brown is seemingly unaware of is Pope's poem's similarity with the *Quran* and *Hadith*. In bridging such a lacuna, this paper argues that an intertextual reading of Pope's "Ode on Solitude" uncovers a possible affinity between Pope and Islamic culture in terms of the relationship between nature, happiness, and solitude. This paper argues that Pope's "Ode on Solitude" restructures, appropriates, and even (in some cases) translates some *Quranic* verses and *Hadith*. In so doing, the paper considers a textual analysis of Pope's poem in order to analyze its preoccupations and connections with Islamic religious texts. Bliss and solace of solitude, the virtuousness of isolation, embracing the simplicity of countrified life of shepherds and sheep — these are some themes that the poem and the *Quran* and *Hadith* deal similarly with.

Those striking similarities indicate Pope's possible familiarity with Islam. These intertextual links between Pope's poem and the *Quran* and *Hadith* can be better analyzed within Genette's concepts of intertextuality and hypertextuality (Genette 1-2). Pope's poem's echoes in those texts are exemplary of Genette's theory of transtextuality as "textual transcendence of the text" (Genette 1). In Genette's terms, transtextuality is "all that sets the text in relationship, whether obvious or concealed, with other texts" and it "covers all aspects of a particular text" (Genette 83-84). Pope's poem is a particularly illuminating choice to illustrate transtextuality bearing in mind the striking parallels between the poem and Islamic sources. In the poem, interlaced lines from the *Quran* and *Hadith* are a deliberate and significant feature of Genette's intertextuality. The poem does not only allude to earlier texts, but is also derived from the *Quran* and *Hadith* through transformations that Genette delineates in depth. "Ode on Solitude" is a hypertext for some Islamic hypotexts.

Brown (104) argues that the modern and postwar ideology of happiness and good life is influenced and shaped by eighteenth-century's imagination and informed by the poetic trope of the "happy man" that is seen as an "early version of modern happiness-invention." This tradition of the happy man, found in Pope's

"Ode on Solitude," which demonstrates the notion of "individualism and denial of process," is traced back to the Horatian tradition as well as seventeenth century's classical formulations, and influential evocations of this literary tradition. Thus, Pope's imaginative vision is evocative of the "Aristotelian trope of contemplation" (Brown 106). These ideas, according to Brown, develop from earlier versions of the happiness tradition found in Andrew Marvell's literary imagination. Pope's concept of happiness, Brown (106) writes, is allegedly associated with "a specific anti-urban and proprietary venue—the 'paternal acres' —and a strong denial of commodification through a claim of rural self-sufficiency." Brown (107) concludes that eighteenth- century fantasies of the happy man and the twentieth- century figure of good life participate in the same long-lived cultural fable. The notion of happiness generated in both eras is specifically and entirely related to significant advancements in economy. In this vein, the eighteenth century's fantasized version of happiness is susceptible to the transformational impact of revolution at the turn of the nineteenth century (Brown 108).

Apart from Brown's thesis, this paper suggests that a hypertextual relationship between Pope's poem and Islam can be obviously detected. This is apparently shown by the presence of some Islamic echoes of the *Quran* and *Hadith* (as the hypotexts) which are united with Pope's poem which is the hypertext. In particular, one might suggest that Pope draws on the Islamic idea of solitude and nature represented in those hypotexts. The poem's hypertextuality derives from Islamic faith through transformation that Genette delineates in depth. Genette's hypertextuality includes "*any* relationship uniting a text B (which I shall call the *hypertext*) to an earlier text A (I shall, of course, call it the *hypotext*), upon which it is grafted in a manner that is not that of commentary" (Genette 5). In other words, Genette's thesis is to explain how a text draws on other texts through restructuring, modification, and translation. Moreover, *intertextuality*, according to Genette, considers a relationship of co-presence between two texts or among several texts: […] typically as the actual presence of one text within another. In its most explicit and literal form, it is the traditional practice of *quoting* […] In another less explicit and canonical form, it is the practice of *plagiarism* […] Again, […] it is the practice of *allusion*'. Allusions may be conscious or unconscious; or, better, attestable or not. Quotation may be implicit or explicit; intentional or incidental; marked or unmarked (Genette 1-2).

In many different ways, it can be said that Pope's hypertext becomes the "site for the dialogue between … occidental and oriental [discourses]" (Kundu viii). From an intertextual perspective, it can be argued that Pope's poem offers deep insights into what might be called the bliss of solitude, which is similarly a core

Islamic notion. There are some parallels and semblances between the hypertext and its hypotexts in their ways of describing and celebrating the peaceful and happy life of shepherds. Their portrayals of the virtuousness and solitude are strikingly similar: both romantically celebrate simplicity and peaceful serenity of the countrified life.

To recap, Pope's idea of solitude is linked intertextually with solitude in the *Quran* and *Hadith* in terms of diction. To begin with, it is obvious that Pope's title, "Ode on Solitude," introduces the term (solitude) to the reader, implying that the whole cycle of the poem revolves around it. The phrase (ode on solitude) establishes a strong relationship between solitude, human bliss, and solace. When Pope wrote his ode, he was certainly aware of the idea of solitude as an important thing to attain especially in times of upheavals. The poem introduces an unknown, lonely man, who catches a strong sense of happiness as a result of being cut off from society. Pope's concept of solitude is linked to social solitude. The real bliss, referred to in the opening line and the first word (happy) is to be in social solitude. Pope's version of blissful solitude is an echo of the trope of solitude found in *Hadith*. The *Hadith* celebrate the importance of solitude in an escape from seditions and social ills. In other words, one can enjoy a happy life by recoiling from people, abstaining from marriage and children, and owning a land, camels, and sheep. Whether consciously or not, Pope alludes to the theme of the virtuousness and solace of seclusion narrated in *Hadith*. There are inextricable links between Pope's poem and the discourse of solitude in *Hadith*. In both contexts, the theme of man's solitude in nature is seen to be a necessity particularly at times of turbulences and seditions. In an Islamic context, one should not avoid what Al-Bukhari narrated. He narrated that Mohammed said "Soon the best wealth of a Muslim will be the sheep which he can follow in the peaks of mountains and places where rain fall*s* to be found, fleeing with his religion from seditions."[1] Moreover, Abu Hurairah narrated that Mohammed (pbuh) encouraged Muslims during seditions to eat and drink from (the milk of) their sheep which they keep in the tops of mountains. He narrated that Mohammed (pbuh) said: "There will be seditions come to you under the cover of dark night. Will survive these seditions a man who keeps in the top of a mountain eats from his sheep or a man behind the paths who rides his horse and eats from his sword."[2] This suggests that an escape to nature is highly encouraged in Islam during upheavals and seditions.

1 This *Hadith* is narrated by Muhammed Ibn Ismaiel Al-Bukhari. *Sahih Al-Bukhari*. *The Book of Faith* (*Kitab Al-Iman*), (Cairo: Dar Al-Shaab, 1987), Vol. 1, *Hadith* Number 19, p.13. [Translation is ours].

2 This *Hadith* appears in *Al-Mustadrak 'Ala al-Sahihain* by Al-Hakim Al-Naisaburi. *The Book of Al-Fitan Wa Al-Malahim* (*Kitab Al-Fitan wa Al-Malahim*), (Beirut: Dar al kotob al ilmiyah, 1990), Vol. 2, *Hadith* Number 2460, p. 102. [Translation is ours].

Muslims are encouraged to seek solitude at times of extreme sedition where right and wrong are difficult to distinguish, or if being among others would weaken their faith or subject them to temptations that they cannot resist. A Muslim can run away from people to nature in case he wants to keep his faith in Allah unshakable and avoid temptations. It can be inferred that society can be a very effective means of corruption and so the solution is to cut off from society. It is definitely worth noting, as narrated in the prophetic *Hadith*, that mountains' peaks, Muslims should resort to at turbulent times, do not simply refer to high places as the word "peak" is used in its literal sense. Instead, "peak" suggests a place where one can seek isolation and solitude, and, thus, makes implications about the benevolence of solitude.

In addition, it is narrated that Mohammed (pbuh) urged people to recoil from people during times of turbulences and follow their camels, sheep, or land especially in avoidance of probable fight. It is narrated that Mohammed (pbuh) said: "There will be seditions (*fitnah*) […]. Therefore, those who have camels are to follow their camels; those who have sheep are to follow their sheep and those who have land are to follow their land".[1] It is, therefore, possible to suggest that seclusion is asserted upon in Islam as being righteous, especially in avoidance of probable tribulations.

This is similar to what Pope experienced as he belonged to a Catholic family who fled and lived in the rural area of Binfield when Catholics were persecuted at the turn of the 18th century (Rogers 23). This poem might be a response to this harsh experience. If so, the poem's intended meaning might be to highlight the significance of recoiling from people if one searches for happiness and immunity from corruption. In other words, what man needs in such a situation is to inherit "[a] few paternal acres" in order to run his own farm, which becomes his own utopia. In this way, it is possible to suggest that Pope's point is to draw attention to man's self-sufficiency and the legal source of his land as well. In other words, this man is utterly cut off from people, who do not even play any part in his gaining the inheritance. He is the master of his own farm.

It seems that Pope's intention is to emphasise that a mystic man needs to catch a strong sense of harmony with nature which replaces society. Pope draws nature as superior to society. It is nature that strengthens man's sense of self-sufficiency, purity, happiness, and solitude in many different ways. It meets his physical and spiritual needs. It is the source of his food, drinks, clothes, warmth, fire, medicine, serenity, health, and stability. Consider the second stanza, which surprisingly echoes

1 This *Hadith* appears in Muslim Ibn al-Hajjaj's *Sahih Muslim*. The Book pertaining to the turmoil and potents of the last hour (*Kitab Al-Fitan wa Ashrat As-Sa'ah*), (Cairo: Maktabat Al-Iman, n.d.), Vol. 1, *Hadith* Number 2887, p. 1424. [Translation is ours].

The Quran:

> Whose herds with milk, whose fields with bread,
> Whose flocks supply him with attire,
> Whose trees in summer yield him shade,
> In winter fire.

It is notable that Pope's reliance on nature in this simple way has *Quranic* echoes. More importantly, in the *Quran*, there are some verses reminiscent strikingly of Pope's second stanza. In *Surah* (16) "An-Nahl," Allah says,

> And verily, in the cattle, there is a lesson for you. We give you to drink of that which is in their bellies, from between excretions and blood, pure milk; palatable to the drinkers." (66) [....] "And Allah has made for you in your homes an abode, and made for you out of the hides of the cattle (tents for) dwelling, which you find so light (and handy) when you travel and when you stay (in your travels); and of their wool, fur, and hair (sheep wool, camel fur, and goat hair), furnishings and articles of convenience (e.g. carpets, blankets), comfort for a while" (80). "And Allah has made for you out of that which He has created shades, and has made for places of refuge in the mountains, and has made for you garments to protect you from the heat (and cold), and coats of mail to protect you from your (mutual) violence. Thus does He perfect His Favour to you, that you may submit yourselves to His Will (in Islam) (81)

Similarly, in *Surah* (36) "Ya-Sin," Allah says,

> And We have subdued them to them so that some of them they have for riding and some they eat." (72)"And they have (other) benefits from them, and they get (milk) to drink. Will they not then be grateful?" (73) [....] "He Who produces for you fire out of the green tree, when behold! you kindle therewith. (80)

It is of great significance to note that some examples of Genette's paratextuality are Pope's allusions to cattle, milk, shelter, and fire (to name but some) in both texts. One might suggest that those allusions in the second stanza might be obviously manifested translations of the *Quranic* verses mentioned above. In addition, those references in the poem are the dominant peritexts. Pope's reference to cattle as a source of both nourishment and shelter provides an example of a peritext that un-

ravels and echoes the poem's remarkable adaptation of the *Quranic* meaning. Considering this peritext, Pope obviously reproduces the beneficial effects of cattle both for nourishment and protective covering as referred to in the *Quran*. Another example of Genette's paratextuality is the allusion to the advantageous quality of fire in both texts. The fire exemplifies another key peritext. In summer's time, Pope's speaker turns to his trees to provide him with enough "shade" and in winter to keep him warm through kindling fire. Similarly, man in the *Quranic* verses is grateful for the beneficial quality of fire instigated form the green tree. Both texts depict man's reliance on nature as a source of self-sufficient living and nothing beyond as one's needs cannot actually exceed such needs. This satisfaction and stability in living, suggested in both texts, fulfills the happiness of the individual while embracing the simplicity of nature and countrified life. However, one might add that those *Quranic* verses underscore how Allah makes nature for the benefit of man in many different ways. Like Pope's speaker, who relies on his own farm for his food, drinks, clothes, shelter, among many other things, man in the *Quranic* verses can get many things from his cattle and trees. In those *Quranic* verses, all those graces must remind man of Allah as the Creator, who must be worshipped. In other words, nature is a sign of Allah's might. However, Pope's speaker does not even refer to God, who must be worshipped for creating this nature.

Pope's portrayal of the speaker's farm and his simple lifestyle, in the second stanza, is fascinating. Thus, the move to the third and fourth stanzas becomes unsurprisingly smooth. Consider the following stanzas:

> Blest! who can unconcern'dly find
> Hours, days, and years slide soft away,
> In health of body, peace of mind,
> Quiet by day,
>
> Sound sleep by night; study and ease
> Together mix'd; sweet recreation,
> And innocence, which most does please,
> With meditation.

The speaker's farm, in enhancing the speaker's self-sufficiency and loneliness, becomes the source of the speaker's solace, serenity, health, innocence, and above all, blessing. The speaker's loss of the meaningless passage of time is of great significance. The speaker becomes immune from social worries, so he is unaware of time;

he becomes healthy, peaceful, and quiet; he enjoys sleeping at night without nightmares. Time passes quickly and quietly because he is very happy. This feeling of extreme happiness is yielded by the blissful solitude he lives and the real meditation he experiences.

Pope's explicit idea in the third and fourth stanzas is likewise emphasised by Mohammed (pbuh). It is narrated that Mohammed mentioned that "if a person wakes up in the morning finding himself fearless from enemies, peaceful, healthy in body, and having enough daily nourishment, it is as if this person were graced the whole world." [1] The point here is that a person can evaluate his happiness in accordance with some standards related to fearlessness, psychological and physical health in body, and absence of hunger and thirst. What a person needs to do in such a situation is to experience meditation. This is suggested by Islamic faith and Pope. Both suggest a taste for solitude and a peaceful state of mind. Pope's verse translates the Islamic faith of the concept of solitude as well as the meditative nature of it which suggests the poet's potential knowledge of Islam. Meditative and reflective associations of solitude are at the heart of Islamic faith and practice of religion. In Islam, the practice of solitude and meditation is of great significance and forms a large part of daily prayers. During prayers, Muslims are supposed to focus profoundly and meditatively on Allah. It is worth noting that this simple and happy lifestyle does not mean that the speaker, who recoils from society, is naïve or unsophisticated. This is, however, a different story. His farm becomes a locus of the speaker's reflection, meditation, spiritual belief, and purity. Pope's point, in this context, perhaps is that the notion of solitude as a meditative experience is pleasing and creative. Solitude, silence, and studious meditation, he underscores, help a person achieve serenity, innocence, and purity

The speaker explicitly emphasises the idea of solitude in his life: he is determined that this solitude must endure forever (even after his death). He wants to leave this world lonely. He does not want anybody to lament him and even to know where his tomb lies. He does not want a stone to disturb his solitude:

Thus let me live, unseen, unknown;
Thus unlamented let me die;
Steal from the world, and not a stone
Tell where I lie.

1 This *Hadith* appears in *Sunan al-Tirmidhi* by Muhammad E. al-Tirmidhi. *The Book of Zuhd* (*Kitab Al-Zuhd*), Vol. 4, *Hadith* Number 2346, p. 574. (Beirut: Dar Ihya al-Turath al-Arabi, n.d.). [Translation is ours].

In this last quatrain, Pope concludes his poem with how his speaker wants to continue and end his life. Apparently, the speaker's solitude becomes immortal *par excellence* in that it goes on after his death. The speaker is stably aware that his social invisibility is the source of his invincibility. Therefore, he emphasises that his life and death must unsurprisingly share seclusion. He lives alone; he wants to die alone. In this version of death, Pope, nevertheless, diverges from Islam through modifying the Islamic attitude towards death and funerals. Islam encourages Muslims to participate in funerals and to put a stone on the tomb so that Muslims can recognise the tomb easily and some of the dead's relatives might be buried in the same grave.

By way of concluding, it is surprising that writers in the field have left out of their account Arabic and Islamic influences in the poetry of Alexander Pope. An intertextual reading of Pope's "Ode on Solitude" uncovers a possible affinity between Pope and Islamic culture in terms of the relationship between nature, happiness, and solitude. This paper argues that Alexander Pope's "Ode on Solitude" restructures, appropriates, and even (in some cases) translates some *Quranic* verses and *Hadith*. This is apparently shown by the presence of some Islamic echoes of the *Quran* and *Hadith* (as the hypotexts) which are united with Pope's poem as the hypertext. The paper, finally, suggests that nobody can deny the parallels between the hypertext and its hypotexts-- not the least of which is celebration of the peaceful and happy life of shepherds.

Works Cited

Ahmad Khan, Israr. *Authentication of Hadith: Redefining the Criteria*. Herndon: The International Institute of Islamic Thought, 2010.

Al-Bukhari, Muhammed Ibn Ismaiel. *Sahih Al-Bukhari*. Cairo: Dar Al-Shaab, 1987.

Al-Garrallah, Aiman. "The Islamic Tale in English Poetry: Solomon and the Angel of Death." *Forum for World Literature Studies* 8.4 (2016): 524-547.

—. "Encounter of the Twain: Rudyard Kipling's "The City of Brass." *Odisea* 16 (2015): 160-177.

—. "An Islamic Reading of Rudyard Kipling's Poetry." *Forum for World Literature Studies* 7.4 (2015): 528-547.

—. "Rudyard Kipling's Transliterations of Arabic Nouns." *American Journal of Translation Studies* 8.1 (2016): 69-85.

—. "The cunning wife/fruit tree' syndrome: Chaucer's *The Merchant's Tale* and Seven Arabic stories." *Neohelicon* 40.2 (2015): 671-686.

—. "A Textual Anatomy of a Poem: James Elroy Flecker's "War Song of the Saracens," and the Poetry of Antara Ibn Shaddad." *Journal of Language, Literature and Culture* 61.2 (2014):

75-86.

—. "The Bedouin Romance in English Poetry: Wilfrid Scawen Blunt's *The Stealing of the Mare*. *The IUP Journal of English Studies* 5: 1 & 2 (2010): 15-41.

—. "Oriental Echoes in Shakespeare's *The Tempest*, *The Quran* and *The Arabian Nights*." *Anglogermanica* (2010): 1-13.

—. "The Dark Night Echoes the Dark Soul: Shakespeare's Sonnets and the Poetry of Antara Bin Shaddad." *Neohelicon* 38. 1 (2011): 101-121.

Al-Naisaburi, Al-Hakim. *Al-Mustadrak 'Ala Al-Sahihain*. Beirut: Dar al kotob al ilmiyah, 1990.

Al-Rodhan, Nayef R. F. *The Role of the Arab-Islamic World in the Rise of the West: Implications for Contemporary Trans-cultural Relations*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012.

Brown, Laura. "The Happy Man and the Cultural Fable of the Good Life." *The Eighteenth Century* 55.1 (2014): 103-108.

Garcia, Humberto. *Islam and the English Enlightenment, 1670–1840*. Baltimore: The John Hopkins UP, 2012.

Genette, Gerard. *Palimpsests: Literature in the Second Degree*. Translated by Channa Newman and Claude Doubinsky. Lincoln and London: U of Nebraska P, 1997.

Genette, Gerard. *The Architext: an Introduction*. Berkeley: U of California P, 1992.

Kundu, Rama. *Intertexts*, *A Study of the Dialogue between Texts*. New Delhi: Sarup, 2008.

Lewis, Bernard. *Islam in History: Ideas, People, and Events in the Middle East*. Illinois: Open Court , 1993.

Muslim, Ibn al-Hajjaj. *Sahih Muslim*. Cairo: Maktabat Al-Iman, n. d..

Pope, Alexander. *The Complete Works of Alexander Pope (Annotated)*. With an Introduction by Leslie Stephen. Art & Poetry Publishing, 2012.

Rogers, Pat. *A Political Biography of Alexander Pope*. London and New York: Routledge , 2016.

The Noble Qur'an. Translated by Dr. Muhammad Taqi-ud-Din Al-Hilali and Dr. Muhammad Muhsin Khan. Riyadh: Maktaba Darussalam Publishers and Distributors, 2002.

Humanitarianism of Rabindranath Tagore: Human Love and The Philosophy of Men of Action

Le Thi Bich Thuy
Institute for Culture and Development, Ho Chi Minh National Academy of Politics, 135 Nguyen Phong Sac Street, Cau Giay District, Hanoi, Vietnam
Email: lebichthuyhcma@gmail.com

Abstract Rabindranath Tagore is considered the great philanthropist of Indian literature. Throughout his life, he has sung humanitarian songs to honor and pay his respects to people. This article uses some basic research methods such as: text analysis method, intuitive method and interdisciplinary and multi-disciplinary method to analyze evaluate and make judgments about Tagore's humanitarianism. He often looks deeply into the inner world of people with the eyes of human love and praises the noble love between people sincerely with kindness. He directed people to the philosophy of action, helping to awaken the people of India a sense of freedom and democracy when the mysterious mist of religion covered the country for thousands of years and the harsh doctrinal ideas of religion were ingrained into the subconscious of Indian people, taking them out of the passive taciturn habit in the metaphysical, mystical mist to actively seek for beauty and happiness in life.
Key words Humanitarianism; Rabindranath Tagore; men of action.
Author **Le Thi Bich Thuy**, Dr. philol., is Lecturer of the Institute of Culture and Development, Ho Chi Minh National Academy of Politics in Vietnam. Her research interests are comparative literature, mainly South Asia, Southeast Asia and Japan literature; contemporary Vietnamese literature; literary and artistic criticism; and Vietnamese culture and literature in the context of international integration.

Introduction

Rabindranath Tagore is a shining star of India's Renaissance, regarded as the sun of India, the great originator and the "pinnacle of human culture." Rabindranath Tagore entered the path of composing artistic literature very early when he was an 8-year-old boy. In 1913, when the *Gitanjali* was awarded the Nobel Prize for literature, Tagore became a literary phenomenon who was interested and studied in and outside of In-

dia. Andre Gide commented: "I feel small and trivial in front of Tagore like Tagore feels small and trivial when singing in front of the God[1]. Nadim Hitmet commented that Tagore's works always contain the most "love of life, belief in life", he affirmed that "Tagore is still the very great among the greatest poets."[2] Speaking at the Nobel Prize award ceremony for literature for the Gitanjali, Per Hallstrom stated, "Since Goeth's death in 1832, no poet in Europe could compare with Tagore's noble personality, natural greatness and the harmonious purity."[3] "A man of prodigious literary and artistic accomplishments, Tagore played a leading role in Indian cultural renaissance and came to be recognized, along with Mohandas Gandhi, as one of the architects of modern India. Tagore's career, extending over a period of more than sixty years, not only chronicled his personal growth and versatility but also reflected the artistic, cultural, and political vicissitudes of India in the late nineteenth and the first half of the twentieth century."[4] In the introduction to the *Gitanjali* first appeared in the United Kingdom, W.Yeats emphasized that this work originated from a transcendental culture and that these poems were no different from the development of happy land and plants.[5] In his opinion, it is the crystallization of Indian culture "for thousands of years of poetry and religion united and harmonious to be the one". From that point, he talked a lot about the special affection that Tagore has shown in his collection of poems — the simple affections in real life are a philosophical way of Tagore to the love for life and love for humanity.

The Indian humanism is primarily Spiritual. "The Indian humanism does not take man to be material being but as one with spirit, mind, life and body. It aims at the fulfillment of the aspirations which are physical, vital, mental and spiritual in nature."[6] Tagore's humanitarian spirit is the succession of the humanitarian tradition of the Indian people through the classical literature, from the Vedas, Upanishads,

---

1 Luu Duc Trung, *Rabindranath Tagore - Collection of works* (Labor Publishing House – Center for East - West Cultures and Languages, Hanoi, 2004) 902.

2 Luu Duc Trung, p.901.

3 Rumesh Chandra Majumdar, *Acient Indian Colonies in The Far East* (Punjab Sankrit Book Depot, Lahore, 1927) 25.

4 Debjani Bandyopadhyaya, "Rabindranath Tagore-his childhood and creativity from the perspective of a Psychiatris", in *Indian Journal of Psychiatry,* Vol.60, No.4 (2018): 507-509. doi: 10.4103/0019-5545.246187

5 Rabindranath Tagore, *Collected Poems and Plays* (London, Macmillan & Co LTD, 1955) 13.

6 Mauchumi Hazarika, "Humanism in contemporaty Indian philosophy with special reference to Rabindranath Tagore," in *International Journal of Current Research,* Vol.5, no.12 (2013): 4306-4308.

Buddhist scriptures to Kalidasa's poetry.[1] "The mysticism of Rabindranath Tagore blossomed on the soil of rich and complex religious influences, which became the fusion of his poetic interest."[2] He is also influenced by the Western humanism and renaissance culture "Thus Tagore's humanism is in tune with the renaissance humanism, the central focus of which is quite simply human beings."[3] He acquires the positive values such as demanding the personal liberation, giving prominence to the self-discipline, fighting for freedom, demanding the justice and humanity for people. Of which, Tagore always believes in human love and gives prominence to the human values "Tagore introduces a process which is manifest in love;because it helps a man to develop his infinity of existence through the relationship of the highest value of life."[4] Tagore's compositions always overflow of love for human, give prominence to human values, pay attention to all areas of human life and "the idea of the human, which played a central role in the thought-world of Rabindranāth Tagore, was invoked by him in 'Sabhyatār sangkat' ('Crisis in Civilization', 1941)."[5] He has condemned the society with backward conceptions, caste distinction, injustice, oppression and exploitation of the colonialist, causing the Indian people to undergo great suffering. At the same time, his works clearly shows the humanitarian spirit, the love for nature, country and Indian people, the love for humanity, the love for peace and the spirit against feudalism, colonialists, imperialist, and against wars. He advocates that the country should first liberate the human and the natural natures of human which are love and goodwill. "Spiritualism of Tagore is not equivalent to Godliness. His God manifests himself in the divinity of man."[6]

Methods

Rabindranath Tagore is the great humanitarian of Indian literature. He always praised the noble love between people sincerely with kindness and faith. This article

1 Banshi Dhar, "The Humanism of Rabindranath Tagore," in *Indian Literature*, Vol.16, No.1/2 (January - June, 1973): 147-152.

2 JoannaTuczyńska, "The Folk Mysticism of Rabindranath Tagore", in *Rupkatha Journal on Interdisciplinary Studies in Humanities,* Vol.6, no. 2 (2014): 2-14.

3 Manjula, R, "Humanism of Tagore: Disciverning our own Divinity" in *SVU Journal of English Studies*, vol. 12 (2013): 92-96.

4 Anayet Hossain, F.M, "Universal Humanism of Tagore," in *Asian Journal of Social Sciences & Humanities*, Vol. 4, no.2 (May 2015): 80-86.

5 Sukanta Chaudhuri, *The Cambridge Companion to Rabindranath Tagore*, (Cambridge University Press, 2019): 416-429. https://doi.org/10.1017/9781108779753

6 Monika Khurana, "Tagore's Philosophy on Humanism," in *IJARIIE,* Vol.3, No.4 (2017): 2188-2193.

uses some basic research methods such as: text analysis, intuition and interdisciplinary and multi-disciplinary methods to understand Tagore's humanitarianism expressed in human love. He affirms that man is a divine light, an openness of generosity, a serene soul, love and an enemy of pride and brutality.[1] Tagore dignifies human values and introduces the philosophy of men of action. He called upon people to be from the ego to create and extend their identity, affirming his existence in the world, towards a more meaningful life.

Results

Tagore believes that we will not have a true conception on human if we do not show the love to human.[2] Rabindranath Tagore is honored as a "great humanitarian" with the love for life and the infinite belief for human. When researching the human love in Tagore's writing, the researchers also affirm,"Tagore says that love and peace is the highest quality of all man" and "Rabindranath Tagore was a great poet of love and affection. In most of his creations he has presented the beauty of love in it's different forms. Tagore's poetry primarily deals with love—love for humanity, love for divinity and love for nature."[3] The human in his compositions is sometimes general but sometimes concrete, sometimes abstract but sometimes very clear. He always wishes the freedom for the Fatherland, freedom for the people and wishes people to live in harmony and equality together.[4] Throughout his life, Tagore sang his songs to honor and pay his respect to human. His compositions always came from the love for people and by his passionate love to the human, he tried to understand and express his conceptions of human. The human in Tagore's compositions does not seek ways to deny life, does not leave human life to seek liberation, the pure land and the infinite world. On the contrary, the human actively finds to life, actively penetrates into the world, thirsts to live forever in the colorful reality. Tagore does not believe in any religion, he acquires from the essence of the good tradition, refuses the bad, the conservative and receives the progressive ideas of Western humanitarianism and he has created his own religion "Human religion,"[5] "Tagore's philosophy of

1 Roy, P. K, *Beauty, Art and Man: Recent Indian Theories of Art* (Shimla: Indian Institute of Advanced Study, 1990) 9.

2 Rabindranath Tagore, *Sadhana*, The Realization of Lìe, Macmillan, London, 1913.

3 Keshari Kumar Shukla, "Beauty of Love in Rabindranath Tagore's Poems," in *International Journal for Research in Applied Sciences and Biotechnology,* Vol.6, No.1 (January 2019): 1-3.

4 Arup Jyoti Sarma, "Humanistic Philosophy of Tagore," in *Kritike*, vol.6, No.1 (June 2012): 50-66.

5 Rabindranath Tagore, *The Religion of Man,* New York: Monkfish Book Publishing Co. Rhinebeck, 2004.

humanism reformulates the idea of *Bhakti* by announcing that devoted love for God is realized in compassionate service to God's creatures. Tagore reverses the concept of *Bhakti* which essentially teaches that through the worship of God people obey the divine order. Rabindranath interprets love of devotion as love for every living form which is a part of the divine body of the Creator."[1] Tagore affirms that he does not belong to any religious community and lean towards any particular faith. According to Tagore, the God is not far away, the God of the world and the world of human beings exists and merges with the human, produces the human and is the human. The God is in the human life and the human is the God. He considers the human life as a journey to meet the God in himself. The journey only comes to the end when the human strives to act creatively, immerses itself in real life to not only receive the gifts of nature but also have to know how to give.

Human Love and Dignification of Human Values:Rabindranath Tagore with Love for Women

Rabindranath Tagore is a man who cares deeply about the fate of Indian women and has a deep love for women. Will Durant in *History of Indian civilization* remarked: "he composed very sentimental, tender poems to describe the beautiful scenes of India, the grace of women, the sufferings of the Indian people"[2] and "in his poetry women are always attractive." [3] Love for women is also one of the main themes in Tagore's writings. "The interest in Rabindranath Tagore's novels is mainly anchored in the struggle of his principal characters, particularly his women characters, to achieve self-actualisation or self-definition out of their situation. Tagore's preoccupation with his women characters seem so obsessive that in almost all his works main protagonist is a woman."[4] "It seems that Rabindranath loved women like flowers, like an object of his song and adulation. He ever respected them and ever wished their freedom. In his life it seems that love was an artistic dream never to be crushed under the stone of reality. Each woman he loved or loved by, was his Muse, to a greater or lesser extent. Women enriched his creativity. He remained grateful

1 Joanna Tuczyńska, "Animals in Rabindranath Tagore's Spiritul Humanism: Compassionate Love in the Idea of Organic Unity," in *Rupkatha Journal on Interdisciplinary Studies in Humanities*, Vol.8, No. 1 (2016): 59-67.

2 Will Durant, *History of Indian civilization* (Ho Chi Minh City General Publishing House, 2013) 415.

3 Will Durant, p. 416.

4 Purnima, B, "Portrayal of Women Characters in Rabindranath Tagore's The Garden," in *The Criterion an International Journal in English*, Vol.5, No.5 (October 2014): 264-266.

to them."[1] In a research on the Indian literature, the author Luu Duc Trung affirmed that "Tagore took a great interest in the fate of Indian women and has a deep affection. He has spent many poems for praising them.[2]" In the study on *Tagore - literature and people*, the author Do Thu Ha analyzes the sympathy and enhancement for the role of women in the compositions of Rabindranath Tagore and emphasizes that "In the literary world in Bengal, Tagore is actually the person who has written a lot of works on women. Tagore described women as a lovely creature of the creation but still in a state of dependency and surrender to men. Until *Binodini*, he built a character for women that were highly antagonistic to society."[3] At the same time, the author asserted in the *Textbook of Indian Literature*: "Among the characters of Tagore, the most memorable characters are women. Through his works, Tagore strongly protested against the sad fact that the highly valuable qualities and talents of the Bengal woman were wasted and strangled over generations."[4] Tagore has dedicated a great deal of affection and respect to the beauty of Indian women in many different angles, from the formal beauty to the rich personality and inner world. First of all, he found in an Indian woman the natural beauty that is bestowed by heaven and earth and embellished by human hands:

> O woman, you are not merely the handiwork of God; but also of men;
> these are ever endowing you with beauty from their hearts.[5]

In the short story collection *The Cloud and the Sun*, Tagore described the unique beauty of Indian women. It was the beauty of Queen Ajita considered the embodiment of beauty and nobility, "a discreet perfume along with the breeze

---

1 Aju Mukhopadhyay, "Essay: Tagore's Love Affairs," in *Kittaab connecting asian writers with readers globally*, Vol.6, No.27 (September, 2016).
From https://kitaab.org/2016/09/27/essay-tagores-love-affairs/

2 Luu Duc Trung, *Indian literature* (Education Publishing House, Hanoi, 2004) 153.

3 Do Thu Ha, *Tagore — literature and people* (Culture and Information Publishing House, Hanoi, 2005) 306.

4 Do Thu Ha, *Textbook of Indian Literature* (Hanoi National University Publishing House, Hanoi, 2015) 355.

5 Rabindrath Tagore, *The Gardener*, The Project Gutenberg Ebook of The Gardener, Produced by Chetan Jain, and David Widger, January 26, 2013. From: https://www.gutenberg.org/files/6686/6686-h/6686-h.htm

pervading the room,"[1] the beauty of the widow's eyes in the *Beautiful Neighbor,*[2] the charming smile on the girl's red lips in the *Skeleton* and the beauty of Mrinmayi in *Little Bride*.[3] Tagore not only describes the beauty of a woman's appearance but also focuses on praising the inner world, the beauty of the soul, the personality of the woman coming from love and the sacrifice "women are simple and honest people who have great stamina, they engage and fulfill their duties in very courageous commitments to society and the family."[4] With pure but deep, fervid love, the women only love but do not dare to show or ask for any consideration for them. Giribala in the *The Cloud and the Sun* wanted Xasibuxan to pay attention to her, so she always gave him simple gifts.[5] Ratan's affection and attentive care for the man in *The Postmaster*.[6] In love, a woman is willing to sacrifice honor, interests, and youth and accept to go through many difficulties, suffer many storms of life to devote to the one she loves. Tagore describes the beauty of women, praises love and shows his compassion to women who are bound by harsh rituals. "Indian women are often kept in chains and only hang around the kitchen, they work drudgingly the whole day and always go outside with a towel covering all their faces to be separated from everybody, they don't dare to raise his face to look at the sky. Many strings of rites are tied around them."[7] He criticizes human ambitions, extremist ideologies and religious laws that caused so much suffering, hurted women, and prevented women from living with her happiness.[8]

In many works, the author denounces actions, gestures that show ruthlessness, blindness, social conception, religion, caste, public opinion, fame, status, money, power, selfishness, jealousy and envy making women suffer injustice, misery and disadvantage. Long-standing customs have robbed many of the girls' beautiful childhoods, making them little brides, even widows when they were very young, like in the stories of *The Beautiful Neighbor, Little Bride, The Cloud and the Sun, Skeleton* and considering the remarriage of widows are the stains of society, causing

1 Luu Duc Trung, *Rabindranath Tagore - Collection of works* (Labor Publishing House — Center for East — West Cultures and Languages, Hanoi, 2004) 67.

2 Luu Duc Trung, p. 80.

3 Lưu Duc Trung, p.203.

4 Do Thu Ha, *Tagore — literature and people* (Culture and Information Publishing House, Hanoi, 2005) 113.

5 Luu Duc Trung, *Rabindranath Tagore - Collection of works* (Labor Publishing House — Center for East — West Cultures and Languages, Hanoi, 2004) 46.

6 Lưu Duc Trung, p. 8.

7 Luu Duc Trung, *Indian literature* (Education Publishing House, Hanoi, 2004): 154-155.

8 Luu Duc Trung, p. 154.

the brilliant young woman to bury the burning desire of love in her heart, do not dare think of the happiness of a couple like in the stories of *The bath steps on the river, Judge, Xu Ba*. The social practices killed women's youth. Class distinction creates barriers that prevent women from reaching the one they love, even when they are willing to accept all suffering, difficulties, and challenges as in the stories of *Hungry Stone, Broken Illusion, Horoscopes, Child abandonment*. Sometimes the "old rules" make women have to exchange their lives in an absurd way. If a woman is lucky enough to escape death from the pyre, there is still an invisible hand determined to prevent them from coming to happiness like Mahamaya in the story of *Cremation*. Customary laws have closed women into extremely harsh frameworks, they have no education, no control over their own life, no position in society and disdain from society and relatives such as: Gribala in *The Cloud and the Sun*, Mrinmayi in *The Little Bribe* misses Apobo, Hemsasi in the *Judge*. At the same time, Tagore strongly condemns the notion that inhibits the liberation of women.

The Creator bestows on man the highest reward in his life is love, he must be free in love, marriage and control of his life. Through art creation, "Tagore treads a middle path often accommodating the social structure over individual attempts at self-expression."[1] Tagore urges and encourages the woman to fight to liberate herself, to fight for the love and triumph over austerity, to overcome the conservative teachings that stifle the sacred sentiments that the Creator bestowed on man. Tagore fights for women who are liberated from the constraints of a backward and conservative rite. Tagore depicts the world of female characters in his creation with a variety of personalities. These characteristics are not only expressed through appearance, language but also clearly expressed through gestures and actions of the character. The author depicts images of smart, sharp Indian women with social understanding and confidence in their communication and a desire to take control of their lives. They are the active women who dare to fight for love and protect their own love. "Tagore strongly protested against the sad fact that the precious qualities and talents of the Bengali woman were wasted and strangled over generations. Surprisingly, if we can find a common feature of the female characters in Tagore's works, it is that they have a stronger personality than men."[2]

In many works, Tagore refers to women who have strongly dared to face their feelings, proactively assert and confess their love to the one they love. The

1 Madhumita Roy, "Scripting Women in Three Short Stories of Tagore," in *Rupkatha Journal on Interdisciplinary Studies in Humanities*, Vol.2, No.4 (2010): 596-604.

2 Do Thu Ha, *Tagore — literature and people* (Culture and Information Publishing House, Hanoi, 2005) 112.

author praises women who dare to overcome the outdated conceptions of society to proactively find their own happiness and the triumph of love against the harshness of religion as in the play *The revenge of nature*, the Kuxum in *The bath steps on the river*, the young widow in *The Beautiful Neighbor*. Tagore criticizes the harsh society of women, especially rural women, demanding the abolition of caste distinction and freedom of marriage. Tagore has actively contributed the voice of art to the cause of fighting for women's liberation, freedom, feminism with all of his heart and humanitarian love.

Rabindranath Tagore with Love for Children

Children are always the subject of Rabindranath Tagore to be portrayed with depth, viewed from the pure, innocent and beautiful aspects, comes from the "sincere feelings of their grandfather, father, teacher, who love them, believe in their future and teach everyone to keep the true, the good and the beautiful in children."[1] Researching Tagore's love for children, the researchers believe that: "In the Crescent moon Tagore depicts the beauty of Love of child" and "The child's Love of adventures and high achievement is equally beautifully described in his songs. Tagore's insight in to the child's hearts is equally admirable. Tagore shows how full of love for the mother the child is, and how to it she is the dearest thing in the world. The child's purity, trustfulness, innocence, and love for all — in fact the whole paradise of the child's moral nature is beautifully revealed to us in his poems. The mother's deep love for the child — that most wonderful and divine thing to which there is no paralleled the side of heaven — is well described by the poet."[2] Tagore is a person who understands the child psychology and, according to him, it is needed to educate them with love, which is the understanding of child psychology.[3] Author Luu Duc Trung selected and introduced *Tagore — a collection* of *works* including two volumes. Of the 35 short stories presented, there are 21/35 short stories under the *Clouds and Sunshine* short stories collection. In the introduction, the author commented, "Tagore's short stories contain the great humanistic spirit."[4] In *Entering the Asian literary garden*, the author made remarkable comments on *Clouds and Sun-*

1 Luu Duc Trung, *Indian literature* (Education Publishing House, Hanoi, 2004) 157.

2 Keshari Kumar Shukla, "Beauty of Love in Rabindranath Tagore's Poems," in *International Journal for Research in Applied Sciences and Biotechnology,* Vol.6, No.1 (January 2019): 1-3.

3 Ranjan Ghosh, "Caught in the Cross Traffic: Rabindranath Tagore and the Trials of Child Education," in *Comparative Education Review*, Vol. 59, No. 3 (August 2015): 399-419. DOI: 10.1086/681905

4 Luu Duc Trung, *Rabindranath Tagore - Collection of works,* Labor Publishing House — Center for East — West Cultures and Languages, Hanoi, 2004) 7.

shine short stories collection and claims that realistic value and humanistic value are the core values of this collection. Short plot, some stories have just only a few pages, but the contents are concise, closely structured, dramatic, creating attractive stories.

Tagore created works for childern with the sincere feelings of a grandfather, a father, a teacher who loves children, believes in the future of children and wants to educate everyone to keep good values for children. Tagore was an expert in the psychology, emotions and dreams of children, so he described the diversity and abundance of children's personalities. In works for children, he always uses language, images and stories suitable for children. Children always like to be in harmony with nature, to have fun and joke around in that boundless world. Tagore paid attention to praising the innocent, honest and carefree personality of children:

> On the seashore of endless worlds children meet.
> The infinite sky is motionless overhead and the restless water is boisterous.
> On the seashore of endless worlds, the children meet with shouts and dances.[1]

Tagore praises the honesty of children and Tagore's works for children all tell about touching stories with profound educational meanings. This is the dominant ideology of his writings for children. "Best of all Brahmins art thou, my child. Thou hast the noblest heritage of truth."[2] He wants to bring the pure, holy soul that exists in the children's soul to oppose the evil, despicable nature of society tempted by money, power and beauty:

> The sun glistened on the sand, and the sea waves broke waywardly.
> A child sat playing with shells.
> He raised his head and seemed to know me, and said, "I hire you with nothing."
> From thenceforward that bargain struck in child's play made me a free man.[3]

Tagore is a person who understands the psychology of children so when creating works for children, he often observes, appreciates and cares about children from

---

1 Rabindranath Tagore, *The Crescent Moon,* London and New York: Macmillan and Company. The Project Gutenberg EBook of The Crescent Moon, 2013.

2 Rabindranath Tagore, *Fruit-Gathering*, New York: The Macmillan Company, 1916. From:https://www.sacred-texts.com/hin/tagore/frutgath.htm

3 Rabindranath Tagore, *The Crescent Moon,* London and New York: Macmillan and Company. The Project Gutenberg EBook of The Crescent Moon, 1913.

their normal sleep or small dreams. The tone in each poem is very funny, vivid images consistent with the psychology of children:

I shall be the cloud and you the moon.
I shall cover you with both my hands, and our house-top will be the blue sky.

Tagore wrote many poems about family affection, the relationship between children and parents. Tagore understands the feelings of children towards their parents, especially the feelings of children towards their mothers. Children are always very close to their mothers, coddle their mothers, demand from their mothers an immense love and respect that love more than gold:

Baby had a heap of gold and pearls, yet he came like a beggar on to this earth.
It is not for nothing he came in such a disguise.
This dear little naked mendicant pretends to be utterly helpless, so that he may beg for mother's wealth of love.[1]

The affection of love between parents and children is a sacred affection in every family. Tagore said that mistakes of children are also part of the responsibility of parents. Therefore, to educate children, parents must use their love and the love of family members:

When I must punish him he becomes all the more a part of my being.
When I cause his tears to come my heart weeps with him.
I alone have a right to blame and punish, for he only may chastise who loves.

In the short story *The Cloud and the Sun*, there are 12/25 stories with the appearance of children's characters and most of children's characters play the central role of the work. Tagore praises the innocent, mischievous, pure, loving personalities and desire to explore world of children. It is the innocent, mischievous of little girl Mrinmayi in the story of *The little bride*, the gentle and lovely character of little girl Giribala in the story of *The Cloud and the Sun*, the liberal, cheerful and sociable personality of little boy Tara in *The tramp*, Nitai Pan's cleverness in *Entrusting money*, the sincere, pure and warm feelings of little boy Venu in *Teacher Masai*, the gentle,

1 Rabindranath Tagore, *The Crescent Moon,* London and New York: Macmillan and Company. The Project Gutenberg EBook of The Crescent Moon, 1913.

delicate personality and the concern, sharing and care of the loved ones of little girl Proba and Ratan in the story of *The Editor* and *The Postmaster*. However, there are also children who are always closed, quietly and do not know how to express their feelings to others like the little girl Xuba in *Xuba*, the little boy Ninkanta with an unpredictable face, looks naive just seems to "ripen before the period," "his lips are wrinkled, he looks old and austere" in the story of *The lonely child*, the little girls Proba and Ratan are gentle and delicate like adult women when they know how to care and share with the people they love in the story of *The Editor* and *The Postmaster*. Tagore often puts child characters in relationships in many ways so that they show different levels and personalities but all show innocent beauty, pure soul, rich in love, mischievous, curious personality and eager to explore the world of children.

Tagore praises the innocent and saintly souls of children that have a profound impact on the adult spiritual world. It is the magical bond of love that connects hearts and warms barren souls. The sincere, pure affection of the little boy Venu for Haralan in the story of *Teacher Masai* is great joy and solace in the teaching life of a poor teacher. The innocent and pure affection of the baby Mini in *The Kabun street vendor* warmed the heart of the expatriate, Uncle Ramun. Love and care of the little girl Ratan has become a joy and a solace for the postmaster in the story of *The postmaster*. Besides, the author describes the innocent, honest soul of children as opposed to the evil, stingy, greedy nature of the society tempted by money and power. Nitai Pan's cleverness is the opposite of Jaganat's stinginess in the story of *Entrusting money*. The affection for the daughter of Proba in the Editor helped me "escape" from the attraction of glory and fame. At the same time, Tagore also expressed the attitude of condemning the attitude, the carelessness of the adults that caused injuries to children and the deaths of innocent children such as: Ninkanta in *The Lost Child*, Nitai Pan in the *Entrusting money*, Mrinmayi in *The Little Bride*, Giribala in *The Cloud and the Sun.*

Tagore succeeds in directly describing character psychology by capturing the psychological characteristics of each character and the psychological evolution of the character through objective and subjective causes. In it, children are intensive objects depicted by Tagore, viewed from a pure, innocent and good perspective. To help readers better understand the world of childhood soul, Tagore uses a method to directly describe character psychology. This description often lies in the narrator's comments or semi-direct comments that appear with descriptions of the characters' language, actions, and gestures. For those children who have a good and peaceful life as in the story of *The Editor*, *The Kabun street vendor*..., the world of their souls

is easy to describe and grasp. But for the unfortunate child characters, the world of their soul is full of torment, suffering, and contradictions such as the stories of *The lonely child*, *The tramp, Xuba*, the author must use more than the direct descriptions of the character psychology. By understanding children's psychology, through describing the jealous, disillusioned psychological states of the child, Tagore made the reader understand that the underlying causes of the actions of children are derived from request for love and lack of love. Tagore's understanding of human psychology is also manifested in detailed description and thorough analysis of the moments of awakening in the soul of each character, and developments in the psychological development process of the character logically under the impact of objective and subjective causes.

The world of characters in the short story collection *The Cloud and the Sun* is diverse and rich with many different personalities. These characteristics are not only expressed through appearance, language but also clearly expressed through gestures and actions of the character. Through describing the gestures and actions of the characters, the writer shows the readers the psychological states that govern the actions of the characters. Children always aspire to be loved and protected and Tagore praises the power of love that can help them through difficult times, situations of despair, support and perfect their souls. The author condemns the heartlessness of adults, the outdated notions of society that have killed innocence in the hearts of children. At the same time, he demands the right to be loved for children and affirms the development process, the perfection in the personality of each child to become good people when they receive love, attention, care and education from adults.

Rabindranath Tagore with Love between Men and Women

Tagore conceives that love is the sacred humanity of man and belongs to man naturally. People born in this world must love and it is a need of life. In Tagore's writings, the topic of love always occupies an important position. "Tagore has spread the beauty of love all where in his literature specially in his poems of romantic approach. This makes him great poet of love among all literary artists of world literature."[1] Tagore writes a lot about the love "He was a man of love, made of love and was played by love." "He wrote many poems on his lovers at different times."[2] "Love is a primeval instinct of the human heart a result of the attraction of the sexes. In the

1 Keshari Kumar Shukla, "Beauty of Love in Rabindranath Tagore's Poems," in *International Journal for Research in Applied Sciences and Biotechnology,* Vol.6, No.1 (January 2019): 1-3.

2 Aju Mukhopadhyay, "Essay: Tagore's Love Affairs," in *Kittaab connecting asian writers with readers globally*, Vol.6, No.27 (September, 2016).

words of Dr. S. C. Sengupta, a renowned Tagore critic: Nothing is more valuable in human life than human love, the intense passion a man and woman feel for each other".[1] And affirming, the love is an important content in the Tagore's writings. Tagore thinks that love is happiness and he always praises the love of freedom, praises the love of man and the endless demands of man for love. Tagore praises the harmony between two souls in love, seek freedom in love and explains the emotional levels in love:

> But it is a heart, my beloved. Where are its shores and its bottom?
> You know not the limits of this kingdom, still you are its queen.
> If it were only a moment of pleasure it would flower in an easy smile, and you could see it and read it in a moment.
> If it were merely a pain it would melt in limpid tears, reflecting its inmost secret without a word.
> But it is love, my beloved.
> Its pleasure and pain are boundless, and endless its wants and wealth.
> It is as near to you as your life, but you can never wholly know it.[2]

Tagore's poems are always directed to the human soul, go deep into the inner world to discover the subtle vibrations of people in love with the desire for the harmony of two souls. Finding his meaning in love is that man has reached heaven on earth. Love is the harmony between two souls, the sacred humanity that people need it as "needing the air to breathe". One of the most intense forms of love is dedication and creativity in love. Tagore always appreciates the act of sacrifice, dedicating everything to love and silent love is the highest expression of love, the most noble and respectable love: silent love is sacred love, in the shadow of the heart, love shining like pearl is hidden. In the strange daylight, love tragically dimmed.[3]

The person in love desires to be constantly devoted to love, the best dedication without request and creation are the highest expressions of the dedication. According to Tagore, in love, dedication is not enough, it requires creativity in love

---

1 Aruna Roy, "*Tagore's concept of love*," in *Indian Literature*, Vol. 19, No.5 (september Octorber, 1976): 103-107.

2 Rabindranath Tagore, *The Gardener*, The Project Gutenberg Ebook of The Gardener, Produced by Chetan Jain, and David Widger, January 26, 2013. From: https://www.gutenberg.org/files/6686/6686-h/6686-h.htm

3 Luu Duc Trung, *Rabindranath Tagore - Collection of* works (Labor Publishing House — Center for East — West Cultures and Languages, Hanoi, 2004) 591.

to bring newness and lasting attraction. Tagore says that love is always full of hope, happiness, burning desire and also times of suffering, boredom, sacrifice and loss. But through suffering ,Tagore always draws lessons and still holds a belief: "I know that this life is not ripe in love, nor has it lost everything".[1]

The Philosophy of Men of Action

Dignifying human values, Tagore has made philosophies of men of action. The human of action in Tagore's poetry seeks to act inwardly, free himself from the constraints of religion. All catechisms of religion that regulate caste, reincarnation—karma, duty are obstacles preventing the human from coming to freedom. In order to be free and bring human to freedom, it is necessary to free the human soul from the obsession of such religious catechisms. By his passionate love to the life and great intelligence, Tagore has realized and explained the familiar problems of religion: The God, liberation, heaven, hell, life, death,... brings all the abstract, metaphysical problems to the concrete, attached to the life of human beings, to real life. In Tagore's poem, the image of human throughout his life is a long and tireless journey to the God, God is the center that people set great hopes and look forward to. In the great hope of every human being, the God bears the appearance of the supreme, mystical, distant power. But for Tagore, God is not far away but a source of joy, a source of comfort, a love that gives the human the ability to act. God is everywhere and is developing in an infinite life, developing in every human being.

Tagore conceives that God is only an abstract idea but embodies multi forms of life. By his clairvoyance and the ability to flash, he has realized the beauty of the real world. Tagore's devotional verses are not intended to solve the abstract and mysterious problems, but to pull back into real life and he asserts that the journey to God is the journey to the real world. The existing world is the embodiment of God, the human in his journey to God has no other way but immerses himself into the real world, into the human life "expressing the infinite in the finite" and absolutizing the spiritual connection between human and God. "Drunk with the joy of singing I forget myself and call thee friend who art my lord."[2] By this awareness, the human has made a great liberation of spirit, escaping from the ignorance, the binding of religion to immerse himself in life and realize the value of life. This is a self-conscious act of cognitive value, awakening human, from which impels the human towards building Nirvana not to be far but right on the earthly life.

---

1 Luu Duc Trung, *Rabindranath Tagore - Collection of* works (Labor Publishing House — Center for East — West Cultures and Languages, Hanoi, 2004) 693.

2 Rabindranath Tagore, *Gitanjali*, New Delhi: Niyogi, 2012.

The human of action in Tagore's conception also requires the fierce struggle against caste discrimination, requires free love, reclaims the true value for man. In Tagore's conception, the man is born from dreams, from the hope and loving of the world and God. In every human being, there is the precious treasure of this life, the "pearl of love that brightens up in the heart". Such pearl naturally belongs to the man, cannot be lost and cannot be hidden and it makes man be true to himself, it is the beginning and the end of every human life.

Affirming that love is the divinity of human, naturally belonging to human, in his verses, he always praises free love, the love of human, the infinite demands of human before the love. Tagore's verses are always directed to the human soul, deep into the inner world to discover the subtle vibrations of the human being in love with the desire for the harmony of the two souls. Finding his meaning in love is that human has reached heaven on the world of human life. Love is the harmony between two souls, the sacred humanity that human needs as "needing the air to breathe." One of the most intense forms of love is the dedication and creativity in love. Tagore always gives prominence to the act of sacrifice, dedicating everything to the love and silent love is the highest expression of love, the sublimest and most respectful love. The human in love always and constantly desires to be forever dedicated to love, giving his best without demands and the creativity is the highest expression of dedication. According to Tagore, in love, dedication is not enough, it requires creativity in love to bring newness and lasting attraction.

In addition to the delicate, romantic and high-faulting lyrical verses, Tagore poetry is full of fighting power, rich of realism with the desire to free the Indian people from the strict rules of religion, trampling of colonial empire. He is considered to be the "great guard of the world," always concerns with the destiny of India and the world, and dedicates his life to the only beautiful ideal. Tagore believes that the peace, kindness, harmony will come true.[1] In order to perform such ideal, Tagore appeals Indian people towards the work to help human act and free from the passive way of life and truly integrate into life. He emphasizes the ability to face, overcome all difficulties and challenges of human and affirms that in working, the human will reveal all his qualities and create himself. From which, he calls on the fighting spirit of human, fighting against the caste discrimination system, the strict rules of religion, fighting for the free love and affirming the good qualities of human in good nature:

1 Rabindranath Tagore, *A flight of swans: Poems from Balaka*, London: John Murray, 1955.

Com, with quick steps over the grass.
If the raddle come from your feet because of the dew,
If the rings of the bells upon your feet slacken,
If pearls drop out of your chain, do not mind.
Com with quick steps over the grass.[1] (Tagore, 2013).

Tagore's life has gone through a period of history with many changes of India and the world. More than ever he understood that it was the colonial empire that caused all suffering for the Indian people and the world people. The hatred of colonial empires and the desire for freedom and peace for all nations of the world have been reflected in his poetry through his outstanding image of the human of action.

Conclusions

Tagore always yearns and believes in the presence of a heaven on earth. In his belief, heaven has a harmony between joy, love, harmony and freedom. Throughout his life, Tagore has sung humanitarian songs to honor and pay his respects to people. His creations always came from the love of man and by his passionate love, he tried to understand and express his conceptions about people and appreciate human values. With a philosophy of action, Tagore contributes to liberate and perfect the human. This thought is conveyed through the image of the human of action. The image of the human of action contains Tagore's subjective thoughts, expressing the desire to free Indian people. The human of action inwardly seeks the freedom in his soul, the awakening of human in consciousness, the re-perception for familiar problems of life. The human in Tagore's poetry has boldly raised his voice to claim his love, is passionate and dedicated to the utmost in love. Not only that, the human is always aware of constantly being creative to renew his love. The human in extrovert action dares to face all the sufferings of life and is aware that happiness is only possible when human dares to fight.

Works Cited

Anayet Hossain, F.M. "Universal Humanism of Tagore." *Asian Journal of Social Sciences & Humanities* 4.2 (May 2015): 80-86.

Arup Jyoti Sarma. "Humanistic Philosophy of Tagore." *Kritike* 6.1 (June 2012): 50-66.

1 Rabindrath Tagore, *The Gardener*, The Project Gutenberg Ebook of The Gardener, Produced by Chetan Jain, and David Widger, January 26, 2013. From: https://www.gutenberg.org/files/6686/6686-h/6686-h.htm

Aruna Roy. "*Tagore's concept of love.*" *Indian Literature* 19.5 (September October, 1976): 103-107.

Aju Mukhopadhyay. "Essay: Tagore's Love Affairs." *Kittaab connecting asian writers with readers globally*, 6 (27) (September, 2016). From https://kitaab.org/2016/09/27/essay-tagores-love-affairs/.

Banshi Dhar. "The Humanism of Rabindranath Tagore." *Indian Literature* 16. 1/2 (January - June, 1973): 147-152.

Debjani Bandyopadhyaya. "Rabindranath Tagore-his childhood and creativity from the perspective of a Psychiatrist." *Indian Journal of Psychiatry* 60.4(2018): 507-509. doi: 10.4103/0019-5545.246187.

Do Thu Ha. *Tagore — literature and people*, Hanoi: Culture and Information Publishing House, 2005.

—. *Textbook of Indian Literature*, Hanoi: Hanoi National University Publishing House, 2015.

Madhumita Roy. "Scripting Women in Three Short Stories of Tagore." *Rupkatha Journal on Interdisciplinary Studies in Humanities* 2. 4 (2010): 596-604.

Manjula, R. "Humanism of Tagore: Disciverning our own Divinity." *SVU Journal of English Studies* 12 (2013): 92-96.

Mauchumi Hazarika. "Humanism in contemporaty Indian philosophy with special reference to Rabindranath Tagore" *International Journal of Current Research* 5 (12) (December, 2013): 4306-4308.

Monika Khurana. "Tagore's Philosophy on Humanism." *IJARIIE* 3 (4) (2017): 2188-2193.

Joanna Tuczyńska. "Animals in Rabindranath Tagore's Spiritul Humanism: Compassionate Love in the Idea of Organic Unity," *Rupkatha Journal on Interdisciplinary Studies in Humanities* 8.1 (2016): 59-67.

—. "The Folk Mysticism of Rabindranath Tagore." *Rupkatha Journal on Interdisciplinary Studies in Humanities* 6.2 (2014): 2-14.

Keshari Kumar Shukla. "Beauty of Love in Rabindranath Tagore's Poems," *International Journal for Research in Applied Sciences and Biotechnology* 6.1 (January 2019): 1-3.

Luu Duc Trung. *Indian literature*, Hanoi: Education Publishing House, 2004.

—. *Rabindranath Tagore —Collection of works,* Hanoi: Labor Publishing House — Center for East - West Cultures and Languages, 2004.

Purnima, B. "Portrayal of Women Characters in Rabindranath Tagore's The Garden." *The Criterion an International Journal in English* 5.5 (October 2014): 264-266.

Rabindranath Tagore. *A flight of swans: Poems from Balaka*, London: John Murray, 1955.

—. *Collected Poems and Plays*, London: Macmillan & Co LTD, 1955.

—. *The Crescent Moon,* London and New York: Macmillan and Company. The Project Gutenberg EBook of The Crescent Moon, 2013.

—. *Fruit-Gathering*, New York: The Macmillan Company, 1916. From:https://www.sacred-texts.com/hin/tagore/frutgath.htm.

—. *The Gardener*, The Project Gutenberg Ebook of The Gardener, Produced by Chetan Jain, and David Widger, January 26, 2013. From: https://www.gutenberg.org/files/6686/6686-h/6686-h.htm.

—. *Gitanjali*, New Delhi: Niyogi, 2012.

—. *The Religion of Man,* New York: Monkfish Book Publishing Co. Rhinebeck, 2004.

—. *Sadhana*, London: The Realization of Life, Macmillan, 1913.

Ranjan Ghosh. "Caught in the Cross Traffic: Rabindranath Tagore and the Trials of Child Education." *Comparative Education Review* 59.3 (August 2015): 399-419. DOI: 10.1086/681905.

Roy, P. K. *Beauty, Art and Man: Recent Indian Theories of Art,* Shimla: Indian Institute of Advanced Study, 1990.

Rumesh Chandra Majumdar. *Acient Indian Colonies in The Far East*, Lahore: Punjab Sankrit Book Depot, 1927.

Sukanta Chaudhuri. *The Cambridge Companion to Rabindranath Tagore*, Cambridge UP, (2019): 416-429. https://doi.org/10.1017/9781108779753.

Will Durant. *History of Indian civilization,* Ho Chi Minh City: General Publishing House, 2013.

Antigone on the Syrian Stage

Raad Kareem Abd-Aun
Department of English, College of Education for Human Sciences
University of Babylon, PO Box 4, 51002, Babylon, Iraq
Email: abdaun.raad@gmail.com

Abstract Arab theatre has heavily relied on European dramatic conventions since its emergence late in the 19th century. For more than a century, the Arab theatre has indeed drawn on a variety of dramatic techniques and adopted traditions it found functional to treat contemporary issues. The aftermath of WWII witnessed radical changes in the Arab social and political structures that required new approaches to portray them. These transformations have naturally been displayed in the literature, including drama, of the period. Consequently, the Avant Garde, the Absurd and other traditions smoothly found their way in the heritage of Arab theater.

Arab playwrights also relied on European myth for their subject matter. They adapted various myths to the Arabic stage. The Antigone myth is one of the enduring myths that was used, though in different ways, by both classical and modern playwrights. Arab playwrights also adapted this myth for their own purposes. This paper is devoted to the Arab playwrights' employment of the myth. Two Arab Syrian playwrights, namely Saadallah Wannous and Jihad Saad, have drawn upon the myth to expose the evils of the systems. The plays are Wannous's *The Unknown Messenger in Antigone's Funeral* and Saad's *Antigone's Migration*.

Key words *Antigone*; adaptation; Wannous, Saadallah; Saad, Jihad.

Author **Raad Kareem Abd-Aun**, Dr. phil., is a faculty member at the University of Babylon since 2004. He was awarded a PhD in English Literature at the University of Baghdad in 2011. He published several papers in Iraqi & international academic journals, a volume of poems, in addition to various translations. His main research interests are postcolonial literature and literary theory, modern drama, and Iraqi literature.

Antigone, the Legacy

The myth of Antigone is one of the Greek myths that not only endured for centuries, but came to have meaning for the oppressed and those whose voice is silenced in

the 20th and 21st centuries. Many modern playwrights and other writers adapted the play. Anouilh, Cocteau, Brecht, Fugard, Osofisan, Brathwaite, Heaney, Carson, and Zizek, to name a few, did so. In the words of Hanif Kureishi, Antigone is a "modern heroine […] a rebel, a refusenik, a feminist, an anti-capitalist […] a martyr, and without doubt a difficult, insistent person" (Kureishi viii). Her struggle with Creon is not simply the conflict of the *polis* and the citizen, or that of wills, but one of laws as well.

Hegel, who describes the play as "one of the most sublime and in every respect most excellent works of art of all time" (Hegel a 464), states that the conflict between Creon and Antigone is that between "the unwritten and infallible law of the gods" (Hegel b 261). Creon insists on depriving the individual citizen from any agency by taking the law into his hand as he represents the *polis*, and the laws of man. However, Antigone does not submit.

Kureishi continues his argument: "She is a rebel but not a revolutionary. She doesn't want to remove Creon and replace his dictatorship with a more democratic system" (Kureishi ix). Her attempts to carry out human law do not succeed in veering Creon from his position and acknowledge his self-blindness, rather he insists on enforcing the laws of the *polis* crushing any signs of dissidence. Yet she manages to defy him and prove that she has agency over his rule by committing suicide, the ultimate weapon in her armory. Her death is symbolic, Lacanian rather than Freudian.

That Antigone speaks despite the despotism of her uncle, finds agency despite his insistence on depriving her of it, does not make her Agamben's *homo sacer* (71), an individual who may not be sacrificed yet whose murderer might not be held accountable for, nor Lacan's living dead (271), rather she becomes what Butler refers to in her *Antigone's Claim*: "Antigone comes, then, to act in ways that are called manly not only because she acts in defiance of the law but also because she assumes the voice of the law in committing the act against the law. She not only does the deed, refusing to obey the edict, but she also does it again by refusing to deny that she has done it, thus appropriating the rhetoric of agency from Creon himself" (11).

Antigone is a complex figure that is both classic and modern. Thus, to adapt the play *as it is* would not do it justice, taking the risk of changing the play for a modern audience, would do. In the words of Slavoj Zizek: "the only way to be faithful to a classic work is to take such as risk — avoiding it, sticking to the traditional letter, is the safest way to betray the spirit of the classic. In other words, the only way to keep a classical work alive is to treat it as 'open', pointing towards the future" (xii).

Antigone, the Oppressed

Saadallah Wannous (1941-1997) is one of the most prominent Arab playwrights in the 20th century. His sojourns in Egypt (1959-1963) and later in Paris (1966-1968) were of great help for him to develop his theatrical gifts. His theatre registers a keen interest in issues and cares of Wannous's contemporary Arabic man, as well as being bound to a call to change the Arab present to the better. His first play was entitled *Medusa Stares at Life* (1962). In this play, as well as his other early plays, Wannous is influenced by existentialism and absurdism, especially through the works of Beckett and Ionesco, the latter having greater influence on Wannous (Dawwara, 190).

The first stage of Wannous's career, which began from 1962 to 1966, is characterized by generalization, a tendency towards abstraction and allegory regarding issues of fear, oppression and authority. These issues led the individual into introversion expressed in long monologues which are nearer to narrative than to drama in a language that is excessively poetic. Wannous himself comments on this saying: "I used to write plays for reading […] I have no conceptualization of the theatre in my mind" (Maala 118). One of the plays he wrote during this period is *The Unknown Messenger in Antigone's Funeral* (Ar-Rasul Al-majhul fi Maatam Antijun) which is based on Sophocles' *Antigone*. The play was written in 1963 and published in 1965 along with its companion play and first of the duology, *The Tragedy of the Poor Molasses Seller* (Maasat Baai Ad-Dibs Al-Faqir) based on Sophocles' *Oedipus*, in a book entitled *The Tales of the Chorus of Statues* (1965).

One of the main characteristics of these plays is their excessive abstraction. The language of the plays does not report or register the action as much as it describes it. This would only indicate the aestheticism of the written word and the self-absorption of the characters, which is the result of oppression and isolation, that led the playwright to write long monologues (Maala 118). However, the plays are political in nature. Wannous himself emphasizes that the theatre was born and will remain political even when it does not concern itself with politics. It is so because when it does not, the theatre is acting politically by diverting people's attention from politics to other less pressing issues, keeping them busy from thinking about changing the status quo (Wannous b, 36-37).

The influence of classical western theatre on Wannous does not need to be stressed. Some of the first plays he wrote are adapted from Greek myths, like *Medusa*, *Oedipus* and *Antigone*. *The Unknown Messenger in Antigone's Funeral* is a one-act play in which Khadhra/Antigone is the oppressed young daughter of Khadhur/

Oedipus, the molasses seller. He is persecuted by Hasan/Creon, the petty spy turned head of authority causing her father's demise in the first play of the duology.

In *The Tales of the Chorus of Statues*, Wannous uses the chorus which he borrows from Greek drama. However, the chorus in his plays (*The Tragedy of the Poor Molasses Seller* and *The Unknown Messenger in Antigone's Funeral*) is made of a group of statues set in the town center to reflect the negativity and inaction of people. These statues represent an artistic correlative referring to the people whose role is limited to commenting on events.

Another radical change in the play is the character of Khadhra/Antigone. She is no longer the outspoken strong-willed girl who defies Creon and buries her dead brother, rather she is a broken-down girl who speaks incoherently, tortured and raped by the agents of the authority whom Hasan wants to possess:

> I was beautiful.
> The wheat spikes smile in my eyes.
> And the roses sing in my mouth.
> I was a princess.
> And the horizon was rolled for my eyes. […]
> A painful story made impossible by time. **(The word impossible echoes painfully.)** The walls have devoured the horizon .. all horizon. The wolfish creature usurped the throne of the city. The knight sunk in mud deeply … deeply. (Wannous (a) 364-365)

Wannous's play might be realistic if broken into pieces but it is closer to a nightmare if taken as a whole, as in the doggish face of Hasan, or killing the boy (whom Wannous might have adapted from the boy who enters at the end of each act of *Waiting for Godot* although the meaning and symbolism of each differs greatly) who returns afterwards. The play is not divided into scenes like *The Tragedy of the Poor Molasses Seller*, rather it continues as the dialogue develops, divided between Khadhra's monologues, the chorus of statues comments, and her dialogues with Hasan.

The conflict in the play is that between the authority, represented by Hasan, and Khadhra. The disparity of the conflict is clear from the beginning of the play. Hasan is powerful, authoritative and violent while Khadhra is the opposite — she is powerless and passive. Although the conflict is the same in both plays of the duology, it is not resolved in the same way: in the first play, Hasan wins, while in the second, he does not. The secondary conflict, that is between the chorus of statues

and the authority, is of little consequence as to the development of the play.

Khadhra loses her beauty as a consequence of the oppression and maltreatment she receives at the hands of the agents of the authority. The dialogue in the play can be taken as a long monologue by Khadhra dotted by the speeches of the chorus of statues and Hasan's. She loses any connections to rality as a result of the torture she is subjected to, which is reflected in her incoherent and broken-down monologues. Wannous opens this play in *medias res* which is unlike what he did in *The Tragedy of the Poor Molasses Seller*. In the latter, the audience follow the persecution and consequent destruction of Khadhur from start to finish. While the second play of the duology opens after Khadhra's destruction and her subsequent confrontations with Hasan, which ends with his destruction.

Some critics accused Wannous at this stage of his career of creating characters that are singular and not universal (Ramadhan 65) because they represent only themselves and not a social class that is in conflict with external forces. However, this is the heart and soul of existential philosophy and the Theatre of the Absurd. This abstraction is what makes such theatres, like the Theatre of the Absurd, universal throughout embodying the suffering of man in a lost world. Nevertheless, Wannous soon realized that this type of theatre is not suitable for an Arab audience who did not undergo what the western audience did. It is the latter's experience which made him identify himself with this kind of theatre that relies heavily on exposing the falsity and oddity of life. Due to this lack of correspondence between the stage and the spectator, Wannous stopped writing in this style and adopted a new style, especially after his disillusionment following the defeat of the Arab armies in 1967.

Antigone, the Dissident

Jihad Saad (1959) is a Syrian actor, director, and playwright. For him, *Hijrat Antigone* (Antigone's Migration) is that of the soul under pressure, a search for the self, and an imagined city representing the legitimate child of freedom (Hatahit). In the play, Haemon, addressing his father, says: "You used to see as you wanted me to be, you've never seen me as I am" (Saad). Saad comments on this saying that the audience want to project their preconceptions on the performance instead of dealing with it as a unique, independent entity. He continues, "we live in an area full of immutable preconceptions and an immutable audience who cannot accept a transforming performance. What I present is a spiritual experience that calls for meditation. Dynamism lies not in motion, but in the weight of the moment" (Hatahit).

The play deals with the loss of one's homeland. This loss is realized in terms of

two dialectic relationships: the tyrant vs. the dissident (Creon vs. Antigone), and the father vs. the son (Creon vs. Haemon) (Zeiter 298). One of the differences between Wannous's and Saad's plays is seen here. While the former limits the play to the confrontation between Khadhra/Antigone and Hasan/Creon presenting a minimalist play where the conflict is a dialectic between two contrasting poles, the latter presents, in a play that is no less minimalist in terms of setting and décor, a number of dialectics in addition to the ones mentioned earlier as Oedipus and Polynices who also appear in the play.

Although the play is an adaptation of a Greek classical, Saad considers it a contemporary play:

> Greek literature is a great pool of philosophical ideas […] I consider [the play] a contemporary one, other wise I would have produced Sophocles' *Antigone*. … I presented *Hijrat Antigone* which is the migration of the soul, of consciousness and of man in search of his true higher self facing all pressures, oppression, and the attempts to kill the seeds of love and freedom. Antigone migrates to another world which might be inside as a new consciousness, like myself as I am in a constant migration in search of something new, like any man and not only as a playwright. Every human being is in need of renewing his life every now and then like a phoenix […] Antigone decided to leave her city and go into a new world, which might be her inner world, that is to say, letting go for the sake of a new life. (Anon.)

The action takes place on a bare stage covered with sand which brings to the foreground the actor as a human being, who is the most important element in the play in Saad's view. The actor embodies the word/the meaning on the stage as a human being before doing so as an actor. The actor is searching for the freedom of his being as well as the characters she/he portrayed arriving ultimately to the liberation of the audience. Saad emptied the stage of any lifeless objects which hinder and hide the movement of the actor and weaken his presence on the stage placing him in a second place after décor and stage props (Samman).

The play opens with a monologue in which Antigone mourns the death of her brother Polynices:

> Antigone: Polynices, my dear brother, with your death you ripped my soul of my body and left me alone to carry this hell in my rips. Here I weep you at your grave, the soul of our father Oedipus fluttering around us. My hands

shake and my little heart jumps from my breast in longing and sadness. (Saad)

From the beginning of the play, Antigone associates her death with her brother's whose body was left without burial. By revolting against her uncle's decision, she becomes (Lacan's) the living dead whose emigration is akin to her death (Ziter, 298). Ziter stresses that she is already dead as she lives under the rule of a tyrant, without freedom and will. The basic question the play asks, and which haunts Saad himself, is: one can actually run from his fate through emigration, or is his fate inevitable. Antigone's fate is homelessness which the play symbolizes by the impossibility of securing a grave for her brother, and later on for herself. Saad says: "She leaves and enters darkness. Where would she go? Where would I go? If I leave Syria, where would I go?" (Ziter 293) Antigone's homelessness brings to mind similar experiences of Syrians, Palestinians, and Iraqis during the last two decades, which Saad stressed. (Samman)

Creon is a tyrant whose only concern is to keep his authority, and the *polis*, intact. The *polis* disappears from the text/performance with only a stretch of sand left of it; perhaps a metaphor for what wars leave of cities. If the conflict in Sophocles' *Antigone* is between the polis and the citizen, here it is between the tyrant and the dissident. That's why Creon does not threaten Antigone only, he fantasizes about the ways to kill her: "You will die the worst of deaths; to be eaten by the worms if your body found a place to be buried in. You will be torn into pieces and your limbs will be scattered around. If a bird of prey lands to devour your rotting corpse it would not know the limbs are for one body" (Saad). Ziter argues that the relationship between Creon and Antigone is "a conflict between an authoritarian power that strives to eliminate even the idea of resistance and a dissident whose most heinous crime is her existence" (Ziter 299).

Yet, Creon is not only in conflict with Antigone, but with his son Haemon as well. He reprimands his son after seeing him cry at the grave of his cousin and friend Polynices. Haemon replies to his father that he never treated him as a son because of his hunger for power and egotism: "You have neglected me and my childhood and the most beautiful days of my life. You never cared for me. I longed for a word that would give me strength. I longed to sit by your side when I was a child to feel you a father. You treated me like a dog that crosses the court, worthless and without any value" (Saad) .

Death haunts the play from its onset. One of the first things to be seen on the stage is the mound of sand that represents Polynices' grave. His appearance on the stage to answer Haemon is a foreshadowing of Haemon's sealed fate: "I remember

the thorn that went in my foot when I was chasing you in the woods we loved. You came and removed it with such skill. […] Who can remove the thorn your father placed in my heart and the hearts of all of you? […] Who can return the fleeing sweet dream that dwelt in your eyes and Antigone's beautiful eyes?" (Saad) Haemon joins the ghosts of Oedipus and Polynices indicating his death.

Through the ghost of Oedipus, Antigone attempts to create "a link with others who have lived through disaster and want only to avoid harsh conditions" (Ziter 304). However, the relationship between Antigone and the *polis*, Thebes, is stressed in the play more than her filial relations, which signals a sharp difference to the Sophoclean original (Ziter 298-99), and is clearly seen in the last things she says in the play:

> O city dwelling between my ribs, in my soul, who gave my life and showed me first light and drawn my path … O city who shaped my face as a child and a young girl and planted in me a soul baptized in her holy secret … a soul clear and gentle like the breeze at sun set, and violent as a sad winter storm […] Here I am casting my last look upon you … planting the marks of my eyes in your walls … I go broken hearted … no father to protect me and no brother to console me on the way … I leave you my decaying goods and the memories of a lost lifetime … I leave my robes … my jewels … a lock of my hair … on your holy ground … and I turn my face toward the brink of the abyss of eternity … (Saad)

Antigone's fear is the fear of dispossession which is clearly seen in her relationship to the *polis*. In her dialogue, which creates an agonizing dialectic relationship, she does not want to leave Thebes but cannot live under dictatorship. The dialectic is even more complex than this simplification: if she stays, she will be killed and will not be buried; if she leaves, she will not have a homeland to be buried in. The last stage direction in the play, "Silence … Antigone stands … she leaves the city … towards void and darkness" (Saad), offers no ray of hope. The dissident Antigone is leaving, after having lost her father, brother, and lover into darkness. This dispossession narrates the tragedy of Syrians, Iraqis and others who had to flee their countries during the last two decades of violence that stormed and still storms the region. The play is not simply and adaptation of a classical text, but an apt comment on a human ordeal that is yet to be solved.

Conclusion

Although the plays are over forty years apart, both agree on one thing: there is tyranny and oppression that crushes the individual, and turns cities into wastelands. Both plays depict the head of the state, Hasan/Creon, as one who would stop at nothing to destroy any (potential) opposition to his absolute rule. In both plays, the city is not of any consequence, nor are its inhabitants. The city is never named in *The Unknown Messenger in Antigone's Funeral* and is represented as a stretch of sand in *Antigone's Migration*. The citizens of the city in *The Unknown Messenger in Antigone's Funeral* are reduced to statues which collapse and shatter as a metaphor of helplessness, and are never present in *Antigone's Migration* which is also a sign for their helplessness. The plays no longer represent the Athenian ideal of *polis* vs. citizen, rather they represent the tyrant (both in the classical Greek and modern sense of the word) vs. the oppressed/dissident citizen.

Another departure from the original which sets the plays apart is the twist in the storyline from being about filial love and divine retribution into plays about oppression and dissidence. Another difference lies in that Saad grants Antigone some sort of agency to act on her own, while Wannous denies Khadhra any. Another point of discrepancy between the two plays is that while Wannous ends his play with a spark of hope, Saad does not.

It is both intriguing and tragic that despite more than forty years time-lapse between the plays, and the different backgrounds and ideologies of the playwrights, the status quo which led two dramatists to write two plays depicting oppression is the same. It is also intriguing that both playwrights chose Sophocles' *Antigone* as a model to adapt. Such an area of research, adaptation of classics for the Arabic stage, remains largely neglected. Perhaps it is time to shed light on this area. It would definitely shed light on the nature of the relationship of the system to its subjects and playwrights' different responses to it in a corner of the world that is still beset with internal and external conflicts.

Works Cited

Agamben, Giorgio. *Homo Sacer, Sovereign Power and Bare Life*. Translated by Daniel Heller-Roazen. Stanford, CA: Stanford UP, 1998.

Anon. "al-Fannan Jihad Saad li Jouhaina" (Dramatist Jihad Saad to Jouhaina). *Jouhaina*, No. 3 (Aug. 1, 2005). <https://jouhina.com/magazine/archive_article.php?id=788> (accessed Oct. 16, 2019).

Butler, Judith. *Antigone's Claim: Kinship Between Life & Death*. NY: Columbia UP, 2000.

Dawwara, Fuad. "Interview." *Al-Hilal*, Vol. 4 (1st April, 1977): 187-197. <http://archive.alsharekh.org/newPreview.aspx?PID=1167390&ISSUEID=13714&AID=283997> (accessed Oct. 10, 2019).

Hatahit, Lilas. "'Hijrat Antigone' Thareea liTarh Tasaulat hawl al-Harb wa As-Sulta" (Antigone's Migration, a Pretext to Question War and Authority), *Al-Sharq Al-Awsat*, no. 9767 (August 25, 2005). <http://archive.aawsat.com/print.asp?did=319419&issueno=9767> (accessed Oct. 16, 2019).

Hegel, G. W. F. (a). *Aesthetics, Lectures in Fine Arts*, Vol. I. Translated by T. M. Knox. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1977.

Hegel, G. W. F. (b). *Phenomenology of Spirit*. Translated by A. V. Miller. Oxford: OUP, 1977.

Kureishi, Hanif. "Foreword: Antigone – If Their Lips Weren't Sealed by Fear." in Slavoj Zizek. *Antigone*. London: Bloomsbury, 2016. viii-x.

Lacan, Jacques. *The Seminar of Jacques Lacan, Book VII, The Ethics of Psychoanalysis, 1959-1960*. Translated by Dennis Porter. NY and London: Norton, 1992.

Maala, Nadeem. *Al-Adab Al-Masrahy fi Suria* (Theatrical Art in Syria). Damascus: Muasasat Al-Wihda, 1982.

Ramadhan, Khalid Abdullateef. *Masrah Saadallah Wannous: Dirasah Fanniyyah* (The Theatre of Saadallah Wannous: An Artistic Study). Kuwait: Sharikat Al-Manabir, 1984.

Saad, Jihad. *Hijrat Antigone* (Antigone's Migration). Unpublished unpaginated play manuscript.

Samman, Najm ad-Deen. "An Masrhhiyyatihi 'Hijrat Antigone': Jihad Sadd 'My body is my idea of my body while I'm on stage'". *Tishreen*, <http://tishreen.news.sy/tishreen/public/read/42789> (accessed Oct. 16, 2019)

Wannous, Saadallah. (a). *Ar-Rasul Al-mahjul fi Maatam Antijun* (The Unknown Messenger in Antigone's Funeral). In *Saadallah Wannous: The Complete Works*. Vol. I. Beirut: Dar Al-Adab for Printing and Distribution, 2004.

Wannous, Saadallah. (b). "Bayanat liMasrah Arabi Jadeed" (Statements for a New Arabic Theatre). In *Saadallah Wannous: The Complete Works*. Vol. III. Damascus: Al-Ahaly for Printing and Distribution, 1996.

Ziter, Edward. "No Grave in the Earth: *Antigone's Migration* and Arab Circulations". In *Antigone on the Contemporary World Stage*. Eds. Erin B. Mee and Helene P. Foley. Oxford. OUP, 2011. 289-306.

Zizek, Slavoj. *Antigone*. London: Bloomsbury, 2016.

Ibsen in Modern Arabic Drama and Theater

Hanan K. Al-Jezawi
Department of English Language and Literature
Al Balqa Applied University Irbid City/ Jordan.
Email: Jeezawi@bau.edu.jo
Mahmoud F. Al-Shetawi
Department of English Language and Literature
University of Jordan, Amman/ Jordan.
Email: alshetawi_m@ju.edu.jo

Abstract This essay argues that the playwright Henrik Ibsen was a head of his time and his thoughts had anticipated ours at the present time. The paper accentuates Ibsen's revival in modern and contemporary Egyptian drama. As a dramatist who discussed social and political problems in his plays, it is implausible to dissociate him from the political and social problems of the Arab World, especially in the aftermath of the Arab Spring. The aim of this essay is to show how Prominent Egyptian dramatists such asTawfiq Al-Hakim, Rashad Rushdi, and No'man Ashur have been influenced by Ibsen's social drama and theatrical techniques. On the other hand, Egyptian playwrights and Arab theater directors are influenced by him; consequently, they have adapted and appropriated some of his plays into Arabic. The essay concludes that Ibsen has an impact on modern and contemporary Egyptian drama and theater in terms of themes and techniques, and that the revival of his plays and themes in the Twentieth and Twenty-first Centuries correlates with the political and social upheavals across the Arab World. the essay is informed by Julie Sanders' theoretical underpinnings of adaptation and appropriation in an effort to show the significance of adapting and appropriating Ibsen's plays by Arab dramatists and theater directors.

Key words adaptation; Arab Spring; Arabic Theater; Egyptian Dramatists.

Authors **Hanan Al Jezawi**, Dr. in English Literature at Al Balqa Applied University. Her Main search interests are comparative literature and African American literature. **Mahmoud Al Shetawi,** Full Professor in English Literature at University of Jordan and Dean of Faculty of Foreign Languages (206-2018). His main interest are comparative literature, Shakespeare , and Postcolonial studies.

Introduction

The emergence and development of Arabic drama from the second half of the Nineteenth Century to the beginning of the Twentieth Century was influenced by Western drama and theater. The latter provides an inspirational platform for Arab playwrights, especially those who have been in direct contact with Western cultures. Modern Arab dramatists explored different Western theater theories. As an illustration, the Lebanese dramatist Maroun al-Naqqash established the first Arabic theater based on Western plays. After spending years in Italy and being affected by the stage art, he adapted Moliere's comedy, *L'Avare*, under the title [*al-Bakhil*] (1848). Sabry Hafez (2017), points out that Al-Naqqash devotes his attention to drama and his work in this genre is a development of Arab culture. Furthermore, the father of the Syrian theater, Ahmed Abou-Khalil al-Qabbani, who is considered the founder of Arabic musical drama, followed the same trend in adapting European plays. His visits to different European countries allowed him to adapt the French dramatist Corneille. Western theater schools, namely the classical, romantic, realistic, and symbolic, were most influential in the Arab theater. It is believed that the adaptation of European dramatic texts constituted the basis of Arabic theater because of the translation and performance of Western plays in Arab countries.

Henrik Johan Ibsen (1828-1906)is one of the most influential Norwegian playwrights. His global significance has exceeded the borders of Norway and Europe; his plays are received not only in Europe but in the Arab world as well. On the other hand, Ibsen refers to Arabs in some of his works and letters. He became interested in Islam and the Arabs after his visit to Egypt in 1869. He accepted an invitation from Khedive Ismail of Egypt to attend the opening of the Suez Canal (1869) where he spent two months (Fischer-Lichte et al. 126). During his visit to Egypt, he learnt more about Arabic culture and history. However, Ibsen's imagination was roaming this land long before his visit to the country. His play *Peer Gynt* (1867)is set in a North Africa Arab region (Morocco in particular) and Egypt.

Ibsen's journey into the Arab World in terms of adapting his plays and translating them into Arabic has not yet been adequately considered. He has been extensively translated into Arabic perhaps more than any other European dramatis with the exception of William Shakespeare; therefore, this study attempts to explore Ibsen's journey into the Arab World in terms of the reception of his drama in Egypt and in other Arab countries.

Ibsen's plays have been frequently performed in the world, and the Arab World

is no exception. On that account, he has achieved a worldwide fame as his plays represent ordinary people and everyday life, which stimulates Egyptian dramatists to follow his techniques and themes such as blending realism with symbolism, and highlighting political and realistic issues. By examining the realities that lay beneath the social facades, his drama becomes a rich material for performance, appropriation and adaptation. Moreover, Ibsen's revival is aligned with political and social issues in modern and contemporary Arabic drama and theater. His revolutionary propositions in his plays have contributed to the revival of his drama in the Arab Spring countries.

In her book *Adaptation and Appropriation,* Julie Sanders uses different terms to describe adaptation such as interpretation and continuation. The interpretations and the different points of view make the new version different from the original one. Sanders (2006) suggests that adaptation attempts to make the original text suitable to new audiences by updating it to address issues of concern to them and their time. Therefore, adaptation is a revised version of the original text.

Sanders diagnoses the relationship between adaptation and appropriation. She defines adaptation as (2006), "a highly specific process involving the transition from one genre to another: novels into film; drama into musical; the dramatization of prose narratives and prose fiction; or the inverse movement of making drama into prose narrative" (19). She uses "appropriation" to identify the kind of adaptation that transposes the source culture to a different culture. In appropriation there is a shift in setting and language into a new context.

Sanders (2006) adds that intertextuality is a form of adaptation and appropriation. She cites different critics who have already discussed intertextuality or imitation. For example, Sanders refers to Edward Said who states that the writer considers rewriting more than writing originally. She also refers to Ronald Barthes who argues that "any text is an intertext" (2). Claude Levis interprets rewriting a text as "repeating structures across cultures" (qtd. in Sanders, 2006). Compatible with these opinions, Sanders maintains that adaptation and appropriation are, "endlessly and wonderfully, about seeing things come back to us in as many forms as possible" (160) In discussing the influence of Ibsen in modern Arabic drama, the present study will be critically informed by Sanders' theorizing pronouncements and critical views.

Ibsen in Twentieth Century Arabic Drama

Ibsen wrote many social realistic plays which focus on social dilemmas and criticize the values of society. Therefore, he is known as the father of realism. In

Ghosts (1881)*,* Ibsen highlights the concept of sins; in *Pillars of Society* (1877), he discusses wars and business, and in *Hedda Gabbler* (1890), he deals with the role of women. As admirers of Ibsen, Egyptian dramatists have revived him in their literary works. Although it is known that "before the 1950s [Ibsen] was virtually unknown in Egypt; very few had heard of him, and even fewer had read him" (Fischer-Lichte et al. 119), some Egyptian playwrights were influenced by him long before this time. Ibrahim Ramzi(1884-1949), who was an important playwright of the modern Arab theater in Egypt, was influenced by Ibsen. He translated Ibsen's play *An Enemy of the people* for the first time in (1932); this was probably the first work for Ibsen to be translated into Arabic.

The Egyptian playwright, Tawfiq al-Hakim (1898-1987), played a pivotal role in the development of Arabic drama. Al-Hakim was introduced to French theater during his sojourn in France for several years to obtain a degree in law. The opportunity of living in France allowed him to immerse in the aesthetics of the new movements in European theater represented in the plays of Ibsen and Bernard Shaw. The Egyptian critic Muhammad Badawi (1987), mentions that when al- Hakim was in Paris, he turned away from the farce, and the popular comedic theater and operettas he used to see in Cairo to "developing an overwhelming interest in the French *avant-garde* theatre of the time: the stage productions of plays by Ibsen" (qtd. in Allen 103).

Ibsen is known for his unique style of blending symbolism with reality. Realism in Ibsen's realistic plays criticizes the ills of his society and Ibsen has extensively dubbed them with symbolism, a dramatic technique that has become a hall mark of his plays. The mechanism of his symbols is based on the idea that the symbol stands for either a character of a play or the meaning of the play as a whole. At the same time, this symbol is presented in a realistic way. For instance, in Ibsen's *A Doll's House,* the title symbolizes the dehumanized wife, Nora, whose soul is the stage of the real action of the play, and at the same time, the symbol stands for the play itself.Nora explains to Torvald: "I have been your doll wife, just as at home I was Daddy's doll child. And the children in turn have been my dolls. I thought it was fun when you came and played with me, just as they thought it was fun when I went to play with them. That's been our marriage, Torvald" (Act III). This is why she has become dissatisfied with her life. Moreover, the male protagonist has a double meaning, which is realistic symbolic. He is trapped by traditional gender roles; however, by the end of the play the traditional ideas are put to the test. In the play, Ibsen rebels against social realism, and the realism of the ordinary life is converted to the symbolic of spiritual happenings.

In *Ghosts*,Ibsen employs disease as symbol of corruption of the body and the mind; he makes the symbol as something real. This corruption is inherited from the raked dead father. When Oswald confesses to his mother that he carries syphilis which he inherits from his father, he repeats the doctor's proverb: "The sins of the fathers are visited upon the children, and the children's children" (Act II). The significance of sickness lies in its relation to the play's main theme of hauntings; this proves Mrs. Alving's theory that Oswald is haunted by his father.

Similar to Ibsen, Al-Hakim blends realism with symbolism in different works. For instance, in his work *Isis* (1955), he juxtaposes the modern social and political conditions of Egypt with the Pharaonic history of Egypt. Besides, Isis is an Egyptian woman who stands as a symbol of the unity of Egypt.In this workthe remains of Isis symbolize Egypt waiting for someone to unite it and gather its people. Al-Hakim blends symbolism with realism to show the sufferings of Egyptians at that time. Moreover, his play *Awdat al-Ruh* [The Return of the Spirit] (1933) is another work that follows Ibsen's style of blending realism with symbolism. It is the story of a nationalistic Egyptian and his family that ends with events around the 1919 revolution which explodes for the sake of the Egyptian revolutionary Saa'd Zaghloul and his companions who were exiled. The 1919 revolution that is said to be for Zaghlul, symbolizes their rebel against colonization. Similar to Ibsen, he reveals psychological facts, and moral problems through characters that symbolize different ideas. Al Hakim intentionally blends the history of his childhood and youth with the history of Egypt in a way that shows his creativity. This work is considered a semi-autobiographical fiction; Muhsin, the protagonist, is based on Al hakim himself. Al-Hakim's adaptation of Ibsen's style goes in line with Sanders' explanation (2006) of adaptation which involves several distinct practices such as imitation, rewriting, echo, and pastiche. Sanders explains that in art and literature, pastiche means imitating the style and character of a certain literary work, or the style of an artist or writer. She adds (2006), that pastiche can be used to show admiration of the literary style of a particular writer.

Additionally, Ibsen has inspired al-Hakim to write what is known as "Drama of Ideas." Before al-Hakim, Ibsen was known for the "Drama of Ideas," or drama of social criticism. Martin Puchner refers in his book *The Drama of Ideas: Platonic Provocation in Theatre and Philosophy* to Bentley's definition of the drama of ideas as follows (2010), "in drama of ideas, […], the ideas are questioned, and it is by the questioning, and could only be by the questioning, that the idea becomes dramatic, for seldom or never is there drama without conflict" (93).It deals with social issues through debates between characters on the stage, who represent conflicting points

of view. Characters and plot are offered to discussion and argument. Meena Sodhi demonstrates that drama of ideas and problem plays are synonymous to each other; the latter was popularized by Ibsen. His aim was to "make the people think intelligently about the problems which he discussed through his "mouthpieces" or through the evolution of the plot" (66). Sodhi adds that such plays have a tragic tone since they discuss "painful human dilemmas" (66). For instance, in Ibsen's *An Enemy of the People,* Arthur Miller suggests that a central theme of the play is "the question of whether the democratic guarantees protecting political minorities ought to be set aside in times of crises" (8). Moreover, the main characters Thomas Stockmann, Peter Stockmann and Thomas's wife, Katherine — each has special constraints of his or her role.Ibsen offers multiple arguments that appeal to the economic interests of the town.

Al-Hakim introduces his "Drama of Ideas" in different plays such as*Ahl Alkahf* [The People of the Cave] (1933), *Shahrazad* (1934), *al-Malik Udib* [King Oedipus] (1949) adapted from *King Oedipus* (1949), and *Suliman al-Hakim*[Solomon the Wise] (1934) which tackle Egyptian social themes and conflicts that the audience need to examine and resolve. Al hakim leaves questions such as "what if?" for the audience to answer. [The people of the Cave] is the story of the sleepers of Ephesus who, in order to escape the Roman persecution, take refuge in a cave. They sleep for three centuries, and wake up in a different era. Al Hakim assumes that the first man leaves his sheep; the second man leaves his family; the third leaves his beloved. The question that al Hakim leaves is: would they accept this reality and live it? It is a study of humans struggle against time. In *Shahrazad,* Al Hakim supposes that shahrazad becomes tired after spending his life moving from one place to another although his travels are not real, but fictional. Al Hakim leaves a question which is: can Shahrazad live a comfortable life after all what he has suffered?Drama of ideas discusses a social or political problem without offering a solution, which may give satisfaction to the audience to consider a way to solve the problem.

The famous Egyptian dramatist No'man Ashur, the founder of social realistic drama in Egypt, was also influenced by Ibsen's mode of writing and he introduced Ibsen into the Egyptian theater. In *Global Ibsen: Performing Multiple Modernities*, Fischer-Lichtepoints out that Ashur is not the only writer who presented Ibsen to the Arab world. Kamel Yousef, who translated *A Doll's House* and Aziz Suliman, who translated *The Pillars of Society* introduced Ibsen to the Egyptian readers (118). These plays reflect social hypocrisy and the exploitation of classes. For example, Ibsen's *The Pillars of Society,*represents the middle-class Norwegian society, which is characterized as materialistic, hypocritical, and full of corruption. Although

Bernick is guilty of attempted murder, he successfully addresses the community and demonstrates that the powerful and rich are often selfish. In the play,Dina tells Rorlund how depressed she feels among people who do not appreciate her since she is from a lower class:

> RORLUND. Could you not try to alter your nature?
> DINA. No.
> RORLUND. Why not?
> DINA.(Looking at him): Because I am one of the "poor fallen creatures."
> RORLUND. My dear Dina, I can quite understand that you feel repressed here.
> DINA. Yes, if only I could get right away from here. (Act I)

Similarly, Ashur's plays *al-Nas Elli Taht* [The People Downstairs] (1956) and *al-Nas Elli Fauq*[The People Upstairs] (1958) reflect the influence of Ibsen and Bernard Shaw in terms of characterization and dramaturgy. Hadle Andersen mentions in his article 'The Brand Poet Strikes Back: *Peer Gynt* as Part of a Norwegian Duel of Satires" (2014), that *Peer Gynt* is a satire on Norwegian culture. Moreover, this play refers to different cultures and deals with universal issues. For instance, Peer Gynt, as a representative of the Norwegian culture, is arrogant and self-deceiving, a character who has been presented by Ibsen in a satirical way in order to criticise some Norwegians. The socio-political elements in these plays mark a beginning of a new era in which the writers start bringing to light social issues. Ashur's two plays mirror class conflict and highlight realism in modern Arabic drama. Molefi Asante points out that in his plays, Ashur highlights political and social struggles in his country, and most of his plays are tragicomedies since they feature the ironical situations in his country as seen, for example, in his play *al-Maghnatis* [The Magnet] (1950), in which he deals with the hardships that result from social classes in his society (146). [The People Downstairs]is the first play to permeate the social issues in Egypt by discussing the conflict between social classes in a satirical way. Ashur poses different questions such as: to what extent is a man capable of constructing a society based on equality? The play criticizes the social ladder which stimulates people to compete for 'room at the top'. [The People Upstairs] rejects the reconciliation between the governing class and other classes in order to build a classless society.

Rashad Rushdi (1912-83) is one of the prominent Egyptian playwrights who was also influenced by Ibsen: "the nearest anyone came to writing what could be called a typically Ibsenitedrama was Rashad Rushdi" (Fischer-Lichte et al. 119). In

writing *al-Farashah* [The Butterfly] (1959) which talks about the annihilation of an artist by a rich womanRushdi becomes close to Ibsen. Rushdi mentions in his criticism book *Fann al-Drama* [The Art of Drama] that we can summarize Ibsen's modern ideas in different trends. The first is that the past obscures the present and the future, and the second is that the past prevents us from progression. Ibsen applies his ideas first in *Ghosts* which is pervaded with the figurative ghosts of the past. The dying son Oswald screams saying that he wants the sun:

> OSWALD. [*Sits in the arm-chair with his back towards the landscape, without moving. Suddenly he says:*] Mother, give me the sun.
> MRS. ALVING. *[By the table, starts and looks at him*.] What do you say?
> OSWALD. [*Repeats, in a dull, toneless voice.]* The sun. The Sun. (Act III).

This represents not only his need for opium to dispel the pain, but the fact that living people are invaded by the phantoms of the dead ones who live with them to poison their present. To scrutinize Rushdi's writings, one may notice that he adapts the same idea of the past in his play *Khayal al-Zil* [The Shadow Puppet] (1965). The main character is Adel who investigates the death of al-Alfi. Al-Alfi's ex-wife's betrayal shakes his confidence and causes him psychological problems. The past confuses his present life, and leads him to accuse Al-Alfi's wife for the death of her husband. Different characters in the play illustrate the conflict between the past and the present. In his play *RihlahKharij al-Sur* [A Trip Outside the Fence], the past plays a distinct role; the hero who embraces new thoughts encounters a society with its rotten past. The past obstructs the way of his progress; therefore, the only way to bring about change is to face the past with its negative aspects. In the present, the will is the weapon to face the past and to be responsible for the *status quo*.

Rushdi focuses in his plays "on the inner truth of individuals as seen through the experiences and conflicts of the human psyche" (Rubin ch.4). Fate chases the individual through the present and into the future and cannot be escaped. In *TheButterfly,*the story that portrays the destruction of an artist by a rich woman, we see the conflict between the modern ideology that the hero, Ramzi, who belongs to the working class embraces and the values that are embraced by his aristocratic wife, Samiha, along with her family. The Syrian critic, RiadIsmat (2018), states that Rushdi's play and its issues are still applicable in today's life after the outbreak of the Arab Spring in 2011 and that the main concerns of the play are about democracy and justice.

Ibsen in the Twenty-First Century Arabic Drama

The theater performance, translations and adaptations of the plays of Ibsen have made this Norwegian playwright widely known in the Arab World in the Twenty-first Century. For example, *Hedda Gabler* and *Ghosts* were performed in English at the American University in Cairo and directed by Mahmoud al-Louzy. Moreover, *Ghosts* was rendered into Arabic as *Egyptian Ghosts*. Like Ibsen who criticizes the Norwegian society and morality of his time, the director Abeer Ali has been inspired by Ibsen's plays to represent conflicts in Egyptian Society. That is why she decides to establish a theater troupe in 1989 that relies on calling into question the conflicts and social ills existing in the Egyptian society and engages audiences in a variety of ways.

The influence of Ibsen in the Arab World appears in Arab experimental theater which deals with critical issues such as revolutions, the Arab Spring, religion and the position of women in Arab societies. Ibsen's global recognition of his plays is the outcome of the timeless issues treated in them; they still exist in different societies all over the world like women's status, the "decay of the bourgeois family life and value, venereal diseases, religious matters, industrial pollution and search for identity" (Fischer-Lichte et al. 40). Adapting Ibsen's plays should not be dealt with only from a Eurocentric perspective; the performance of his plays should suit the world audience to consider the multiple perspectives included in his plays.

The adaptation of Ibsen's *An Enemy of the People* has been performed in different Arab Spring countries such as Egypt, Libya, and Syria. With the exception of Syria, the play received positive views for portraying the political climate. In *An Enemy of the People*, Ibsen addresses corruption and hypocrisy which remain relevant in today's society. The play shows how the majority is oppressed by a minority of powerful people who control society. One main message of this play is that the individual, who stands alone, is more often honest than the mass of people, who are depicted as ignorant. The notion Ibsen challenged is the belief that the community can be trusted.

In her book *Adaptation and Appropriation,* Julie Sanders uses different terms to describe adaptation such as interpretation and continuation. She suggests that adaptation attempts to make the original text suitable to new audiences by updating it to address issues of concern to them and their time. Therefore, adaptation is a revised version of the original text. Sanders describes adaptation as having an infidelity toward the original text. She explains that in many adaptations there are things that are added or taken out. In order to be considered adaptation, one needs to

deviate from some original ideas or twist them.

This classical play was adapted into Arabic as *Ado al-Sha'ab* and the play was produced and directed by the Egyptian director Nora Amin in the context of the Arab Spring and contemporary revolutions. The play is rendered into colloquial Egyptian language to make it close to the emotions of the common people. It is worth mentioning that the play has also been translated and performed in different Arab countries in which people are protesting against their oppressive governments and rulers. The protagonist is a doctor who discovers that the water is contaminated by the local tannery.He expects to be praised for saving the town from the nightmare of infecting visitors with disease, but instead he is declared an 'enemy of the people' by the locals, who band against him. The play ends with his banishment.

The performance of the Arabic adaptation of the play tends to heighten the social awareness of the social and political problems in the Arab countries that are plunged into political turmoil. The director of the play, Nora Amin, states that her troupe 'Lamozika' performed *An Enemy of the People* in different Arab Spring countries. The performance began in Egypt after the Egyptians' protest against their presidents Mobarak in 2011 and Morsi in 2013. In an interview Nora Amin declares that the first performance outside Egypt was in Libya. She adds that while the original text consists of five acts, her Arabic adaptation is composed of only one act in which she has made dramatic text alterations and concentrates on the crux of the issue, which is the conflict between the hero and the society.[1]

Nora Amin deals with the dramatic text from a political perspective by relating it to the political upheavals and revolutions in the Middle Eastern countries in general and Cairo in particular. She remarks that she has changed nothing in the dialogue. Sanders (2006) asserts that "in appropriation, the intertextual relationship may be less explicit, more embedded, but what is often inescapable is the fact that a political or ethnical commitment shapes writer's, director's, or a performer's decision to re-interpret a source text" (2). She postulates that this may include the personal vision of the director or the cultural relocation of the original text. Moreover, she uses "appropriation" to identify the kind of adaptation that transposes the source culture to a different culture. In appropriation there is a shift in setting and language into a new context. Sanders explains that "appropriation frequently affects a more decisive journey away from the informing source into a wholly new cultural product and domain" (26). This is why, as she believes, the appropriated text is not always "acknowledged as in the adaptive process" (26). Hence, appropriation shows more independence than adaptation.

1 All interviews are translated from Arabic to English by the authors

Although the director, Nora Amin, has altered the original dialogue of *An Enemy of the People* by adding some dramatic elements to make the adaptation appealing to the Egyptian audience. These alterations include cutting lines and recontextualzing the original text. In order to rewrite Ibsen's play to suit the Egyptian and the Arab culture, as Fischer-Lichteet al. suggest, the original names of the characters and Christianity are be substituted by Arab ones and Islam, respectively. She calls this concept "indigenizing," which is used in an attempt to avoid alienating the audience.

Different Arab intellectuals and artists admire Ibsen and adopt his thoughts and dramatic style. For example, Alaa al-Aswany, an Egyptian writer and a founding member of the political movementin Egypt called "Kefaya," has been inspired by Ibsen. In an interview, he mentions that his stories take place in Egypt, but the reader would easily relate them to Ibsen's characters. Like the director of Ibsen's play, Nora Amin, Al-Aswany believes that Ibsen's plays are suitable for the present time because they address situations and issues similar to those in Egypt and Arab countries.

The Egyptian dramatist Sa'ad al-Din Wahba, whose early plays expose the oppression of the police, has also been influenced by Ibsen. In this sense, Jennie Sowers points out that Wahba reprinted many of the letters written by the public who wrote to *al-Ahram Newspaper* in order to document the degradation and pollution of Alexandria. These letters were collected in a book entitled *The People's Enemy* in Alexandria. In his opening article, «Enemy of the People: A story of Assassinating a City," the author illustrates that the title derives from Ibsen's play *An Enemy of the People* (76), in which a doctor, Thomas Stockmann, a medical officer of the Municipal Baths of the town, discovers that the water supplying the public baths is polluted with a micro-organism. The images of dirt and the polluted baths that are full of bacteria throughout the play symbolize moral corruption. Dr. Stockmann, as Mordecai Roshwald explains in his article "The Alienated Moralist in An Enemy of the People," is "estranged from his brother and the upper social class he represents, as well the from the politicized liberal sector, [he] stands as a defiant Prometheus doomed to suffering, but faces the enemy, the modern god of popular opinion." Hovstad, a publisher from the lower class, finds out that the rich are the real corrupters of the land. He states: "The idol of Authority must be shattered in this town. This gross and inexcusable blunder about the water-supply must be brought home to the mind of every municipal vote" (156). Hovstad plans to use this issue as a weapon against the elite of the town. In the city, Thomas insists on fighting the ills of his society until the end; he is warned by the authorities

and is considered the enemy of the people by the populace. In his diary, Wahba attacks the problems of the sewage system in Alexandria. He combines "simplistic political analysis with a keen eye for critiquing Egyptian decision- makers and their American counterparts, written in a satirical, lively style that attracted readers" (Sowers 76). Sa'ad al-Din Wahba comments on the corruption and contamination of the Egyptian urban regions.

The revival of Ibsen in the Arab World is not just confined to political issues. The social issues of Ibsen's drama play a significant role in adapting his works in the twenty-first Century. One of these issues is the treatment of women in society. Ibsen's *A Doll's House* demonstrates the way Nora breaks away from the authority of her husband. She discusses the position of women in Victorian marriage. The play draws attention to the double standards of morality for women and men. Nora describes her husband: "he's so proud of being a man — it'd be so painful and humiliating for him to know that he owed anything to me. It'd completely wreck our relationship" (36). She discovers that their marital relationship is based on the patriarchal role her husband has been playing. This play was adapted by the Lebanese director and actor Ziad Abou Absi in 2015 at a time when women are still oppressed in most Arab societies. Nora who believes that she has been a voiceless doll in her house, decides to remove the shackles of social conventions at the end. The Arabic adaptation of the play illuminates the pride of Arab men nowadays. AbouAbsi engrafted local cultural Lebanese elements onto the original text to make it appealing to the audience. In an interview, AbouAbsi says that the realities that Ibsen portrays in his play still exist in Arab societies. He explains that Nora rebels at the end of the play because she wants to free herself from the social traditions that have been stifling her as a human being.

In Ibsen's *A Doll's House,* Nora is represented as "a doll" under the dominance of the patriarchal authority of her father, husband and children. Ignoring herself and her existence as a human being can be likened to the situation that Arab women still face today. Her sacrifices are similar to the sacrifices that Arab women are making today. *A Doll's House* deals with domestic issues which do not exist anymore in Europe. However, the play appeals to the Arab audience, especially Arab women in the Twenty-first Century who begin to ask questions about their position as 'dolls' in Arab societies.

Zakiyya Kherhom al-Shanqity is a Moroccan-Norwegian writer, and an admirer of Ibsen. In an interview published in *Middle East Transparent*, she observes that Ibsen's plays speak to us today though they were written in the late nineteenth-century and that Ibsen is renewed as if he had escaped from his time

to live among us nowadays (2009). Al-Shanqity adapted Ibsen's play *The Pillars of Society* under the name *AyyamDhae'ah* [Lost Days]. In *The Pillars of Society*, Ibsen concentrates on the corruption of ruling classes. Ibsen also suggests that the Nineteenth-Century middle class is characterized by hypocrisy and corruption. In the play, Bernick is marrying a woman for her money, as he is in love with an actor's wife. Ibsen illustrates how Bernick abuses his industrial power and threatens his workers, and how commercial and sexual oppression are inevitably linked together. Ibsen's play serves as an inspiration for al-Shanqity to depict in her adaptation a world which is full of corruption and terrorism. Al-Shanqity says that we live in a world of "democratic dictatorship" and "duplication of conscience" where "we have converted into cannibalism" (2009).

Ibsen's plays are widely read today not in the Norwegian language, but in translations and adaptations. Sanders refers to Susan Basnett who argues that (2006) "all translation is a form of rewriting and cultural negotiation" (4). Aware of the significance of translation, Sanders offers a definition of adaptation that correlates with the process of translation: "adaptation can also constitute a simpler attempt to make texts 'relevant' or easily comprehensible to new audiences and readerships via the processes of proximation and updating" (19). For Sanders, adaptation can be considered as an attempt to make a text appropriate and relevant to new audiences by the process of updating it. In a similar vein, J, C Santoyo corroborates that adaptation is "a form of 'naturalizing' the play for a new milieu, the aim being to achieve the same effect that the work originally had, but with an audience from a different cultural background" (qtd. in Baker 4). The text is given the characteristics of its new surroundings to make it more suitable to the new culture. The motivation of rendering Ibsen's plays into Arabic is induced when the Egyptian broadcasting service starts its 'Second Cultural Program'. Many translators such as Aziz Suliman and Nai'mGaballa worked together with a team of radio drama directors and "treated listeners to excellent radio versions of many of Ibsen's best-known plays" (Fischer-Lichte 118)). For instance,the novelist Bahaa Tahir worked for the same program and directed some of Ibsen's plays such as *Little Eyolf*and *When We Dead Awaken* (118).

Conclusion

In conclusion, we may safely state that Ibsen has exerted a considerable impact on modern and contemporary Egyptian drama and theater in terms of themes and techniques. The revival of Ibsen's plays and themes in the Twentieth and Twenty-first Centuries correlates with the political and social upheavals across the Arab

World. The Arab Spring has instigated Arab playwrights to translate, appropriate and adapt Ibsen's plays. Tawfiq al-Hakim, the prominent Egyptian writer, cogently states that "the reformer [Ibsen] died, but Ibsen the artist remained" (qtd. in Allawi 106). Therefore, Ibsen remains very much valid for contemporary Arab readers and audiences; Ibsen deals with a wide range of topics such as the position of women, social and political corruption, and the perennial conflict between the individual and society. His plays address the kind of social and political problems that Arab audiences are facing in their societies. Therefore, Arab writers who believe that revolutions and rebellions are a precondition to end corruption, political despotism and social injustices have used Ibsen's drama as a vehicle to debate the oppressive situations prevalent in most Arab countries and criticize their own societies.

Works Cited

Abou-Absi, Ziad. "Returns after a Long Absence in *A Doll's House* at the Monroe Theater: An Interview with OTV Lebanon." Available at www.youtube.be/j9tRUGePfBK. Accessed February 17, 2015.

Al Hakim, Tawfiq. *The Return of the Spirit*. Egypt: Dar Al-Sharq, 2005.

Allawi, Hamid. *Theorizing Theatre of Tawfiq Al-Hakim.* PhD dissertation, University of Algeria, 2005.

Allen, Roger. *Essays in Arabic Literary Biography.* Germany Harrassowitz Verlag, 2010.

Al-Shanqiti, Zakiyya. "The Master Work for Henrik Ibsen 'A Doll's House': An Interview with Middle East Transparent." Available at YouTube. http:// metransparent.net. Accessed January 29, 2009.

Amin, Nora. "The First show of 'An Enemy of the People' in Libya: An Interview with Aljazeera Arabic." Available at youtu.be/jGewSNXLQ2U. Accessed September 24, 2005.

Andersen, Hadle."The Brand Poet Strikes Back: Peer Gynt as Part of a Norwegian Duel of Satires." *Ibsen Studies* 25 (July 2014): 71-88.

Asante, Molfie. *Culture and Customs of Egypt*. London: Greenwood Press, 2002.

Baker, Mona. *Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies*. UK: Psychology Press, 1998.

Fischer-Lichte, E, Gronau, B. and Weiler, C. *Global Ibsen: Performing Multiple Modernities*. New York: Routledge, 2012.

Hafez, Sabry."Cultural Journals and Modern Arabic Literature: A Historical overview."*Alif: Journal of Comparative Poetics* 37, 2017. Available at: www.jstor.org/stable/26191813. (accessed November 3, 2020).

Ibsen, Henrik. *Henrik, Ibsen, Plays Collection.* Trans. Edmund Gosse et al. US: Createspace Independent Pub, 2014.

—. *The Correspondence of Henrik Ibsen*. Trans. Mary Morison. New York: Haskell House

Publishers Ltd., 2018.

Ismat, Riad. *Artists, Writers and the Arab Spring*. US: Springer, 2018.

Miller, Arthur. *Adaptation of an Enemy of the People.* US: Penguin books, 1950.

Puchner, Martin.*The Drama of Ideas: Platonic Provocation in Theatre and Philosophy.* UK: Oxford UP, 2010.

Roshwald, Mordecai. "The Alienated Moralist in An Enemy of the People." *Modern Age* (Summer 2004): 227-233.

Rubin, Don. *World Encyclopedia of Contemporary Theatre Volume 4: The Arab World.* Routledge, 2003.

Rushdi, Rashad. *The Art of Drama*. Egyptian General Authority, 1998.

Sanders, Julie. *Adaptation and Appropriation.* UK: Routledge, 2006.

Sodhi, Meena. *Shaw's "Candida": A Critical Introduction*. UK: Atlantic Publishers & Dist, 1999.

Sowers, Jeannie. *Activists, Experts and the State: Environmental Politics in Egypt*. UK: Routledge, 2013.

Symbiosis of Women and Nature: An Ecofeministic Study of Indigenous Women in Doris Pilkington's *Under the Wintamarra Tree*

P.Rathna
Department of English, BSA Crescent Institute of Science and Technology
Chennai – 600 048, Tamil Nadu, India.
Email: rathnasikamani@crescent.education

Abstract The Aboriginal people, the first people of the land, were deprived of their basic human rights, dispossessed of their native land and were doomed to live a subhuman life due to the colonial invasion. The policies of the colonial government turned out to be pernicious in the lives of the Aboriginal people. Thousands and thousands of Aboriginal children of mixed parentage were forcibly removed from their parents and family, thereby the government attempted to obliterate even the vestiges of aboriginality. Institutionalisation and indoctrination of white values made an indelible mark in the lives of the Stolen Generation people that they had to wage a life-long battle to attain redemption. Doris Pilkington, in her life writing *Under the Wintamarra Tree* brings out the horrors of institutionalisation, the agonising search for her Aboriginal identity, and the victimisation as a woman. The basic premise of the paper is that there is a strong connect between women and nature and women have an intrinsic wisdom of nature, especially the indigenous women who benefit as well as benefitted from nature. This paper endeavours to explore this symbiosis of indigenous women and nature as revealed in Doris Pilkington's *Under the Wintamarra Tree*, through the lens of ecofeminism.

Key words Ecofeminism; Institutionalisation; Stolen Generation; Aboriginal; Identity;

Author **Dr.P.Rathna** is Professor in the Department of English, in B.S.A. Crescent Institute of Science and Technology, Chennai, India. She has a passion for training and thus trains her students and other professionals to enhance their Communication Skills in English, apart from teaching English language and Literature. Her research interests are Comparative Literature and Indigenous Literature.

Introduction

Ecofeminism "sees relations of domination and hierarchical social systems as patriarchal and phallocentric, creating significant "others" such as women and non-human nature who are at the receiving end in this dialectic" (Mutekwa and Musanga 240-241). Ecofeminists and ecocritical theorists have identified a striking homogeneity and a strong affinity between women and nature based on various factors such as physiological features of women, social and cultural practices forced upon them over the generations, and the male/science domination over women/nature. That women live in close harmony with nature and have inextricable ties with nature more than men is discernible in the lives of the indigenous women. This paper attempts to explore the symbiosis of women and nature with reference to Australian Aboriginal writer Doris Pilkington's life writing, *Under the Wintamarra Tree.* According to Oxford Advanced Learners Dictionary, the meaning of symbiosis is "the relationship between two different living creatures that live close together and depend on each other in particular ways, each getting particular benefits from the other." With their intrinsic and inherent wisdom of nature, the indigenous women not only get benefits from nature but also help in conserving nature, thus achieving symbiosis. These indigenous women with their symbiotic relationship with Nature draw strength and stoical endurance from Nature to tackle the life's challenges posed by their double oppressors — the Whites and their own men.

Discussion

Doris Pilkington stands as the representative of Stolen Generation women through her life writing. She documents the history of exploitation, in particular, the struggles of the Aboriginal women who bear the brunt of familial, social and cultural alterations effected by colonialism. Wheeler's insightful observation helps to understand the voice of the Aboriginal women:

> Australian Aboriginal women have experienced numerous difficulties while seeking to claim an identity of their own. Before Australia was colonized by the British in 1788, Australian Aboriginal women were an integral part of their tribe and they played an important role in their children's lives…. The legislation stripped Aboriginal women of their children and diminished their role within the community. With no chance to retaliate, Aboriginals were silenced and their culture diminished. It was not until the late 1970s, after

> federal legislation was changed, when the indigenous population felt they could start raising their voices and sharing their tribal stories again without fear of retribution. (236)

The life writing of Doris Pilkington serves as a cultural and historical document of the Stolen Generation people. She portrays the strenuous life of the indigenous women, their ordeal under the protection of the Whites, their misery as institutional orphans, their determination to revive their culture and traditions and their resurrection, through her life writing *Under the Wintamarra Tree*. In fact, she gives more importance to the vivid description of the indigenous way of life, especially that of the womenfolk during the course of her documentation. The story begins with the life of TjiramaGarimara and Bambaru Banaka, grandparents of Doris. They were the desert natives who travelled across the desert based on the availability of food during various seasons. Though Bambaru was blind, "her memory and knowledge of gathering and preparing bush foods made her invaluable" (2-3). As desert natives, it was imperative for them to have "a sound knowledge of the land" and not only that, Bambaru "imparted much of her wisdom and information to the younger women because she knew it would help to ensure the survival of her children and grandchildren. They were the ones who would practice and preserve the customs of the Gududjara" (3). Thus, the indigenous women were hard working and courageous and were willing to take risky hunting tasks in order to gratify the hunger of their family.

Doris Pilkington's *Under the Wintamarra Tree* stands as a testimony to the observation that "The literature of nature is nevertheless replete with tales of sagacious living by communities of human beings at one time in balance and harmony with nature — *rife with ecological wisdom* or rather environmental wisdom!" (Murali 21-22). It presents how the traditional culture and way of life of the indigenous people are in perfect synchronization with nature:

> The Gududjara and Mandildjara people had lived in harmony with their land for thousands of years and, like other indigenous people, they were practicing conservationists, taking only what was needed. They learned from their ancestral Spirit Beings that if they took care of the land, the land would reciprocate, providing an abundance of plants and game. This practice of reciprocation and its obligations were upheld, not only by the Gududjara and Mandildjara, but by the Mardudjara people of Jigalong and, further, across the length and breadth of the Western Desert region. This was the unbroken golden thread woven through

> the fabric of their way of life and it had to be preserved. (3)

The vagaries of the seasonal changes and the inclement weather made the indigenous people more sensible towards their sole provider and they proved to be the fittest to survive with this knowledge about nature. As people who relied heavily on nature for their living, starvation and meager food were not uncommon in their life. The women were adept at hunting skills and they hunted kangaroos with the help of the hunting dogs. Having realized the strength of the indigenous people, their dependence 'only' on nature, the Whites began their domination by controlling their source of food so that they had to depend on them for their survival. The Indigenous people were not allowed to own dogs in order to prevent them from hunting and being self- reliant. The gravity of the colonial conspiracy can be understood in these words:

> Aboriginal people were not allowed to have more than one registered male dog. This legislation was introduced to prevent Aboriginal people from owning and using dogs for hunting, warmth and protection — a subtle way to control their movements and take away their independence, forcing many to leave their traditional homelands to settle on government depots and to seek employment on pastoral leases. (16)

The indigenous women were bold, industrious, caring for other lives, including flora and fauna around them, unassuming, and selfless in sharing the resources, and thus appear "to have stronger and more direct connotations with nature," to borrow the words of Sherry Ortner (qtd. in Soper 139-140). Gossiping and exchanging information to each other were commonly present among the women: "The women and girls sat under the shade of the eucalyptus trees and shared station gossip and stories while they waited for the fire to burn so that the coals could be raked into the holes prepared for cooking" (40). If they had to fight the iniquitous Nature in their bush life, they had to endure challenges of "incarceration and alienation" in their station life under their Protector. As Doris Pilkington portrays, these Mardu women "went to work on stations, some as stock workers like the men, and others in the homesteads. There they would carry out domestic chores, cooking and cleaning or caring for the children of the station owners" (18). They shared their maternal care and affection with other children also. The breastfeeding mothers were always ready to feed and nurse any baby which needed their support. As averred by Kate Soper, "… nature is allegorized as either a powerful maternal force, the womb of all human

production, or as the site of sexual enticement and ultimate seduction. Nature is both the generative source, but also the potential spouse of science, to be wooed, won, and if necessary forced to submit to intercourse" (141), the indigenous women prove to be the "Naturalized Woman" by being "a powerful maternal force" and the "generative source."

The indigenous mothers were forcibly alienated from their children by the Government. These women were brimming with valiance and determination, though they were torn to pieces by the cruel factors of life. They would risk even their life to fulfill their duties. Doris' mother Molly Craig was known for her "fierce independence and determination" (18). She absconded from the Moore River settlement for the second time in order to fulfill her obligation to the son of her deceased kinship sister. Though it was a desperate and a risky plan to escape from the careful vigilance of the protection board, Molly ventured into it. For her, the "baby's safety was paramount" (60). Despite her best efforts to keep her daughter Anna safe with her from the hands of the Protection Board, the baby was taken away from her. Without her children "she became a melancholy figure who moved around in a dream-like manner" (67). She had to endure the "indescribable pain of a mother in torment and grieving for her lost children" (67). It was the most distressful time for a mother "whose pain in her breasts was made worse by the pain in her heart" (67). Though she wished to end her life, she had a hope to see them again and she never gave up that hope. When the assimilation policy substituted the protection policy, she renewed her hopes to get her daughters back. Her hopes and dreams were shattered by the Government which was reluctant to relieve her quarter caste and half-caste children.

The Stolen Generation people were destined to grow on their own without the guidance of their elders. They were uprooted from their cultural connections and forced to nurture an alien culture and habits. But the connections with their Aboriginal root were so strong that, though "the toddlers were not speaking their language and the memories of the families left behind were fading, they still remembered the smell and taste of bush foods" (80). This cultural alienation had devastating effects on their personal as well as their social life. When the little girl Doris was bold enough to dive across the fence to enquire about her grandmother Bambaru in her native language to the native women, "she was roughly lifted over the fence and smacked on her bare legs. It was Nurse Hannah who caused this pain — to punish a child who dared to 'talk to natives' and in 'native language'" (81). She was severely warned not to use "blackfella language" (82) again. The children were not able to adapt to the meals in the communal dining room and they terribly

missed their bush food. Young Doris once saw a lit fire that instantly evoked her memories of the past — the love and warmth of her mother, father and Bambaru. When she went near it eagerly, in search of these special people, as usual she was smacked rudely by Nurse Hannah.

> Standing inside the boundary fence sad and alone Doris understood, this was a lesson and she could pretend no longer. She decided that she had enough of smacks and being humiliated in front of the other incarcerated children, and so from that day forth she would become a child with no past. All her memories would be suppressed. This was a mutual experience for all incarcerated Aboriginal children and adults, who have no culture, no language, no history, no people. Like the blazing fire that had burned so cheerfully, the memories flicker and then die, extinguished forever. (87)

The Department was cautious about extricating the ties between the children and the native people. It gave instructions to the staff not to allow the children to see or move with any native people. In the case of Doris, "pain was the decision maker and the forceful persuader. Combined with daily reinforcement to forget the past, it proved effective indeed" (88) .

The Aboriginal children, according to the government, had to be taken care of by the Christian missionaries. Because, they have "the native's spiritual, moral and material welfare at heart" and it was believed that "they can guide the natives to independence" (135). The treatment in the mission made the girls from settlement feel that "they were the little heathens who needed evangelising" (137). They were taught self-control and discipline. The preaching in the mission implied that "they were 'ungodly' and 'unrighteous'. They were bombarded with negative reference because of their spiritual status, or rather their non-Christian one. This attitude fed their low self-esteem, so while they were in this vulnerable position, the conditioning and the Christian indoctrination began in earnest" (140). As the young boys and girls were segregated, the settlement girls "could not fulfill their cultural obligations to their brothers" (142), and all their "correspondence was monitored and censored" (142). In the words of Narogin (1990), "The policy of assimilation attempted to submerge a dark minority, the remnants of the victims of a brutal colonization, in Anglo-Celtic life and culture without questioning the right to do so" (13).

When Doris' friendly exchange of smile with a twelve-year old boy was mistaken and misinterpreted by the Matron, she decided not to work as domestic

help anywhere but to study and work as a wards maid in a hospital. Though, "sixteen was the legal age that all girls could become domestic servants to any so-called Christian family who was willing to employ them" (148), Doris took an important decision not to "work for any farmer's wife" (146). She studied hard and had the training from the old Aboriginals to memorise quickly. Though Doris was successful and contented in her training course, "she was beginning to be mortified to find just how naïve she was, that she was an unsophisticated eighteen-year-old woman who knew nothing about the facts of life" (152). Her dreams of marrying Danny were shattered by his mother who was not ready to accept an Aboriginal girl as her daughter-in-law. Though Doris, "who had been taking orders from white women all her life" (156) decided not to give up her love, his mother intrigued to get her way finally. Doris married a Nyoongah man, a soldier who returned from service, called Gerard Pilkington.

The half-caste children had to suffer severe psychological and emotional set back and identity crisis, as a result of the regimented institutionalisation. They had to confront with the identity crisis right from their childhood. As children, they were indoctrinated in the institution that they were Whites and thus were superior to the Aboriginal people. They were conditioned to treat their own Aboriginal people with contempt. But, outside the institution, they were treated as "others", inferior to the Whites. Thus, the Stolen Generation had to bear the brunt of their fair skin which was too white to mingle with their Aboriginal people and not too white to amalgamate with the White people. They had to wage a life-long battle to attain emancipation. They vacillated between black and white values. When she met her father and mother after more than twenty years, Doris had mixed feelings. Her mother wailed and other relatives came and joined her as they saw Doris. Later, Doris understood that that was the traditional custom to cry in order to express their feelings. Doris was afraid of her husband's reaction, on seeing her parents: "The conditions her parents lived in were a disappointment. It was basic and plain, and she hated to think of what her husband's reactions would be if he saw what his children were being exposed to. He and his family would have a fit" (182). Her husband and mother-in-law were already prejudiced against her people as they did not come under the Native Act. They acted "superior to the black — skinned people of the north — west and the eastern goldfields of the state" (183).

Doris expresses her confusion when "only negative aspects" of Aboriginal culture were propagated to them. This created a fear among the children. The missionaries did not understand that this sort of negative propaganda would have a traumatic effect on the children, when they grow into adults, as revealed in the case

of Doris Pilkington. When Doris' father died, the traditional funeral that Doris took part for the first time in her life confused her greatly. She saw her family members "rubbing their heads and upper bodies with a salve of red ochre and animal fat" (196). Having tutored in her youth that the aboriginals were "evil devil worshippers" (196) and "heathen fornicators" (196), Doris was, in fact, frightened to see their custom. Afterwards, she "learned this was an age—old ceremony that had been practised for thousands of years and was still an important part of her people's culture. Amazed, she found after the funeral that she was able to talk about her father without breaking down" (196).

The indoctrination of "white" culture and the inherent "black" values in the subconscious mind victimise the Stolen Generation people. This develops an inferiority complex among them which prevents them from socialisation and incapacitates them to take firm decisions in their life. During her mission life, Doris started to revive her communication with her parents. Once, when she received a letter with the photos of her family members, "she had mixed feelings…. She was ashamed to discover that her father was a Mardu or full blooded black man" (144). Afraid of the stings of criticisms and mockery from the other girls and the missionaries "of her full-blood relations sowing suspicion and fear of the traditional Mardu culture practices and belief systems" (144), she used to hide the photos. When Doris received "two dust — covered, tobacco- stained ten shilling notes", from her father, she was ordered by the Matron to "put that foul–smelling, filthy money" (144) in a jar. This prejudice against the Aboriginal people burdened Doris with the inferiority complex.

Besides being oppressed by the colonial rules, the Aboriginal women were mortified in the familial domain also, the main reasons of which being their caste difference and institutionalisation. Doris Pilkington's family life was not blessed with peace. The absence of parental guidance and elders' advice did create a vacuum in her life. Though she became the mother of two children, Doris was longing for some woman to accompany and advise her. She says: "It was frustrating without an older sister or another female relative to advise her" (161). The arrival of her in-laws to stay with them added to the woes of Doris. Her mother-in-law's "presence seemed to bring out the negative side of her husband's personality. The criticism, the sarcasm and humiliation heaped on Doris were made worse by her husband's change of attitude. Doris felt abandoned and neglected" (163). Her mother-in-law, "made it quite clear that Doris was an unsuitable wife for her son for the simple reason that her family did not come under the Native Act and Doris did. Doris felt alienated and uncomfortable. Her husband's family were categorized as being

'Octoroons', one eighth Aboriginal" (164).

During her third confinement, Doris acutely felt the need for someone to guide and advise her: "No one understood that she had not been trained in raising babies" (p.165). Her inability to have better living conditions, lack of elderly guidance, mental trauma due to "the constant criticism, the sarcasm and intimidation" (166) of her husband would have caused nervous breakdown to Doris but for the loving and affectionate company of her children and her faith in the Lord. She was denied freedom even to listen to her favourite music on radio. As Gerry didn't like her listening to the radio, she "decided to revert to more cunning and deceitful methods so that she could enjoy her music in secret and at the same time preserve her sanity", as "it was her elixir of life" (169). She regrets: "This was reality, a rural life of hardship, toil and tears. How can any woman be enthusiastic about this?" (170). When Doris left her son with her father and mother on their request to have the grandson for some time, she was scolded by her husband for leaving their son with the "black, tribal people" (187).

When Doris joined as a Nursing Aide in the Community and Child Health Services, she was totally engrossed in her tiring work and "began ignoring Gerry's negative attitude and hurtful comments towards her" (195). Under the influence of alcohol, Gerry started abusing her physically, emotionally and verbally. This abuse "gathered momentum as the barbed words and accusations increased" (197). Doris could not understand, "how a mild-mannered, modest man could change into a loud, obnoxious individual when under the influence of alcohol" (197-198). Doris was able to perceive that it was because of his inferiority complex. It was the innate male-ego which wanted to exert its power over his sub-ordinate, his wife. Thus, the subordination of Doris testifies to the fact that secondary treatment was given to Aboriginal women by their men. One of the reasons for this is the impact of colonialism. As rightly presented by Diane Bell:

> Within the historical context of Aboriginal society, the maintenance of male-female relations entailed a continuing dialogue which allowed women to participate actively in the construction of the cultural evaluations of their role in their society. But today, as members of a colonial frontier society, Aboriginal women no longer participate as equals in this process. Women's solidarity and autonomy are being eroded and devalued. They are constrained and defined by the male-dominated frontier society as a necessarily dependent sex. The inter-relation between the sexes are thus no longer shaped predominantly by the set of male-female relations of Aboriginal society; the new forces of the wider

> colonial society affect them too. The activities of men and women within this new order are differently evaluated and different opportunities for participation are available to men and women. (103)

Thus institutionalisation, or to put it more precisely, their deviation from their indigenous way of life, had an adverse effect not only on the Aboriginal children's life, but also on the marriage life and the male-female relationship in the Aboriginal community. In other words, colonialism served as an antibiosis to the social and cultural environment in which the indigenous people lived.

Doris Pilkington was able to get rid of her disorientation due to institutionalisation by going back to her roots. The past was revisited and relived by her. When she went to meet her parents, Doris had to get accustomed to the climate and the "impoverished living conditions. Doris came to realize that she must humble herself and settle down to learn something about her traditional history and culture. That required patience" (184). Thus, she prepared herself to be more resilient. The conditioning and the indoctrination among the Stolen Generation was very strong. She reveals:

> It took me ten years to actually sit down and start my journey of healing, which was necessary for me to reconnect to my land and to reclaim my language and culture. It took ten years, because the conditioning was so strong that I had to metaphorically go through it all again, undo all that conditioning and come back. (206)

She was able to break the negative conditioning thrust on her and forge an identity for herself. Though it was a Herculean task to detonate the thick concrete wall of indoctrination ingrained in her 'self', Doris was able to recollect and realise her misconceptions about her past. At first, Doris misunderstood that she had been handed over to the government by her mother. Later on, she was told by her mother that she had been taken from her and as an Aboriginal mother, she had no rights to claim her children: "If the Government wanted your children, you had no right to prevent their removal. You just sat down to cry and mourn for your lost children. There was nothing else to do" (205). She recalls how she was not allowed to speak "black fella language" and says:

> Mardu people who spoke my traditional language were called 'primitives 'and uncivilized'. That was the beginning of the conditioning, the negative stereotyping against my own family. When the caste system was introduced,

> they graded us like cattle. We were octoroons, with one eight Aboriginal blood, or quarter cast or half — caste. Light skinned children were conditioned to look down on their own people. The caste system caused a lot of trauma, right through to when they were adults, because they were discriminating against their own relations, their own brothers and sisters. (205)

Doris Pilkington explicates the *raison d'être* of writing her story and her mother's story: "Not all of us are asking for compensation in terms of money, but what we need are support and recognition, and acceptance of our shared histories. We need to teach the children, break down the negative stereotypes so we can get on with enjoying our rights as other people do in this country" (207). Doris subtly informs about the loss of heritage that the Stolen Generation had been forced to have by means of altered history through the example of her sister Anna. Doris says: "She was given an altered vision of her history and I think she prefers that" (207).

Doris became broken-hearted when she learnt about Gerry's affairs with another lady. But she never lost her hope: "She was determined to suffer in silence and prayed to the Lord for strength and guidance and deliverance from this impossible situation" (175). Though the ups and downs in her life caused mental agony to her, she "refused to accept defeat. She was a fighter and that fighting spirit had manifested itself at her premature birth. But most of all, she had hope; the very substance of life itself and where there is hope, there will always be life and love" (176). When the children saw the silent suffering of their mother, they suggested Doris to leave their father. Encouraged by them, she took that drastic step in her life — to separate from her husband. She beautifully narrates:

> As the sun was setting over the blue-green sea she sat watching one of the beautiful sunsets she had ever seen. With the swift twilight came her decision, it was time to make a drastic change in her life. …Like her mother, Molly Kelly, she had the determination and the strength to confront any new challenge and, when spring returns, you can be sure that Doris Pilkingtom will once again be walking amongst beautiful wildflowers somewhere in this wonderful country of ours, celebrating the resurrection of life itself. (199)

As an indigenous woman with intrinsic association with nature, she takes her life's decisions influenced and inspired by nature. Thus, Doris was able to recognize herself as a "self-existent entity" as perceived by Patrick D Murphy in his "Ecofeminist Dialogics." He says: "Only by recognizing the existence of the

'other' as a self-existent entity can we begin to comprehend a gender heterarchical continuum in which difference exists without binary opposition and hierarchical valorization" (194) and continues to insist that "It is not just recognition of a male … It would also mean female recognition of a woman not only as the other but also as a self." (195)

Doris spreads the message of hope to the victims of the Stolen Generation, especially the women, who bore the brunt of the institutionalisation, through her metaphorical observation of life.

> The journey of healing and the healing process is similar to the wintamarra tree, my birthplace. When I was born here there was one tree, now, because over the years it died, four others have replaced it. This is in fact the story of life — you lose one part of your life and you get others coming through, stronger. This is a message I give to the members of the Stolen Generation, particularly the women. We all now need to develop our spirituality, this is making us stronger, and we are going to be the leaders of the movement to heal our people. (208)

The Wintamarra tree plays a seminal role in her life. As the representative of Stolen generation women who have inseparable bonding with nature, who was born and brought in the lap of nature, Pilkington could not write her narrative without talking about the integral part played by nature in her life. There are two chapters titled on wintamarra tree as 'Tree of Life' — when she talks about her birth and 'The Healing Tree' — when she talks about her rebirth. Nature becomes the part and parcel of her life as a companion, as a mentor, and above all, as a healer. She identifies her true self in nature and through nature:

> The Wintamarra tree of my birthplace is a permanent reminder of the beginning of my life, and of the wonderful lady who gave birth to me here on the ground in the traditional way, so my connections to the land are very strong. The cycle will go on, like the family, the old people go and the younger ones come up. Although the tree at my birthplace is dead, the original tree, its roots are still there down in the earth, and four new trees have grown up. It's always been there, waiting for me to come and reconnect to my birthplace." (208)

As succinctly put by Hooti and Ashrafian, "The environmental texture which we live in plays crucially important and inevitable roles in our physical and emotional

patterns that determine our thoughts of who we are" (79), the 'Wintamarra tree' becomes the symbol of hope, resurrection and revival of life for Doris Pilkington.

Conclusion

The life writing of Doris Pilkington reveals her successful attempts to overcome her feeling of deprivation. It reveals the equanimity achieved by her through self-introspection and revelation for which Nature acts as a stimulus. She is empowered to achieve healing through her powerful connect with nature which proves to be her mentor and healer. As affirmed rightly, "The change in direction from a situation of domination and hierarchy to a different world order wherein collaboration and collective action is recognized as essential is one of the major tenets of ecofeministic ideology" (Usha 170), Pilkington's life writing, that speaks about her revival of Aboriginal roots, strengthens its relevance to this ideology closely. Her portrayal of indigenous life before and after colonialisation attests to the inherent symbiosis of women and nature and the mutual give and take the indigenous women practice — the "reciprocation," their intrinsic qualities such as judicious sharing of resources, maternal care, amazing endurance, resilience, fierce braving against odds, and their resurrection validate their wonderful resonance with nature.

Works Cited

Bell, Diane. "Daughters of the Dreaming." *Aboriginal Australians: First Nations of an Ancient Continent*. Ed. Stephen Muecke and Adam Shoemaker. London: Thames & Hudson, 2004. 102-103.

Hooti Noorbakhsh and Amir Ashrafian. "D.H. Lawrence's *St. Mawr*: An Ecocritical Study." *3L: The Southeast Asian Journal of English Language Studies* 20.2 (2014):31–42 <http://dx.doi.org/10.17576/3L-2014-2002-03>

Murali.S. "Nature and Human Nature: Contexualising Literature, Ecology and Meaning." *Nature and Human Nature: Literature, Ecology and Meaning.* Ed. S. Murali. New Delhi: Prestige Books, 2008. 9-25.

Murphy, Patrick D. "Ecofeminist Dialogics." *The Green Studies Reader: From Romanticism to Ecocriticism.* Ed. Laurence Coupe. New York: Routledge, 2000. 193-197.

Mutekwa, Anias and Terrence Musanga. "Subalternizing and Reclaiming Ecocentric Environmental Discourses in Zimbabwean Literature: (Re)reading Doris Lessing's The Grass is Singing and Chenjerai Hove's Ancestors." *Interdisciplinary Studies in Literature and Environment* 20.2 (Spring 2013). < https://academic.oup.com/isle/article-abstract/20/2/239/686663. 12 February 2018>

Narogin, Mudrooroo. *Writing from the Fringe: A Study of Modern Aboriginal Literature*.

Melbourne: Hyland House Publishing Pty Limited, 1990.

Pilkington, Doris/NugiGarimara.*Under the Wintamarra Tree.* St. Lucia: U of Queensland P, 2002.

Soper Kate. "Naturalized Woman and Feminized Nature." *The Green Studies Reader: From Romanticism to Ecocriticism.* Ed. Laurence Coupe. New York: Routledge, 2000. 139-143.

Usha V.T. "Silent Voices: Women-Nature in Women's Oral Narratives in Kannada." *Nature and Human Nature: Literature, Ecology and Meaning.* Ed. S. Murali. New Delhi: Prestige Books, 2008. 167 – 178.

Wheeler, Belinda. "Helping Reshape Australia: Female Aboriginal Narratives." *Reading DownUnder: Australian Literary Studies Reader.* Ed. Amit Sarwal, and ReemaSarwal. NewDelhi: SSS Publication, 2009. 236-242.

When British and Arab Novelists Teach Feminism: A Comparative Reading of Wollstonecraft and El Saadawi's Views

Mohamed B. Khafajah & Azra Ghandeharion
Faculty of Letters and Humanities, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad
Azadi Square, Mashhad, Khorasan Province, 9177948883, Iran
Emails: alsuhaily@gmail.com; ghandeharioon@um.ac.ir

Abstract To approach the problem of women's oppression internationally, this paper compares the ideas of two feminist canonical writers, Mary Wollstonecraft (1759-97) and Nawal El Saadawi (1931-). Despite the fact that Wollstonecraft and El Saadawi come from very dissimilar cultures, religions and epochs, they have tackled the issue of women's oppression, through their female heroines, in a strikingly similar way. Hence, principally through the application of the theories of both the American school of comparative literature and second wave feminism, the current study attempts to manifest how the respective authors have utilized the same techniques to expose the reality of the patriarchal social system and its direct role in women's oppression. It is concluded that the authors' socio-political contexts have influenced their writings considerably. The novelists have conveyed their own experiences through their writings to create an intimate text that in turn validated their stories. The paper also shows how El saadawi's prose has been a feminist revolution in Arabic literature, similar to that of the 18th century English literature led by Wollstonecraft.

Key words Women's Oppression; Feminism; Comparative Literature; Mary Wollstonecraft; Nawal El Saadawi

Authors **Mohamed B. Khafajah** holds MA from Ferdowsi University of Mashhad. **Azra Ghandeharion** (corresponding author), Dr. Phil., a faculty member of Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, is the youngest associate professor of English literature and cultural studies in Iran. Her emphasis is on 'Otherness' issues (i.e Minority Studies), media studies, body politics, and literature of diaspora. Her recent publication includes: "Governmental Discourses in Advertising on Iran's State Television," "Iranian Advertisements: A Postcolonial Semiotic Reading," "Ideology be-

hind the Bestselling Book Covers in Iran: Female Narrators of War Literature," and "Recasting James Bond in Iran: The Voice of Masculinity at the Cost of Silencing Women."

Introduction

Women from the remote ages and in most societies have suffered from oppression in terms of social, political, and economic discrimination. In spite of the numerous attempts by women to improve their circumstances, they, not only as married women but also as singles and the most pitiful female children, still experience manifold forms of oppression. This oppression is imposed upon them either by the domineering spirit of men in patriarchal society or by having to follow strict traditions and conventions which are often misused for the purpose of undermining their role. Almost in all societies, feminists, in an attempt to prove themselves, have striven to regain their extorted rights as human beings and citizens; their struggle has proved certain fruits, so far. Feminism has captured critics' attention due to its controversial theories which mismatch the traditions and conventions in most societies.

Some of the cognoscenti have had an avid advocacy in revolting against the traditions and conventions that grant absolute authority to men over women in the existing social system. In lieu of the bloody encountering, those people of distinction have invested the power of their pens as the only weapon to bring about the essential changes in the society. Ian Watt (2001), in *The Rise of the Novel*, states that the novel genre has bloomed in the early eighteenth century (47-48), and from that time on, authors have written many feminist works for the aim of improving women's conditions. However, the image of the female character that has been introduced by male writers in the novel, which is the most masculine of all genres in the eighteenth century (Poovey 111), is different, to a certain degree, from that introduced by female writers. Some male novelists did their best to write about women from a female perspective albeit they have not been very successful. As a result, some female writers have realized that it is their responsibility to convey the suffering of their sex in their words.

Undertaking fiction writing as their vital means to achieve the desired change, female novelists have declared the war against patriarchy (Bahadl-Khafajah et al. 6). One of the most enthusiastic leaders, the mother of feminism in the eighteenth century, is Wollstonecraft (1759-97). Because of the practiced oppression, represented by the strict traditions and conventions followed in the British society at that time, Wollstonecraft has been prompted to write in such controversial way in an attempt to engender some changes. Feminist related discourse and activities have begun to

cross the European borders and travel in all directions. Since women in most societies have suffered from patriarchy, the travelling feminist ideas have been warmly received everywhere, especially in the East. As the plight of women in the East is not less than that of their counterparts in the West, the adoption of feminist ideas has been natural. However, feminist ideologies would not have been adopted without the existence of the native demand.

To show how there has been an indigenous need to change the old fashioned way in which women are treated in eastern societies, especially in Egypt, the present paper illustrates how the feminist prose of the Egyptian writer Nawal El Saadawi (1931—) is similar to that of Mary Wollstonecraft. Drawing such comparison between the considered authors brings to the reader's mind the eighteenth-century feminist revolution; nonetheless, the present revived version of the revolution is led by an easterner (i.e. Nawal El Saadawi) in different place and time. Like Wollstonecraft, El Saadawi is a pioneer voice of feminism in Egypt and the Middle East (Abouzeid 537). She has been dubbed "Simone De Beauvoir of the Arab World" due to her very controversial writings .

Benefiting from the tenets of second wave feminism and comparative literature, this paper provides a close look at feminism, its second wave, its version in the Arab world and the originality of eastern feminism. Because the novels depict controversial ideas this study aims to shed light on the derisive views toward Wollstonecraft's *Maria,* or *The Wrongs of Woman* (1798) and Saadawi's *Imra'ah 'Inda Nuqtat al-Sifr* (1973), translated into English as *Woman at Point Zero* (1983). The paper also compares some of the main concepts presented in the aforementioned novels, such as women's commodification, their extorted liberty, and enslavement in marriage, to show how El Saadawi's prose has been a feminist revolution in the Arab literary world of 20th century, similar to Wollstonecraft's revolt in the British literary world of 18th century.

Close Look at Feminism

Over the last three centuries, feminist ideas and debates have been introduced and, more or less constantly, elaborated. However, what feminism means or what it encompasses has been a complex question without a certain answer (Caine 2). Hence, encapsulating the concept of feminism in a single short definition is not an easy task, if not impossible. Feminist movements, in different parts of the globe, have passed through many historical periods with ramified thoughts and ideologies that each has given its own definition in accordance with its principles. Defining feminism, according to Offen (1988), must be preceded by some generally accepted

understanding of the term feminism. However, the best way to arrive at such understanding can be achieved through reflecting the "cumulative knowledge" people have acquired regarding the "socio-political change" in women's lives and how they have been historically developed in divergent cultures (Offen 120).

Likewise, El Saadawi (1980) points out that "the situation and problems of women in contemporary human society are born of developments in history that made one class rule over another, and men dominate over women" (*The Hidden Face of Eve* i). However, neither the extent nor the nature of the feminist can be perceived without fair understanding of the changing social, political and economic conditions of women within both the family and the wider society. These changes were extremely complicated and diverse, "varying considerably according to social class, ethnic, and religious origin and regional location" (Caine 14). Therefore, exclusively deriving apprehension of feminism from a certain culture or a certain time and apply it as a general model, will never give a supple understanding that is applicable across all cultures and times (Offen 120). To speak effectively, pinning feminism down necessitates the presence of both historical and comparative backgrounds in order to come up with a dependable understanding.

Although there are many definitions compete to explain what feminism is, many, including feminist activists, still have difficulties figuring out what exactly feminism means. It even happens sometimes that some people usually declare themselves as non-feminists while actually they are unconsciously feminists. The disability to realize their true attitudes is attributed to the lack of understanding the meaning of feminism. Obtaining intelligible clarification, as Offen (1988) puts it, is of great significance because feminist historians, theorists as well as those in other academic disciplines, who are concerned with feminist studies, are eagerly in need of a path to follow; they need a framework on which they can rest what they are theorizing, tracing, claiming and interpreting (121-22).

In 1914, Marie Jenny Howe has outlined the accommodation of inner and outer aspects of women's experience by describing the relationship between psychological, political, cultural, and economic changes. She has defined feminism as:

> Woman's struggle for freedom; its political phase is women's wish to vote. Its economic phase is woman's revaluation of outgrown customs and standards … Feminism means more than a changed world. It means a changed psychology, the creation of a new consciousness. (Rowbotham 33-34)

The platform, upon which the feminist programme is based contains certain criteria. Bouten (1922) attempts to explain the criteria in four levels. 1) Physical enfranchisement claims that women are human beings who have the soul, will and responsibility which, in turn, grant them the absolute freedom from the domineering master and his whims. 2) Intellectual emancipation assumes that education of women is the only issue that enables them to use their minds reasonably which results in putting them on the same level with men. 3) Moral emancipation is to accredit women, who have a soul, of the same quality and value to that of men, with moral duties and responsibilities, which are partly determined by considerations of sex. 4) Social emancipation, which is considered as a direct result of what has preceded, constitutes the basic ideas of utter equality between men and women concerning social and political matters (Bouten 2-3). However feminism, in its beginnings, was mainly concerned with women's political and legal rights; and such concern has become only a small part of what feminism tries to achieve in the present day (Caine 2).

Second Wave Feminism

Towards the end of the 1960s, second wave feminism has emerged out of the leftist movements that have rejected reducing women as second-class citizens in the United States, Britain, and Europe (De Clercq 15). For Nicholson (1997), second wave feminism is an important event occurred in the 1960s which is still spinning itself out; that occurrence was a "new intensity in many societies in the degree of reflection given to gender relations" (1). The concern of the second wave feminism is to oppose any kind of oppression exercised by men against women and to ensure social equality between sexes through debilitating the patriarchal social system. Moreover, second wave feminism examines the way wherein patriarchal features are presented in any literary or cultural production and how these masculine characteristics are directed to "reinforce or undermine the economic, political, social, and psychological oppression of women (Tyson 83).

As there have been two contradictory streams, each with distinct sets of beliefs has become a part of the general culture. Firstly, "the differences between women and men were deep and rooted in nature and, secondly, that women and men were basically the same" (Nicholson 3). Second wave feminism has been hailed "for the removal of the social barriers that had constrained women's lives" (De Clercq 16). Therefore, the ultimate goal of second wave feminism is to achieve social justice that provides all citizens with equal opportunities to develop, express, and exercise their potential as humans, regardless of their sex.

The groundwork of the radical second wave feminism has been laid by Virginia Woolf's (1929) *A Room of One's Own* and Simone de Beauvoir's (1949) *The Second Sex* by proposing the notion of "apparent distinction between sex and gender." Other influential works of the movement are Kate Millett's (1969) *Sexual Politics* and Shulamith Firestone's (1970) *The Dialect of Sex* (De Clercq 16). To establish the social justice within a system that "draws its authority from the autocratic power exercised by the ruler of the state, and that of the father or the husband in the family" (El Saadawi, "A Daughter of Isis" 352), influential feminist works have been employed as a vital weapon in the Arab world. These works include: Assia Djebar's *Les Enfants du Nouveau Monde* (1962, *Children of the New World*, 2005), Nawal El Saadawi's *Al-Wajh al-'Ari* (1977), and Fatima Mernissi's *Le Harem Politique: Le Prophète et les Femmes* (1987, *The Veil and the Male Elite: A Feminist Interpretation of Women's Rights in Islam*, 1991).

Originality of Eastern Feminism

The emancipation of women in the Arab world was first voiced in 1928, when the pioneering Egyptian feminist leader, nationalist, and founder of the Egyptian Feminist Union Huda Shaarawi publically unveiled herself. She announced the commencement of war against conventions and traditions that kept women subjugated inferiors in the Arab society (Cooke "*Al-Dirasat Al-Ourpiya*" 568). Like the western first call of women's liberation in the eighteenth century, the movement of Arab feminism faced hostility and refusal as being an attempt to westernize Arab society as a result of the French and British colonialism. However, viewing Arab feminism as an imported product is a complete ignorance of the spontaneous change and the indigenous needs of the Arab society. Golley (2010) ascribes the birth of Arab feminism to "the struggle between the dying traditional, religious, feudal Ottoman way of life and the rising modern, secular, capitalist European ways of life" (27).

Golley (2010) lists three fashions that have outlined Arab feminism. First, there was a movement that called for Islamic and social reforms, and claiming for women's rights was part of that general campaign to improve Islamic societies. Second, in an attempt to achieve democracy and social liberation, men and women of letters, of the national bourgeoisie and the petit-bourgeoisie, have been the first to call for women's emancipation. Third, Arab feminism considered the continuation of the plight of double struggle represented internally by standing against old social, economic and religious regulations, and externally by the reformists' struggle for identity, as they had to resist the very ideals of modern European, on which they

have founded their movement (27).

The birth and institutionalization of Arab feminism has emerged from a "coalescence in solidarity around a nationalist cause, the Palestine cause"; however, its development was, in part, due to the limitations of international feminism (Badran 240). In the literary domain, the Arab world witnessed an uprising against male literary writings in the second half of the twentieth century (Bahadl-Khafajah et al. 6). This rebellion was triggered by national and global developments in feminist movements which aim to "subvert and deconstruct male-oriented genres deeply rooted in a macho culture and reinforced by androcentric traditions" (Gohar 175). The major transition in female's conditions, in Egypt and other parts in the Arab world, has finally come as a result of the ruthless efforts of Arab feminists, particularly Nawal El Saadawi. In Sherifa Zuhur's (2001) words, "the last century witnessed women's transition . . . from the harem to corporate and governmental offices," and such transition coincided with an overwhelming feminist awaking and an enormous corpus of "serious literature dealing with gender issues" (78).

In a published interview with Nawal El Saadawi, she identifies the difficulties she undergoes in dealing with feminists from America and Europe. The essential issue that western and eastern feminists often disagree about is that western feminists fall short of understanding and conceptualizing the variety of religions, cultures, and politics in different countries, particularly in the East. Therefore, western feminists constantly try to dominate eastern feminists and dictate what they should or should not do. For instance, El Saadawi severely criticizes those American feminists who think that their feminism is the only valid version of feminism and that everything American serves as a model and is international (El Saadawi & Wilmuth, 441; Golley 4). El Saadawi attributes her frequent quarrel with western feminists in the international conferences to such disagreements especially when an activist proposes an idea and urges the rest to adopt the same, regardless of their backgrounds. El Saadawi considers such acts as "another form of oppression and colonialism" which she calls "the colonialism of western feminists" (El Saadawi & Wilmuth, 441).

Every society has its own history and conventions which, in turn, inspire its people in all spheres of life. El Saadawi states, "we have a feminism that is original and not copied from the West" (El Saadawi & Wilmuth, 441). She assures that she has become a feminist not through reading western books, "I became a feminist without knowing English. I was inspired by our history" (El Saadawi & Wilmuth, 441). El Saadawi and her colleagues are inspired by the great women of their own history and apply their own native criteria to arrive at the finding of discrimination

against women (El Saadawi & Wilmuth, 441; Perry 66).

In the early 1970s, the Arab world has witnessed the advent of the overarching theories of Arab feminists, chiefly represented by the theories of the universally acclaimed feminist Nawal El Saadawi. Her controversial thoughts have resulted in a fierce campaign of criticism besides the threats of death she has received. Many critics, especially the conservative Muslims, like al-Afani (2009), have accused her of being atheist who antagonizes Allah and the Prophet (17). On the contrary, El Saadawi is an Islamic feminist who rigorously censures those who constantly try to steer the religion towards their own benefit in an attempt to maintain the dominance and power they currently hold. Anne Roald in description of El Saadawi states that she is a "rejectionist" who is engaged in reforming and reconstructing her religion (Cooke, "Women Claim Islam" 76).

The most permanent points El Saadawi (1977b) highlights in her influential book *Al-Wajh al-'Ari lil-Mar'a al-'Arabiyya* are: 1) Not only has the Islamic or Arab culture had treated woman as a commodity or a slave, but also the western Christian culture has been even tougher in this regard. 2) Woman's oppression has nothing to do with East or West neither with religions; it is rather an immediate result of the patriarchal system in all human societies. 3) Woman's intellectual ability is not inferior to man's, as many think; history tells that woman has preceded man in thinking since she is the first who has used knowledge. 4) Woman has had rights in the time of Prophet Mohammed, yet, they have been extorted from her later. 5) Islamic Arab tradition has many positive aspects which should be looked for while negative aspects should be bravely left, because woman's freedom primarily depends on the combination of old and present positives. 6) Women can be emancipated only by becoming a political power which cannot be achieved without being aware of their own rights and goals (El Saadawi, "Al-Wajh Al-'Ari" 4-5).

Wollstonecraft's and El Saadawi's Political Activism

Mary Wollstonecraft worked so faithfully to serve humanity in general and women in particular. Nevertheless, she has been subjected to a severe chastisement in return (Pennell 1). Although the sexual freedom which Wollstonecraft experienced in her life "influenced men of the French Revolution on the subject of women's rights" (Agustín 133), by the end of the century a loud chorus of condemnation reverberated through Wollstonecraft's "intellectual reputation as well as her personal character" (Taylor 247). Her radical feminist ideas, however, were transferred into "libertine propaganda" (Taylor 247). Consequently, Wollstonecraft's *Vindication of the Rights of Woman*, however, was received with shock, horror, and derision when it was first

published early in 1792 (Janes 293). Due to her controversial ideas, Wollstonecraft has been ridiculed and dubbed with various epithets.

Horace Walpole's epithet in which he called her "a hyena in petticoats" has been the most notorious one (Johnson 1). Richard Polwhele went even further to "index her under 'P' for prostitute" (Johnson 1). The Reverend Polwhele in *The Unsex'd Females* (1798), provides his own criticism against Wollstonecraft. He considers her early death in childbirth as "a judgment against her perverted femininity and against the philosophy of her life" (Todd, "Annotated Bibliography" xiv). Twentieth-century critics such as Richard Cobb, Ferdinand Lundberg and Marynia Farnham supported the ideas of Polwhele as well. Cobb accused Wollstonecraft of "malevolence and social destructiveness" (Todd, "Annotated Bibliography" xiv), while Lundberg and Farnham (1947) also accused her of "perverted sexuality" (941-44).

Like Polwhele, these twentieth-century critics were convinced that Wollstonecraft's premature death was "a culmination of a perverted attempt to turn people from the decencies of life (Todd, "Annotated Bibliography" xiv). In *Love, Morals and the Feminists*, Constance Rover (1970) also notes that Wollstonecraft's associations with Godwin and Imlay augmented the association between feminism and immorality in the public mind (14-17). The campaign of chastisement Wollstonecraft has received is essentially attributed to her feminist theories which she has spared no effort to promote. Her efforts to encourage females to be independent thinkers and to dissociate themselves from the feminine traits that keep them subjugated by males were regarded as sexual perversion in her age.

Marriage certificate, El Saadawi (2006) proposes, is no more than a contract by which women are legally possessed by men (El Saadawi, "Qadyat Al-Mara'a" 25). One of the contradictory concepts adopted by the patriarchal society which El Saadawi, like Wollstonecraft in her *Vindication of Woman* (Wollstonecraft, "Vindication" 203-04), severely criticizes is the duplicity in dealing with women's bodies. She argues that the commercial value of a female's body contradicts its moral and religious values. Where the female body is disrobed in advertisements and commercial promotions, it should be veiled according to religious and moral conventions (El Saadawi, "Qadyat Al-Mara'a" 30).

The other contradictory aspect, Wollstonecraft and El Saadawi agree on, is honor and women's chastity. Dishonorable deeds can be carried out by both men and women; nonetheless, the punishment is received only by women. Sometimes men are even proud of their illegal, immoral and irreligious sexual relationships (El Saadawi, "Al-Mara' Wa Al-Jins" 39-41). Moral principles, El Saadawi points out,

should be followed by all people regardless of their sex, color, or social class.

Wollstonecraft and El Saadawi have had a prodigious inclination for education from their early childhood at a time when education for females had been neglected (Faubert 13; El Saadawi, "The Hidden Face of Eve" 12; "Al-Mara' Wa Al-Jins" 39-41). Both have studied philosophy, medicine and history (Faubert 13; El Saadawi, "A feminist in the Arab world" 437; "Muthekarati Fi Sijin Al-Nisaa" 11; "The Hidden Face of Eve" 12), although Wollstonecraft was almost self-educated (Faubert 13; El Saadawi, "Muthekarati Fi Sijin Al-Nisaa" 11; "A feminist in the Arab world" 437). Delving into history, in particular, has offered Wollstonecraft and El Saadawi vast knowledge about women's high position in ancient societies and the rights they once enjoyed. Their awareness of such historical facts and their acquaintance with other sciences have consolidated their social and political activism whereby they struggle to restore women's extorted rights.

Living among oppressed people has given Wollstonecraft and El Saadawi an exact image of the reality of their societies which they have desperately wanted to improve. The aims they have set for themselves have kept them intimately attached to people whom they have defended. The circumstances under which these authors have lived in their early lives with their families have given them first-hand experience of several feminist matters about which they have later written. Such issues include sex discrimination and disrespect for females within both the micro (family) and the macro society, their lack of rational education, the dearth of decent jobs, and the trap for women that is marriage.

Because of their daring method of criticism and the controversial ideas they have propounded, especially in criticizing rules and traditions, Wollstonecraft and El Saadawi have been chastised fiercely and most of their works have been banned in an attempt by the authorities to prevent their works any effects they might have on society members, principally on women. However, these two writers have remained steadfast in their struggles against patriarchal system and its oppressive institutions. Their nonconformity has pushed them to lead tormenting lives in masculine societies that strictly follow traditions and conventions. They have combined their proficiency in writing with their awareness of the gender-based oppression to introduce subversive texts which have the potential to improve females' conditions.

Derisive Reception of *Maria* and *Woman at Point Zero*

Due to their critical impact upon feminist fiction writing, Wollstonecraft's *Maria* (1798) and Saadawi's *Woman at Point Zero* (1983) are briefly discussed in this section. A woman's wording is identified under the aegis of the reflection of her

experience in life, thereafter come her knowledge and beliefs. Such factors grant women's writings unique feminist features (Faubert 13). Tarabishi (2013), an influential Arab critic, also argues that the novel written by a male writer holds the world as its center, yet, it is self-centered when it is written by a female writer (Bishara 3-4). Thus, the constructing power of the male-authored novel comes in the first place while the female-authored novel notably derives its beauty from the richness of the passions and emotions (Tarabishi 13). Passions and emotions are usually referred to as the immediate consequences of humans' own experiences when they are in touch with their surroundings.

Women are usually associated with the lack of creativity (Tarabishi 13). Brockett (1870) claims that female writers have brilliant ability in describing any person or thing and narrating incidents; nonetheless, their fiction rarely involves a real creation or a character that is life-like and original (Reis 306). The claimed existence of such deficiency in females' creative productivity is not exclusively attributed to the intensity of emotions females pursue particularly in art and fiction writing (Brockett 90). Recent studies, however, have manifested that females' creative productivity is highly affected by the gender stereotyping throughout their lifetimes besides both "internal and external barriers in their education, marriage, and family lives" (Piirto 144).

Maria is an unfinished novel written by the well-known eighteenth-century British author Mary Wollstonecraft and published posthumously by her husband William Godwin. It tells the story of a woman who is wrongly incarcerated in an insane asylum by her abusive husband as she rebels against her disastrous marriage and the complete subjugation practiced by her husband. Maria, the protagonist of the novel, dramatizes marriage in European society as a prison in which women are sentenced for life (Wollstonecraft *Daughter of Isis* 184). In this novel, Wollstonecraft draws parallels between "domestic and political life, private and public morality" (Tone and Jon i). She also sheds light on the aspects that portray women as objects that exist only to gratify men's selfish caprices. *Maria* is an autobiographical novel through which Wollstonecraft probes the women's social, religious and political position as an ideal feminism (Ingham 223).

On the other hand, *Woman at Point Zero*, one of the most powerful works in Arabic literature (Palmer 1), is a novel written by the most controversial feminist Egyptian author Nawal El Saadawi. It revolves around Firdaus, the protagonist, and her gloomy story. In the presence of a female psychiatrist, Firdaus narrates her life story only one day before her execution as she is sentenced to death for killing a male pimp who has tried to subjugate her. She recounts her suffering as a child

in the village where her poor family has lived and the period she has spent in her uncle's house in the city, after being orphaned. To get rid of Firdaus, her uncle and his wife have planned to marry her off to an old abusive man, Sheik Mahmood. She continues to run away from her dwelling place to take prostitution as a job which finally leads her to prison. *Woman at Point Zero* explicitly unveils issues of women's struggle against an unfair patriarchal social system and conventions that reinforce inequality between sexes. Such explorations, in turn, make the novel worthy of such great reputation (Palmer 1).

Both *Maria* and *Woman at Point Zero*, have faced heated rejection not just because they were penned by female authors but also because of their controversial ideas. Harriet Jump (1994) maintains that *Maria* "cannot be called anything but a failure as it stands" and judges it as being "didactic" (Reis 306). Jones (2005) states that *Maria* is notorious for its explicit comments on sex education (145, 32). However, more than explicit sex education, Wollstonecraft challenged the dogma that loving the husband is wife's duty. In a letter to her daughter, Maria, the protagonist, justifies her decision to leave her brutal husband:

> Those who support a system of what I term false refinement … will not allow a great part of love in the female, as well as male breast, to spring in some respects involuntarily. … To such observers I have nothing to say, any more than to the moralists, who insist that women ought to, and can love their husbands, because it is their duty. (Wollstonecraft "Maria" 74)

While in the courtroom where George Venables, Maria's husband, sued his wife's lover for seduction and claimed damages for the loss of her domestic services, Maria asserts her right to sexual autonomy, "in the heart of misery, I met the man charged with seducing me. We became attached – I deemed, and shall ever deem, myself free" (Wollstonecraft "Maria" 83). Todd (1995) points out that Wollstonecraft was considered as "one who at best encouraged other women to live in the fantasy of books rather than face the bracing realities of material life" (Wollstonecraft "Maria" 119). Wollstonecraft's radical feminist ideas introduced in *Maria*, however, have been considered libertine propaganda (Todd 153). Like Wollstonecraft's, El Saadawi's *Woman at Point Zero* is looked at as an invitation, encouragement and justification for prostitution and immorality.

El Saadawi has been attacked by an overwhelming number of Arab critics, writers and other influential figures. She has been chastised for everything from her writing style to her thoughts which, in some degree, resemble that of the western

feminists' (Taylor 247). In *Tah't Shamss al Fikr* (Under the Sun of the Intellect), Tawfīq al-Ḥakīm (1982) maintains that the woman is the blooming and fragrant flower in the garden of human's life; nonetheless, it has thorns as well (Saiti and Salti 172). Upon analyzing *Woman at Point Zero,* Tarabishi (2013) concentrates on the negative aspects that characterize both El Saadawi and her protagonist, Firdaus. He argues that El Saadawi's endeavor to bind herself to Firdaus is not to add more credibility to her novel. It rather shows the author's own yearning to be associated with a criminal prostitute (233). El Saadawi, as the narrator of the story, comments on the close bond between herself and her heroine:

> All my attempts to see Firdaus were of no avail. I felt somehow that my research was now in jeopardy. As a matter of fact, my whole life seemed to be threatened with failure. My self-confidence began to be badly shaken, and I went through difficult moments. It looked to me as though this woman who had killed a human being, and was shortly to be killed herself, was a much better person than I. Compared to her, I was nothing but a small insect crawling upon the land amidst millions of other insects. (Tarabishi 267-70)

Keeping in mind the above mentioned limitations and the fierce censure their novels have received, it seems that not only Wollstonecraft and El Saadawi's lives are distinctive but they also have distinguished creative genius in propagating feminism. *Maria* and *Woman at Point Zero* have conveyed theories of feminist politics, which Wollstonecraft and El Saadawi have developed in most of their works. In the feminist politics theories, they have interrogated the "anti-feminist hegemony" which is empowered by religion and reinforced by male writers (Gohar 174-75; Wollstonecraft, "vindication" 87). They have proved themselves to their most influential contemporary male authors, such as Rousseau and Gregory in the eighteenth century in the West (El Saadawi, "Nuqtat Al-Sifr" 4) and Tawfīq al-Hakīm, Naguib Mahfouz and Tayyeb Saleh in the twentieth century in the East (Wollstonecraft, "vindication" 87).

They have presented themselves as impartial rationalists who are eligible to compete with men for recognition of their literary genius (Gohar 174-75). As feminism has been mainly concerned with reflecting the real condition of women in a patriarchal society, Wollstonecraft and El Saadawi, through their selected novels, mirror the situation in which women are portrayed as the objects of men's desires (Rich 88; Todd 153). They actually reflect the idealized construction of patriarchal values according to their viewpoints. To put it differently, their writings allow the

patriarchal society to observe how dark the real male image may be reflected in women's writing. Apparently, Wollstonecraft and El Saadawi's distinctive styles of fiction-writing are replete with gloomy self-expression. They adopt such a style of writing as a weapon through which they can confront women's oppressor, namely the patriarchal social system.

Conclusion

Keeping the aforementioned views in mind, it seems that underpinning feminism necessitates an apprehension of both historical and comparative backgrounds (Wollstonecraft, "Vindication" 84; El Saadawi, "The hidden face of Eve" 88). It is also necessary to employ the tenets of comparative literature. What makes the parallelism in comparative literature more appropriate is that it draws on the similar social and historical evolution of humanity, which means harmony in the process of literary development (Offen 120). By considering the social, political, and economic aspects of individuals' lives, comparative literature contributes a comprehensive understanding of the motives behind each individual's behavior.

So comparing females' conditions in different cultures and epochs, El Saadawi (2007) concludes that women's plight does not belong to the Arab, Middle Eastern or the Third World societies only; it rather constitutes an essential part of the social, political, economic and cultural system followed in almost all societies from the ancient times up to the present day (Enani 42). The contemporary women's misery is a sequence of the old social systems based on "dominating-dominated relationship between classes (races) and sexes" (El Saadawi, i). Royer (2001) explicates that reading El Saadawi's works within the history of Arab feminism, activism and humanism enables the reader, particularly in the West, to dispel the stereotypes that regard Anglo-American feminism the model for worldwide feminism from a Eurocentric perspective (El Saadawi, "The hidden face of Eve" i).

In the same fashion, comparing two of the radical feminist works both in the West and the East (i.e., *Maria* and *Woman at Point Zero*) contributes a broad understanding of the real indigenous motives that stand behind each feminism. Pinpointing the distinctive motives of each feminism, in turn, dispels the belief that eastern feminism is only imitating the western model. Notwithstanding eastern feminism is a homegrown demand, it cannot be ideologically detached from western feminism. The ideological shifts that take place in the western society have an undeniable influence on the eastern part of the world in one way or another. Such influence, consequently, impels many eastern intellectuals to (re)examine women's condition as well as feminist discourse in their native societies.

The type of fiction Wollstonecraft and El Saadawi have introduced to propagate their feminist ideas, invests their daily struggles for survival. They convey their own experiences through their writings to create an intimate text that can be felt by many readers. Additionally, the novels under consideration do not examine the miseries of individual heroines; they rather touch the social, political, cultural and economic spheres of women's lives in general. Wollstonecraft and El Saadawi believe in the power that the novel has in influencing the reader; and that is why they re-introduce their theories and thoughts in their fictional works. In the author's preface to *Maria*, Wollstonecraft mentions that in writing this novel, she has rather attempted to portray "passions" rather than "manners" (Royer v).

In reading a novel penned by either Wollstonecraft or El Saadawi, the reader will not fail to sense the plight the authors have as they write. The passions and depths of the novelists' own reactions to their lives represent all the essential ingredients of their dramatic fictions. However, Wollstonecraft and El Saadawi's power to fascinate has not only been attributed to the effectiveness of the incidents that shaped their writings, but also to the impassioned way they demand social justice and impartial categorization. Despite the fact that feminism has been nascent in their place and time, Wollstonecraft and El Saadawi have strongly responded to this movement or, more accurately, they have led feminism through their theoretical and fictional writings.

Works Cited

Abouzeid, Amany. "[Review of the Book *a Daughter of Isis: The Early Life of Nawal El Saadawi*, by N. El Saadawi]." *Gender and Development* 17. 3 (2016): 537-40.

Agustín, Laura María. *Sex at the Margins: Migration, Labour Markets and the Rescue Industry*. London & New York: Zed Books, 2007.

Al-Ḥakīm, Tawfīq. *Tah't Shamss Al-Fikr [under the Sun of the Intellect]*. Cairo: Al-Adab Library, 1982.

Al Wassil, Ahmed. "Simone De Beauvoir Iil Al-Arabiya: Intisar Al-Muthakaf Amam Al-Harb Wa Ideololojiya Wa Al-Mawta [Simone De Beauvoir to Arabic: The Victory of Educated to Write against War and the Ideology of the Dead]." 14997 (2009, July 9). 21-01-2017 <http://www.alriyadh.com/445163>.

Alafani, Bin Hussain. *A'alam Wa Aqzam Fi Mizan Al Islam [Figures and Dwarfs in the Scale of Islam]*. Jedda: Magid Hussein Asiri, 2009.

Badran, Margot. *Feminists, Islam, and Nation: Gender and the Making of Modern Egypt*. New Jersey: Princeton UP, 1996.

Bahadl-Khafajah, Mohamed, Ghandeharion, Azra, Taebi, Zohreh., & HeydarianShahri, Ahmad.

Delineating female characters in wollstonecraft's maria and el saadawi's woman at point zero: a comparative study held at Ahwaz University, Feb. 2–3, 2017. Paper presented at the The International Conference on Current Issues of Languages, Dialects and Linguistics, Ahwaz, 2017.

Bishara, Hanan. "Takatu' Wa Taaluq Al-Ruwya Al-Nisa'ya Wa Al-Tarjama Al-Thatiya [Intersection, Relevance and Self Interpretation of Feminist Novel]." *Al-Majma'* 7 (2013): 71-118.

Bouten, Jacob. *Mary Wollstonecraft and the Beginning of Female Emancipation in France and England*. Amsterdam: Kruyt, 1922.

Brockett, Linus Pierpont. *Woman: Her Rights, Wrongs, Privileges, and Responsibilities*. Cincinnati: L. Stebbins, 1870.

Caine, Barbara. *English Feminism, 1780-1980*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.

Cooke, Miriam. "Al-Dirasat Al-Ourpiya Wa Al-Amrikiyah Wa Al-Thakafat Al-Islamiya [European-American Feminist Studies and Islamic Cultures] (H. Kamal, Trans.)." *Encyclopedia of Women and Islamic Cultures* 1 (2006): 568-80.

—. *Women Claim Islam: Creating Islamic Feminism through Literature*. London & New York: Routledge, 2004.

De Clercq, Eva. "Feminism: A Trouble Spot." *The Seduction of the Female Body*. Ed. Clercq, Eva De. Women's Rights in Need of a New Body Politics. London: Palgrave Macmillan. doi: 10.1057/9781137030726.0004 2013. 7-45.

El Saadawi, N. *Al-Mara' Wa Al-Jins [Woman and Sex]*. 4th ed. Alexandria: Al-Mustaqbel, 1990.

—. *Al-Wajh Al-'Ari Lil Mar'a Al-'Arabiyya [the Bare Face of the Arabian Woman]*. Cairo: Madbouli Liberary, 1977.

—. *A Daughter of Isis: The Autobiography of Nawal El Saadawi*. Trans. Hetata, Sherif. London & New York: Zed Books Ltd, 2009.

—. *The Hidden Face of Eve: Women in the Arab World*. Trans. Hetata, Sherif. London: Zed Books, 1980.

—. *Imra'ah Inda Nuqtat Al-Sifr [Woman at Point Zero]*. Beirut: Dar al-Adab, 1975.

—. *Muthekarati Fi Sijin Al-Nisaa [Memoirs from the Women's Prison]*. Beirut: Dar al-Adab, 2000.

—. *Qadyat Al-Mara'a Al-Masriya Al-Syasiya Wa Al-Jinsya [the Political and Sexual Case of the Egyptian Woman]*. Vol. 2. Cairo: Madbouli Liberary, 2006.

—. *The Hidden Face of Eve: Women in the Arab World*. Zed Books, 2007.

El Saadawi, Nawal, & Wilmuth, Mary. "A Feminist in the Arab World." *Women & Therapy* 17. 3-4 (1995): 435-42.

Enani, Muhammed. "Theories of Comparative Literature." *The Comparative Tone: Essays in Comparative Literature with Special Reference to English Studies in Egypt, Translation and Culture*. Ed. Enani, M. M. Cairo: General Egyptian Book Organization, 2005. 1-58.

Faubert, Michelle. "Introducation." *Mary, a Fiction and the Wrongs of Woman, or Maria*. Ed. Wollstonecraft, Mary. Canada: Broadview Press, 2012. 11-71.

Gohar, Saddik. "Empowering the Subaltern in Woman at Point Zero." *Journal of International Women's Studies* 17.4 (2016): 174-89 pp. <http://vc.bridgew.edu/jiws/vol17/iss4/13>.

Golley, Nawar Alhassan. *Reading Arab Women's Autobiographies: Shahrazad Tells Her Story*. Austin: University of Texas Press, 2010.

Ingham, Aston. *Women and spirituality in the writing of More, Wollstonecraft, Stanton, and Eddy*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.

Janes, Regina M. "On the Reception of Mary Wollstonecraft's: A Vindication of the Rights of Woman." *Journal of the History of Ideas* 39. 2 (1978): 293-302.

Johnson, Claudia L. *The Cambridge Companion to Mary Wollstonecraft*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2002.

Jones, Vivien. "Advice and Enlightenment: Mary Wollstonecraft and Sex Education." *Women, Gender, and Enlightenment*. Eds. Knott, Sarah and Barbara Taylor. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005. 140-55.

Jump, Harriet Devine, and Harriet Devine. *Mary Wollstonecraft: Writer*. Harvester: Wheatsheaf, 1994.

Lundberg, Ferdinand, and Marynia Foot Farnham. *Modern Woman: The Lost Sex*. New York: Harper & Brothers, 1947.

Nicholson, L.J. *The Second Wave: A Reader in Feminist Theory*. London & New York: Routledge, 1997.

Offen, Karen. "Defining Feminism: A Comparative Historical Approach." *Signs* 14.1 (1988): 119-57 pp. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3174664>.

Palmer, Eustace. Nawal El Saadawi and the female predicament: A study of woman at point zero. *Journal of the African Literature Association 7*.2 (2013): 88-114..

Pennell, Elizabeth Robins. *Mary Wollstonecraft Godwin*. Eminent Women Series. Ed. Ingram, John H. London: WH Allen, 1885.

Perry, Eleanor H. "[Review of the Book *Opening the Gates: A Century of Arab Feminist Writing*, by M. Badran & M. Cooke]." *Digest of Middle East Studies* 2.3 (1993): 64-67.

Piirto, Jane. "Why Are There So Few?(Creative Women: Visual Artists, Mathematicians, Musicians)." *Roeper Review* 13. 3 (1991): 142-47.

Poovey, M. "Mary Wollstonecraft: The Gender of Genres in Late Eighteenth-Century England." *Novel: A Forum on Fiction* 15.2. Duke UP, 1982. 111-126.

Reis, Sally M. "Toward a Theory of Creativity in Diverse Creative Women." *Creativity Research Journal* 14. 3-4 (2002): 305-16.

Rich, Adrienne. "Toward a More Feminist Criticism." *Blood, Bread, and Poetry:Selected Prose (1979-1985)*. Ed. Rich, Adrienne. New York: W.W. Norton, 1986. 85-99.

Rover, C. *Love, Morals and the Feminists*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul Books, 1970.

Rowbotham, Sheila. *Dreamers of a New Day: Women Who Invented the Twentieth Century*. London & New York: Verso Books, 2011.

Royer, Diana. *A Critical Study of the Works of Nawal El Saadawi, Egyptian Writer and Activist*. New York: Edwin Mellen Press, 2001.

Saiti, Ramzi, and Ramzi M Salti. "Paradise, Heaven, and Other Oppressive Spaces: A Critical Examination of the Life and Works of Nawal El-Saadawi." *Journal of Arabic Literature* 25. 2 (1994): 152-74.

Tarabishi, George. *Al-A'amal Al-Naqdiya Al-Kamila Li George Tarabishi [All the Citical Works of George Tarabishi]*. Ed. 2nd. Vol. II. Dubai: Madarek, 2013.

—. *Al-A'amal Al-Naqdiya Al-Kamila Li George Tarabishi [All the Citical Works of George Tarabishi]*. Ed. 2nd. Vol. III. Dubai: Madarek, 2013.

Taylor, Barbara. *Mary Wollstonecraft and the Feminist Imagination*. Vol. 56. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2003.

Todd, Janet. "Aphra Behn—Whom Mary Wollstonecraft Did Not Read." *The Wordsworth Circle* 26.3 (1995): 152-58. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/24044554>.

—. *Mary Wollstonecraft: An Annotated Bibliography*. Vol. 39. London & New York: Routledge, 2012.

Tone, B., and Jon, M.. Introduction. *Letters written during a short residence in Sweden, Norway, and Denmark*. Marry Wollstonecraft (Ed.), New York: Oxford UP, 2009. i-xlii.

Tyson, Lois. *Critical Theory Today: A User-Friendly Guide*. 2nd ed. London & New York: Routledge, 2014.

Watt, Ian P. *The Rise of the Novel: Studies in Defoe, Richardson and Fielding*. Los Angeles: U of California P, 2001.

Wollstonecraft, Mary. *Maria or the Wrongs of Women*. New York: ICON Group International, 1975 (Original work published 1798).

—. *A Vindication of the Rights of Men and a Vindication of the Rights of Woman*. 1792. New York: Oxford University Press Inc,1993. (Original work published 1792)

Zuhur, Sherifa. "The Mixed Impact of Feminist Struggles in Egypt During the 1990s." *Middle East Review of International Affairs* 5. 1 (2001): 78-89.

Epistemological Postmodern Science in Tom Stoppard's *Hapgood* and *Arcadia* Through a Lyotardian Perspective

Samira Hemasi
Department of Literature and Foreign Languages
Tabriz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tabriz, Iran
Email: samirahemasi@gmail.com
Hossein Sabouri
Faculty of Persian and Foreign Languages, University of Tabriz, Iran
Email: sabouri@tabrizu.ac.ir

Abstract Tom Stoppard, the British postmodern playwright, has used two postmodern sciences, quantum mechanics and chaos theory, as the basis of his plays *Hapgood* and *Arcadia*. However, studying these plays in detail shows that he has a paradoxical style. His treatment with these sciences seems to be in opposition to what is believed in postmodernism. This paper aims to study quantum and chaos theories in *Hapgood* and *Arcadia* through a Lyotardian perspective. However, Stoppard challenges Lyotard's theories and his beliefs regarding postmodern science. It seems that Stoppard does not reach the full expression of a postmodern writer in this respect. Here, the researchers have tried to show Stoppard's postmodern science is somehow "classical." At the end, it is suggested that the duality in Stoppard's attitude can be considered a postmodern move. He is actually practicing postmodern doubt and uncertainty by his dualistic behavior. All in all, it can be considered what Lyotard calls a case of "differend."

Key words chaos theory; quantum theory; postmodern Science; differend; death of metanarratives

Authors **Samira Hemmasi**, graduated in English language and literature at B.A. level from University of Tehran in 2004. Then, she studied English literature at M.A. level in Islamic Azad University of Tabriz and graduated in 2006. Since then, she has been teaching at the same university as a part-time instructor. She has been studying English language and literature at PhD level since 2017 in Islamic Azad University of Tabriz. She is also teaching English language in Iran Language Institute (ILI). **Dr. Hossein Sabouri**, is Associate Professor in Faculty of Persian

and Foreign Languages of University of Tabriz. He got his B.A. degree in English language and literature in 1995 from University of Tabriz and his M.A. degree from Islamic Azad university of Tehran in 1997 and got his PhD degree from Punjab University Chandigarh in India in 2005.

Introduction

Postmodern drama, as a recent phenomenon following the principles of postmodern philosophy, emerged in the middle of 20th century. Tom Stoppard is one of the playwrights who has written plays following this mode. He presents different features of postmodernism challenging accepted norms. But reading his works raises an important question in the reader's mind. The question is: Does Stoppard remain faithful to these postmodern notions in his works?

Postmodern science is one of the elements which makes the foundation of Stoppard's plays, *Arcadia* and *Hapgood*. Studying these plays shows that Stoppard challenges the principle of postmodern science which is raising questions rather than answering them. Michael Vanden Heuvel writes in an article that "Stoppard does not fully inhabit the postmodern terrain, but he often travels there and traverses it, speaking the language of the region faultlessly even as he stops occasionally to arraign it with deadpan irony or wit" (213).

This article is going to study two postmodern sciences, quantum mechanics in *Hapgood* and chaos Theory in *Arcadia* from Lyotard's point of view. Jean Francois Lyotard, as a postmodern theoretician, has presented the definition of postmodern science and defines it as an anti-epistemological phenomenon. It would be interesting to investigate how Stoppard is dealing with postmodern and anti-postmodern principles regarding science and how he is playing with antinomies in this respect. After all, there arises another question: Can we still call Stoppard a postmodern writer?

To achieve this goal we have divided this paper into three parts. In the first part quantum theory and Stoppard's challenge with this postmodern science has been studied in *Hapgood* and in the second part chaos theory has been studied in *Arcadia* and at the end there is a final conclusion following these two sections.

A Quantum Leap: Postmodern Science in *Hapgood*, Classical Result!

Hapgood, one of the major well-received plays of Stoppard, was written in 1988. This play is a science-based play and Stoppard has used one of the postmodern sciences, quantum mechanics, at its core. He has used the baffling aspects of quantum

physics as a parallel to bluff and double-bluff in the plots of spies. Actually, it is an analogy between Cold War spies and the behavior of particles in the subatomic world. The play begins with a scene at the pool where the secret government agents of Britain and Soviet Union are exchanging information. This operation has been designed by Betty Hapgood to find out the agent who is suspected to be a double agent and gives secret information to Russians. But the exchange goes wrong and they try to put the pieces together to find out how it happened. Ridley is the double agent whom Hapgood is looking for but they can't figure out how he is doing it.

Stoppard has artistically dramatized quantum mechanics and brought it into the world of human beings. Quantum theory describes the interaction of particles in subatomic level, where the rules of classical mechanics can be no longer applied. It has a close up look at the behavior of the electrons in an atom and tries to find out where an electron is and what it is doing which is not possible at the same time. It suggests "if we take one classical Parameter—position—and measure a subatomic particle accordingly, we not only sacrifice measurement of similarly classical parameters, such as velocity but actually alter the behavior of those particles" (Sim 345). Stoppard makes this analogy the basis of his play by comparing the behavior of an electron and Ridley as a double agent.

Besides Ridley, Kerner's behavior has also been compared to an electron's in some other parts of the play since he is also a double agent but not a secret one. An example is in the scene two of the play when Blair wants to know that Kerner is on which side as a double agent; on British side or on the Russian side? Kerner tries to explain the dual behavior of light which was the basis of discovering quantum theory. He explains that light has both particle-like and wave-like behavior. He continues to elaborate the similarity between the behavior of light and the duality in the behavior of a double agent. He states that "Nobody knows. Somehow light is continuous and also discontinuous. The experimenter makes the choice. You get what you interrogate for and you want to know if I'm a wave or a particle" (Stoppard 501).

As Kerner mentions, a double agent or an electron can be in all possible states as long as one does not look to check. So, it breaks the classical principle. This is exactly what has been stated in Bohr's superposition principle. In an online dictionary, "Quantum Theory," it is noted about this principle that "It claims while we do not know what the state of any object is, it is actually in all possible states simultaneously, as long as we do not look to check" (2006). A double agent, like an electron, is "here" and "there" and sometimes he is a little bit "here" and a little bit "there." Polkinghorne writes "Classically speaking there are only two possibilities

(here or there). However, if we consider it a quantum world there are not just 'here' and 'there' possibilities any more. There can be mixture of these states, a bit of 'here' and a bit of 'there'. This new possibility that separates quantum world from classical physics is called superposition principle" (polkinghorne 21).

The other analogy made by Stoppard in the play, which is the main subject of this paper, is between Ridley, the one who is the most suspected to be the double agent they are looking for, and an electron. In fact, the shared principles in the behavior of both of them are uncertainty and superposition principles. For instance, in Act Two, Scene Five, Kerner asserts that Ridley's unexplainable movements from here to there without going in between is a quantum leap. He says "The particle world is the dream world of the intelligence officer. An electron can be here or there at the same moment. You can choose. It can go from here to there without going in between … Its movements cannot be anticipated because it has no reasons …" (Stoppard 544).

They cannot figure out how Ridley is giving information to both sides and what he is doing while he has always had an alibi. Stoppard's philosophical challenge in the play starts when Kerner proposes a solution for Ridley's riddle! Kerner who is a physicist and the rational mind in the play, proposes his radical theory and says this riddle could be solved if only Ridley had a "twin." Kerner says that just in this case Ridley can be always his own alibi. In fact, he proposes a rational solution for the problem of Ridley's dual behavior which has prevented his accusation as a double agent; just like Immanuel Kant's Konigsberg which was the problem of seven bridges that should have been passed without passing any of them twice, this problem could be solved by passing of two persons instead of one.

What Kerner tries to do is to give a reasonable explanation for an unreasonable behavior. He notes, Ridley can be in two places at the same time and doing something unknown while under close surveillance if only he has a twin. Therefore, everything can be "reasonably" explained. So, the twins removed the films from Kerner's briefcase, and it is the unseen twin who was marked by the isotope in it; so the other one who was dealing with Hapgood and her team was completely clean.

Kerner's solution is an interesting end for the play although there is a big problem here. This ending for the play is not "quantumic" at all and that is the point in which Stoppard goes astray from moving in postmodern track. Actually the conclusion that Kerner, or in other words Stoppard, reaches is completely different or probably the opposite of what happens in quantum mechanics.

Quantum theory proposes there is a duality in the behavior of an electron and this is not because of the fact that the electron has a twin or a double but because

this is the very characteristic of an electron which cannot be reasonably explained. Actually, half- knowledge is the best that a physicist can attain or he can just talk about the possibility of the behavior of an electron.

This can become clearer by Heisenberg's uncertainty principle that was clarified in 1927. Polkinghorne mentions in his book that Heisenberg wanted to measure the position and the momentum of an electron by an x-ray microscope. However, he considered that increasing knowledge of the position of the electron is in fact a decrease of knowledge about its momentum. This was the basis of his uncertainty principle (Polkinghorne 32-33). So, determining the location of an electron is not possible no matter how much information you have. Unlike Ridley that has a twin in the play, an electron can be here or there, not because it is double but because this is its nature.

Considering it from Lyotard's point of view, postmodernism questions human rationality and it is not an instrument of reaching the truth any more. Lyotard believes "postmodern science seeks to discover the unknown rather than known … Such theories feature a host of mysterious entities that seem to defy any possibility of rational explanation" (Sim 339).

In fact postmodern sciences, like quantum mechanics, undermines reason too since they deal with probabilities and a definite truth cannot be attained even by reason. In other words, they are anti-epistemological and indeterministic. Ashley Woodward in an online article states that "Postmodern sciences, which concern themselves with undecidables, the limits of precise control, conflicts characterized by incomplete information, 'fracta', catastrophes, and pragmatic paradoxes, continue to undermine performativity in the form of determinism" (2006).

On the other hand, classical science is on the basis of reason and it is deterministic. As McEvoy and Zarate discuss in their book, *Introducing Quantum Theory*, classical scientists relied on experiments and measurements and they had a similar law. They all tried to reach the results by mathematical laws. The late 19th century physicists were called classical because they were moving on the path of Newton's mechanics and Maxwell's electromagnetism. In fact, classical physicists had built up some assumptions which were based on their thinking and made the acceptance of new ideas very difficult. They all believed in determinism (5-8). Classical physicists were confident in what they knew. This kind of science is epistemological since it is deterministic and aimed to reach a final absolute result.

Accordingly, what Stoppard does is making a reasonable and classical ending for Ridley's mystery. He is showing that the uncertainty about Ridley's behavior has been because of the lack of information and Kerner found the missing informa-

tion and reached a rational definite solution to justify Ridley's behavior; while "an electron's movements cannot be asserted because it has no reasons" (Stoppard 544). Coming to the conclusion that Ridley has a twin, calls into question the postmodern aspect of quantum mechanics since the postmodern uncertainty which is the end of quantum theory has been unexpectedly resolved here and this is a totally classical and Newtonian end.

Daniel Jernigan notes in his article "Tom Stoppard and Postmodern Science" that "Indeed while previously many assumed that we might eventually move beyond probable predictions, after quantum mechanics it becomes certain that probability is the best we can ever hope to achieve. A postmodernist would see this change as significant. Stoppard does not" (2003). In other words, probability is the end of quantum mechanics while it is not the end of *Hapgood*.

Stoppard shows an inclination towards classical deterministic science in other parts of the play too. In the following quotation Kerner admires the kind of science that proceeds in a clear reasonable method. In Act One, Scene Five he says "In science this is understood: what is interesting is to know what is happening. When I write an experiment I do not wish you to be *surprised.* It is not a *joke*. This is why a science paper is a beautiful thing" (Stoppard 543).

Stoppard has changed the anti-epistemological postmodern science into a complete epistemological science in *Hapgood* and the language game of possibility has turned into the language game of predictability and certainty. As a result, paralogy is not the legitimation criterion for postmodern science in *Hapgood*. "Stoppard, like Einstein imagines that a classical scenario that normalizes non-classical behavior still persists" (Jernigan 2003).

Stoppard also undermines Lyotard's theory of the "death of metanarratives." It is stated in *Beginning Theory* that Lyotard believes postmodern science is incredulity towards metanarratives. This notion corresponds to the idea of the rejection of totality which is the basis of postmodernism (Barry 86). Quantum mechanics provides the ultimate incredulity to metanarratives because it resists reaching an absolute final result. Since the position and the momentum of an electron can never be determined at the same time. Therefore, quantum physics is anti-epistemological and not classical. Daniel Jernigan asserts in his article:

> It is a very tenet of quantum mechanics that the best for which we can ever hope with regard to giving the life history of a quantum particle is to tell it as a probability narrative. At best we can predict that a particular pattern will result, or express the odds against a particular particle traveling along a

> particular path. Contrary to Newton (whose mechanics implies that we might even predict the roll of dice if we knew all the necessary conditions involved to establish it fully), quantum physics asserts that no matter how much information we have about a particular system, prediction will always be a matter of probability. (2006)

But on the contrary, a metanarrative or an absolute result, has been gained in a reasonable way at the end of Stoppard's play.

What Stoppard does in *Hapgood* is also completely in contradiction to Lyotard's notion of "sublime" and "the unpresentable." With Kerner's resolution, there remains nothing unknown which cannot be explained by rationality. Attaining a reasonable certainty and resolving the duality in a double agent's behavior fades away what was supposed to be unpresentable. It is written in *The Cambridge Companion to Tom Stoppard*: "Stoppard's vision is not merely that of the mystery-solver, the sort based on a Holmsian clue that yields the pleasurable 'ah-hah!' Stoppard refuses to oversimplify the universe…he can solve the mystery of the twin spies in that play, but he cannot solve the mystery of the wave/particle controversy in the theory of light…it suggests a contemporary author who is distinctly not a postmodern one" (Zinman 121).

Kerner notes "Mathematics does not take pictures of the world, it's only a way of making sense. Twins, waves, black holes—we make bets on what makes best sense" (Stoppard 571). He chooses a "reasonable" solution, a metanarrative that makes sense and cannot be questioned.

In fact, if Stoppard was tended to end the play in a quantumic way with all of its probabilities at the end, Ridley should not have been captured. He should have gone free or at least the play should have ended unresolved in a kind of probability. In this way, the uncertainty and duality in his behavior still remained unresolved at the end of the play. But Stoppard breaks the rules and makes a classical result for a postmodern science. He decides to give a classical solution for a non-classical issue. Maybe, by repeating the sentence "I've always broken the rules" all over the play, he tries to show his own breaking of the rules of postmodern science and betraying postmodernism.

Orderly Chaos in *Arcadia*

Arcadia is Stoppard's second science-based play which was written in 1993. It deals with another postmodern science, chaos theory, at its center. It would be interesting to know whether Stoppard has a postmodern attitude towards this key concept of

postmodernism or not.

Lyotard calls Chaos Theory a postmodern science. According to Rae's article "Chaos Theory: A Brief Introduction," Edward Lorenz, the first experimenter of this theory, found out that very tiny factors in a system which are called hidden variables can have a very huge effect in the whole system. Rae asserts that a small change in the initial conditions makes a vital change in the long-term behavior of a system. Such things are not avoidable and controllable even in a lab (2006). This theory asserts that the result of a chaotic system cannot be predicted exactly or the prediction would be very hard. So chaos theory undermines predictability like quantum mechanics. It undermines grand narratives and opens up a new language game which is the language game of probability instead of the classical language game of determinism.

Stoppard compares the process of a biographical research in *Arcadia* to a chaotic system. Chaos theory has been used to show the difficulties of biographical literary researchers. Hannah and Bernard want to relate the events that occurred in Sidley Park in April 1809. The play lingers between two periods of time in Sidley Park estate. Bernard claims that Lord Byron had been present in the house in 1809, seduced Ezra Chater's wife and wrote a harsh review of his work, killed him in a duel and then left for Europe as a self-exile.

Bernard presents some evidence for his theory. He found a letter of Chater to someone unnamed, challenging him to a duel because of an insult to his wife. He had found this letter in Chater's book of poem that was in Byron's possession for some time. Thus he assumed that they belonged to Lord Byron and the duel had been between him and Chater. Bernard had also assumed that the harsh review of Chater's work was written by Byron according to some evidences.

Since the play dramatizes 1809 too, the reader of the play knows that what Bernard has concluded is not true. He's achieved this false result because of some trivial mistakes. He's made mistake about the duel letter since it was not addressed to Byron and the harsh review on Chater's book was not written by Byron either. In fact, Bernard's truth was a self-constructed truth and the final result was untrustworthy. This chaotic system, the process of their biographical research, didn't reach the truth because of small initial factors intervening the whole system of the biographical research.

Hannah's challenge with Bernard is a turning point for the play since Stoppard deviates from postmodern track at this point. From Lyotard's point of view, Bernard's truth is a "little narrative." It is a kind of personal truth that has been made by him. Right or wrong, Bernard claims his theory which can claim its own validity as

a personal truth or little narrative. But Hannah refuses to accept his self-constructed theory. All the time that Bernard tells her about the proofs that he has, she treats rationally and uses her logical mind in order to find the accuracy or inaccuracy of Bernard's theory.

Hannah keeps saying to Bernard that Chater could have died of anything else, at anywhere else because she believes that Bernard does not have enough proof for his claim. In Act One, Scene Four, she uses her rationality again and refutes Bernard's claim about the duel between Byron and Chater or even the presence of Byron in Sidley Park at that time. She asserts "You haven't established it was fought, you haven't established it was Byron. For God's sake, Bernard, you haven't established Byron was even here!" (Stoppard 72). In fact, Hannah believes that Bernard does not have a leg to stand on and his theory is not acceptable for a rational mind.

In Act Two, Scene Five Hannah again explains it does not seem rational to imagine that Byron has killed Chater in a duel in April 1809, relaxed till July and then left the country in a cloud of panic and mystery. She ridicules Bernard's theory and says "Nobody would kill a man and then pan his book. I mean, not in that order. So he must have borrowed the book, written the review, posted it, seduced Mrs. Chater, fought a duel and departed, all in the space of two or three days. Who would do that?" (Stoppard 85). She says it is in no way rational.

What Hannah does, is in fact using a logical **s**cientific method of conjecture and refutation. She fights with Bernard to find the real truth. The truth that Bernard achieves, is the one that he wants to get. It's a kind of personal truth or a little narrative. On the other hand, Hannah tries to catch the absolute final result, the real truth. She examines every step of Bernard's theory and refuses the anti-logical ones until she reaches the final truth. This procedure is classical. This is not the way of postmodern science because it is believed in postmodernism that no matter how much knowledge and information one has, ration is not anymore a metanarrative that leads him/her to a final result. "In general, the postmodernists claim that reason, being situated rationality, can no longer aspire to certainty" (Steuerman 1).

As a result, by using a classical, rational, scientific method, Hannah constantly insists on calling Bernard's theory under question in order to reach the truth in a chaotic system and this is how Stoppard moves out of postmodern track. Susan Vees-Gulani, in Jernigan's article, asserts that "Stoppard believes firmly in scientific method of conjecture and refutation, a process that chooses some data to be less flawless than other data on seemingly arbitrary criteria" (qtd. in Jernigan 2006). Consequently, by giving credibility to reason, Stoppard challenges Lyotard's thought.

As it has been mentioned, the end of postmodern science is a kind of probability that cannot be resolved by ration. "Postmodernism elevates the irrational as sublime and decries metanarratives and the idea of transcendence as nihilistic" (Scolomb 57). However, Hannah found out the truth that Chater had actually died in 1810 and of a monkey bite. This is an epistemological ending for this play which is in complete contradiction with chaos theory as a postmodern science. Daniel Jernigan argues in his essay "Tom Stoppard and Postmodern Science' that 'Because stoppard's use of chaos theory is not especially anti-epistemological, it might be even argued that Stoppard only delves into chaos theory because he is convinced that chaos theorists really have seen 'what things meant' and that if the universe happens to be so complex that it fails to be deterministic, so be it. At least we know the truth" (2006).

What Stoppard does is trying to find order out of chaos. He asserts this fact when Valentine, another character of the play, says "See? In an ocean of ashes, islands of order" (Stoppard 107). Actually, his use of a logical process and quest to find order is not postmodern but it is classical since order can be found in Classical science because it believes that the future could be exactly computed and predicted and there could be a definite final result for every experiment.

Michael V. Heuvel, one of the main critics of Stoppard's works, notes in his article that "Stoppard is always more interested in the interplay of order and disorder than in maintaining a prevailing belief in one or the other" (229). Heuvel fortifies what has been said so far. Actually, Stoppard does not stick to one track but changes his line all the time. He is not fully faithful to postmodern beliefs. In fact Stoppard puts postmodern science and classical science, the opposite facts, beside each other and plays with them.

According to what Lyotard believes about postmodern science, Stoppard absolutely contradicts the main postmodern notions. As Stuart Sim states in his book, Lyotard believes postmodern science is a kind of language game that searches for instabilities in a system rather than stabilities. It deals with undecidables and limits of precise control. Postmodern science, as Lyotard believes, does not reach a unified knowledge. Probability is the end in this kind of science (339). On the contrary. Stoppard tries to make stability in the play and leaves nothing out of control.

Daniel Jernigan notes Stoppard does not transfer the postmodern incredulity. At the end, everything becomes certain and for sure. Daniel Jernigan argues in his article that:

> Stoppard's narrative is decidedly traditional. The reverbrations that result from the various chaotic deteriorations are simple enough that careful application of

> scientific method can result in progress. Thus Stoppard refuses to experience any of the 'atrocious solitude and anxiety' which is the postmodern product of such feedback. Thoroughly, postmodern work might, by contrast, simultaneously raise ontological questions about the nature of the past and epistemological questions about how we are to know the past – and remain incredulous about that pasts grand metanarrative. Indeed that a postmodern squeal is the end result of such investigation. (2006)

Another important point about the play is the irreversibility of a chaotic system. One cannot reach the input or the past in a chaotic system through the result or the output. Actually, a chaotic system is irreversible because of the principle that is called dependence on initial factors. Susanne Vees-Gulani explains the irreversibility of chaos theory. Gulani believes that one cannot reach from the result or the output to the input or the past in a chaotic system. Jernigan states that Gulani points out "… it increases the difficulty not only of predicting the future, but also of describing the past. She sees 'the consequence of sensitive dependence on initial conditions' as the **'**irreversibility of chaotic systems'. Hence she asserts the impossibility of speculation not only about the future of the system, but also about its past. Even though the output of a system is determined by its input, it is impossible to reconstruct this input exactly" (qtd. in Jernigan 2006). However, Hannah has made this chaotic system reversible and could reach the input through the output.

Moving against Lyotard's theory of "death of metanarratives" is another evidence of leaving the postmodern track at the end of the play. As it has been mentioned, Lyotard believes every little narrative is claiming its own authority because postmodern school of thought is on the basis of plurality and not totality. However, this doubt cannot be seen at the end of *Arcadia*.

If this play had ended in a postmodern mood, it shouldn't have been ended in a kind of certainty about the truth. It should not have ended up in an absolute metanarrative. Stoppard should have ended the play in a shadow of doubt. It means Hannah shouldn't have reached the true theory or the play should have ended up in a kind of postmodern uncertainty by not revealing the accuracy or inaccuracy of Bernard's theory; Hannah and Bernard should have remained uncertain about their theories.

Consequently, it seems that Stoppard is not following the postmodern Lyotardian idea of death of metanarratives but he is following a kind of "speculative grand narrative." What Stoppard does is mixing classical result and postmodern science. He has made a kind of epistemological postmodern science. Stoppard has used the

anti-epistemological chaos theory and made it epistemological. After all, Stoppard undermines himself as a postmodern writer.

Conclusion

The study of postmodern science in these two plays shows a kind of duality in Stoppard's style. He is putting two antinomies, postmodern science and classical (or Newtonian) science, beside each other and reconciles them. In fact, he reconciles epistemological and anti-epistemological views toward science. Actually, there is an interplay of order and disorder, certainty and uncertainty and finally he makes one lead to the other one. There is a kind of classical reasonable result for the "quantumic" situation in *Hapgood* and an orderly chaos in *Arcadia*. Niederhoff was so right when he called *Arcadia* 'a play of ideas'. Burkhard Niederhoff says in his article that "Stoppard allows for the cooperation of opposed principles" (2001).

In Stoppard's plays, one feels an inability to decide whether Stoppard is dealing with quantum and chaos theories as postmodern sciences or classical Newtonian sciences. Actually, what Stoppard does is considering postmodern and classical as two little narratives and does not stick to just one of them; he mingles them in each other. In fact, Stoppard prefers this kind of uncertainty and shows every concept, world-view or narrative contains the traces of its antinomy in itself. Kerner states in *Hapgood* that "The priest is visited by the doubter, the Marxist sees the civilizing force of the bourgeois, the captain of industry admits the justice of common ownership" (Stoppard 73).

It is concluded in this paper that this kind of duality in Stoppard's attitude can be considered a postmodern trick. Jacques Derrida defines uncertainty as the "impossibility of deciding between two or more competing interpretations" (Bennett & Royle 179). This is what Derrida explains in his concept of "deconstruction." By deconstruction Derrida tries to find another center in order to decenter one. He tries to reverse binary oppositions to decentralize.

It was mentioned that Stoppard has considered "postmodern/Newtonian" as a binary opposition; each side of this binary has the traces of the other side in itself and gets meaning by the other one. When we say "postmodern," we mean "not Newtonian." So "Newtonian or classical" is absent in the meaning of "postmodern." But "absent signs leave their trace in what is present (say, in our word postmodern); they are there and not there at the same time" (Schmitz 2007, 119); it's like the behavior of an electron. It can be said that Stoppard has deconstructed this binary by reversing it and not giving privilege to the first side of the binary. He does that by mixing them and reaching a classical epistemological result for the postmodern

sciences in these plays and therefore questioning himself as a postmodern writer. But this decentralization is exactly the aim of postmodernism.

What is trying to be said is that Stoppard's duality in dealing with postmodern science is not an anti-postmodern characteristic. Actually, unlike what it seems, Stoppard celebrates postmodern plurality by his dualistic behavior. Derrida believes "In the universe there are no absolutes or fixed points, so that the universe we live in is decentered" (Barry 67).

By looking in a different way, it is seen that since Stoppard gives credibility to different antinomies, he is fortifying Lyotard's notion of 'death of metanarratives' which are classical science and postmodern science. Heuvel claims that opposite concepts have something in common with each other and a little bit of one lives in the other one. He asserts Stoppard has a similar claim and quotes from Stoppard that "even the facility to perceive and define two ideas such as classical and romantic in opposition to each other indicates that one shares a little bit of each" (Heuvel 213).

What Stoppard has done in these plays is the representation of Lyotard's differend. Differend is a case of conflict, between two parties, that cannot be resolved. According to Malpas, Lyotard believes a differend is an unstable state in which no impartial metalanguage is possible in order to decide between the different language games (60-61). Stoppard cannot decide between antinomies and therefore switches from one of them to the other one. In fact, Stoppard is doing justice to them. He does not make one of them silent, but lets both of them exist. He lets both postmodern science and classical science speak. Honi Fern Haber comments on Lyotard views that heteronomy and multiplicity is the basis of justice. He defines multiplicity as the demands of justice and says a just situation is when all potential narrators are allowed to narrate from their individual perspectives and none of them hold privilege over the other (16-18).

Since inconsistency is the nature of postmodernism, it can be claimed that Stoppard has done his mission as a postmodern writer skillfully by his doubt and uncertainty. Stoppard has an "electron-like behavior" himself. He is not fully "here" or "there." He is sometimes here, sometimes there, and sometimes in both; a little bit here and a little bit there; a little bit postmodern and a little bit "not postmodern." He doesn't stick to just one world-view and this is exactly what postmodernism tries to convey.

Works Cited

Barry, Peter. *Beginning Theory*. Manchester: Manchester UP, 2002.

Bennett, Andrew, and Nicholas Royle. *An Introduction to Literature, Criticism and Theory*. Hertfordshire: Prentice Hall Europe, 1995.

Haber, Honi Fern. *Beyond Postmodern Politics*. London: Routledge, 1994.

Heuvel, Michael Vanden. "Is Postmodernism?: Stoppard Among/Against the Postmoderns." *The Cambridge Companion to Tom Stoppard*. Ed. Katherine E. Kelly. Cambridge: Cambridge, 2001.

Jernigan, Daniel. "Tom Stoppard and Postmodern Science," 2003. Available at: <//http://www.questia.com/PM.qst?a=o&d=5002081542//> (accessed 24 June 2006).

Malpas, Simon. *Jean Francois Lyotard*. London: Routledge, 2003.

McEvoy, J.P, and Oscar Zarate. *Introducing Quantum Theory*. New York: Totem, 1996.

Niederhoff, Burkhard. "Fortuitous Wit: Dialogue and Epistemology in Tom Stoppard's *Arcadia*," 2001. Available at: <//http://www.unituebingen.de/uni/nec/niederhoff111.htm//> (accessed 29 September 2006).

Polkinghorn, John. *Quantum Theory: A Very Short Introduction*. New York: Oxford, 2002.

"Quantum Theory." *SMB (on-line dictionary)*, 22 June 2006. Available at: <//http://searchsmb.techtarget.com/sdefinition/o,,sid44-gci332247,oo.html//> (accessed 24 November 2006).

Rae, Greg. "Chaos Theory: A Brief Introduction," 2006. Available at: <//http://www.imho.com/grae/chaos/chaos.html//> (accessed 27 June 2006).

Schmitz, Thomas. *Modern Literary Theory and Ancient Texts, An Introduction*. Massachusetts: Blackwell, 2007.

Scolomb, Will. *Nihilism and Sublime Postmodern*. New York: Routledge, 2006.

Sim, Stuart. *A Routledge Companion to Postmodernism*. London: Routledge, 2001.

Steuerman, Emilia. *Bound of Reason*. London: Routledge, 2000.

Stoppard, Tom. *Plays 5: Arcadia, The Real Thing, Night and Day, Indian Ink, Hapgood*. London: Faber and Faber, 1999.

Woodward, Ashley. "Jean Francois Lyotard," 2006. Available at: <//http://www.iep.utm.edu/l/Lyotard.htm//> (accessed 8 July 2006).

Zinman, Toby. "*Travesties, Night and Day, The Real Thing*." *The Cambridge Companion to Tom Stoppard*. Ed. Katherine E. Kelly. Cambridge: Cambridge, 2001. 120-135.

Minority Discourse: A Concave View of Hybridity in Ayad Akhtar's *American Dervish*

Syrrina Ahsan Ali Haque
Department of English Language and Literature
The University of Lahore, Defence Road Campus, Lahore
Email: syrrina@gmail.com

Abstract The paper aims to explore a kaleidoscopic view of minority discourse seen through the concave lens of hybridity in Ayad Akhtar's *American Dervish*. The aim of the research is to locate minority discourse on the spectrum of plural existence with special reference to Pakistani-American marginalization. The hybridity of the term American dervish is studied in the context of identity clasped in the scope of minority narrative. Since, minority is a term closely attached to power discourse, Akhtar's narrative delineates the power dynamics of a South Asian community replete with paradoxical sub-existence of identities in the American landscape. The study spreads out the refracted vision of minority discourse while correcting the myopic view of religious affiliation. *American Dervish* provides a concave view of Pakistani-American lives in conjunction with their interaction to both American and dervish identities. Minority discourse has not been explored as an annexation connected to the protracted discourse earlier. This study provides a lens to divulge from myopic focal points to broader affiliation with the social narrative.

Michel Foucault's theory of power and Allen Thiher's work of *The Power of Tautology: The Roots of Literary Theory* are surveyed as theoretical bedrock of the study. The research thus, delves into the meaning of minority in a diverse society, its divulgence into mainstream and the refraction into tautologically contrived and concocted identities and sub-identities forming means of affiliation to the preponderant narrative of the society. Future researchers can explore religious subsets within the global spectrum of plural societies.

Key words minority discourse; diaspora; Muslim identity; hybridity; power

Author **Dr. Syrrina Ahsan Ali Haque** teaches English Literature, Creative, Academic Writing, and Research Methodology at the University of Lahore, Kinnaird College for Women, Lahore School of Economics, LGSIDP-University

of London, Government College University. Dr. Haque's first book, *Sand in the Castle: A Collection of Short Stories* was published in USA in 2010. Her second book, an academic non-fiction, *Cultural Confessions in Khaled Hosseini's Works,* was published in Germany in 2017.

Her Manuscript, Dialogue on Partition: Literature Knows No Borders has won Honorable Mention Award at NeMLA 51st Convention, Boston, USA. She has held many talks at universities as well as on television and conducted workshops on writing, academic as well as creative. She has been writing as a freelance writer for newspapers and magazines. Her research articles have also been published in scholarly journals. Her research paper received the Best Paper award in Japan. She has won Summer Fellowship Award, USA.

Introduction

The paper aims to explore a kaleidoscopic view of minority discourse seen through the concave lens of tautological hybridity in Ayad Akhtar's *American Dervish*. The aim of the research is to locate minority discourse on the spectrum of plural existence with special reference to Pakistani-American de-marginalization. The tautological hybridity of the term American dervish is studied in the context of identity clasped in the scope of minority narrative. Since, minority is a term closely attached to power discourse, Akhtar's narrative delineates the power dynamics of a South Asian community replete with paradoxical sub-existence of identities in the American landscape. The study spreads out the refracted vision of minority discourse while correcting the myopic view of religious affiliation. *American Dervish* provides a concave view of Pakistani American lives in conjunction with their interaction to both American and dervish identities. Minority discourse has not been explored as an annexation connected to the protracted discourse earlier. This study provides a lens to divulge from myopic focal points to broader affiliation with the social narrative.

Literature Review

The word Minority is defined as "the smaller part of a number," "a group in society distinguished from, and less dominant than the more numerous majority," "a racial, ethnic, religious, or social subdivision of a society that is subordinate to the dominant group in political, financial, or social power without regard to the size of these groups," and/or "a smaller party or group opposed to a majority, as in voting or other action" ("Minority" Dictionary.com). M. J. Akbar questions 'minoritism,'

then explains, "A minority, therefore, is not a consequence of numbers, but a definition of empowerment" (489). Hence, if minority is connected directly to the power structure of a country then numbers are irrelevant.

The hybridity of the identity of American dervish may deprive him of power in one instance, as a minority, but empowers him at another, as being part of a powerful number of Muslims. Can this be considered an oxymoronic taultology? In this regard, Michel Foucault's theory of power and Allen Thiher's work *The Power of Tautology: The Roots of Literary Theory* are surveyed as theoretical bedrock of the study. The research thus, delves into the meaning of minority in a diverse society, its divulgence into mainstream and the refraction into tautologically contrived and concocted identities and sub-identities forming means of affiliation to the preponderant narrative of the society, which creates power.

According to Michel Foucault "Power is Everywhere" (Foucault 63), "the idea that 'power is everywhere', diffused and embodied in discourse, knowledge and 'regimes of truth' (Foucault 63). Power for Foucault is what makes us what we are, operating on a quite different level from other theories: "His work marks a radical departure from previous modes of conceiving power and cannot be easily integrated with previous ideas, as power is diffuse rather than concentrated, embodied and enacted rather than possessed, discursive rather than purely coercive, and constitutes agents rather than being deployed by them' (Gaventa 1)" As "Power is everywhere" and "comes from everywhere" so in this sense is neither an agency nor a structure (Foucault 63) and therefore the question arises do numbers matter in minority discourse?

Discussion and Analysis

Muslim population does not belong to the ruling party in the United States of America therefore it is considered a minority. Hayat in *American Dervish* is brought up in a Muslim household in a town in USA. Despite his father's conscious effort to dissociate his identity from his Muslim faith and community, his mother's friend Mina inculcates within him an identity he can allocate his roots to. It provides a scaffolding for him. He does not follow the teachings of the clerics but follows the Holy Quran from the heart. He learns the English translation of the Holy Quran and imagines himself to be a Hafiz. Mina's teachings are rooted in the spiritual upbringing of his character. She narrated stories of the Prophet, Djinns and sufi saints. She taught him, "With everything in life, Hayat, is the intention that matters" (53). She was teaching him in a pre- 9/11 USA, that there are three words repeated in the Quran and these are "'God', 'benevolent', 'merciful'" (56). She asks him

"When someone hits you, what do you do about it?," his immediate response is "Hit them back?" however, Mina leads him to forgiveness, and says "You can forgive them […] If you forgive them you're showing mercy" and benevolent means "when you do something good, you are being benevolent"(56). He acquired power from learning about a "holy power" which was benevolent and merciful. According to Hayat, "the months that followed were witness to a series of spiritual experiences" (59). He understood the 'inner aspect' of praying, which enabled him to feel that God was near him (65). It is significant to note that, "For Mina, faith really wasn't about the outer forms," and advocated "ijtihad, or personal interpretation," however, " the only problem was, the so-called Gates of Ijtihad had been famously 'closed' in the tenth century," because, "personal interpretation led to innovation and that these innovations created chaos in the matter of knowing what it meant to obey God's will" (66-67). On the contrary, Akhtar shows American Muslims, who live and enjoy livelihood in America yet condone it, and consciously dissociate themselves from the American nation, yet, expect to be a part of it. Chatha "loved to talk about what God was going to do to American unbelievers on Judgement Day." According to him, "Allah will turn them this way and that […] He'll fry them just like one of their fishes at the church Friday fish fries" (80). The same fish he would devour heartily. Akhtar demonstrates two ways of interpreting Islam and elucidates the paradoxical lives the Pakistanis live shunning the fabric of their livelihood which they opted for yet adorning it wholeheartedly. Hayat's American boy is enlightened by Mina's 'dervish' teachings but he remains American. The novel begins with his realization that as he bites into the forbidden "brown-and-white pork bratwurst," he feels "brave and ridiculous"(4), yet "complete"(5), he becomes a "Mutazalite"[1](9) for assimilation. However, as we journey through his past events, we realize the potency of his love for Islam as nurtured by Mina. The American and dervish live side by side within his Identity and Self. It is not simply a matter of assigning Identity to his Americanness and Self to the Dervish in him. These interchange with time and circumstances.

Hayat, as a ten-year-old boy delves into both the Identity and the Self to locate his point of nexus and arrives at an alliance with a larger force, in numbers, which is the Muslim nationhood he belongs to. However, with the course of time, he questions his Pakistani, American and Muslim selves, in the context of majority and minority discourse within these three realms. Akhtar proffers the existence of power within the discourse.

Hence, the minority discourse has the potential to be empowered if the

1 Those who withdraw, or stand apart. In Islam, Political or religious neutralists. Britannica

narrative it presents is generated through knowledge creating a specific truth. If the country is ruled by a member of the minority group, the community is automatically empowered by the system of governance, curriculum choices and media generated knowledge. As was the case in Indian Hyderabad state, where the majority population comprised Hindus (approximately 80%), however, the ruler was Nizamuddin, a Muslim, the narrative of the State was Muslim, with its agents of power creating knowledge aligned with the Muslim discourse. Hence, minority is relative to the power structure. An American Muslim discourse can enervate its ideologies through stepping up on the hierarchical order in the society. In *The White Tiger*, Aravind Adiga shows how Balram, belonging to the lowest caste could become a powerful man by acquiring wealth. In *American Dervish*, Akhtar, does not empower his character with materialistic wealth but elevates his stature for himself through his mystic knowledge. Mina, becomes the source of his uplift and he considers her as the guide rather than his parents, because she takes him on an inward journey to arrive at the truth, of being One with God. The societal truth he had been exposed to by the American society is concrete rather than abstract:

> Truth is a thing of this world: it is produced only by virtue of multiple forms of constraint. And it induces regular effects of power. Each society has its regime of truth, its "general politics" of truth: that is, the types of discourse which it accepts and makes function as true; the mechanisms and instances which enable one to distinguish true and false statements, the means by which each is sanctioned; the techniques and procedures accorded value in the acquisition of truth; the status of those who are charged with saying what counts as true. (Rabinow)

The power of the hybrid title, *American Dervish,* lies in its oxymoronic tautology, inclusive of both concrete and abstract elements which make up Hayat. According to the dictionary, "A tautology states the same thing twice in slightly different wording, or adds redundant and unnecessary words. Tautological reasoning is logic that uses the premise as the conclusions, or is too obvious to be necessary" ("Tautology"). Akhtar has empowered both the words by conjoining them and producing a new ideological bedrock which the Muslim community can adhere to. Hayat finds the Holy Quran as his bedrock to adhere to, and memorizes the English translation and in his mind believes that he is Hafiz, however, he is shunned for not learning the Quran in Arabic. His knowledge of the Quran is far greater than of the child who memorizes it in Arabic. Hayat tries to even follow the Quranic teachings

and finds solace in reading the English translation.

According to Allen Thiher in *Words in Reflection: Modern Language Theory and Postmodern Fiction,*" 'The world' or 'reality' , then emerge as solely the result of intertextual relationships" (Theo). Hence, there is a relationship between the concrete and the abstract. It is therefore, important to trace this relationship. Thiher writes: "Derrida's writings are exemplary of the postmodern awareness, that, if the world no longer represents a theological form of presence, a manifestation of some transcendent logos, it can be taken as the trace of all other words. Texts are a tissue of all other texts" (Thiher 90). Hayat, finds this transcendental logos in the Quran, which he reads and the stories of the dervish he hears.

Thereby, Hayat finds allegiance to his Muslim identity, Mina, however, introduces Hayat to the mystic elements of being Muslim. While exposing him to the prayer and recitation of the Quran, Mina also acquaints him to the benevolence preached in Islam. According to Hayat, "For once, life in our home was settling into a peaceful, lively rhythm," he was not sure if they could be happy because he felt, "we were formed and informed (to various degrees) by an Eastern mythos profoundly at odds with the American notion of happily-ever-after. For though we longed for happiness, we did not expect it" (Akhtar 70). Hayat, thus, acquires a latent power within him through the knowledge of Islam which Mina provides him to connect to two worlds and stay connected. He remains American but acquires a mystic knowledge which allows him to look within himself. His father, on the other hand, wholly absorbs his American identity and absolves his Muslim self. On the other extreme, are people like Mr.Chatha, according to him, Islam was unforgiving so each act was accountable, he believed in an intolerant Islam. He chose to reside with Christians and Jews but advocated hate and continued to hate the communities he had whole-heartedly opted to live with for better sustenance. In his case, sustenance was material rather than spiritual. To appease his spiritual side, he quotes verses without context and deems judgement. Sonny asks, "Why only these verses, Ghaleb? Why not have him read sixty-two as well?" Chatta is unaware of sixty-two verse, so Sonny exclaims, "Maybe it's you who needs to know your holy book a little better" (130-31). Dawood then reads verse sixty-two:

> It is true: The faithful, those who follow the
> Jewish faith, the Christians, the Sabians-all
> Who believe in God and the Last Day and do
> Right-these shall find reward with the Lord.
> They will not fear. They will not grieve. (131)

In this case, knowledge created out of references which are quoted out of context create the truth. Hayat, living in USA, tries to locate the multiple truths within the religious and scholarly text with the help and support of Mina. According to Foucault,

> Power is employed and exercised through a net-like organization. And only do individuals circulate between threads; they are always in the position of simultaneously undergoing and exercising this power. They are not only its inert or consenting target; they are always also the elements of its articulation. In other words, individuals are the vehicle of power, not its points of application. (98)

So, it is the individual, himself, who creates knowledge and his own power in turn. Minorities are considered different because of the knowledge created about them and from them. As Foucault further states, "Knowledge linked to power, not only assumes the authority of 'the truth' but has the power to make itself true" (Foucault 27). It is therefore, of utmost importance to accommodate all agencies of power in the creation of knowledge. Foucault further claims that,

> it is quite possible that the major mechanisms of power have been accompanied by ideological production[…] but basically I don't believe that what has taken place can be said to be ideological [...] It is the production of effective instruments for the formation and accumulation of knowledge […] All this means that power, when it is exercised through these subtle mechanisms, cannot but evolve, organize and put into circulation a knowledge, or rather apparatuses of knowledge, which are not ideological constructs. (102)

In this regard, minority communities, in order to, acquire some form of power create knowledge disguised as ideological truth to bind them while creating a sub-hierarchical order within the order they live in. It is a way and means to create a simulation of power. In doing so, they create knowledge which adheres them as a sub-community rather than as a productive part of the nationality they belong to. The families in *American Dervish* hold American nationalities, however, they wish to extract the economic benefits of the macro society they live in while forming a micro society which continuously debunks the macro society. They use knowledge based on their ideological discourse to disprove the society. Hayat, reads the verses

of the Quran free from the constraints of ideology and cultivates the teachings in his practical discourse. He finds the essence of the religion. Mina is his guide, despite her transgressions from the codes set by her religion, she maintains the humane aspect of her religion and inculcates that within Hayat. Thus, his hybrid existence as an American and a dervish create peace within him. He tries to locate both aspects of his existence the identity of being an American at the same time his dervish self. A dervish is "any member of a Ṣūfī (Muslim mystic) fraternity, or *tariqa*. The main ritual practiced by the dervish is the *dhikr*, which involves the repeated recitation of a devotional formula in praise of Allah as a means of attaining an ecstatic experience. Dervishes can be either resident in community or lay members. A wandering or mendicant dervish is called a *fakir* (faqir) ("Dervish Sufism"). In Merriam Webster dictionary, "a dervish is one that whirls or dances with or as if with the abandonment of a dervish."

However, in this novel, dervish is used to describe his inner state, which is whirling as he is trying to find his center. It is quite a novelty that a young ten-year old child, is trying to locate a center. Since, Hayat is exposed to his father's way of life as well as Mina's, his approach is different from other children of his age. As Mina leaves, the thread that strung him to both worlds snaps. An adult, Hayat, in the prologue, "rushed to Schirmer Hall," he claims, the "Quran tucked under my arm, […] I would find a place near the back-[…]where I would have the space quietly to reel and contemplate as the diminutive, magnetic Edlestein [a professor] continued to take his weekly sledgehammer to what remained of my childhood faith" (Akhtar 5). The prologue sets the mood of the novel as one which will cater to the oxymoronic existence of being American Dervish, as he "unwrapped" his packet of burger to "find" he "wasn't holding a beef frank, but a marbled, brown-and-white pork bratwurst," he wonders and contemplates upon both his identity and self and exclaims to himself, "What reason did I have anymore not to eat it? None at all" (4), so the question arises, is Mina the only connection he could find with God and his religion? With her departure does that connection break? The American within him entices him to bite into the forbidden food, as he states, "My heart raced as I chewed, my mouth filling with a sweet and smoky, lightly pungent taste that seemed utterly remarkable-perhaps all the more so for having been forbidden for so long […] I felt like I was complete"(4-5). The forbidden meat unites his two worlds. Akhtar shows how he feels freed from faith and it coincides with Mina's death. Hence, he was carrying the burden of two worlds and as he abandons one for the other he feels free. However, in Mina's death, he feels grief for himself. There, in that moment, he finds the power in him to tell the story which united the two worlds. The need

to express and narrate the story keeps him connected, despite his endeavor to break free. The story empowers him to enter his dervish self. As Mina says, "That's someone who gives up everything for Allah" (101). She says, "I'm talking about a Sufi. A Sufi dervish. Whose whole life is devoted to Allah. It was his choice to give everything up" she further explains, "Because by giving everything up, his home, his family, his job, nothing is in the way anymore. Nothing between himself and God" (102). According to Mina, a dervish becomes "the same as everything created by Allah's hand [...]What was in his way before? He thought he was different. But now he saw he was not different. He and Allah, and everything Allah created, it was all One" (104). Hayat discovered peace, "For once, life in our home was settling into a peaceful" state of mind, "For though we longed for happiness, we did not expect it. This was our cultural text, the message imprinted in even the movie videos my parents rented from local Indo-Pak grocer" (70), while the cultural discourse offered "loss, pain and sorrow," the Quranic verse he remembers states,

> Truly, with hardship comes ease,
> With hardship comes ease! (71)

He recalls the stories that Mina told him, "the ones about dervishes: the first, in which a dervish sitting by the side of a road has orange peels tossed on him by a couple of passersby and, in that moment of ill-usage, awakens to the fiction of the personal self that imagines it is any different from the peels or the passersby, or God Himself; and the tale that suggested being ground to dust was the way to our Lord" (337), according to Hayat, it is people which grind you to dust and Mina intentionally married Sunil "someone to ill-use her, someone who would eventually grind her to dust" (337), thus, a deliberate effort on her part to be One with God. Mina, showed him a quote from a collection of Fitzgerald's letters: "The test of a first-rate intelligence is the ability to hold two opposing ideas in the mind at the same time and still retain the ability to function" (340). Hayat has to hold both worlds together. Mina says, "Faith has never been about afterlife for me, Hayat. It's about finding God now. In the everyday" (342). Hayat could not find God in her pain, but she said, "When Chisti [the Saint] was dying […] he was in pain all over his body. His followers didn't understand how a man who Allah loved so much could be put through so much pain […] Do you know what he told them when they asked him why Allah was making him suffer so? [...] This is how the divine is choosing to express Himself through me […] what he meant is that His glory. Even the pain" she paused, "That is the real truth about life" (343).

Since, "'Power is everywhere' and 'comes from everywhere'," it "is neither an agency nor a structure" (Foucault 63), "'power/knowledge'" "signify that power is constituted through accepted forms of knowledge, scientific understanding and truth" (Rainbow). Hayat attempts arrive at Mina's "real truth" to understand his whirling selves.

Conclusion

Akhtar's novel, offers means of enervation within the body of minority discourse through affiliation to mystic ideologies which unite rather than divide differences. Therefore, the truth created from the powerful discourse finds its way into the society. Akhtar raises the question whether, a minority discourse can also infiltrate the macro discourse. He presents characters like Sonny to show how universal Truths of existence and humanity can connect people. Foucault claims further that, "Truth is a thing of the world: it is produced only virtue of multiple forms of constraint. And it induces regular effects of power. Each society has its regime of truth, its 'general politics' of truth: that is, the types of discourse which it accepts and makes function as true" (Rabinow). These "regimes of truth" are "reinforced constantly through the education system, the media and the flux of political and economic ideologies" (Rainbow). According to this approach, power "transcends politics and sees power as an everyday, socialized and embodied phenomenon" (Rabinow). Since, "power is […] a major source of social discipline and conformity," "there is little scope for practical action […] the norms can be embedded as to be beyond our perception" (Rabinow). Hence, to "challenge power is not a matter of seeking some 'absolute truth' [which is in any case a socially produced power], but 'of detaching the power of truth from the forms of hegemony, social, economic, and cultural, within which it operates at the present time" (Rabinow 75) and connecting them to agents of knowledge which propagate universality. In *Power/ Knowledge*, Foucault claims, "it is a fact that we have repeatedly encountered, at least at a superficial level, […], an entire thematic to the effect that it is not theory but life that matters, not knowledge but reality, and above, and arising out of this thematic, there is something else to which we are witness, and which might describe as an insurrection of subjugated knowledge" (81), the "illegitimate knowledges against the claim of unitary body of theory which would filter, hierarchise and order them in the name of some true knowledge and some arbitrary idea of what constitutes science and its objects" (Foucault *Power/ Knowledge* 83). This knowledge is present between the oxymoronic existence, since binaries are parts of a whole and not mere oppositions Akhtar creates a world where

the whole can exist together and produce a "lively rhythm"(70). Future researchers can explore religious subsets within the global spectrum of plural societies.

Works Cited

"Dervish Sufism." Britannica. https://www.britannica.com/topic/dervish_ (accessed June 2019)

Foucault, Michel. *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of a Prison*. London: Penguin, 1990.

—. *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972-77*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1977.

—. *The History of Sexuality Volume 1.: An Introduction*. New York: Vintage, 1990.

—. *The History of Sexuality: The Will to Knowledge*. London: Penguin,1998.

Gaventa, John. *Power After Lukes: a review of the literature*, Brighton: Institute of Development Studies, 2003.

Hayward, Clarissa Rile. "De-Facing Power." *Polity* 31(1), 1998.

Rabinow, Paul.Editor. *The Foucault Reader: An Introduction to Foucault's Thought,* London, Penguin, 1991.

世界文学研究论坛

聂珍钊 / 浙江大学（中国）
查尔斯·罗斯 / 普渡大学（美国）

Editors in Chief

Nie Zhenzhao, Zhejiang University, China
Charles Ross, Purdue University, U.S.A

ISSN 1949-8519